



CITY OF
**PALO
ALTO**

Planning & Transportation Commission Action Agenda: June 14, 2023

Council Chambers & Virtual
6:00 PM

Call to Order / Roll Call

6:01 pm

Chair Summa: Good evening and welcome to the regular Planning Commission meeting of June 14th.

[automated voice announced recording in progress]

Chair Summa: Oh, good evening, welcome to the Planning Commission of June 14th. Ms. Dao, could you take the roll, please?

Ms. Veronica Dao, Administrative Assistant: Chair Summa?

Chair Summa: Present.

Ms. Dao: Vice-Chair Chang?

Vice-Chair Chang: Here.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Ms. Dao: Commissioner Akin?

3

4 Commissioner Akin: Here.

5

6 Ms. Dao: Commissioner Lu?

7

8 Commissioner Lu: Here.

9

10 Ms. Dao: Commissioner Hechtman is absent. Commissioner Reckdahl?

11

12 Commissioner Reckdahl: Here.

13

14 Ms. Dao: Commissioner Templeton?

15

16 Commissioner Templeton: Here.

17

18 Ms. Dao: We have a quorum.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Summa: Thank you so much and at this time I'd like to ask if there are any members of
2 the public, either here or Zoom, who would like to speak to items that are not on the Agenda.

3 **Oral Communications**

4 The public may speak to any item not on the agenda. Three (3) minutes per speaker.^{1,2}

5 Ms. Veronica Dao, Administrative Assistant: No public comments.

6

7 Chair Summa: So, seeing that there are no public comments, get your hand up now or we will
8 move onto the next thing.

9 **Agenda Changes, Additions and Deletions**

10 The Chair or Commission majority may modify the agenda order to improve meeting management.

11 Chair Summa: Any Agenda changes, additions or deletions?

12

13 Ms. Amy French, Chief Planning Official: No changes.

14

15 Chair Summa: Thank you and then I think it's time for the City official reports.

16 **City Official Reports**

17 1. Directors Report, Meeting Schedule and Assignments

18 Ms. Amy French, Chief Planning Official: Yes, as noted in the Packet, we have some meetings

19 coming up July... sorry June 28th and July 12th and July 26th. We're targeting a number of items

20 for those meetings. We haven't yet set the items for August, but considering possibly looking at

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 the first August meeting as a potential break and resuming at the end of August. So, we'll... we
2 have some time to deliberate that later when we look at all of the other items on our plate.

3
4 Let's see, and we're.... we have the last Council meeting of the year coming up on Monday the
5 19th. We have a number of items on that Agenda which are Consent Calendar primarily. So, off
6 the top of my head, that's what we have.

7
8 Chair Summa: [off mic] Alright and so other Staff? Oh, sorry, if we have other Staff that would
9 like to make a report with us this evening. Mr. Rius?

10
11 Mr. Rafael Rius, Senior Engineer: Thank you, Rafael Rius, I'm Senior Engineer with the Office of
12 Transportation. I just wanted give an update on a couple of things. One, the Lincoln/Middlefield
13 [unintelligible], the [unintelligible] that we're under progress of doing. We've launched a
14 website and hopefully, it's being showed up there on the Board, but on the website, it's going
15 to include a link to the consultant's Safety Assessment Report as well as notice of a community
16 meeting that's planned right now for 6:00 pm on June 27th. It's a Tuesday and then we're... also
17 on there's a form to provide input and email addresses if you... you can either email or use a
18 form on there or attend one of the community meetings. We're looking to get input from
19 [unintelligible] on that.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 And then in addition to that, get [unintelligible] City Council meeting, we have a couple of items
2 on the Consent Calendar. Including a contract for a Bicycle and Pedestrian Transportation Plan
3 and a funding agreement for an FHWA Safety Action Plan. So, just as a heads up, there are two
4 items that if they passes, potentially will be coming to PTC for some review.

5
6 Chair Summa: Thank you very much for that and do any of my colleagues have questions for
7 Staff? Commissioner Chang [note – Vice-Chair Chang].

8
9 Ms. Rius: [unintelligible]

10

11 Chair Summa: Uh oh.

12

13 Vice-Chair Chang: I do have a question for Mr. Rius but I don't know if we've lost him.

14

15 Chair Summa: Yeah.

16

17 Mr. Rius: Sure, I think I'm back, sorry about that.

18

19 Chair Summa: Sorry, I thought... were you finished? I'm sorry, I thought you were finished. I
20 didn't realize you were missing.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Rius: I don't know when I got cut off. I was giving an update on the Lincoln/Middlefield website and information and then a couple of... for the couple of items on the upcoming City Council meeting Agenda. Did I miss... did I get cut off from [unintelligible]?

Vice-Chair Chang: We did hear your update. My question, hopefully, you'll be able to answer it, is where the various community members who wrote in, in the past, regarding Lincoln and Middlefield notified that the website is up and notified about the community meeting? Is there an email list of interested community members that has been created?

Mr. Rius: Yes, so not yet, but we are in the process of compiling that email list. I know, myself, I had about 12 added to that list. We are sending postcards to the residents within a couple blocks and that should be... should have gone out I believe today. So, we're planning to launch the email right around this same time, so the email will go out this week for sure.

Vice-Chair Chang: Okay, thank you.

Commissioner Akin: And I've notified a number of them personally, so some of the key folks are in the loop already.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Chang: Wonderful, thank you.

2

3 Chair Summa: If there's nothing else I guess that concludes this portion and we can go onto our
4 action item which is Item 2.

5

6 **Action Items**

7 Public Comment is Permitted. Applicants/Appellant Teams: Fifteen (15) minutes, plus three (3) minutes rebuttal.
8 All others: Five (5) minutes per speaker.^{1,3}

9

10 2. PUBLIC HEARING / QUASI-JUDICIAL. 800 San Antonio (23PLN-00010): Rezoning of
11 Two Parcels of Land, Proposed to be Combined Into a Single 38,194 Square Foot
12 Property, from Commercial Service (CS) Zone to Planned Community/Planned Home
13 Zoning to Allow the Construction of a Five-Story Residential Building Providing 76
14 Dwelling Units Including 16 Below Market Rate Units (21%).

15 Chair Summa: Public Hearing/quasi-judicial on 800 San Antonio Road etc. So, I know Staff has a
16 report so I will turn it over to Staff.

17

18 Ms. Amy French, Chief Planning Official: Thank you, introducing, although she's been here
19 before, Emily Foley, who will present on this item.

20

21 Ms. Emily Foley, Planner: So, this is the presentation for 800 San Antonio, a Planned Community
22 or PHZ application.

23

24 Ms. French: So, presentation mode.

25

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. Foley: Yeah, sorry, there was just a big of a delay between when I clicked it, when I started
2 talking and when you could see it on your screen. So, this project is a Planned Home Zoning
3 application to include a new five-story residential building with 76 residential units, 20 percent
4 which will be affordable as required by the PHZ Program. It will include two levels of
5 underground parking with sufficient parking for the number of units under the Zoning Code.
6 However, the Exceptions to the Zoning Code that the PHZ is requesting includes a height
7 exemption exceeding the typically allowable FAR and Lot Coverage. The fact that it is 100
8 percent residential use and does not include a commercial component where usually mixed-use
9 is required in the CS Zone. This application will also merge two existing parcels and is located in
10 the Housing Incentive Program area of San Antonio.

11

12 This maps shows the relative location on San Antonio between Leghorn Street and East
13 Charleston Road. Other projects that are nearby and are in phases of the planning or permitting
14 process includes 788 San Antonio, 824 San Antonio and 3997 Fabian.

15

16 This slide shows the PHZ process since it has pretty much the most hearings one of our
17 application types can have. This project started with a pre-screening in August of last year and
18 now we have the formally submitted application. It has gone through a couple of rounds of
19 Staff review and this is now the first PTC hearing. After this hearing, it typically would move

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 onto the Architectural Review Board for a couple of rounds of their review before returning to
2 the PTC for a formal recommendation to the City Council.

3

4 In terms of CEQA, this project is currently having an Addendum to the Housing Incentive
5 Program Expansion EIR being prepared. This means we do not currently expect that there will
6 be any new significant environmental impacts beyond what was analyzed as a part of the HIP
7 Expansion EIR, but we are still in that process. So, if anything new comes up this will change and
8 this project must comply with all adopted mitigation measures for that previous EIR.

9

10 This slide shows the site plan. In general, the application is meeting all required setbacks.
11 However, some of the balconies in the rear for some of the units protrude slightly into the
12 required 10-foot setback. This project is also respecting the required 24-foot special setback
13 along San Antonio and you can see that the driveway is located at the norther most end of the
14 site.

15

16 These are sample floor plans, the one on the left is the ground floor and the one on the right
17 are the upper floors. Most of the units have outdoor balcony space. The minimum required
18 space for this Zoning District is 150-square feet per unit and this does meet it on an average
19 basis; though not on a by-unit basis as not every unit has a balcony.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 The next two slides show elevations. The proposed materials included fiber cement panels,
2 metal panels, metal trim, glass windows and glass railings for the balconies and the material
3 sample board is here in the Chambers tonight.

4
5 And I mentioned this earlier but more specifically this project is asking for exceptions to some
6 of the CS Development Standards. The project is proposing a 2.99 Floor Area Ratio where .4 to
7 1 is allowed. It is proposing 65 percent Lot Coverage where 50 percent is allowed and it is not
8 proposing any ground floor retail or commercial use where typically 5,000... approximately
9 500... 5,700-square feet is required. It is also asking for Exceptions to the height limit. Typically,
10 the height limit is 50-feet but this building would be 60-feet to the top of the parapet and 62-
11 feet to the top of the mechanical enclosure. Though technically the mechanical enclosure
12 would still fit under the 15-foot allowance above the 50-feet for mechanical equipment.

13
14 Our recommended motion is that you provide initial comments and feedback and recommend
15 that the Staff forward the project to the Architectural Review Board. This concludes my
16 presentation and the applicant, Mark Donahue, is available for this presentation, thank you.

17
18 Ms. French: Also, I wanted to acknowledged that Emily Foley is now Emily Kallas which I
19 neglected to mention as the beginning under happy circumstances.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Mark Donahue: Okay and should I do it from here? Okay, great.

2

3 Chair Summa: Excuse me, it's Mr. Donahue?

4

5 Mr. Donahue: Mark Donahue.

6

7 Chair Summa: Mark Donahue, thank you.

8

9 Mr. Donahue: Thank you. Alright and I know we had a presentation. I don't know if that's ready
10 to go or if I need to give you a disc. Oh, okay, sure. Oh, okay great.

11

12 Chair Summa: Excuse me and is... the applicant gets 10-minutes, is that correct? Yeah, okay
13 thank you. Are we just loading the presentation? Okay.

14

15 Ms. French: [off mic] It's actually 15.

16

17 Chair Summa: 15? Okay.

18

19 Ms. Donahue: I promise I won't take that long.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Summa: Well, please feel free to use all 15.

2

3 Mr. Donahue: Alright and then should I just ask you to advance the slides for me? Okay,
4 fantastic. Alright, well ladies and gentlemen, thank you very much for listening to us tonight
5 and what we talk about the project that has become... we have become very attached to and
6 hope that you will get attached to it as well. You're seeing here the view of the project from San
7 Antonio which is slightly to the south of the project. In the foreground, we'll talk in a little bit
8 more detail later about the no-fly zone as we call it. That is an easement, a special easement
9 that gives the City a little bit of latitude in terms of future planning along San Antonio.

10

11 And so, the things I want to talk about are, of course, things that you're already familiar with. I
12 know in May you passed the latest Housing Element and a lot of the points that we want to talk
13 about a little bit right now were embedded in that discussion; which is the City's got 6,000-units
14 to try to make up over the next 10 years and that the part of the City that have been targeted
15 for that kind of development are precisely like the site that we have on San Antonio. It's a light
16 industrial area and a lot of the opportunity sites that were identified were in that same zone.
17 We'll get to that later. It is a match with the future planned development in the area as well
18 and in fact, there is a project as you've come through that is underway that's right next door
19 that's very similar in scale. And then I guess the last thing is you can see from the image that
20 we're looking for a high-end contemporary design. There should be a material board that

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 you've had a chance to see and we're proposing a very high-end cement panel system that very
2 much resembles stone and conveys that as a texture and adds colors to the street. Next slide,
3 please.

4
5 I'm not going to spend to much time on this. The location, of course, is right there in the red
6 circle. It is sandwiched between major transportation infrastructure and it backs essentially to
7 Menlo Park. Menlo Park is our back property line and the area's very suitable... pardon? Oh,
8 Mountain View, sorry, I knew it was one of the end cities, thank you for that. Mountain View
9 and what is also good about the site is that there's a lot of retail and grocery availability very
10 close by. There are cultural institutions and so it's really an ideal spot to place high-density
11 residential, so next slide. I got to fix my map here, I was deceived. So, the star represents the
12 site, further to the south, as you note, there are a couple of hotels that have already been built.
13 Immediately to our south will be the new residential project and then over the course of time,
14 as we'll see, there were or other projects planned for the area. Next slide.

15
16 And there was some concern about it's proximity to existing low-scale residential and we just
17 wanted to show that it is actually a considerable distance from the nearest actual residential
18 zoning. Next slide. And it's... whoops, back one. It's still 350-foot minimum away from any
19 residential use that's current in play or low-density residential. Next slide, to the right Mountain
20 View and but essentially, for people who live in Palo Alto the front of the building is essentially

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 what they will see. The folks over in Mountain View, we'll give them a nice façade but the
2 primary focus is on the street-facing façade on San Antonio. Next slide.

3

4 So, the other unique aspect of this project is that we have applied for the PHZ Zoning. So, the
5 Planned Home Zoning, and we feel that this is a reasonable approach to the spirit of the law in
6 terms of what the Planned Home Zoning is for; which is to take a site that's already appropriate
7 for multi-family and just intensify it a little bit more. And so, that's where those extra height
8 considerations come in and some of the extra density. It is definitely located on transit
9 corridors that lead to housing or to other housing, near jobs and near services. And as we've
10 saw in previous slide, there's Costco within walking distance and then several other shopping
11 centers available also within walking and biking distance. The PHZ, as you know, provides some
12 flexibility at your discretion for the Zoning Standards and so that's part of why we're here
13 tonight. And then the challenge of course is... there's actually several challenges. What is the
14 appropriate density for the site? We feel that this is appropriate for this particular site and part
15 of what's driving that is just the head winds that residential developers are facing in terms of
16 finance costs; in terms of the cost... hard cost for building. And so, that density can make the
17 difference between a project that pencils and one that doesn't. Alright and so it is, as you know,
18 the PHZ is limited to commercial and high-density residential zones and this falls under the
19 commercial rubric. Next slide.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 The Housing Element, this is an extract from an earlier draft of it, but I wanted to point out that
2 these particular properties that are highlighted in yellow will show up on this next map. Next
3 slide and so when you look at the aggregate of all the potential opportunity sites along San
4 Antonio. Plus, the sites that have either already been developed or are going to be developed.
5 You'll see that we are really sitting amidst a fairly large number of similar neighbors and so this
6 isn't something that will stick out. It's something that will blend in with a future corridor. Next?
7 Oh, there's those surroundings uses. There's the Costco, a few other ones, cultural center and
8 then of course the hotels to the south. Next slide.

9

10 This is a site plan and the area that is highlighted in yellow is that special easement that we
11 spoke of. Even though the adjoining properties may not have this enforced or take advantage of
12 it. We felt it was important to respect that and of course, working with planning, to place the
13 façade of the building outside of that special zone. So, that the City has some flexibility in the
14 future for creating a corridor on San Antonio that's friendly to bicycles and friendly to
15 pedestrians. Next slide. The basic form of the building, as you can see, is a doughnut. Kind of a
16 French crawler if I had to pick a particular kind of doughnut. With the straight sides, angled
17 sides being compromised of what I would characterize as slide-formal elements. So, that it
18 presents a serrated edge and then also each of the east and west-facing facades are broken
19 down into smaller elements. We'll see later when we look at the elevations, that the north and
20 south facades are also broke down... broken down rather and but to a smaller degree. In the

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 center, this is the landscape plan and so there's the buffer zone were no permanent
2 landscaping can be applied, so we have paving. We do have some utilities that will appear in
3 that zone at the request of the utility company on [unintelligible] a transformer adjacent to our
4 driveway entry to underground parking. And then outside the buffer zone, there will be some
5 outside areas that are part of the building amenities here on the lower left of the page. On the
6 interior of the doughnut is the central courtyard and this is important not only for the residents
7 of the building to provide a refuge amidst the hustle and bustle of San Antonio. But also, what...
8 as I'll show later, it is a glimpse of that inner sanctum will be made available to the street.
9 Looking through two layers of glass in the lobby, you'll be looking into this screened courtyard
10 and so it actually becomes an amenity for the street as well, so next slide.

11

12 There's the basic form. You can see in the upper is the garage entry leading down a ramp. So,
13 all of the vehicular parking will below grade and hidden from view except for the entry ramp.
14 We have a few utility functions that must be on the street per PG&E or the local utility and then
15 the balance of the façade is either amenities such as the bike room. Then we have that large
16 lobby and as you can see that it passes through from the front of the building into the court
17 yard and then building amenities to the south of that. We do have residential units on the
18 ground floor that address the quieter sides of the building on the south, on the east and some
19 on the north. Next slide and this is the second floor. I was going to say it's a typical floor but the
20 two-story high lobby you can see is punching through here at the left side of the screen and

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 there will be a bridge going across. So, as you walk by on the street, you will see through that
2 into the court yard but also you may see people crossing the bridge and just a sense of activity
3 within the building. For the most part, the rest of the floors, if you fill in that gap, are precisely
4 the same and stack and so they all have that same level of articulation, slightly different as you
5 get to the top floor. Next slide and then just to give you a glimpse into the basement. We have
6 a lot our utility functions there. Ones that normally would be up on the street. For instance, the
7 trash room is down here and we understand that that means that we've got to get the trash
8 out of the building up to the street. That is part of the arrangement we're looking for is private
9 transportation of trash from this centralized trash room, which is out of the way, up to the
10 street to where it would be picked up by the local trash service. Next slide.

11

12 Alright, so I just wanted to talk a little bit about the design principles that we implode here. One
13 of the things that was part of our early discussions is that the zoning would allow for a four-
14 story high building in its [unintelligible] form. And so, we spent a lot effort trying to get our five-
15 story building to look like a four-story building. So, if it's not immediately apparent, the white
16 columnar elements are all four-stories tall and that fifth story is a darker color so that its
17 recedes visually. Next slide and essentially it divides the building into the... we can't avoid it,
18 classical order of base, middle and capital or top. And this, first of all, breaks down the scale of
19 the building so that instead of feelings like you're confronting a five-story wall. It's a one-story
20 plinth, it's a three-story building on top of that plinth and then penthouse if you will that

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 recedes with the darker color. Next slide. We've also broken up all of the facades but
2 particularly the front façade with these vertical elements. And it kind of express almost a
3 townhome proportion with deeply shadowed divisions between them where the balconies are.
4 So, there's a lot of texture between these projecting elements and so between the horizontal
5 and the vertical the façade's broken up into bite-size chunks shall we say. Next slide and then
6 the portal I was talking about, its two-stories high, it's in the center of the building and looking
7 through that blue element there, particularly during certain times of the day. You'll have a clear
8 view straight into this beautiful green space that we're creating for the building. Next slide and
9 there it is back again; [unintelligible] overlay. The landscape as well responses to the rhythm of
10 the building for the street trees and it's all in the effort of providing the passerby with an
11 experience of a much smaller building. Next slide.

12
13 Going through the elevations, this is the elevation that you've been seeing in our rendering.
14 There are the four vertical elements divided by balconies. Further, there are other elements,
15 detailed elements, that emphasize that verticality and then you can see that the color we've
16 selected for the top floor really gives it less presence on the street than those things in the
17 foreground. The top level it primarily composed of long balconies and so there's a sense of
18 much more transparency up there as well just from the fenestration. Next slide, here's a
19 diagram of our portal looking into the courtyard. Next and this is actually the rear of the
20 building and you can see that we've taken the same strategies that we've used on the front and

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 used them on the back. So, that as the surrounding neighborhood changes over time, the
2 appearance of the building from all sides will be pleasing. Next slide, now on each of the north
3 and south elevations, the divisions are not as small. These ones have the front of the or excuse
4 me, the side of the building divided into three parts. Same thing though, here what we have is
5 we have the base element, the plinth if you will, actually comes up in the middle and it's the
6 same material in color. So, it divides the building into three parts as you're looking from the
7 front and the whitish material turns the corner. There's a sense that there's a bar embedded in
8 this sub-straight of the grey podium material and the same for the back. Next slide, on the
9 other slides it's inverse and the only difference here on the south to provide additional sun
10 protection. We are proposing to have sun shades that are going to shade both the south sun
11 and the west sun. Just a better thermal comfort, a little bit more texture facing our neighbors
12 and actually a little bit more privacy. As the neighboring project looks in through the windows
13 there is these screens that will help to block views into the windows.

14

15 How did I do? That was like three or four minutes, wasn't it? Excellent and happy to answer any
16 questions that we can about the project.

17

18 Chair Summa: Thank you so much for that and I'll go to questions from my colleagues and then
19 we'll take public comment. So, I see that Commissioner Akin has questions.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Akin: Chair Summa, I actually have a fairly long list. Do you want to do this in two
2 passes or a single pass? Two rounds?

3

4 Chair Summa: We'll start out and we'll see.

5

6 Commissioner Akin: Okay, in general, I like this project a lot. The mix of unit types and sizes is
7 excellent. The high density with zero new office space is very helpful. There's adequate parking,
8 solar power with back up is a nice plus.

9

10 Commissioner Reckdahl: [off mic] This is just questions [unintelligible].

11

12 Commissioner Akin: Oh, okay.

13

14 Chair Summa: Yeah, this I just questions and we're having a little... you need to get probably
15 closer to your silly mic, but so now is the time for questions.

16

17 Commissioner Akin: Pardon me, as someone new here, I apologize for the out-of-order
18 comments.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Donahue: Sorry, I thought you're... it was preamble to questions so I'm waiting for that
2 question.

3
4 Commissioner Akin: Alright, so we'll drop down to the questions. On Page A0.1, the proposed
5 unit mix is slightly differently from the one that's listed under required parking and this is also
6 true on A0.4. So, I think it's clear what the intent is, but just I wanted to make sure you knew
7 that there was a little inconsistency in the plans.

8
9 Mr. Donahue: We can make those corrections, thank you.

10
11 Commissioner Akin: I think the remainder of the questions I have are for Staff rather than for
12 Mr. Donahue so we'll move on. Okay, so the Code Section 18.38.080 (D) requires projected sale
13 or rental prices for PC districts. Do we have those?

14
15 Mr. Donahue: These will be for sale but I think the actually... the actual sales price is probably
16 something that will fluctuate between now and the time that it's open.

17
18 Commissioner Akin: Yeah, this was strictly a question about conformance with the Code, rather
19 than something we needed immediately. Much of the parking stacker system, do we have a
20 sense of how well that's worked out elsewhere?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Mr. Donahue: My office has quite a bit of experience in the use of stackers and it is definitely careful consideration for who is the stacker if provider because as... if you're familiar with stackers. The City Lift, which is the largest local provider, has gone bankrupt and so we have been relying on providers who have been in the market for much longer and have proven to have a track record. So, I don't have the exact specification, it's between one or two providers for that reason.

Commissioner Akin: And my remaining detailed question has already been answered so thank you.

Chair Summa: Thank you. Commissioner Templeton?

Commissioner Templeton: Thank you very much. I appreciate your presentation. I'm going to ask a tough question here and I apologize in advance. So, I noticed that you've got the open space on the ground floor, which is awesome, and I wondered why there's not a plan for open space on the roof. And I'm guessing because of height restrictions or something, but I just wanted to ask you to speak to that.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Donahue: Well, I think the answer is actually several fold, but I'll start with the easiest one
2 which is just the cost. The cost of doing a shared roof deck rather than focusing on private open
3 space is really prohibitive these days, so that's just one element of the three. Since these are
4 higher-end market rate units, there's also the sense that those who live on the top floor, and
5 who are frankly probably paying top dollar, would not be necessarily open to having the roof
6 over their unit since these will be owned units with a shared space on top. So, that was a
7 second minor consideration. The other thing is just it complicates the exiting to a great degree.
8 Once you have a certain population, now you've got to bring the elevators all the way to the
9 roof, you've got to have both of your stairs going to the roof and even though this is a market
10 rate project. We were still trying to be cost-conscious about those items, so what we did
11 instead is in addition to having the court yard, which is also more protected. There are... there's
12 open space on the ground floor facing the street that is behind a fence line but is still a shared
13 amenity of the building. And those... that's associated with the fitness center and with the
14 office space down there, the work share space.

15

16 Commissioner Templeton: Thank you for speaking to that. The other question I had was, and
17 I'm sure this will... you'll go into more detail with this with the ARB, but I just wanted to ask
18 because I'm curious. On the front façade facing San Antonio, in the rendering, it appears to be
19 wider and taller than the building walls itself where it extends beyond up here.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Donahue: Right, the little blade there.

2

3 Commissioner Templeton: Yeah, I wonder if you could speak to that.

4

5 Mr. Donahue: Certainly, so one of the challenges we have as architects is there are certain ideas
6 that we're trying to express. Ideas about how the building is composed formally, like what's it
7 made of? When you look at it as passerby, we have certain intentions for it. We want you to
8 think of it as heavy, light, warm, cool and so those little flanges at the end are intended to give
9 the sense that these elements in the front.. the white and then there's the blue canopy
10 elements in the blue blades... are actually embedded in the plane rather than in a block. And
11 the real reason for that is it gives the building a sense of lightness and the secondary reason for
12 it is that it takes a little bit more of the street noise out of the sides of the building as it goes
13 back. It did suit a purpose compositionally where it gave us broader surface to work with in
14 terms of embedding our elements along that façade and so when you put all those things
15 together. We tried it out, we did experiment of course without it, with different conditions and
16 this is the one we arrived at.

17

18 Commissioner Templeton: Okay, so there's some aesthetic principles at play. Do you think it in
19 any way contributes to the height discussion or are those matching... things of the matching
20 height behind them?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Donahue: You know, that’s actually a very good question because immediately behind is relatively the same heights. It’s a little bit lower because the parapets a little bit lower but in terms of the overall composition, where we to express that as a solid block rather than as a plane. I think the overall feeling of mass of the building would have been more pronounced and even though height is a concern. You know, once we went to the darker material as a foil to that. We felt like we should commit to it and also make it feel lighter in massing ways as well as in color.

Commissioner Templeton: Thank you for taking the time to explain that, thank you.

Mr. Donahue: Sure, great questions, thank you.

Chair Summa: Commissioner Chang [note – Vice-Chair Chang].

Vice-Chair Chang: Thank you. A couple questions for you, so you’re picture on the front shows these street trees.

Mr. Donahue: Yes.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson’s presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Chang: And when I look at the tree and the landscape planting plans. Well, I'm not
2 sure I was reading them correctly first of all because it was pretty small and my old eyes, even
3 with glasses, were struggling.

4

5 Mr. Donahue: Totally understanding, bright lights.

6

7 Vice-Chair Chang: So, if you look at the Tree Protection Plan on T-2 and then oh, I don't think I
8 marked it properly, but there's a Landscape Plan also, but I think I'm just going to go with T-2.
9 So, T-2 shows which trees are being removed, are there actually going to be street trees
10 replaced because at least on the T-2 I don't see any replaced? And when I look at on Page T-2
11 there's the tree removal summary and then the total trees to be mitigated and trees to be
12 planted and when I count up the trees that are to be planted as part of the project. I only count
13 the six that are in the doughnut hole.

14

15 Mr. Donahue: I see. I'll be honest, the landscape architect is not here tonight and so it is a
16 question that I will have to study before I can answer. I would hate to answer incorrectly. The
17 discussion as it has proceeded thus far is that we're going to have street trees because it's a
18 requirement of the streetscape design, but the fact that you're not seeing them is giving me
19 pause.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Chang: Okay because I do have additional questions regarding the tree replacement
2 and tree removal table. Yeah, so I was concerned because it looks lovely with the street trees
3 there.

4

5 Mr. Donahue: It does, doesn't it?

6

7 Vice-Chair Chang: I'd be very concerned if there were no street trees because it would look
8 rather like a concrete block without the street trees and I didn't see them planted. And then
9 when I looked at the trees to be removed, the quantity that are required to be mitigated and
10 then the actual quantity that are actually going to be planted as part of the project. The
11 quantity required looks like 28 and then the actual trees to be planted is six. So, then I had a
12 question for Staff which is how does that work? It looks like there's a fee that's paid.

13

14 Ms. Kallas: Right, so as a part of helping to streamline projects, there are still certain Staff
15 comments that have not been fully addressed yet. I don't have it up in front of me but there are
16 some Urban Forestry items, just generally speaking, that will need to be addressed, but on
17 Sheet A-1.1. It also shows four proposed trees in the front setback, but I've noted down just in
18 general the consistency issue, so that will be incorporated into our comments.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Chang: Ah, I see that's... okay and then I guess a follow-up question for Staff. So,
2 what happens... I mean it's more of a City issue but if we were to say put a bike path where
3 those street trees would be. Then we would have to figure that out, right? I mean...

4

5 Ms. Kallas: Yeah, I mean a simple answer is we would figure it out.

6

7 Vice-Chair Chang: Okay and then I guess a question for Mr. Donahue?

8

9 Mr. Donahue: Donahue.

10

11 Vice-Chair Chang: Okay Donahue, is there any... I understand the need to... there's just very... I
12 understand the desire to maximize the FAR here. It's wonderful how much housing is being
13 built, but when I looked at City Council's or when I looked that the City Council minutes for the
14 pre-screen. There was a lot of concern about this San Antonio corridor and how little greenery
15 there is in this area of Palo Alto, which I think is partly the reason why Commissioner Templeton
16 asked about open space on the top. Is there anything else that can be done in the back or
17 elsewhere to add greenery?

18

19 Mr. Donahue: I'm certain there is. I think we have several other constraints that are binding us.
20 The subterranean garage of course means that anything within its footprint, you really can't

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 grow trees within the footprint. As I understand it though the special setback is meant for some
2 kind of a master-planned greenway or you know (interrupted)

3

4 Vice-Chair Chang: Bikeway.

5

6 Mr. Donahue: Bike lanes and so we were constrained from placing any permanent, such as
7 trees, anything permanent within that setback and that's actually where we typically would
8 have focused most of the landscape. I do think that there's opportunities to do smaller
9 interventions but as far as large trees, very limited at this point. I think the street trees will have
10 to take up much of the burden.

11

12 Vice-Chair Chang: And then a follow on question for Staff, so if not all the trees that are need to
13 be mitigated are able to be planted on site. How does that work for my education?

14

15 Ms. Kallas: Yes, there is an in-lieu fee that can be paid based on the radius... based on the size of
16 the trees being removed.

17

18 Vice-Chair Chang: And then for Ms. Donahue, a question about traffic circulation.

19

20 Mr. Donahue: Yes?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Vice-Chair Chang: How does it... you had mentioned that trash... refuse would need to be moved up from the garage.

Mr. Donahue: Correct.

Vice-Chair Chang: So, then it would be picked up where on the street?

Mr. Donahue: Currently (interrupted)

Vice-Chair Chang: Or can you show how the entrances to the garage and if you could pull up any diagram of the building?

Mr. Donahue: Sure, is it possible for us to bring up... the site plan shows where we are proposing to have the pickup zone. It is on the street and it is just south of the driveway entry. There is a designated zone for trash on those days as well as a proposed loading zoning for FedEx, UPS, Uber, Lyft, whatever, ride share comes in the front of the building as well. So, if you look... the zone... I can't really read the number but it (interrupted)

[Note- unknown speaker:] [unintelligible]

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Donahue: Thank you, zone 10 is designed for trash and then just below that is the pickup (interrupted)

Vice-Chair Chang: Which page is this?

[note – unknown female speaker:] [off mic] A-1.1.

Vice-Chair Chang: Okay thanks, zone 10. Sorry while I get there. Okay great, thank you. Thank you, thank you. Alright, and then oh, one more question about the... there was a comment in the Staff Report about the rear setback and how the balconies encroach a little bit on the rear setback. Can... I couldn't tell how much the balconies encroach on the rear setback and exactly what that refers to. So, maybe if you could just keep... I don't know if this... I don't think this diagram shows it.

Commissioner Templeton: It's also on... it's on the same page. There's a red dash line on your Packet on A-1.1.

Vice-Chair Chang: Yes, okay so I did see that but then how much does it encroach into the rear setback because I don't think that... I don't think I could read it. I could see it, but I couldn't

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 tell... so it's... it's just a couple feet right? The rear setbacks 10-feet and then do we know how
2 much that's going in?

3

4 Ms. Kallas: We don't seem to have (interrupted)

5

6 Vice-Chair Chang: Dimensions.

7

8 Ms. Kallas: The exact dimension.

9

10 Mr. Donahue: It's a couple feet. I think 1-foot 8 [inches] or 1-foot 10 [inches] perhaps.

11

12 Vice-Chair Chang: Okay.

13

14 Mr. Donahue: And that... I have to look back at the Zoning Code. There are some allowances for
15 infringements on the setbacks. I just can't remember if balconies is one of them.

16

17 Vice-Chair Chang: And that's for all the upper floors, correct?

18

19 Mr. Donahue: The balconies are consistent on all floors.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Chang: Alright great.

2

3 Mr. Donahue: Except in the front. The top floor in the front, the balconies are much longer.

4

5 Vice-Chair Chang: And then on the front 24 [foot] setback, there's a patio for the lower left unit.

6 Does that patio encroach into the front 24?

7

8 Mr. Donahue: Are we talking about on the ground floor?

9

10 Vice-Chair Chang: The ground floor, yes.

11

12 Mr. Donahue: Yeah, ground floor, those do not encroach and those patios are associated with
13 community rooms rather than a unit.

14

15 Vice-Chair Chang: Got it, okay and then final question I believe. Is... so for the BMR units, those
16 are also intended for sale, is that correct?

17

18 Mr. Donahue: Correct.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Chang: Okay, question for Staff, how does that work with respect to for BMR units?
2 So, if somebody buys into BMR unit and their income increases beyond that. Do they have to
3 leave?

4
5 Chair Summa: I can answer that. Yes, because somebody, and usually we use Alta Housing to do
6 this, has to verify income every year. So, it's kind of tricky actually, to be honest, is that right?

7
8 Ms. French: Yes, we do use Alta Housing and I mean I don't think if somebody... I don't think
9 they'd be kicked out day one if that were to happen. I think it's... there's a grace period of some
10 sort.

11
12 Chair Summa: That I'm not sure of but they do have to income verify but also they
13 [unintelligible – mic cut out] Oh, Albert is here.

14
15 Ms. French: Albert is on the (interrupted)

16
17 Mr. Albert Yang, City Attorney: Sorry, so I do know that is the process for rental units. I am
18 going to have to verify how it works for ownership units, so I'll get back to you on that.

19
20 Vice-Chair Chang: Thank you. Sorry for the long list of questions.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Mr. Donahue: No, those were great, thank you.

Chair Summa: Commissioner Lu.

Commissioner Lu: Can you talk a little bit more about the side yards on both directions? And what that would look and what the fence is or open space might be?

Mr. Donahue: Sure, I think that... I'm not sure that I would characterize it as open space per say. It's more of a buffer and each of the units has an outdoor patio. So, there is that as one buffer and then the zone that's outside of that is either for firefighting circulation or as part of that additional buffer between the patios and the fence line. And it's planted with low shrubs throughout, so there's a sense of greenery there on the sides and the back of the building. We just don't have a lot of trees again for the reason of the structure being beneath that, but I think for...what we were hoping for, for the people in those units, is that as they are in their living rooms. They're looking out onto a space that they have control over and so if they want to plant trees in pots or some vines or something. They can do that but then beyond that, the general impression is of a green zone separating this project from any adjoining project.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Lu: I'm looking in between 788 and the development and on the front rendering
2 it seems like this little inlet which actually seems much more pleasant and nice than having a
3 tall oppressive fence super cleanly dividing the property lines. I was just... I can't really make it
4 out clearly and I'm not sure what it is in the plans so.

5
6 Mr. Donahue: Sure, I mean typically we would have a fence just for the legal reasons so there's
7 no encroachment onto the property, but the exact nature of the fence is... I don't know that we
8 have that information in this set. Typically, we have been trying to avoid tall solid elements. It...
9 both for air circulation and just for a little bit of visual porosity. We favor something that is
10 either perforated or that is made up of vertical slates, but to leave that boundary line between
11 our property and the adjoining property open represents some liability issues unfortunately.

12
13 Commissioner Lu: Cool, one more question. Can you tell me a little bit more about the decision
14 not to include retail and whether you considered any designs that included retail?

15
16 Mr. Donahue: We did actually, we went through quite an exercise both with the Planning Staff,
17 but also just in discussions with the various Committees that we've met with. And the... so, my
18 office does a lot of retail and the one thing that we can tell you is that isolated retail, like a
19 small pad of small size that's disconnected from other retail, will die on the vine faster than
20 almost anything and especially in this day and age. Even in areas that are really busy, there are

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 still empty store fronts just because we still haven't gotten to that point where people are out
2 circulating. You can imagine, we talked a lot about having a café that the building occupants
3 could use and that the neighborhood could come to. But the actual reach that a café, even a
4 small café, has to have in order to survive financially is much, much larger than just a building or
5 a few buildings. It's really entire neighborhoods and the most successful retail will be where
6 there's already people going for other things. Those... and we do have an example of a fairly
7 well-thriving retail center not too far away, so when we weighed all those considerations. It
8 seemed that if we really want this to be a space that's active over the long term. Then it should
9 be a use that the building users have where there's people populating it at various times during
10 the day. That it's an amenity to the building and then let the local retail take care of some of
11 those... yes, to take care of that particular aspect of life on the street.

12

13 Chair Summa: Commissioner Templeton.

14

15 Commissioner Templeton: Hi, thank you. It's been a good discussion and some other questions I
16 forgot in my first round came up, so I just want to get through them hopefully pretty quickly.
17 The first question was about the garage. Do you know... I apologize if it's in this Packet and I
18 missed it. What is the approximate elevation of the site?

19

20 Mr. Donahue: You mean above... you mean sea level?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Templeton: Yes.

Mr. Donahue: That I do not know off the top of my head.

Commissioner Templeton: That’s okay. The reason I’m asking is how many layers deep is the parking garage?

Mr. Donahue: There’s two layers.

Commissioner Templeton: Two layers and I think it’s pretty close, if I recall correctly, that’s pretty close to sea level. Do you have any concerns in the design about water?

Mr. Donahue: No, we will have to look at the Geotechnical Report and respond accordingly, but it’s always surprising to me that the way that the water table behaves underground is completely detached from the adjoining water bodies. This constantly surprises me that except in areas of alluvial deposits where it’s porous ground. Depending on the density of the material, depending on what’s between you and the shoreline. Sometimes some places you would expect the water table to be, pretty much as the surface, there is none. It's just is beyond the borings, but (interrupted)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson’s presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Templeton: It sounds like you've thought about it and that's probably enough for me for me. I'll let you and the ARB deal with the rest but that's definitely something I want to make sure you're thinking about. And then thank you to Vice-Chair Chang for her comments about the setback because I'm just wanted to clarify a few points. So, looking at the back setback, the part that touches the Mountain View properties. What's back there? What are they facing?

Mr. Donahue: That currently is... looks like a window manufacturing plant.

Commissioner Templeton: Okay, so it's an industrial facility.

Mr. Donahue: It's industrial, but there's probably a 40 or 50-foot deep parking lot where, from what I can tell, they set up tests for their windows.

Commissioner Templeton: So, that's what it is for now and that's... so it's 10 or some close approximation of 10. Except for those little corners and you said that was for fire access and I just wanted to follow up on that because I'm looking in the other two... the sides, I guess the north and south... whatever, the sides. They have a 5-foot setback? Is that what is says on the chart?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Donahue: 5-foot... is it 5-foot from the patios to the fence? There's a 5-foot way that's provided around the entire site precisely for firefighting and so it we've encroached on that I'll need to check back with the team.

Commissioner Templeton: No, no, no, it does say 5-foot. I just want to make sure... firetrucks are bigger than that.

Mr. Donahue: No, no, they... what they would do is... so there's a combination of things. That would be a very big concern if we're trying to get fire trucks back there. There's several things that you can do in terms of where the apparatus is located and how you fight the fire. Part of what we're using is we're using a higher intensity of fire resistance in the construction and so you get some passes on that. It's not like this thing is made of kindling and it's going to go up very fast.

Commissioner Templeton: Which I never suggested.

Mr. Donahue: No, no, of course, but I guess that's a little bit... may be a little bit dramatic but it is... the idea is that you design a building that has certain elements that are more high fire rates so there's more time to fight the fire. Most of what we're contenting with is how far are you

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 from the pumper truck and the limit is 150-feet. And so typically we do a hose pull test, like
2 we're graphically do it and go through it with the fire department. At the end of the day, they...
3 if they don't permit us if they don't allow us to get a permit. Then we'll have to make
4 adaptations that meet their criteria and they're very conservative and we are fine with that.

5

6 Commissioner Templeton: Yeah, I just wanted to check because that's smaller than many of the
7 sites that we look at so we just wanted to double-check. Thank you very much for answer those
8 questions.

9

10 Mr. Donahue: Sure.

11

12 Chair Summa: Commissioner Reckdahl.

13

14 Commissioner Reckdahl: I have a question about the setbacks. We have a 10-foot setback in the
15 back. What's going to be on there? Is that going to be just planting of shrubs or is it going to be
16 grass or what do you anticipate?

17

18 Mr. Donahue: Well, primarily it's low shrubs, a mixture of low shrubs and ground cover at this
19 point.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Reckdahl: So, you don't anticipate that people will be walking there?

2

3 Mr. Donahue: No and they're precluded from walking back there. It's just for maintenance and
4 emergency access only. If you look at the design of the patios, they extend out into that zone
5 but then they're etched in and we would want to prevent people. And as much of maintenance
6 issue it is, it's also nobody wants somebody else walking in front of their patio because it's a
7 disturbance to their privacy.

8

9 Commissioner Reckdahl: Understandable, how about the side yards? Are they going to be
10 gated?

11

12 Mr. Donahue: Yes, there won't be access in the street into any of the site except through a
13 locked gate.

14

15 Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay, thank you.

16

17 Chair Summa: Commissioner Chang [**note - Vice-Chair Chang**]

18

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Chang: I forgot to ask one big question which is, I don't know if you can answer it. Do
2 you know how this project has changed since the or it is has changed in broad strokes... I'm sure
3 it's changed quite a bit... since the City Council pre-screen?

4
5 Mr. Donahue: I would actually say that for the most part, it's been refinements that in general
6 when we talked to the City Council. They were generally supportive. There were comments, I
7 think if you read the minutes, you know that there were comments and concerns, but
8 seemingly there was an understanding that this site is a good site for this kind of project. And
9 within that context, we have been making those refinements, responding to comments from
10 planning and from the other departments and we'll continue to do so until the entitlement.

11
12 Vice-Chair Chang: Okay so then very specifically, the consistent feedback I heard from all the
13 Council Members was about deeper affordability. So, can you speak to how that has changed in
14 what we see now versus what was initially presented?

15
16 Mr. Donahue: As a matter of fact, I believe... and I'm just going to check. It's one additional
17 unit? So, we've actually added one more unit to the affordability matrix on the below-market
18 rate side since we talked to the City Council and actually, it's precisely because of their
19 feedback that we did it. And really, as of a matter of percentage, going slightly over that
20 required percentage just to make the affordability available to that one more household.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Vice-Chair Chang: Do you have a matrix? I had to kind of construct my own based on little hash tags and tallies. Is there a matrix somewhere in the plans or report that I missed? Of all the units, the percent affordability.

Commissioner Akin: There's a numerical list on A-0.1 if I remember correctly.

Vice-Chair Chang: Oh, okay yeah. I did a little tally.

[note – Commissioners were speaking off mic]

Vice-Chair Chang: Yeah, I couldn't read... so affordability is basically remain the same with the addition of which unit then?

Mr. Donahue: Well so, one of the other things that's changed is the location of the affordable units based on feedback again from Planning Staff and from City Council. And I thought that we had a diagram of that but I'm sensing that that may not have been included.

Vice-Chair Chang: Well, there is a diagram on Page A-0.4 that... where I can see the location of every single affordable unit marked and the size of that affordable unit as well as the level of

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 affordability. Like whether it's very low income, low income, or moderate income, so that is
2 what I did my little hash tag tallies with, but I don't know what it was before.

3

4 Mr. Donahue: Oh.

5

6 Vice-Chair Chang: Right.

7

8 Mr. Donahue: So, I think... I can't... I'm sorry, I can't remember the percentages off the top of
9 my head but (interrupted)

10

11 [unknown male speaker from Lowney Architecture:] [off mic] It was 20 percent, we're not 21
12 percent. We go over the require [unintelligible] (interrupted)

13

14 Mr. Donahue: So, we were meeting the requirement before and then after the City Council's
15 comments the decision was made to exceed the requirement.

16

17 Vice-Chair Chang: Okay and then do you know what level of affordability was before? In other
18 words, was it all 80 to 120 AMI and now it's deeper affordability or?

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 [Note - unknown male speaker from Lowney Architecture:] Yeah, I just... sorry, I couldn't
2 remember exactly before we presented to City Council pre-screening meeting, but after we
3 worked with the Planning Department Staff and the recommendation and the communication.
4 So, we put more percentage to lower income, that direction, overall. Yeah, that was the
5 direction change.

6
7 Vice-Chair Chang: Great, thank you. Thank you, that's exactly... I just want to make sure we
8 were responsive. Thank you.

9
10 Chair Summa: I see our City Attorney, did you have...?

11
12 Mr. Yang: I just have an answer to Commissioner Chang's [note – Vice-Chair Chang] question
13 earlier about how ownership program works.

14
15 Vice-Chair Chang: Thanks.

16
17 Mr. Yang: Alta Housing does an annual check for owner occupancy but there is no income re-
18 verification for ownership units. The only requirement is that you're eligible when you purchase
19 the unit and then when the unit is sold. It's sold at that affordable price again.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Summa: Thank you for that.

2

3 Commissioner Templeton: [unintelligible – off mic]

4

5 Chair Summa: I'm not seeing any other lights but I have a few questions. Do all the units have
6 private outdoor space, meaning balconies in this case?

7

8 Mr. Donahue: Yes.

9

10 Chair Summa: They do, okay so I heard two different things and then the garbage and loading
11 area are in the public parking part of the street. Is that correct?

12

13 Mr. Donahue: The pickup zone yes, is in the public right of way and so we're asking for
14 permission to use those zones for the limited time that would be required to get the trash out.

15

16 Chair Summa: Okay.

17

18 Ms. Kallas: And if I can just add, Staff has not yet approved the specific trash pick-up plan. It is
19 likely to change.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Summa: And the loading, okay because... and the reason I'm concerned about that is
2 because of future needs for safe bikes lanes in this area... on the street. Then I may have... I
3 forget where I saw this and I may have it wrong. Are the rear and the front setbacks counting as
4 shared open space?

5

6 Mr. Donahue: We typically do not count... you're not allowed to count areas that are for
7 circulation of any kind as part of your open space calculation.

8

9 Chair Summa: Okay, so the answer is no. Okay I (interrupted)

10

11 Mr. Donahue: I'm going to need to verify that we didn't do it because we shouldn't have but
12 because it's emergency access there's stipulations that say you cannot count this.

13

14 Chair Summa: Thank you for that. I thought I saw that somewhere but I can't locate it now
15 between the various documents and then this is a question that's kind of general in nature. So,
16 maybe it's for Staff but at what height level do buildings need to be accessed in emergencies by
17 a ladder truck? Do we know?

18

19 Mr. Donahue: I can answer that.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Summa: You can?

2

3 Mr. Donahue: Yeah, it is... it's a function of two things. One is the height, but it's also the
4 construction type. This particular building is Type 3A and what that really means is that all of
5 the exterior cladding and the structural members have to meet a certain Fire Code longevity if
6 you will, 1 hour, 2 hour. And so, in that case, the fire department does not require you to
7 provide aerial access to the windows because they know they have enough time to go into the
8 building and rescue people from inside the building whether than approaching it from the
9 outside. That's part of the reason that we don't have a fire lane all the way around the building
10 because aerial access is not required and that is purely a function of how fire proof the building
11 is.

12

13 Chair Summa: Okay, thank you. It was kind of specific to your building in fact. Okay, I am not
14 seeing any other lights, so I think we can go to members of the public. Ms. Dao, do we have
15 people in the room or online?

16

17 Ms. Veronica Dao, Administrative Assistant: I have not received any speaker cards or raised
18 hands.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Summa: No speaker cards, okay seeing that I guess we will just take it back to the
2 Commission. So, time for discussion and/or more questions. I'm seeing that Commissioner Akin
3 would like to go.

4
5 Commissioner Akin: This time I'll wrap up what I started. The only other thing I wanted to
6 mention that I thought was particularly work while was that it managed to achieve all this with
7 relatively few Zoning Exceptions. It could have been considerably more extreme and we got
8 some value for the concessions that are being requested here.

9
10 There are two questions that I specifically want to refer to the ARB, so since we're making
11 comments for their use as well. One is the court yard is essentially a bottom of a 60-foot deep
12 well and I wonder if that's going to be appealing to the residents. So, I'd like the ARB to give
13 that some thought.

14
15 And two, a lot of effort has been made to modify the massing of the building but I would like
16 the ARB to consider whether it's compatible with 788 next door.

17
18 Now the remaining comment I wanted to make is just a general one because I worked the
19 numbers and was surprised and just thought it would pass it along. The mix of BMR unit types
20 in this project is really very good, but like all projects of this kind, there aren't nearly enough

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 units total. So, we're fighting this financial issue as well as trying to establish what our policy is.
2 So, just as an observation, if every project that's brought before us has this ratio of BMR units.
3 We'd need 253 of them to meet the RHNA requirements, so you can see how far we're falling
4 short on what we would like to see.

5

6 Commissioner Reckdahl: [off mic] Requirement for affordable [unintelligible].

7

8 Commissioner Akin: For affordable, yeah for affordable, so just something for us to keep in
9 mind as we try and provide policy guidance in the future. Thank you, that's all.

10

11 Chair Summa: Thank you. Let's go to Commissioner Templeton.

12

13 Commissioner Templeton: Thank you. I appreciate the discussion that Commissioner Akin is
14 starting on the policy area. Just to provide some context, 20 percent is awesome, like very few
15 projects can come in at 20 percent and this one has met it which is a high bar we've set for the
16 City. So, the... from my perspective, yes we need more. It's worth acknowledging that they have
17 come in at a very high bar which many projects in the area don't meet. So, it is a relief to see a
18 project that's starting at what we've asked of them so that's good. It is also interesting to hear
19 that you've been able to add another unit so that's something to acknowledge as well. I, for

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 one, appreciate the applicant taking that approach and would love to see more applicants do
2 that. I think that's what the City is asking of people, so yeah that's my thought on the matter.

3
4 In general, I appreciate the proposal and definitely excited. I think that the ARB is going to have
5 some comments on this and it may look different when we get it back. But one thing to
6 celebrate in this initial design is that we have natural light and patios in is it all the units. Was it
7 nearly all or all? Yeah, it... yeah, so that's something just to clarify the presentation because we
8 heard two different things.

9
10 **[Note - unknown male speaker:] [unintelligible – off mic]**

11
12 Commissioner Templeton: Only if you want us to look at it next time but I'm just celebrating
13 that it's nearly all or all. Let's start there for now, but the idea of being able to have that much
14 natural light and access to the outdoor fresh air is really important and I want to highlight that
15 as something that I like.

16
17 So, I'm just roll through a few things that I like and like some others here, just highlight some
18 questions that still remain. I also appreciate we have a sample of your textures here and colors
19 and I think they're very exciting. I like the ideas that you've put forth in your design and

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 especially making it look more homey and townhome-y than a giant block house for example.

2 Right, you've taken the time to do that and that's very nice.

3

4 Like Vice-Chair Chang, I really do hope we find a way to keep that greenery on the street front.

5 This area, for the benefit of anybody listening who might be familiar with this street, we... has

6 gone through a lot of changes that... especially on the street side landscaping over the last

7 decade or so. Where we've lost a lot of trees, we replaced some trees, we did some landscaping

8 and we know we've got some more work coming up on that road. So, it's really nice to see that

9 you're keeping that greenery in mind because it does make it look homier so thank you for that.

10

11 Regarding the location and I sort of anticipate that maybe we'll see more development on the

12 Mountain View side that we might find they want to pursue homes there. I'm not exactly sure

13 and it's not relevant to our discussion, but I think in general that whole area that's industrial

14 may change more towards residential in the future and being able to corporate with the

15 neighboring properties is a nice precedent to set so I appreciate that as well.

16

17 I think Vice-Chair Chang mentioned this but just to acknowledge it. That you have a mix of sizes

18 here. Some of the proposals we've seen have been a lot more smaller properties and I see

19 you've got some family-size units and that makes me very happy. There will be likely more

20 discussions in the future if... as we see more residential units in the area around schools and

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 safe crossings and things like that. So, we hope you, as owners, will participate in those
2 conversations about how we can have safe crossings and less congestion.

3
4 The underground parking garage, like Commissioner Akin I'm hopeful that it's all going to work
5 out but we have seen a few of these be problematic. So, you know, contingency plans galore for
6 the parking situation and then just want to echo the concerns that Vice-Chair Chang mentioned
7 about the trees.

8
9 She's right, that is exactly the open space dearth in the area, is exactly why I asked the
10 questions about the roof and I understand now why it's not practical in this scenario because of
11 the egress. So, thanks for explain that, but I do hope you can brainstorm with the ARB about
12 any reasonable way to consider that, that wouldn't exacerbate your cost or height issues
13 although, I realize that's a bit much of an ask.

14
15 So, in general, I think there's a lot to celebrate in this proposal. I'm very glad to be reviewing it
16 and not as apprehensive as some of the proposals we've seen. So, I can tell that you've put a lot
17 of care into addressing the needs of our community and appreciate you bringing it forward. So,
18 that's my comments, thank you.

19
20 Chair Summa: Commissioner Chang [note – Vice-Chair Chang].

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Vice-Chair Chang: Hi. I to was really pleased when I looked at the size of the units and the
3 affordability table once I created it because I didn't see it on my own. And really, really pleased
4 to see that there were seven units set aside for very low income, so 30 to 50 percent of AMI
5 and then another five, two bedrooms for 50 to 80 percent of AMI. So, that is fantastic and then
6 pleased to see that there are two, three bedrooms so family size units at 80 to 120 and another
7 two, two bedrooms at 80 to 120. So, that's... and when I... I always so this analysis where I look
8 at what income that actually represents and whether that would actually mean housing for
9 teachers or is it truly affordable and those would truly be affordable. So, it would still be
10 difficult but it's within reach and so I was really pleased to see that.

11

12 I was also pleased to see that the bike storage was on the ground floor because in the garage is
13 just, you know unless there's good elevator access and everything. It's not really feasible for
14 what looks like... you know families are going to be here and likely kids riding bikes, so really
15 glad to see that.

16

17 Also, glad that when I asked the questions about patio encroachment in the rear setback. That
18 it's a very slight encroachment because as Commissioner Templeton mentioned. I do foresee
19 that in the future it's likely that on the Menlo Park... Menlo Park, now you've saying, Menlo
20 Park. On the Mountain View side that there's going to be a residential development there as

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 well and so I would... it sounds like there's going to be a decent amount of space; if on the rear
2 side that there's also a patio or a balcony that won't be balcony to balcony, 5-feet apart, so I
3 think that's looking good there.

4
5 And I think that this location is the right place for some added height because it's not
6 overshadowing much lower residential neighbors. So, I think that that's really important.

7
8 The things that make me a little bit nervous are this area of Palo Alto is a bit of an urban heat
9 island. So, as you move into the southern part of Palo Alto, it's noticeably warmer than the
10 northern part of Palo Alto because the trees are younger and smaller and it is noticeably
11 warmer. And if you get towards San Antonio, it is really hot, so if you get onto the other side of
12 San Antonio onto the Mountain View side. If you've gone to Costco in the summer, it's roasting.
13 It's really hot because there are no trees or very few and they're... and so I don't know what we
14 do about that but I think this is a larger question and larger planning question for us as a City.
15 It... I'm not quite sure how we solve this problem because if we want this density I don't see
16 where we necessarily put the trees, but I want to see if there's any way to creatively make it
17 cooler. So, I didn't look at the roofing materials and green roofs, school roofs, what you can do
18 there, but we want to make sure that this part of Palo Alto and Mountain View isn't roasting
19 hot and a fundamentally different place to live for all the many people who are going to be
20 living here.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 And another concern I have is if we put a... so while it's within walking distance of Costco. I
3 don't think anybody can realistically walk with a Costco-size toilet paper bale. So, really a need
4 at minimum a bicycle but that's also difficult. So, what I'm saying is that this is a
5 transportation... if difficult on San Antonio. Transportation is difficult and as I think about
6 school-age kids trying to cross over to get... this is a PAUSD... people living here would be going
7 to PAUSD and as I think about them trying to get to where our schools are. They'd have to cross
8 San Antonio. Ideally, we're going to have bike lanes there at some point. We, as a City, need to
9 plan to have bike lanes there and one of my concerns would be that if our loading zones for
10 trash, for FedEx deliver are in the bike lane, if we eventually have a bike lane there. That could
11 present a real problem, so I worry a little bit long-term circulation impacts for this property as
12 well as every single other property that may be developed there.

13

14 And then finally, while I think the affordability is amazing if I sit there and actually do the math.
15 I... this is... you know, we're already getting a lot but my understanding is that when we take say
16 something like 20 percent affordability or in this case 21 percent. We're suppose to evenly
17 divided the number of units. So, if there's 15, three-bedroom units, our goal usually is then to
18 have 20 percent of those three-bedroom units affordable. Is that correct, Staff?

19

20 Ms. Kallas: Yes, I need a second to see what the comments where about that.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Vice-Chair Chang: And I understand though that we are going for deeper affordability here so maybe there's some negotiation there.

Ms. Kallas: Yeah, so in our review we determine that they do need to change one of the one-bedroom units to a three-bedroom to meet the affordability mix.

Vice-Chair Chang: Okay, great because that was exactly my concern too is that there's 15, three-bedroom units. So, then doing the math, one more three-bedroom unit should be affordable. So, yeah great, thank you.

Chair Summa: Commissioner Reckdahl.

Commissioner Reckdahl: I have a couple more questions here. I'm looking at L-1 and up near the driveways there's drivable grass. Can you explain the reason? Can the applicant explain the reason for the drivable grass near the driveway?

Mr. Donahue: So, I believe you're talking to the area that is immediately to the south of the driveway?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Reckdahl: Correct.

2

3 Mr. Donahue: That's part of our stormwater program, so inside the perimeter of the garage
4 there's no chance for us to infiltrate the ground. Since we're required to have a plaza in front of
5 the building, a portion of it is designated as permeable so that that water can reach the soil.

6

7 Commissioner Reckdahl: So, it's not so much that you're adding drivability to grass but you're
8 adding grass to a patio or plaza.

9

10 Mr. Donahue: It's really a way of doing a permeable plaza element, yes.

11

12 Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay. I have also a question about the stacker. How reliable are
13 stackers? I don't have a feel about that. Is it they break down once a year, once a month? What
14 (interrupted)

15

16 Mr. Donahue: No, I think the track record is depending upon the brand that you buy. They're
17 actually fairly simple devices. They really comprise a motor and a cable that lifts and it seems
18 really impossible because cars are heavy, but in fact, they're not that heavy compared to other
19 things. So, the more reliable lift systems that we've seen, there may be a maintenance call

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 every couple years and usually, if they're worth they're salt they have an on-call maintenance
2 crew so that they're there in a couple hours. You can imagine if your car is stuck (interrupted)

3

4 Commissioner Reckdahl: Yes.

5

6 Mr. Donahue: That gets people very excited and so we have definitely seen that the ones that
7 are still in business, like for instance KLAUS is one of the more popular brands. It is precisely
8 because their devices are so reliable and I would liken it to like a passenger elevator. You don't
9 want that thing to be breaking down. You want it to be reliable all the time. The technology is
10 somewhat similar.

11

12 Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay, thank you and then during the Council discussion, pre-screen,
13 one of the Council Members asked about solar panels on the roof.

14

15 Mr. Donahue: Yes.

16

17 Commissioner Reckdahl: Did you investigate that at all?

18

19 Mr. Donahue: Oh, you know I contemplated bringing the roof plan because at the end of the
20 day, the roof is actually packed with things and so this somewhat addresses the why's there no

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 roof deck as well. The new Building Code, the new CALGreen Code is much stricter about how
2 much solar and when you install it. And so, we have large areas of solar designated and then all
3 of our mechanical equipment will live up there as well. We're using very efficient system,
4 variable refringent flow which is highly efficient and allows you to do multi-tasking with the
5 energy. For instance, you can heat water with it as well as cool the building and then they can
6 do double duty. They can work during the winter and the summer so they both heat and cool.
7 All in the effort to make an all-electric building which is another one of our goals.

8
9 The... I can't remember if Palo Alto is one of the municipalities that's already passed the no-gas
10 rule but we're essentially designing all of our buildings to be hooked up to the grid because of
11 how green it's getting. And so, all the appliance packages, all the heat pumps, all the water
12 heaters are electric water heaters. All of that is being incorporated.

13

14 Commissioner Reckdahl: So, would you be able to add solar panels on the roof?

15

16 Mr. Donahue: Yes, we have plenty of space for that.

17

18 Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay, but it's not in the baseline design?

19

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Donahue: You know, the baseline I believe is 15 percent of the roof surface. When you start
2 looking at things like the maintenance areas, the mechanical, the elevator overruns, you're
3 already starting to get... and then the clearances that you need around the solar panels and the
4 equipment. When I looked at the roof plan earlier, it's packed. Now could we probably get
5 more solar panels in, I believe that could.

6

7 Commissioner Reckdahl: So, you will have 15 percent of the roof covered by solar panels?

8

9 Mr. Donahue: I think that's the Code minimum, I'll have to double-check the number. It's 15 or
10 20.

11

12 Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay, that is good, but is there any reason you couldn't put solar
13 panels raised above the mechanical equipment?

14

15 Mr. Donahue: You know, you can, it's just a question of efficacy because some of the
16 mechanical equipment you have to raise it quite a bit because there's a plumb of hot air
17 coming out of it which the panels don't like. But if we're really trying to shove as many beans as
18 possible in the bag, we can look at all kinds of possibilities.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Reckdahl: Is there anything structurally or electrically that would prevent this?

2 So, let's say 5-years down the road you wanted to add it. Have you painted yourself
3 (interrupted)

4

5 Mr. Donahue: No.

6

7 Commissioner Reckdahl: In the corner or you have the flexibility to add it?

8

9 Mr. Donahue: No, as it turns out the primary concern with solar panel installation is penetrating
10 the roof membrane just because leaks but. In terms of their load, they're relatively light
11 compared to most others... like I think the roof even has to have a live load capability that can
12 handle that dead load.

13

14 Commissioner Reckdahl: That's all I have for you, thank you. I have a question for Staff, I also
15 am concerned about the greenery. We're making good use of this lot but that also means there
16 no room for greenery. What are the restrictions for planting in that front setback? Could you
17 add bushes, could you add some type of greenery up front, or can you not plant anything?

18

19 Ms. French: There's allowance for vegetation. I think when it gets to be problematic is when
20 there's trees that start to send roots if you're putting basement and such nearby. You know,

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 you have to careful about all that and you know, of course, anything that's put into an
2 easement, which this isn't, but would be cautionary.

3

4 Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay and then you also mentioned the cost. There was an in-lieu fee if
5 they weren't able to plant all the trees onsite. What is the cost of that in lieu fee? Do you have
6 a rough number?

7

8 Ms. Kallas: I can look that up. It's something that would be in the Tree Technical Manual. It's
9 part of the Urban Forestry Department regulations rather than planning, so I'm less familiar
10 with where to go looking for it.

11

12 Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay, I don't think we need to know it now but next time it comes
13 back I would like to know how much that costs because that's a policy issue also. If that price is
14 too low then we're really encouraging people not to plant trees but okay. I'll hold my
15 comments and let everyone else take a shot at it first.

16

17 Chair Summa: Commissioner Lu.

18

19 Commissioner Lu: Well, yeah, I'll just make some quick comments. I really liked the project for
20 all the reasons other people have mentioned and just I hope we can build housing there soon.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 A few specific comments, I do like the size actually and personally, I wouldn't mind more
3 housing though that might be a fringe position. I also like that there's not too much parking and
4 on the point about potential issues with underground parking. I would personally much rather
5 remove parking than have the podium at street level and really just distract from the street.

6

7 Couple of points to note, I quadruple, quintuple the point on greenery and I live above a
8 parking garage. We have small maple trees, yucca trees, jasmine bushes, a variety plants.
9 Maybe I should be worried, but I think reconsideration of the landscaping would be great.
10 Especially, in the area up front where there are a lot of low-laying shrubs. We could add
11 something that feels and looks more green.

12

13 And the last point is I don't want to get stuck on retail since I realize that could be a big change,
14 but any consideration of retail would make a huge difference in the long run for the
15 neighborhood. It really needs more third spaces and retail that's not giant big box stores or
16 chains.

17

18 Chair Summa: I don't see any other lights so I'll make a few comments and I just want to thank
19 the applicant and our Staff for their presentations and for bringing this housing project to us; to
20 the applicant and there's a lot of good in that, but I have some questions and problems.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 One thing and some of this is for Staff and our process, and some is more for the applicant, but
3 one thing is I think all the bike storage is in the bike room in front, 76 spots. That strikes me and
4 I don't... I didn't see but maybe there's other private storage area for the units, but I didn't see
5 it in the plan and that strikes me as a very limiting number of bicycles. Especially since you were
6 good enough to provide family-size units here. I don't know where anyone else would put their
7 bicycles. You could have three or four kids in a three-bedroom apartment and we want people
8 to bike and so that seems limited to me.

9

10 Also, there's only about half of the parking spots have electric chargers. I'm not sure if they can
11 be added later or if they can't be put in where stackers are, but that seem very problematic
12 also. Especially since the City wants new multi-family buildings to be 100 percent electric and
13 while it's not taking away from all the other stuff being electric. It's not providing that option
14 for all the residents and I don't know how you would decide who got to use the EV spots and
15 who didn't and that just sounds complicated to me.

16

17 I think to... some of my colleague's concerns about trees and landscaping I would agree and in
18 general, I'm not at all convinced that one shared open space area is adequate for a building this
19 size. Especially given that there will be families there with children who have nothing they can
20 walk to, nowhere they can walk to play. And I note that four... two sides of the shared open

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 space have the patios, private patios abutting them. So, that seems kind of strange to me but it
2 seems like the outdoor open space is very limited where... in a neighborhood where there are
3 few options. I would have been very interested in applicants wanting to provide useable retail
4 for residents on the ground floor as we develop in this area. Only because there is actually not
5 much that's walkable in any practical way and if everybody did it. It would create a new
6 environmental of walkability and usability, but if nobody does it and we don't require it. It's just
7 going to be a dead zone in that regard.

8
9 Let's see, I am very troubled by using the public right of way for... that is for parking on the
10 street for loading and garbage because I think... well first of all, I think it can be very awkward
11 given the traffic on the street. Garbage trucks are really wide and there's a lot of traffic and grid
12 lock in rush hour on the street. San Antonio onto 101 there is a real... is a problem on ramp that
13 we've been trying to get fixed for years because it's very old-fashioned and backs up and
14 doesn't work well. People already living on San Antonio and there's another residential use on
15 San Antonio, Altaire, just a little further... closer to 101 already experience a lot of difficulty with
16 the traffic there.

17
18 And then, I for one, I have to say while we all appreciate what you've brought here today. I
19 was... I'm disappointed that the extension of the HIP to this area and the Development
20 Standards and that that offered was not enough. And now you want even more than 788 which

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 is... hasn't been built but has been entitled and I'm worried that as we go through
2 developments in this area. Each one will want more based on the fact the applicant before
3 them would want more and that's certainly not an applicant issue. That is a planning issue and
4 a policy decision issue for ultimately to Council.

5

6 Some of my questions have already been answered. I'm very concerned that in this area with its
7 underlying zoning of CS and the extension in for 9 ½ acres or 18 parcels I think it was. To extend
8 the HIP to get housing to change from what, light industrial to housing, that we don't have... we
9 haven't thought about extending any extra privacy and Daylight Plane protections to this area.
10 Because as buildings get bigger than the one next to them, that's going to become an issue.

11

12 I find 5-foot side setback to be unreasonably small and I think the project would be more
13 successful with more open space around it. I worry that with the loading and... I worry about
14 the future for our City of finding a way to put safe Class 4 I think is the best class bike lane. Even
15 with the 24 special setback being kept because are you really going to want... I mean both bike
16 lanes might need to be developed on one side of San Antonio. I am not sure, nobody has looked
17 at it in detail yet but would you really... it makes the building entrance unusable except from
18 accessing inside the garage if the bike lane is heavily used and it also makes the building right
19 on a bike lane. So, I think these buildings would be more successful if they had a more standard
20 residential, multi-family setback which I believe is much bigger but I can't remember what that

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 is right now than 24-feet. But like I said, that's a City and policy and Staff question, that's not for
2 the applicant.

3

4 But I guess I'm not sadly as excited as some of my colleagues are about this as I see this project
5 specifically and it's not because there's a problem with the project. But there's the same issue
6 with the one previously that got entitled here and that is we are entitling these projects that
7 will limit what we can do to widen and make San Antonio safer and more accessible for bikes
8 and pedestrians and I don't think that's what we want to do.

9

10 So, let me see, I do have another light so I can stop speaking and I'll Commissioner Reckdahl
11 speak.

12

13 Commissioner Reckdahl: I just wanted to give my two sense. Yeah, this is a big project and big is
14 good in that it's 76 units and that's 76 families that will have a house. So, that's really good and
15 that's why I'm supportive of this. There are the same things that give me a pause. We are
16 building right up... you know, the setbacks are tiny. There's no room for trees or greenery. We
17 have the look of it, the massing will be large and you've done a good job of breaking it up and
18 hopefully, the ARB can help you with that, but that is a concern that we have 5-feet on the side
19 and 10-feet on 78 [note – 788]. There's two buildings that are going to be 15-feet apart, that's
20 going to be tight but again we're adding a lot of units and that's a plus for this.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 It also is near the East Bayshore Job Center. Google is adding a lot of jobs and the units that we
3 put over there means the people have a short commute. They can bike or even walk to their
4 jobs and so that's a good thing. I like the affordability, I like this true affordability. It's just not a
5 bunch of micro units they've discounted. These are real units that are affordable and I also like
6 the fact that there are units that are size for families. That's a really good thing.

7

8 The two biggest complaints I have aren't on the applicants, it's on us. Is that we don't have any
9 existing bike lanes and we have no nearby parks. I mean when you look at this type of dense
10 housing there's no backyard here. There's no place that you can throw a ball with your kid. That
11 has to be done in a park now and we have no nearby parks. And so, we really do have to take it
12 seriously that this is not the only high-density area... high-density development that we're going
13 to have in this area. We need to be adding parks nearby because if... especially with these
14 family-size units there are going to be families that need outdoor activities.

15

16 So, but overall, even with all those bad things, I think this is a good design and I hope that we
17 can make it work. Thank you.

18

19 Chair Summa: I'm going to call on Commissioner Templeton in one second but I'm also going to
20 note that the Housing Element had... Housing Element has maximum and realistic anticipated

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 number of units; which for this site was 40 and 27 anticipated. And we're getting a lot more
2 than that which is great but we don't need every single site that gets developed to be that... to
3 be three times or two times or whatever it is the Housing Element to the detriment of how the
4 people living in this new neighborhood, residential neighborhood, are going to experience life
5 which could be... I think Commissioner Chang [note – Vice-Chair Chang] said it. It was in terms
6 of heat islands but could be very different than the way other people in Palo Alto experience
7 life. Even in multi-family dwellings, multi-family buildings so I just want to keep in... once again,
8 that is not directed at the applicant. That is more directed at us and what we're doing in the
9 City and what we're... how we're communicating with applicants.

10

11 So, I wanted to add that because I forgot to say it and then I will move on to Commissioner
12 Templeton.

13

14 Commissioner Templeton: I appreciate the Chair's comments. I echo the need for dealing with
15 San Antonio and this area has suffered from serious planning and transportation neglect for
16 decades. I remember talking about improving the flow, which is the Chair mentioned as well,
17 over in this area which requires coordination and corporation with Mountain View when we
18 were improving that intersection of Charleston at San Antonio back when I first joined the
19 Commission. This was a long time ago and the feedback we heard from Staff at that time was
20 that's Mountain View, but as we start developing this corridor and adding more people. It's not

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 going... if it's not industrial, we're talking hundreds of more people, maybe if we're lucky
2 thousands of more people will be housed in this area that we have used for industrial purposes
3 in the past. So, I would ask Staff when you come back just to let us know what kind of planning
4 is happening for the flow, the transportation part, the corporation part with the neighboring
5 cities and things like that. I think that will really help us. Also, to address the questions because
6 how do we evaluate this project in the context of what it's going... what this areas going to
7 change into right? It's not like it use to be. We need to use it for something else now so if
8 there's anything wireless can do as a Commission to encourage more focus there. We'd love to,
9 especially the biking.

10

11 So, what we talked about at that time, maybe 5-years ago, was a bike path, which we've got
12 now down Charleston to San Antonio, but now we need to be able to go either way on San
13 Antonio Road. Especially, if we're expecting people who will reside in these properties to work
14 in the Bayshore office parks. So, getting the bikes over 101 is terrifying, I've done it, I learned
15 my lesson. It's really scary, so you know, we do have the options for what is it, Fabian crossing
16 but that's also about a mile detour, just throwing that out there.

17

18 Anyway, so regarding the trash on the street. I don't know, is that something the ARB will
19 address, or is that something you want us to address because we got opinions on it and we all
20 want to share it? I put my trash on the street. My street isn't as busy as San Antonio Road. It's

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 really an apples-to-oranges comparison but I understand why that's the proposal. That's where
2 our services offer to pick up the trash, right? So, we need to figure out how to meet the needs
3 of our utilities while meeting the needs of the people that are using this major, major road. So, I
4 think that was a good point that everybody brought up, but I'm not against it. I'm just saying
5 that needs to be thought through and it sounds like that's on the docket for you guys anyway.
6 That's something you're still looking at?

7

8 Ms. French: Yeah, that would fit nicely into the... what the ARB considers when it looks at the
9 findings for functionality and [unintelligible].

10

11 Commissioner Templeton: Look at that, the ARB's going to handle it.

12

13 Ms. Kallas: Well, and as I mentioned earlier, the Zero Waste Department has not approved the
14 current arrangement yet so it is still under discussion.

15

16 Commissioner Templeton: So, I think, just if I'm phrasing correctly, what sentiment you're
17 hearing from this body is input to that conversation is don't mess up the flow of traffic. Like do
18 what you got to do but let's try to not cause a distraction there.

19

20 Chair Summa: And leave room for future protected bike lanes.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Templeton: Yes, I think the whole protected bike lane discussion is huge and bigger and needs more attention. So, if is that something we want to... it's not agendized. How do we... other than this commentary, how do we let you know we really want to talk about that?

Ms. French: Well, as the PTC Liaison, I can certainly let transportation know if they're not still on the call. We can have future sessions (interrupted)

Commissioner Templeton: We love them, we always want them here and we always want to talk about this stuff. So, yeah, I think it's actually going to become urgent and problematic if we don't address it ahead of time.

So, anyway, are we... do you want a motion?

Chair Summa: I don't know that we need a motion, even though it's an action item. I was going to ask Staff because this was really a first step. It's going to come back to us for a recommendation to Council, up or down, with conditions or whatever we come up with. Do you want a motion that contains all these various thoughts or are you good and Albert, I see that Albert Yang is here to give us advice.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Yang: So, I'll just say that we'll... we'd like at least a motion moving it forward to the ARB.

Chair Summa: Okay, that's... alright so we need a motion to move towards ARB with all our comments.

MOTION

Commissioner Templeton: I would be happy to make that motion to move it forward to ARB with all our comments.

Chair Summa: Thank you and is that okay for everybody or does anybody have any more comments before we move to the motion? No, okay thank you. Do I have a second?

SECOND

Commissioner Reckdahl: Second.

Chair Summa: Thank you, so we just need to vote on that then.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 VOTE

2

3 Ms. Dao: Commissioner Akin?

4

5 Commissioner Akin: Yes.

6

7 Ms. Dao: Vice-Chair Chang?

8

9 Vice-Chair Chang: Yes.

10

11 Ms. Dao: Commissioner Lu?

12

13 Commissioner Lu: Yes.

14

15 Ms. Dao: Commissioner Reckdahl?

16

17 Commissioner Reckdahl: Yes.

18

19 Ms. Dao: Chair Summa?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Summa: Yes.

2

3 Ms. Dao: Commissioner Templeton?

4

5 Commissioner Templeton: Yes.

6

7 Ms. Dao: Motion carries 6-0.

8

9 MOTION PASSED 6(Akin, Chang, Lu, Reckdahl, Summa, Templeton) -0 -1 (Hechtman absent)

10

11 Chair Summa: Thank you very much. Would my colleagues like to take a short break before the
12 next item? Yes, okay. We will take a short break for 7-minutes, thank you very much.

13

14 [The Commission took a short break]

15

16 **Commission Action**: Motion by Templeton, seconded by Reckdahl. Pass 6-0-1 (Hechtman
17 absent)

18 3. Review the Permanent Installation of the Traffic Calming Pilot Project in the Crescent
19 Park Neighborhood and Recommend to the City Council for Approval.

20 Chair Summa: And we will move on to our next item which is about the traffic calming issues in
21 Crescent Park. So, I believe the first thing we should do is get a Staff report.

22

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Ripon Bhatia, Senior Engineer: Good evening... ah, I can start whenever you are ready.

2

3 Chair Summa: Oh here. We are ready.

4

5 Mr. Bhatia: Good evening honorable Chair and Commissioner Members. Ripon Bhatia, Senior
6 Engineer with Office of Transportation. Tonight, before you we are hear to seek PTC review in
7 proceeding forward a traffic calming project in Crescent Park neighborhood.

8

9 A brief background, the residents of Crescent Park neighborhood expressed their concerns
10 about the cut-through traffic, congestion and speeding. That led to the development of a pilot
11 program for traffic calming with improvements at various locations. PTC approved the pilot
12 project in September of 2020 and that later that year in 2020 Council granted approval to
13 proceed forward with a pilot program. Staff designed and constructed the improvements in
14 summer of 2021. Staff conducted the post-installation survey of the traffic conditions and
15 sought feedback from the neighborhood community in fall of 2022, a yea after the
16 implementation and collected data that revealed improvements in the traffic conditions. The
17 project also garnered support from this community to proceed with a permanent
18 improvements. So, therefore, Staff is now requesting PTC to review and support the review and
19 approval of recommending to proceed with a design for permanent improvements to the City
20 Council.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

I'll now hand it off to Chirag Panchal who has been managing this project and will share the additional details of the project.

Mr. Chirag Panchal, Associate Transportation Engineer: Thank you, Ripon. My name is Chirag Panchal, Associate Transportation Engineer with the Office of Transportation. Let me share the screen, slides. Can you see the slides?

[note – unknown male speaker:] [off mic] Yes.

Chair Summa: Yes, we can.

Mr. Panchal: This is the presentation about traffic calming project Crescent Park neighborhood. Staff recommends that the Planning and Transportation Commission reviews and recommends to the City Council for approval of the permanent installation of the traffic calming pilot project in the Crescent Park neighborhood.

Project information, the initial goal for this project was to improve the safety and quality of life, minimize the travel speed during on and off-peak hours, minimize the cut-through traffic during the peak hours in the Crescent Park neighborhood area.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 This slides shows the brief area for the Crescent Park project. It's a bit bigger than that but this
3 is more of a location focus. That's why I took the snap shot of this. This is the traffic calming
4 measures that consultants and the Staff came up with for the traffic calming and it's already in
5 place right now as a pilot project. The first one is we are seeing here is by the East Crescent
6 Drive and Southwood Drive. This is the three-way stop stops at the Southwood and East
7 Crescent Drive curb extension improvement. An oval shape traffic circle, which I'm sure if you
8 have driven by at this location, you might have seen this pilot oval shape by the Hamilton
9 Avenue, Sandel Drive and Southwood Drive. The third location is at the west Crescent Drive and
10 the University Drive 50-foot protected bikeway. There are currently fortifiable bollards that
11 protect the bikers on the University Avenue.

12

13 Location number one is the Southwood Drive and East Crescent Drive. This is the traffic calming
14 project that... at this location that Staff and consultant came up with to reduce the speed and
15 cut through traffic. This is... as we can see it's temporary, the location has been in place right
16 now.

17

18 The second location is the... just give you the picture and the idea of the oval shape and how it
19 looks like if no one has seen or no one has driven by. This is the oval shape circle and it's been

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 effectively working. I have driven a couple of times over there and then also observed after the
2 post-pilot project installations of this oval shape.

3
4 Location number three is University Avenue and West Crescent Drive. Here we can see the four
5 bollards here that protect the bikers biking on the University Avenue, especially during the peak
6 p.m. peak hours. What's happening over here is that a lot of cut-through traffic was going to
7 the West Crescent Drive, making a right turn and jamming into the... into this bike lane and also
8 causing bicycles to move around.

9
10 Before I go into the size I want to talk about that the average. The Staff collected the pre-pilot
11 and post-pilot data and average volume on Hamilton Avenue reduced by approximately 35
12 percent. The University Avenue reduced by six percent. The average volume on East Crescent
13 Drive and Center reduced by about 23 percent and every speed on Center Drive reduced by
14 about 81 percent and keep in mind these are the average. We [unintelligible] the data log
15 presented by the consultant as well.

16
17 Moving forward to this slide, we also... after we saw the pre and post-pilot data collection and
18 we saw the improvement. The Staff thought it is necessary to ask... to get a word from residents
19 since their word matters and that's their neighborhood. So, location one, we collected the word
20 for an overall neighborhood as well as the area, the focused area neighborhood as well. So,

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Southwood Drive and East Crescent Drive, which was the location number one, curb extension
2 and a stop sign, 74 percent said yes, 26 percent said no. On location number two, Hamilton
3 Avenue, Southwood Drive and Center Drive, oval shape circle, 78 percent said yes and 22
4 percent no. So, the majority of the residents were in the favor of converting this temporary
5 improvements to permanent improvements at this location in this Crescent Park neighborhood.
6 And I want to reiterate that the design that we are seeing here, it's temporary. It's not
7 aesthetically pleasing looking right because we are in the pilot project phase right now.

8
9 As a next step for this project, we will be... Staff will be seeking the Council approval for
10 permanent installation after the PTC recommends and based on the PTC voting and approval.
11 Staff will also initial the design for permanent improvements if everything after the City
12 Council's approval. During that period of time, Staff will outreach... reach out to the community
13 and seek feedback on the planning and designing. And that's where the residents will be able to
14 vote and have their say on the design, and how the traffic calming is pleasing, and what they
15 need too... what the Staff or the City needs to include in order to fulfill their... any questions or
16 any concerns they have. In the meantime, the temporary improvements will remain in the
17 place. The Staff do not think that it is time to take out because we are moving in with the
18 permanent installation if it is approved.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 And at this point, this concludes my presentation and if you have any questions I'll take the
2 questions. Thank you so much.

3

4 Mr. Bhatia: And just to wrap up I just wanted to also add to the fact that yeah, certainly
5 neighborhood feedback and fronting property owners will be involved as we design these
6 improvements when we do the... if it goes through the permanent installation. And also, this...
7 these features help not only in the traffic calming but also improve the safety at these locations
8 or in the neighborhood. So, that concludes our Staff report, thank you.

9

10 Chair Summa: Thank you for that. I see that I already have a light from Commissioner Akin who
11 must have a question.

12

13 Commissioner Akin: Yeah, I've got a couple. So, the residents original concerns were about cut-
14 through traffic but did we do an origin-destination or some kind of zone study to get a big
15 picture sense of where the traffic really is coming from and where it's going, Mr. Panchal, I
16 guess?

17

18 Mr. Panchal: Sure, I'm going back to this slide where it shows the picture. So, what's happening
19 was that the cut-through traffic was majority coming toward the Hamilton Avenue and going
20 towards the West Crescent Drive or the Center Drive and... or moving forward too. So, these

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 are the tree main parallel streets, that's where the cut-through traffic was mainly going through
2 and we don't know. At one point when I was driving from here I was also... I also once used the
3 cut-through traffic just to get the feel for it, how the traffic get congested and whatnot.

4
5 The other also... the second point I also want to make sure to get it because I also work on the
6 engineering side and the signal. So, there's a signal on the Woodland is not... for the signal is
7 not owned by us. Its [unintelligible], I believe it's East Palo Alto and that coordination also
8 causes the jam on the University p.m. peak and this is before the Covid I am talking about.

9
10 So, to answer your questions, these are the cut-through traffic that we saw as a major impact
11 on the neighborhood.

12
13 Mr. Bhatia: And Commissioner Akin, if I might add? We looked at the pre-volume data on these
14 locations and after-pilot project installation data. So, we compared the pre and post, so we
15 didn't do an origin-destination but we just did a comparison of pre and post-data on volumes
16 that were being at these location. And we do understand that there may be some skew
17 because of the Covid, but there was overall degrees and that's what we noted.

18
19 Commissioner Akin: Thank you, Mr. Bhatia, you've moved exactly into my second question
20 which is the Fehr and Peers Report said we can't separate the pandemic effects from the

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 project effects. So, I was curious as to the confidence level you had in the traffic volume effects
2 of the pilot.

3
4 Mr. Bhatia: Yeah and we cannot say with great certainty but we have noticed that on major
5 freeways and major facilities, the traffic has returned back to pre-pandemic level. Though not in
6 the local levels at the same rates so there is certain level of volumes that may be [unintelligible]
7 to... a reduction due to the pandemic. Also noting that these features are not only reducing the
8 traffic but also improving the safety. So, if they are to use these intersections, they will be much
9 more safer to use.

10
11 Commissioner Akin: Thank you, those are the two questions I had.

12
13 Chair Summa: Commissioner Chang [note – Vice-Chair Chang].

14
15 Vice-Chair Chang: Thank you. Do... does Staff have a sense of for the... you know when the
16 residents were... when the residents voted and there's 20 odd percent who said no, they did
17 not want the pilot turned into permanent features. Why those 20-odd percent said no? Was
18 there any open-ended feedback for that or has Staff received comments?

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Panchal: Sure, I can answer the question. I'm the one who piloted the comment. The
2 majority of the... out of those 20 or 24 percent... 22 percent and 26 percent no, the majority of
3 them said that the aesthetically pleasing... it's not aesthetically pleasing. So, they thought this is
4 it, there is nothing forward that the City is going to do with it and that's what the majority of
5 the comments that we received.

6
7 Vice-Chair Chang: Thank you and then what is the sample size here or approximately? What's
8 100 percent? How many people?

9
10 Mr. Panchal: So, we're looking at about 319 house... the residential household here and the
11 data is based on the 319 residential households. Each household can only vote one.

12
13 Vice-Chair Chang: So, you're saying that you got about 390 respondents?

14
15 Mr. Panchal: Yeah, about that.

16
17 Vice-Chair Chang: Thank you.

18
19 Mr. Bhatia: I would... back to the... I think [unintelligible] you can correct, the number of
20 respondents where less than that.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Panchal: Yeah, I want to clarify that. The... so we... the zone... the project boundary was 319, about that size but the voting card we received was not the 314. It's less than that. I don't know the exact number on top of my head.

Mr. Bhatia: I believe it was a little less than 50 percent, but yeah, there was good participation from the neighborhood.

Vice-Chair Chang: Okay so at least a third participated?

Mr. Bhatia: Yes.

Vice-Chair Chang: Okay perfect, thank you.

Chair Summa: Commissioner Reckdahl.

Commissioner Reckdahl: I'm looking at the traffic counts here, how much variability is there from day to another or from one week to another? So, if I go on Tuesday and count the traffic and come back the next Tuesday and count again. How much variability do you expect in that? Is there a rule of thumb that you have?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Panchal: Correct me if I'm wrong Ripon but the way we count the traffic is usually on Tuesday, Wednesday, Thursdays. So, that's when we have the highest traffic count variable and then Tuesday, Wednesday, Thursday depends on the project, depends on what area focus that we are doing. We take even highest of the Wednesday so let's say there were 1,7000 cars on... vehicles on Thursday and there were 2,000 on Wednesday. So, we would go with 2,000 but depends again on the project. Other projects we might take an average of all three days but to answer your question. We would take... we would count on... we place the data collection for Tuesday, Wednesday, Thursday.

Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay.

Mr. Panchal: The... sorry to answer you question is from one week to another week, the traffic does not differ that much from one week to another week from Tuesday, Wednesday, Thursday and the next week Tuesday, Wednesday, Thursday. But I do want to confirm that the Staff takes the data when the school is in session when the weather is good. If there is something off then we would cancel the data and try to collect the data when it's clear weather, everything runs perfectly as normal conditions. Correct me Ripon if I'm wrong or if you want to add this to this data collection or to this question.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Bhatia: No, you summarized it pretty good, but Commissioner Reckdahl to answer your
2 question. Generally, a peak day mid-week is representative of a regular day in general and
3 don't vary a lot; within 5 percent.

4
5 Commissioner Reckdahl: You think a [unintelligible] of 5 percent, so when we... my concern is
6 that we have two samples here and how much of it is causation? How much of it is just
7 randomness and are we trying to look at randomness and trying to look at trends... formed
8 trends from randomness? Okay, thank you.

9
10 Chair Summa: I have a couple questions. One is so was the University Avenue, maybe I missed
11 something, was that also the bollards to protect the bike lane? Was that also some how voted
12 on by neighbors?

13
14 Mr. Bhatia: No, we excluded that from the voting process since those are more likely actual
15 traffic calming device... traffic control devices and also, they are... we were intending on
16 keeping that moving forward with or without traffic calming because they have been a safety
17 measure as well.

18
19 Chair Summa: Thank you for that and then is the plan when they're made permanent with two
20 and three, the rubber curb and the oval area, to be landscaped?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Bhatia: We would seek input from the residents and community in moving forward with the design of those improvements. Generally, we would like to have some kind of aesthetically pleasing elements to match with the community surroundings and environment. And depending upon the budget and availability we will balance those needs.

Chair Summa: So, I think they would be much more successful and safe...the oval especially but I think devices like that in the street are safer and more pleasing to look at when they're landscaped. So, that would make them successful for me and then asking about something that Commissioner Akin asked about.

Given the inability to separate the pandemic effect from non-pandemic times. Would it be better to do another year or some period of time of the trial?

Mr. Bhatia: Certainly, we could extend the period of the pilot program but like I said we can leave [unintelligible] some safety features as well. So, yeah it's the... suddenly a feasibility... feasible option.

Chair Summa: Alright, I do see any other lights so I'd like to go members of the public. Do we have speakers Ms. Dao?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Ms. Veronica Dao, Administrative Assistant: Yes, we have two in-person speakers. The first is James Girand.

Chair Summa: And do we have any out in Zoom land?

Ms. Dao: Oh yes and one raised hand on Zoom.

Chair Summa: Okay, thank you for that.

Mr. James Girand: Thank you. There's another Zoom person. My daughter is standing by and would like to also make some comments after I'm finished. And I've live at 590 East Crescent which is right at the berm on... you might put location one just for graphic (interrupted)

Mr. Bhatia: Next slide.

Mr. Girand: Just a second.

Mr. Bhatia: Chirag, if you can pull the slide... Page 9?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Panchal: Location one?

2

3 Mr. Bhatia: Yeah.

4

5 Mr. Girand: There you go, that's... see I live just beyond the berm and I have to say that I hope
6 you consider that for people who are directly effected like myself and others as opposed to
7 further away. That people who "skimmed the game" if you will I think certainly should have a
8 higher degree of consideration compared to people who just aren't effected that much.

9

10 And that said, I've lived at 590 East Crescent Drive for 43 years and I have an office that is just
11 literally looks right out on this berm here and so I see a dynamic situation. I think as good as the
12 pictures are there's a static nature to them as you would have to see but I... so I'd like to read a
13 text that I've prepared and then my daughter who also oversee a lot of my activities. That she'd
14 like to speak afterwards, so with that I'll say as follows.

15

16 I'm opposed to the installation of the berm at this intersection of location one. My home looks
17 out on a giant oblong berm the City has temporary installed at that intersection. I can speak
18 with experience regarding the results of this attempted traffic calming.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 There are three primary reason I am opposed to the berm. It's not safe. I see it on a dynamic
2 basis as opposed to a static basis and statistics are one thing, but on the other hand, just
3 observe the activity and the dynamics of the traffic. I see it all the time in real-time. I an attest
4 that the berm has create new and worse traffic issues. Traffic safety is [unintelligible] this
5 intersection. Since this temporary berm was installed on August 2021... excuse me, since this
6 temporary berm was installed on August 2021 I regularly observed and have collected footage
7 video if you're interest of the effect that the berm has is bad on traffic. Drivers are not stopping
8 at the new stop sign on East Crescent. I see it all the time. The signs are there but the dynamic
9 is they're not stopping. Instead, they're allowing... they're slowing only slightly, if at all, and
10 often swerving recklessly on an attempt to navigate around the barrier. On East Crescent, the
11 berm makes the intersection two narrow for two cars to safety pass each other. I witnessed
12 near collisions repeatedly over the past year and a half.

13
14 There are no other berms of this size in any other residential neighborhood in Palo Alto. The
15 Transportation Office admitted that there's no other intersection where a berm of this size has
16 been implemented. The Transportation Office did not test out less obtrusive measures of
17 slowing traffic at this intersection such as the installation of a stop sign with out the berm.
18 There's been no commitment for the Transportation Office regarding how this berm will be
19 completed. Will it be filled with cement? Will there be landscaping in the middle of it? The
20 Transportation Office said that it might be filled with cement which would be an unsightly blight

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 on our beautiful tree lines streets in Crescent Park. I don't understand how the Planning
2 Commission can now vote to implement the berm with out any thought as what the final design
3 of it would look like. Thank you for your consideration but I just have to say, personally, not in
4 my text here, but just living it. I hope I have credibility with you because I see it just daily. I see
5 it, have for the last couple years and it is just a mess right now and period. So, with that, I'll ask
6 if... can we let my daughter speak on Zoom? Lisa Lawson, yeah.

7

8 Chair Summa: Okay and could you give us your name? I didn't catch that.

9

10 Mr. Girand: Oh sure, James Girand. I've lived here... lived there for 43 years, I live alone and like
11 to see my beautiful area remain beautiful.

12

13 Chair Summa: Okay and Mr. Girand's daughter is signed up right?

14

15 Ms. Dao: Yes, she's the person (interrupted)

16

17 Mr. Girand: [off mic] Lisa Lawson.

18

19 Ms. Dao: Yes, Lisa Lawson is the one who's on Zoom. You can unmute yourself, you have 5
20 minutes.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Chair Summa: Okay, thank you.

Ms. Lisa Lawson: Hi, can you head me okay?

Chair Summa: Yes, we can.

Ms. Lawson: Great, thank you, so my name is Lisa Lawson. I am one of the property owners of 590 East Crescent along with my father who's lived there for 43 years. In addition to the safety issues raised by my father, Mr. Girand. I'm deeply concerned about the lack of thought give to less unsightly and extreme measures to slowing traffic at this intersection, intersection number one.

The Transportation Office could have simply tried installing a stop sign at this intersection, which would have been in keeping with the look and feel of the neighborhood. They've offered statistics about the alleged slowing of the traffic along East Crescent but as the Commissioners have noticed, there are no statistics regarding whether slowing could have been achieved with other less extreme measures such as simply installing a stop sign. They've had the opportunity to measure the traffic calming effects of such a stop sign compared to this berm but they didn't do that. Instead, they went ahead with the berm design that has never before been

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 implemented in any residential neighborhood in Palo Alto. Initially, when they installed it they
2 actually installed it in an even larger format that blocked my father's, who's disabled, access to
3 the handicap ramp to his house from the street to the sidewalk and we had to have numerous
4 meetings with them in order to that changed.

5
6 This leads to my second issue which is that the statistic, as the Commissioners have noted, of
7 the alleged traffic calming at this intersection are misleading. The City's post-berm statistics are
8 based on measurements taken in the summer of 2022 compared to speeds measured in 2019.
9 It's clear that the reductions in traffic volume and speed that the Transportation Office claims
10 as a result of the berm where in fact the result of an unprecedented global pandemic, and
11 relatedly sharp reduction in the number of commercial tenants downtown and the fact that
12 workers are increasingly working from home. If cut-through traffic were truly reduced by the
13 berm at East Crescent and Southwood. One would expect the traffic would be diverted onto
14 University Avenue. The City's statistics however do not support that theory.

15
16 I am also deeply concerned about the Transportation Office failure to provide any proposal as
17 to how this berm will be completed and how it will be filled in as Mr. Girand has noted. In
18 listening to the Commission's extensive discussion regarding the first item on tonight's Agenda.
19 It is clear that aesthetics of the City's planning projects are critical for assessing whether they
20 should be approved. I do not understand why the Transportation Office has failed to offer a

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 solution for how this project will actually be executed. Will this berm be a peninsula filled in
2 with beautiful flowers and trees, or is it going to be a massive concrete structure? If it's going to
3 be filled in with plants, we heard Mr. Bhatia comment that executing it will depend on budget.
4 Well, if it's going to be filled in with plants, how will the City get water to it? It seems unlikely
5 that they will be able to fill it in with plants and we'll be stuck with a giant cement berm at this
6 beautiful intersection.

7

8 I also want to note that the photo that Mr. Panchal showed of this intersection is warped and
9 that it does not show the extent of the actual berm. The Transportation Office has birds-eye
10 views of what exactly this berm show or exactly how this berm is laid out. And it is significantly
11 greater than how it appears in the photo that Mr. Panchal showed in his PowerPoint
12 presentation.

13

14 I also want to touch on one of the issues that Mr. Panchal and Mr. Bhatia spoke to with... which
15 is with regards to the vote. As they noted, the vote that they showed the statistics for included
16 neighbors that don't even cross this intersection and therefore, have no "skin in the game" as
17 my father would say and have no real meaningful way of commenting on whether the traffic is
18 improved or has become more dangerous. And I think that's all I have for now.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Summa: Thank you. If any of my colleagues have questions for you, we will let you know
2 but why don't you take a seat in the meantime? I believe we have another speaker.

3

4 Ms. Dao: Yes, last speaker is Greg Welch.

5

6 Mr. Greg Welch: [off mic] Thank you. First of all, I'd like to thank the Staff of the transportation
7 department. This has been a journey we have been on for, gosh over 4 years at this point;
8 approaching 5 years. It was motivated by the observed conditions that the collective
9 neighborhood was experiencing. It is not nearly about the vehicular traffic. It is also about the
10 pedestrian traffic. If you are in Crescent Park in the morning, you see literally dozens and
11 dozens and dozens of people out exercising, walking their dogs, etc. And the pedestrian
12 situation frankly, before these traffic calming measures were put in place, were treacherous at
13 times. Particularly, during the rush hour commute hours.

14

15 A couple comments, first of all, the... during the lengthy process that the transportation
16 department ran. They did over three public workshops attended by as many as 120 people from
17 the neighborhood I think was the peak attendance. They looked at a whole variety of different
18 measures that could be taken. They also educated us on the difference between traffic calming
19 measures and traffic control measures. Stop signs are a traffic control measure. Berms,
20 roundabouts, curb extensions, these are ones and the big thing there was that these physically

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 slow down traffic and do not require a policemen standing there in a patrol car in order to
2 enforce.

3
4 With regard to the data collection, we would all love to have perfect data. In fact, during the
5 process, there was a big and long examination about what other sources of data we could get.

6 There were companies out marketing data drawn off of cell phones. The more you look at
7 those, they give the illusion of being perfect data but when you plug in and drill in a little
8 deeper. You realize all you're doing is sacrificing maybe one set of accuracy for another set of
9 sample bias. There were also budgetary concerns associated with buying that kind of data set.

10 The trials that were used by the transportation department are consistent with the excepted
11 traffic planning norms. Let's talk about the impact of the pandemic, you know we don't have an
12 alternative universe were we can conduct a control experiment. So, there was actually a lot of
13 debate about should the experiment proceed and the key thing is that part of what of the
14 debate looked at was not just overall volume. But the change in the pattern, because the real
15 issue previous to this trail was the fact that the main thoroughfare was actually not where most
16 of the traffic was going. In fact, there was data that was in the Stanford did a very, very
17 comprehensive study before this that showed that Hamilton was carrying 35 percent more
18 traffic at peak hours than University. And it was in part because what was happening is all that
19 traffic was contributing to the back up on University because it was cutting through a
20 residential neighborhood, rejoining University right up before the creek crossing and there by

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 backing University up. The key thing to bare in mind is yes, the overall volume in our City has
2 gone down, but it's not gone down equally. The reduction on University is only six percent, the
3 reduction on Hamilton is more like 30 percent. So, if it's not the traffic calming that contributed
4 to that difference, what is it?

5
6 So, as a resident, as somebody who walks their dog multiple times a day at morning and
7 afternoon hours. I can say without reservation I feel safer. Talking to neighbors, they feel safer,
8 particularly at the five-corner intersection. It was like a demolition derby there before. People
9 would rush in, there was no sense of who was supposed to go next, how do I make the left?
10 Now, are there shortcomings with the temporary designs? Yes, and even I think the
11 transportation department would admit to those short comings because it was just a test.
12 There were real limitations imposed upon what they could do under the budget of a trial and
13 without configuring the whole intersection.

14
15 I think you also, if you ask them, if you said do the intersections conform to anything
16 approaching the standards for modern intersections that put pedestrian safety first. They
17 would have to admit they don't. One of the reasons why there was a reference to the handicap
18 access, it's because they're in the wrong place. They're actually not at the crosswalks. The
19 handicap access dumps you into the middle of the intersection, so it would require, and expect
20 that the transportation department as it looks a permanent instillation, it's a well thought out,

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 comprehensive redesign of these intersections. So, that they meet modern standards for
2 pedestrian safety as well as vehicular traffic flow. So, I also share my neighbor's concerns about
3 the aesthetics. We don't want this to look like something plunked down a highway interchange
4 in the middle of a residential neighborhood, but I think we can point to plenty of examples
5 where the department has implemented very attractive, landscaped traffic calming measures
6 elsewhere in the City. And I have no reason to believe why this neighborhood would be any
7 different, so I encourage you to at least allow this to progress to the next step because I know
8 that you're not sitting here today approving a final project because there's no design. This is
9 just simply allow a process that has taken us 5 years to get to here with hundreds and hundreds
10 of residents coming together and spending hours and hours and hours with City Staff to just
11 continue on a process to improve our neighborhood. Thank you.

12

13 Chair Summa: Thank you. Is that our final speaker?

14

15 Ms. Dao: Yes.

16

17 Chair Summa: Okay, thank you. I guess I already have a light here from Commissioner
18 Templeton.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Templeton: Thank you, Chair. Yes, it's very interesting to see this, how it played
2 out because I was... this again was one of the projects from 2018 I think that or thereabouts
3 that was one of the first ones I worked on as well. And I think we were really hopeful for this
4 project and it sounds like some of the data supports that and it's also interesting that some of
5 the way data has been presented tonight doesn't tell the whole picture. So, I really appreciate
6 the people from the neighborhood sharing their thoughts.

7

8 I have brought up a picture from Google Maps of what that berm looks like at point two and
9 that was shown earlier and I wonder if one of the people from the transportation department
10 can show. It does give a very good sense of the size and scope of that area. The size of the berm
11 and why someone who lives close to that and interfaces with it might be frustrated. Are you
12 able to bring that up using street view?

13

14 Mr. Bhatia: Chirag or?

15

16 Commissioner Templeton: For the benefit of my colleagues here, if you are able to bring that up
17 it's worth the wait. I think it will be informative.

18

19 Mr. Bhatia: I'll try to bring it up.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Templeton: Yeah.

2

3 Mr. Panchal: I got it Ripon.

4

5 Mr. Bhatia: Okay.

6

7 Commissioner Templeton: Excellent, can you proceed around the corner where you're looking
8 at the back of the stop sign?

9

10 Mr. Panchal: Let me know when to stop.

11

12 Commissioner Templeton: You're going the wrong way. Okay.

13

14 Mr. Panchal: Let me know when to stop.

15

16 Commissioner Templeton: If you can see the back of the stop sign that's within the berm then
17 you're looking at the right angle, the correct angle. So, you need to proceed further down East
18 Crescent and then rotate towards the house.

19

20 Mr. Panchal: Sure.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Commissioner Templeton: Yeah, so it's [unintelligible] to swing around to get in and out of that
3 building. It does go adjacent to the walkway and it's large and is visually distracting from
4 the beauty of the landscaping of the home. So, just wanted to validate that we're seeing that
5 and also to echo some comments from the public that how can we really know if it's going to
6 continue to be an eyesore like this until we have designs until we okay designs and so that's the
7 kind of the crux of the question before us for this particular site.

8

9 I will say that the stories we heard back in 2018 were pretty compelling about why this was
10 dangerous. You heard some echoes of that tonight. Now, are there things that could be
11 improved? It sounds like we have some first-hand reports of ineffectiveness of the stop sign
12 that's controlling car traffic there and potentially that's an area for us to include in the study,
13 right? So, if we're able to specifically request that, not only proceed with the planning and
14 visualize what the designs might look like but also to improve the effectiveness of that control. I
15 think we could specify that in our motion tonight if we want to.

16

17 Regarding the irrigation, one of the things we've been trying to work on as a City is to irrigate
18 less and plant native plants more. So, that you have something that's beautify and hardy. So, I'd
19 love to hear more thoughts on that from the... my fellow Commissioners, but I do feel like that's
20 a solvable problem. That we make it beautiful for those that encounter this every day and see

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 this intersection and experience it. To make it beautiful and integrate into the neighborhood so
2 that not only are cars actually stopping but what they see when they're there, and pedestrians
3 too, is beautiful.

4
5 So, I think all I can say is how much I appreciate people coming and sharing their thoughts
6 because I think this is a yes and situation. We need to solve both problems, so that's my initial
7 thoughts, thanks.

8
9 Chair Summa: Commissioner Chang [Note - Vice-Chair Chang].

10
11 Vice-Chair Chang: Thank you to both the or all three public comments. Really appreciate the
12 additional color that brings and I, as a result, have some additional questions for Staff. So, do
13 we have accident reports from at this intersection from before hand and after because our first
14 commenter mentioned seeing accidents here?

15
16 Mr. Bhatia: Good even, Commissioner Chang [Note - Vice-Chair Chang]. To add to that, I just
17 ran a poll with limited information that we have from in our database after the installation.
18 There was one hit and run with a... on damage... there was no damage to any and to this. So,
19 there was only one collision that was reported since the installation.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Chang: And so how long has this been installed again and during the similar
2 timeframe beforehand how many accidents where there?

3

4 Mr. Bhatia: Let me run the one before. There was... let me get back to that one as I run the
5 information, but (interrupted)

6

7 Vice-Chair Chang: Sure.

8

9 Mr. Bhatia: I can see if we can answer other questions.

10

11 Vice-Chair Chang: Okay and then in the mean time I'll ask a second question of Mr. Panchal. Can
12 you review the process for what happens if this project moves forward in terms of the design
13 process? And then what are the steps or the review processes this goes through before actual
14 implementation if it goes... if we move this project forward?

15

16 Mr. Panchal: Sure, let me go back to (interrupted)

17

18 Vice-Chair Chang: There was a slide I think that you had.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Panchal: Yeah, so at this point we don't have the in detail of steps inside of what will be the
2 steps. For example, we'll seek first City Council approval for the permanent installation and if
3 that moves forward. Then the Staff will initiate the design for permanent deployments and at
4 that phase, we'll work with the consultant and the outside parties to develop the scope of the
5 permanent design and also we will look into the budget options as well.

6
7 There are also some information that we need to look at as an engineer regarding the irrigation
8 pattern, regarding how the permanent design will work, how it... any... completely based on the
9 design. For example, if we look... if we go back to this one, so we want to make sure that the
10 debris doesn't fall inside this curb if we were to make this as permanent. So, let's assume for
11 now this is a permanent so if the debris goes inside, which I drove by there and then we could
12 see it. So, we would have to look into that as well to see who's going to be responsible for it. So,
13 its completely based on the design how we proceed to move forward with that. So, that is the
14 phase, the second phase that we are looking into it.

15
16 Then once the design phase is 60 or 75 percent based on how the Staff feels during the
17 meeting. We'll reach out to the community, so we would have a leeway of going back to the
18 consultants, say that hey, we received this few feedback from the residents and then what if we
19 make this changes? What... if we make these changes how would it look like and what are some

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 concerns that we would come across or what is some litigations that we have to take into
2 account if we go move forward with the design?

3

4 Again, we also want to focus on the budget as well to how much budget we have because we
5 could literally go with the \$2 million... we could make it a \$2 million project or we can make it
6 half a million. Our project depends completely on the design phase and (interrupted)

7

8 Vice-Chair Chang: So, is it going go... is it... so when City Council makes the approval for
9 permanent installation. Does City Council make a budget determination as well and will it come
10 back to any body for permanent approval or is that permanent... is the design approval
11 ultimately made by Staff?

12

13 Mr. Bhatia: Let me take that question, Commissioner Chang [note – Vice-Chair Chang]. So, our
14 intent is to seek feedback from the community in determining the elements that should be...
15 that are important to the community before we seek the consultant support for the design
16 efforts. And we could have... we could take certain... we would have certain level of those
17 elements incorporated in the concept plans, in the development of the various options or
18 alternatives and we will develop a budget accordingly. And then seek feedback from planning
19 and PTC and the City Council was we move forward. And then also at the same time, make sure

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 that our community is involved in the process with the... for the outreach feedback and input as
2 we make the design.

3

4 So, at the initial level, at the time of the approval, after PTC approval we would have a
5 concept... we would go to the Council, get their approval to proceed forward with the design.

6 Seeking input from the residents, have various concepts at and then develop some cost
7 estimates and then seek a direction.

8

9 Vice-Chair Chang: Okay so it would come back to PTC, is what you're saying?

10

11 Mr. Bhatia: We will certainly be able to come back to PTC.

12

13 Vice-Chair Chang: I guess my other question is can we also study... in this design process can we
14 study the effectiveness of the stop sign or multiple ways to implement the stop sign itself?

15

16 Mr. Bhatia: We can certainly look into it. The effectiveness of the stop sign is generally difficult
17 to because you would need more monitoring and we can look into the possibility of how we can
18 study it. And if there are ways to do it we will certainly look into it and bring back to the
19 Committee [**Note – Commission**].

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Chang: Thank you. I will say that one of the things that I am... as a comment. I am
2 appreciative of the fact that there's a pilot in place because there are other situations
3 elsewhere in the City where the City has not been responsive to safety concerns. And I'm really
4 glad that in response to this neighborhood's concerns, even though it's taken this long and even
5 though some of the solutions may not be optimal. That there actually is something being done
6 and I commend Staff on that. I'm glad to see that there's temporary pilot berms put in place
7 when we didn't do that for other things like Charleston and such. So, that's it for right now,
8 thanks.

9

10 Mr. Bhatia: And I have an answer for your collision data from before, so from 2016 to 2018
11 there were three collisions that were reported and that were reported in the [unintelligible]. So
12 that's the data I'm looking at right now and there was one from (interrupted)

13

14 Vice-Chair Chang: What was the timeframe again?

15

16 Mr. Bhatia: From 2016 to 2018 there were three collisions at this location. So that is prior to the
17 implementation and since the implementation, there has been one and no other party... there
18 was only one party involved so.

19

20 Vice-Chair Chang: So, that's an apples-to-apples timeframe?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Bhatia: No, it's not because we don't have any much timeframe after the installation because we have only installed it in 2021.

Vice-Chair Chang: Yeah, I understand that. Okay, so it's not an apples-to-apples timeframe and it's also not apples-to-apples because there was a pandemic. Got it, okay thanks.

Chair Summa: Commissioner Akin.

Commissioner Akin: I'm going to delve into the policy issues again for a minute here because this is something that's near and dear to my heart. The Comp Plan and Goal T-4.2.1, where it requires us to evaluate traffic in residential areas periodically with the goal of prioritizing traffic calming projects. We're looking at one instance where we finally got around to doing that today but as Vice-Chair Chang said. There are plenty of instances of this elsewhere and more importantly, there are instances of this that none of us know anything about because the measurements don't exist. So, at the very least, we need baselines.

Taking a momentary deep dive into the data from this project. Lincoln Avenue between University and Hamilton had traffic 24-hours a day. The count was 1,480 vehicles which is above the neighborhood traffic calming project threshold of 1,200. There's a problem already

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 there that we're not doing anything about. The average for all the neighborhood streets in this
2 study was traffic 22.4-hours a day. So, what's gradually happening is that our local streets and
3 collectors are turning into defacto residential arterials and we just don't where it's happening
4 and how quickly.

5
6 So, the policy implications here are that we need to do... we need to find a way, and I
7 understand the financial implications are difficult here. We need to find a way to do what the
8 Comp Plan requires and get those baselines so we can monitor what's going on because this is
9 happening all over. We just don't know where and how seriously.

10
11 With respect to this project in particular, I'm extremely supportive with the warning that this is
12 just another round in a game of whack-a-mole. We'll be back with more issues in this general
13 area before too long. So, let's keep in mind that we have to take appropriate actions but in the
14 background, we should be doing better about finding a general solution. Thank you.

15
16 Chair Summa: Commissioner Reckdahl.

17
18 Commissioner Reckdahl: Yeah, I was not on PTC at the time, so how did we chose these three
19 locations and how did we chose these three techniques? For example, why did we not consider
20 or did we consider speed bumps for example, or other traffic calming measures?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Mr. Bhatia: Commissioner Reckdahl, sorry I was also not part of the team originally and this...
3 my understanding is that there was a rigorous community input and outreach as Mr. Greg
4 Welch also pointed out in his comments. That there were several community outreach
5 meetings, feedback and input in support of the consultant in finding the different locations. And
6 it narrowed down to the three locations for the final configurations that was community's...
7 that would garner community support in moving forward.

8

9 Commissioner Reckdahl: Cari [note – Commissioner Templeton], did you have...?

10

11 Mr. Bhatia: So, I'm (interrupted)

12

13 Commissioner Templeton: If I recall, at the time, we had a transportation specialist on our
14 Commission that contributed to the discussion as well. So, it was certainly it came from
15 community conversation... the reason it came in front of us was community conversations like
16 Mr. Bhatia said but also, I think we were interested in trying things at the time because we had
17 some additional expertise to consult. But that doesn't mean... like it's been 3-years after we
18 voted on it before it got implemented. The pandemic happened and we don't know for sure
19 that we picked the right ones. We do know that there are some improvements. We don't know
20 if other variables would improve it more, improve it less, change it in nature. So, I think that's...

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 there's a lot of unknowns but it is good that we did a rapid prototype, like if you can call it rapid
2 in 5-years. I was really shocked when I read the Packet and realized that it had been this many
3 years after approving it before it was implemented. So, just keep that in mind, like there's a
4 grain of salt with how we should be looking at it and what we should expect. So, I hope that
5 answers you (interrupted)

6

7 Commissioner Reckdahl: Yeah, that was helpful.

8

9 Mr. Panchal: I would like to add to Ripon's comment on this one. Strictly speaking from
10 engineering point of perspective is that the reason why the consultants and the Staff came up
11 with this... the recommendations and narrowed it down to three is because the community
12 raised the concerns. And when the community concerns, those specific concerns are related to
13 what traffic calming would be a better choice and that's how the recommendations and the
14 reasons are made. And then the traffic are chosen after what the symptoms are as an oral in
15 the neighborhood from the first meeting. I was new at that time so I don't have much of the
16 background as well but this was my two sense on the engineering side of the point of
17 perspective.

18

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Reckdahl: I have a lot of concerns about this. I mean overall, I think we have to
2 address traffic here. I don't think there's the question is the best way to do it and we can't think
3 that we can get a perfect plan. And if the... don't let the perfect be the enemy of the good.

4
5 I'm not convinced that this is... that we have data to support that this is the right thing to do
6 right now. When I went out there, the roundabout, I'm surprised that wasn't a roundabout
7 years ago. That seems like the right answer for that intersection.

8
9 For this bulb out, I'm not convinced that that's... I can see that having a shallow corner, people
10 could take that faster but I'm surprised that we did this in the sense that I don't think it would
11 be that effective compared to example a speed bump.

12
13 I'm also concerned about the whack-a-mole. If you look at the stats, we have seen Lincoln get
14 more traffic and I suspect that some of the traffic that was coming down here has been moved
15 to Lincoln. And so are we just now going to create another problem and the people on Lincoln
16 will have to come back and say you have to address this.

17
18 The other thing is that these are really ugly right now and I'm concerned about putting concrete
19 because if we don't have much money. We're going to do the really ugly, cheap versions and
20 we're going to make matters worse. For example, the bulb out, if you filled that with concrete, I

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 would not want that in front of my house. If filled with flowers, maybe I would want it and so I
2 think the final design is very important, very critical to say whether we want it. If we can't fill
3 that flower or that bulb out with flowers or something that's pretty. Then we should be looking
4 at speed bumps or something else.

5
6 But if we could... so there's a lot of tradeoffs here and the other thing is the City does not have
7 a lot of money right now and I think two issues with that. One is we have higher priorities
8 elsewhere we can spend this money and I don't want to be forced into making something really
9 ugly just because that's all we can afford.

10
11 So, my personal preference would be to kick this can down the road another year and let's see.
12 People are going back to the office now and maybe we'll get another count a year from now
13 where we have much better clarity about how well this is working, so I don't see the rush. I do
14 think this is an issue and I think we do need to address this but I think we have to be thoughtful
15 of this and not just say well it's time to make a decision.

16

17 Chair Summa: Commissioner Lu.

18

19 Commissioner Lu: A couple quick questions. Was there any pedestrian or cyclist data on any of
20 the intersections?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Commissioner Templeton: Transportation Staff, that's questions for you.

Mr. Panchal: We did not collect the pedestrian or the bicycle data since the initial... the concern was the cut-through traffic speeding and the unsafe driving behavior. So, we were... the concern was came specifically from the vehicle point of perspective, not the pedestrians or the bicycle point of perspective.

However, we did want to take into account for the bicyclist and that's why we chose the number... location number three by the University and West Crescent Drive. To protect the bike lane and that's... we thought that bikers are may be at risk due to this driving behavior and cut through traffic.

Commissioner Lu: And can Staff give context or talk about the literature or best practices around turning radiuses and whether the tighter turning radius materially makes that intersection safer, or it there's an industry standard expectation that like tightening the turning radius will reduce accidents by X percent on average? Is there any data or best practice or study here?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Panchal: So, in general, for the radius, from engineering... strictly speaking from the
2 engineering point of perspective, when we were doing the pilot installation. We wanted to look
3 at the fire trucks. Make sure the fire... emergency vehicle access is cleared. We want to make
4 sure the garbage truck can easily go through that, so those are the biggest radius that we would
5 encounter. And during the design phase before the pilot, we did the radius calculated from the
6 consultants to... and sent it out to us to make sure that everything moves. In a sense, all size of
7 vehicular move efficiently through the bulb out and as well as the oval-shaped circle.

8
9 So, to answer your question we could have bigger but then the fire truck would not be able to
10 move. They would have to move over the oval shape and we would have to design based on
11 that as well.

12
13 Mr. Bhatia: To add to the question Commissioner Lu, is that yes? The greater the radius on the
14 intersections, the higher the speeds generally because it gives easy maneuver ability for making
15 the turning moments. So, what Mr. Panchal was saying was more towards the traffic circle
16 radius, but your question may be more pertaining to the curb returns and the greater the
17 radiuses. Usually that poses more incentive to speed through the intersections because it
18 makes it easier to travel. So, in residential and in downtown and in more business district areas,
19 the practice is generally to reduce the radiuses to a practical means that an accommodate the
20 vehicle movements and also tighten the radius to the maximum feasible.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Lu: Thank you.

Chair Summa: Commissioner Templeton, do you want to go again or? Okay go, then I'll go.

Commissioner Templeton: Okay, sorry just following up on some of these questions. So, first of all, the comments from Commissioner Akin and Commissioner Lu are exactly on point. Like the data we've been measuring has only been vehicular data and that is not the origin of the complaint primarily. The origin of the complaint is the pedestrian/vehicular conflict, right? So, we do need to be able to measure that and it sounds like there's not only a discussion about traffic calming but we also have a discussion about the control that's not effective. And so, I'm wondering if you have collected data that would substantiate what we've heard from our eye witness who sees this multiple times a day from his office. Have you been able to see how effective that control is?

Mr. Bhatia: Chirag, have you... been to that intersection notice any through-the-stop sign maneuvering?

Mr. Panchal: Can you repeat the question regarding the last few sentence? Is it regarding the previous stop sign at the Southwood/East Crescent Drive?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Templeton: Yep. Yes, so we had a testimony tonight from a public comment about someone who oversees from his office the challenges and problems with people compelling with that traffic control, the three-way stop sign, at point number two on our maps. And if... first I want to know have you observed that and if so, what are we doing about it and if not, why not?

Mr. Panchal: Sure, I did observe it. I did go multiple times before the pilot installation. The Y intersection is... and you could before the installation you could swirl around and I have seen many drivers would swirl around that from Crescent Drive to Southwood Drive and basically a cut-through traffic. After installation, I drove multiple times as well and I have a big car. I drove pilot as well I drove City car, all kinds of stuff and then just wanted to get the feel for it because on paper it looks different when you go into the field it's completely different. So, I noted the point down that the residents mentioned its to tight. Well, we can definitely look into the design and this where... this is the reason why we wanted to go to the... we wanted to have a pilot. We don't want to put in a permanent because this is the kind of challenges and issues come in. So, we can add a just a little bit here and there. So, just to have the curb cut... sorry not the curb cut, the design, the bulb out is to reduce the radius and the width of the intersection. So, that way it forces the drives to slow down and so does the stop sign effectively works on that.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

The second point I noted was that the stopping sign and I think the resident mentioned that people are not stopping. I think that's more of a poor driver behavior or the code enforcement issue. If there is a stop sign, I think it's the CVC Code that vehicle... the drivers must stop before they proceed.

Commissioner Templeton: Yes, I mean, okay. Fair enough, yes people should obey the controls that are there, but if we're saying that this traffic calming bulb out, or whatever we want to call it is, is designed to make it safer. I think we can understand why somebody would be frustrated if stop signs were still being run and if there was something our design could focus on that would have higher safety impact than what we've done. So, that's I think the question and the reason I'm going through this is because we have, and this addresses Commissioner Reckdahl's comments. We have the ability to move this forward but there's a chance and possibly a high chance that if we do move it forward. That the design process will think oh, we're approving the design that is been implemented during the pilot and I think there are problems with that design. That's what we're hearing from the neighborhood is sure, I'm all about traffic calming, pedestrian safety, but we've heard about how it's ugly. We can address that in the design process, but we haven't explicitly yet tonight talked about maybe it's not the perfect design in terms of traffic calming and maybe there was something we can explore. Like do we have to do

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 with... if we move forward tonight, do we have to go with the design of the traffic calming thing
2 that's there, or can we get feedback from the neighbors about what needs to be improved?

3

4 Mr. Bhatia: Commissioner Templeton, if I may add, we can work with the residents and
5 community to come up with improving the existing... the design in the pilot program. Such as
6 curb radius, maybe add an element or other thing. On aesthetic wise, like what Commissioner
7 Reckdahl and Commission had indicated, about aesthetic elements that should be part of the
8 incorporated. In order to proceed forward to the extent that's feasible and drought resistance
9 like you were mentioning already that we need to be focusing on. So, we will look at those
10 elements and can incorporate and at the time when we bring back the concept plan after
11 seeking input from... feedback from the community. We can, at that point, before construction
12 because the design on paper is different and so we could seek that input and feedback at that
13 time if the Commission so feels more comfortable at that time and then move forward any
14 additional elements that maybe help.

15

16 And at the same time, we can do some additional data like Commissioner Chang [note – Vice-
17 Chair Chang] recommended. That we should look further into the data and see if there's
18 enforcement and also the practicality of the design that we can look at in the meantime.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Templeton: Thank you so much, Mr. Bhatia. I think that's a really important
2 distinction as we head into our decision tonight is to understand what exactly it means to move
3 forward. So, it sounds like Staff is willing to speak to people... explicitly seek out input and have
4 a conversation with people who live in the effected intersections. Is that correct?

5

6 Mr. Bhatia: Yes, we'll conduct an outreach to seek input and feedback from... especially from
7 the ones who are in the front [unintelligible] and of course, the entire neighborhood.

8

9 Commissioner Templeton: I think that would be helpful and you sound like you're willing to, as
10 part of the design process, make adjustments to accommodate feedback... specific feedback
11 which is great. And you don't... and it sounds like you mean not just aesthetic feedback but
12 functional feedback.

13

14 So, with that, for me, I'm a lot more satisfied about moving forward because there are some
15 adjustments that need to be made and I want to celebrate that we've done the pilot because
16 that's really important and we should do more of those. But I also want to acknowledge that
17 there are some functional and aesthetic changes that need to be made to what we piloted in
18 order for us to make it permanent. Thank you.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Summa: Thanks, and now the Chair's going to exercise her right to speak. So, little
2 background, I lived through the College Terrence very extensive, it might have been 20 years
3 ago, traffic calming program. And I was the fortunate recipient of a traffic circle at the end of
4 my driveway basically and I will say one thing. It's very hard to find the perfect solution. I know
5 traffic circles inside and out and it took me 8 years... we voted as a neighborhood on
6 landscaped traffic circles and it took me 8 years of pestering the City, 8 years, to get it
7 landscaped after that's what we were promised. So, we don't want to see that happen again, so
8 I think we should be sure we are going to landscape these before we vote on them.

9
10 I think these three things are very different. I think the oval circle is kind of a no-brainer and I've
11 driven it a lot. And I think it definitely improves the functionality and safety of that intersection.
12 I will say that the design of what is in front of Mr. Girand's house and the impact on him
13 personally is not acceptable. It is bazar and it looks way too big to me. The beauty of a speed
14 table is you go over it too fast, it wrecks your car and nobody cares about a stop sign when no
15 cop is looking, a lot of people. You put up a whole bunch of stop... new stop signs in
16 neighborhoods and people will purposely run them.

17
18 So, and it is totally unacceptable to have curbs, which have to be kind of mountable for
19 emergency vehicles, with nothing inside them because they become trash receptacles and I had
20 8 years of that. People started dumping sofas in them and stuff and they are much, much...

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 whether they're circle circles or oval circles, they are much safer when landscaped because
2 they're much more visible.

3

4 So, I would be willing to move ahead and I am sort of trusting Staff on University that that's the
5 right solution there and that it's important to have it just at that small distance. I would be
6 happy... and no one has complained about the oval circle. I would be happy to move ahead with
7 making those permanent if they can be... making that permanent if it can be landscaped. It is
8 unacceptable to have it landscaped in my opinion.

9

10 Vice-Chair Chang: [off mic] Not landscaped.

11

12 Chair Summa: Not landscaped, sorry and I think Mr. Girand's bulb out needs to be rethought
13 completely, to be honest. And I'm fine with University if bike people are fine with that and we
14 haven't heard from anybody. I wouldn't bike down University Avenue to test it frankly.

15

16 Commissioner Reckdahl: Do we know, has PABAC have an opinion on this?

17

18 Chair Summa: I don't know if the... our Staff consulted PABAC but.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Bhatia: Staff... this particular item did not go to the PABAC but we did not hear any negative
2 feedback or comment from either the resident of PABAC or any of the members regarding
3 those improvements.

4
5 Chair Summa: Yeah, well that's good. I will mentioned that PABAC does not represent all the
6 bikers in the community because there are children and older people biking too that aren't as
7 athletic but anyway. I don't know if my colleagues would be interested in moving ahead on the
8 oval and the University solution with the condition that it be landscaped in a manner that is
9 discussed with the neighborhood and rethink the one at East Crescent which I call Mr. Girand's.

10
11 Commissioner Templeton: I think that's a good solution. I think in order to get funding for the
12 rethinking, we may have to include point number two in the motion. Even (interrupted)

13
14 Chair Summa: I think or they can all be in the motion but (interrupted)

15
16 [note – Commissioner Templeton and Chair Summa began talking at the same time]

17
18 Chair Summa: So, I don't know, if somebody... that's my thinking. I see a light from... oh and I do
19 want to thank Staff because this is actually pretty work on traffic calming. Quick response time
20 for the City, so I think that deserves mentioning and I think that's mostly all I had to say.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

And the other thing that's really hard to with traffic calming is the whack-a-mole effect. It's just... it's very hard to do. I was involved in it for years, but that's in general what I think works and what really doesn't work so far. So, I will call on... didn't you want to speak? Did you want to speak?

Commissioner Lu: [off mic] I would love to speak.

Chair Summa: Yeah, okay. You don't want to speak? Okay. Commissioner Lu?

Commissioner Lu: I just wanted to give a couple ticks. Tighter turning radiuses are empirically safer I believe, so even if you can't measure an improvement directly in like stop sign compliance or speeds. It is actually safer for pedestrians who might cross that street and I think we can make the landscaping work and Staff can move quickly on this.

Chair Summa: For East Crescent?

Commissioner Lu: Yeah, for the East Crescent/Southwood turn-off. So, I feel like it could be a [unintelligible] to actually punt this forward and maybe wait another year. Maybe do a whole other cycle of design when we already will have a cycle of design and community meetings as

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 part of this or least part of Staff's proposed next steps if we approve this as a permanent or if
2 we recommend this to be permanent. So, I'm comfortable just approving all of these and we
3 can give further direction to try to accelerate this or to try to commit to landscaping as soon as
4 we can, maybe at the Council level.

5

6 Chair Summa: I have a couple more lights. Commissioner Reckdahl.

7

8 Commissioner Reckdahl: I don't think we have the money to do both of them right. I'd rather to
9 do one of them right and kick the other one down the road, wait till we had more money and so
10 to me the obvious one to do right would be the traffic circle.

11

12 Chair Summa: Commissioner Templeton.

13

14 Commissioner Templeton: With respect, I think the money argument is irrelevant to this body's
15 discussion. Whether or not Council wants to finance it, that's up to them and if they want to
16 chose which one to finance that's fine. I agree partially with what Commissioner Lu said about
17 trying to combine the design cycle and I think the compromise here is nobody here wants us to
18 build out permanent the design that is currently at point number two. It's not good but it needs
19 to be designed and redesigned as part of the same study. And so, I would like us to move

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 forward with very clear instructions in an optimistic way and leave the option for Council to
2 downsize if needed if you think that would be appealing Commissioner Reckdahl.

3

4 Commissioner Reckdahl: I think something has to be addressed there. I'm not convinced that
5 this is the right solution. I think maybe traffic or I mean speed bumps might be a better solution
6 than this but.

7

8 Commissioner Templeton: Can we study it?

9

10 Commissioner Reckdahl: Oh yeah.

11

12 Commissioner Templeton: I mean that's really (interrupted)

13

14 Commissioner Reckdahl: I'm not opposed to this, I just think two constraints. One we better
15 make sure... put some thought behind it and look at other options and number two, be able to
16 make it look attractive enough.

17

18 Chair Summa: I think the thing that's different about East Crescent is that when you attach that
19 kind of oddly shaped, from my point of view and much bigger in looking in a photo that
20 Commissioner Templeton found. It looks like an extension of his yard and it just looks awful.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 And so, it... I don't think... some... because there's no sidewalks it really looks like an extension
2 of his yard also and so I have a bulb out to in front of my house just so you know. So, I think that
3 one just... I think that is so much about his property and his daughter's property that it needs to
4 be designed with them and it... more explicitly also because I mean even if you left it the way it
5 was and landscaped it. It would look... it would make his property look weird and you're right
6 bulb-outs narrowing the intersection are safety devices but this one just doesn't look right to
7 me. So, I would entertain a motion if everybody's ready.

8
9 Commissioner Templeton: I'm happy to do so and I just want to say that I think it's a matter of
10 being explicit. What you just said Chair needs to be in the motion that the current design is not
11 acceptable and further study is required. Would that be okay? Okay.

12
13 Commissioner Akin: Just a second.

14
15 Commissioner Templeton: Yeah.

16
17 Commissioner Akin: I requested a chance to speak so if you're... when you're done, may I follow
18 up?

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Templeton: I was just going to make a motion per Chair's request so please
2 speak.

3
4 Commissioner Akin: Okay, just we need to be careful here because we're second-guessing a lot
5 of engineering that's already been done. So, I wasn't privy to the discussion that results in these
6 particular designs, some of them seem intuitively right. The one that doesn't seem intuitively
7 right may yet be the best solution, but I haven't seen the alternatives that were already ruled
8 out. So, I hesitate to give too much direction to Staff about what should be there when they
9 may have already considered that and we simply don't know the outcome of those discussions.

10
11 Commissioner Templeton: I am not sure that design has happened yet, so I'm not sure we're
12 second-guessing engineering design because that's what we're going to try and move forward
13 with.

14
15 Commissioner Akin: No, the pilot, the pilot is the result of a design process which included a lot
16 of public input as well.

17
18 Commissioner Templeton: It is certainly not the level of design we're asking for if we move it
19 forward.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Akin: I understand the concern and I appreciate it actually, but I also have a
2 strong sense of my own ignorance about what went into that decision. So, I'm just reluctant to
3 second-guess Staff on that.

4
5 Commissioner Templeton: How about I give it a try, [unintelligible] a motion and if you have
6 comments... oh, Chair?

7
8 Chair Summa: [unintelligible – spoke off mic]

9
10 Commissioner Lu: Oh, I'm I'll just second Commissioner Akin's comments. It should empirically
11 be safer like we've done design work, we've done community meetings and the neighborhood
12 by large supports it by a pretty healthy margin. And I think the aesthetic concerns and the
13 aesthetic design concerns are really significant and can be addressed, but I think the actual
14 safety and traffic calming design feels difficult to second guess at this point. Given that we
15 might just kick the can down for several more years and delay other implementations on other
16 roads.

17
18 Commissioner Templeton: It's not a design, we haven't approved design yet. That phase has not
19 happened yet and there's more than one way to have a turn radius at that intersection. And so,
20 I do agree that we don't have a design to reject, but I do also agree with the comments we've

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 heard from other Commissioners that what we're seeing is problematic and requires further
2 study and we should encourage that and I think that you are also agree with that.

3

4 Commissioner Lu: Yeah, I agree and I think if we move forward explicitly there will be a design
5 process in the next steps on the bottom of Packet Page 25. So, I think we maybe just agree,
6 yeah.

7

8 MOTION

9

10 Commissioner Templeton: Okay, so I'm going to give it a try and if you guys... any if anyone's
11 uncomfortable with this, please speak up and we can workshop it, okay? But let's see if I can
12 find the recommendation, so planning... I move that Planning and Transportation Commission
13 recommends the City Council approval of permanent installation of traffic calming pilot project
14 which includes a point one, to be permanently installed and point three to be permanently
15 installed with adequate landscaping. Preferably, not drought tolerance, not the right word,
16 local? What is the word?

17

18 Commissioner Reckdahl: [unintelligible – off mic]

19

20 Mr. Bhatia: Native?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Commissioner Templeton: Native, thank you. I have... I'm drawing a blank, I'm getting... it's
3 getting late for me. Preferably with native landscaping and preferably timed within a very short
4 amount of time from the installation. And then to also take further steps to improve the design
5 of point two at Crescent and Southwood such that it is as safer, if not safer than what's there
6 while being more aesthetically pleasing and suitable to the adjacent properties.

7

8 Chair Summa: Okay.

9

10 Commissioner Templeton: Suggestions?

11

12 Chair Summa: Well, Mr. Bhatia... so, if we can wait for a second till after he has a chance.

13

14 Mr. Bhatia: Thank you, Chair and actually, I was going to say that the refinement of that design,
15 the pilot design, in the plan of the engineering department. So, if that is the intent to refine and
16 seek input from the fronting property owners. That is intent of our next steps.

17

18 SECOND

19

20 Vice-Chair Chang: I'll second.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Chair Summa: I have... would you like to speak to your motion, Commissioner Templeton?

Commissioner Templeton: Yes, I'll be brief, I know it's late. Just to say that we do have pilots for a reason. That's because we want to try with something that's reasonable and see how the feedback is going. And I understand Staff is saying that engineering decisions were involved in the pilot, as I would expect, but we're sending... where the motion is to send point number two back for another iteration with input... closer input from the adjacent properties. Thank you.

Vice-Chair Chang: I'd like to speak to the second. I do think that one and three seem pretty ready to go. Point number two does need work and in response to what an earlier Commissioner said about this is empirically safer. I don't think that we can say that because the data shows that there was an accident in a time, during a pandemic, when there was greatly reduced traffic and we don't know that the reductions that we've seen in traffic volume and speeds are real because of the pandemic. So, we know that the collision data at least isn't apples to apples and we have data from an eyewitness that there are collisions there. So, clearly, we want to see if this can be made safer as the motion states and yeah so I do have a question. Does that redesign include or exempt, does that include entirely different options as well such as speed tables?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Templeton: I don't see why not. I mean that's what we're discussing.

2

3 Vice-Chair Chang: Okay.

4

5 Commissioner Templeton: They've heard the feedback here and that's what Commissioners are
6 suggesting.

7

8 FRIENDLY AMENDMENT

9

10 Vice-Chair Chang: So, do we need to be more explicit about that because I don't want to say
11 that we're specifically signing off on a bulb out? I mean if the design team were to say oh, and
12 we think that actually here a speed tables would be better. I certainly wouldn't want to... I don't
13 want to preclude that.

14

15 MOTION AMENDED

16

17 Commissioner Templeton: So, let's add that point number three should come back before the
18 Commission with the next iteration.

19

20 Vice-Chair Chang: [unintelligible] two?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Commissioner Templeton: Point number two, thank you so that we can confirm that our feedback was incorporated because we have heard a couple of different ideas here that might be more suitable. We recognize you're not prepared tonight to speak to every kind of possibility that was considered but don't come back with us with the same design.

Vice-Chair Chang: Or at least come to us with an evaluation of other or you know, if... a reason why certain other ideas here might not be good ones.

Commissioner Templeton: That seems fair to me.

Vice-Chair Chang: Okay so (interrupted)

Commissioner Templeton: But (interrupted)

Vice-Chair Chang: Amended and seconded.

Commissioner Templeton: Yes, and just to clarify for Staff because I can see you guys looking at us. What we're saying is don't come back to us before going to Council. Go Council, talk about

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 we want to have safety improvements in these three areas. Two are ready to go, one needs an
2 iteration.

3

4 Mr. Bhatia: Commissioner (interrupted)

5

6 Chair Summa: Mr. Bhatia.

7

8 Mr. Bhatia: Chair, I'd like to add that any traffic calming device will need to go through the
9 voting process again through the residential community in order to be approved by the City
10 Council or the City engineer. So, as a recommendation from the Staff, so we follow the traffic
11 calming process which requires voting and it has be a majority vote supporting the
12 improvements. So, if we are changing or deviating from the currently approved voting
13 mechanism then we would have to redo the entire process for that particular intersection.

14

15 Chair Summa: Just for that one intersection, correct?

16

17 Mr. Bhatia: Correct, so if we were move forward with the redesign efforts then we would have
18 to go back to the community, the entire community feedback and that entire process and might
19 have to go back and do another pilot program for that intersection separately.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Templeton: Are you saying that you would try to push through this one because
2 you feel that you have the votes for that, instead of taking the feedback we've given tonight?

3

4 Mr. Bhatia: No, we will take the feedback but if we were to change the design, like if we are
5 adding a speed table or some other elements other than refining the existing design that was
6 proposed. Like say, if we were to refine the design of the bulb out and massage it to work with
7 the property owner to make sure that their access is maintained, to make sure that the
8 landscaping and other elements are included and the maneuverability of the location and
9 things are safer. So, we could do all those kind of iterations to the design that was proposed,
10 but if we were to change the element, like from a bulb out to say a traffic circle; or if the
11 community comes back and tells us we need another traffic circle here, or if we need speed
12 humps through the intersections and other things. Then that would need to go through another
13 process of traffic calming which is in accordance with our traffic calming policy.

14

15 Commissioner Templeton: Well, thank you for letting us know that part about the process. So,
16 really we're leaving this up... if this motion passes, we're leaving it up to you to work it out with
17 the neighbors, which ideally would have been done before it comes to us this time. And it's
18 unfortunate that we're not able to approve this one right now, but it needs... it's not there yet.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Bhatia: No, Commissioner Templeton, that's all the intent. We want to move forward with
2 this... it's like an initial pilot. We will refine to prepare a concept plan that will share... that will
3 be planned after getting input and feedback from the community and then come back at 35
4 percent level say concept plan to the Commission... to the PTC and then seek their blessing in
5 moving forward with the final design. That's something we can do.

6

7 Chair Summa: Commissioner Reckdahl.

8

9 Commissioner Reckdahl: I mean the one thing that makes me uncomfortable is that I have to
10 think that someone looked at things like speed bumps or whatever and it would really help us if
11 we knew why they were not accepted.

12

13 Mr. Bhatia: Generally, it's the neighborhood residents that are not in favor of those. That's
14 because they cause noise, they cause other elements of nuisance when installed and also, for
15 fire access, you have to provide for the wheel spacing in the speed humps when they're
16 installed in the neighborhood streets. And so, and the frequency or the location and the
17 repetition of that to be effective needs to be there. So, it has to be like a pair of three or four
18 and fronting property owners will lose parking. So, there are so many other negative effects
19 that may have been discussed with those property owners and community before and they
20 may have already ruled out that speed humps were not appropriate for that community.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Reckdahl: So, does the transportation department have some document that describes this... what we went through? What was considered and why it was rejected?

Mr. Bhatia: I do not have the entire document but I'm... you know I can check with our Staff to see if they... some of that Staff do not exist. They are not here anymore and so we may not have the historic information but my understanding is that speed humps generally are... if we want to start the speed hump process. That would be a separate process.

Vice-Chair Chang: I think (interrupted)

Mr. Bhatia: We need to go through their own qualification process also.

Chair Summa: So, I don't think our intention was to redesign that area tonight, but just to say that we weren't happy and the one person... two people of the three people that came and spoke tonight, well did not really... who were property owners really didn't want it. So, I think that we shouldn't get... try to tell the experts what's better. I bet they had a couple other choices and second choices or that were considered but I don't want to redesign it tonight. I just want to... if nobody wants to make an amendment, I think we should just vote on it and see if it passes. Is that (interrupted)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Akin: Can we restate the motion for clarity? I mean for (interrupted)

Commissioner Templeton: I knew you were going to ask that. I don't know if I remember the whole thing.

MOTION RESTATED

Chair Summa: So, let me restate the motion. The motion is to move to make permanent numbers one and numbers three, but number three only with a condition that it be landscaped and that we think number two needs more work. Maybe it just needs to be refined as a bulb out that's more suitable with more conditions that meet... that are better, but (interrupted)

Commissioner Templeton: With input directly of adjacent property owners.

Chair Summa: Yes.

Commissioner Lu: So, it needs more work but it will be up in the interim and also, just evaluated by Council when it comes to them.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Summa: Yeah and I mean that's much simpler than what Commissioner Templeton said
2 but I think it (interrupted)

3

4 Commissioner Lu: [off mic] Just wanted to confirm.

5

6 Commissioner Templeton: So, should we explicitly say that the temporary one stays in place
7 until it's redesigned or just leave that out?

8

9 Chair Summa: I think that's already a part of the process.

10

11 Commissioner Templeton: Great.

12

13 Chair Summa: Okay, everybody ready to vote, or do we have any (interrupted)

14

15 Vice-Chair Chang: Did we need... part of that also or part of her motion was also that specific to
16 number two, it would come back to PTC after... assuming that Council approves the
17 recommendation from us.

18

19 Chair Summa: Okay and that number two will come back to the Planning Commission.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Bhatia: We'll bring back all three of them for your review... both of them for your review
2 because it might have a landscaping component, redesign efforts. So, the whole project will
3 come back to you at concept level, like when the concept level plans are ready, for seeking
4 input and feedback as well.

5

6 Chair Summa: That's what... thank you. That's what I thought, we don't need to say that
7 because they're all... it's all coming back to us. Okay, can you please conduct the vote?

8

9 VOTE

10

11 Ms. Dao: Commissioner Templeton?

12

13 Commissioner Templeton: Yes.

14

15 Ms. Dao: Chair Summa?

16

17 Chair Summa: Yes.

18

19 Ms. Dao: Commissioner Reckdahl?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Reckdahl: Yes.

2

3 Ms. Dao: Commissioner Lu?

4

5 Commissioner Lu: No.

6

7 Ms. Dao: Vice-Chair Chang?

8

9 Vice-Chair Chang: Yes.

10

11 Ms. Dao: Commissioner Akin?

12

13 Commissioner Akin: Yes.

14

15 Ms. Dao: Motion carries 5-1.

16

17 MOTION PASSED 5(Akin, Chang, Reckdahl, Summa, Templeton) - 1(Lu) - 1(Hechtman absent)

18

19 Chair Summa: Thank you everyone and thank you to the members of the public who stuck it out

20 for this conversations and I think that means we (interrupted)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21

Commissioner Reckdahl: [off mic] Speak to the no vote.

Chair Summa: Oh, I'm sorry. Would you like to speak to your no-vote?

Commissioner Lu: I mean I think my opinion is clear. It is safer and it's just less thrashy and I don't think we need the thrash.

Chair Summa: Okay, thank you for that and then our last item this evening is approval of the minutes.

Commission Action: Motion by Templeton, seconded by Chang. Pass 5-1-0-1

Approval of Minutes

Public Comment is Permitted. Five (5) minutes per speaker.^{1,3}

4. Approval of Planning & Transportation Commission Draft Verbatim and Summary Minutes of May 10, 2023

Chair Summa: Draft verbatim and summary minutes of May 10th. Do I have a motion? Nobody wants to make a motion.

Vice-Chair Chang: [off mic] Bart's [note – Commissioner Hechtman] is not here.

MOTION

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Reckdahl: Yeah, Bart's [note – Commissioner Hechtman] not here. I move that
2 we accept the draft verbatim and summary minutes of May 10th, 2023.

3

4 SECOND

5

6 Vice-Chair Chang: Second.

7

8 Chair Summa: [unintelligible – off mic]

9

10 VOTE

11

12 Ms. Veronica Dao, Administrative Assistant: Chair Summa?

13

14 Chair Summa: Yes.

15

16 Ms. Dao: Vice-Chair Chang?

17

18 Vice-Chair Chang: Yes.

19

20 Ms. Dao: Commissioner Akin?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Commissioner Akin: Yes.

3

4 Ms. Dao: Commissioner Lu?

5

6 Commissioner Lu: Yes.

7

8 Ms. Dao: Commissioner Reckdahl?

9

10 Commissioner Reckdahl: Yes.

11

12 Ms. Dao: Commissioner Templeton?

13

14 Commissioner Templeton: Yes.

15

16 Ms. Dao: Motion carries 6-0.

17

18 MOTION PASSED 6(Akin, Chang, Lu, Reckdahl, Summa, Templeton) -0 -1(Hechtman absent)

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Summa: Thank you for that and now... and thank you again to the public and we just go
2 on to Commission questions, comments, announcements, and we already have future Agendas
3 as part of our Packet.

4 **Commission Action:** Motion by Reckdahl, seconded by Chang. Pass 6-0-1

5 **Committee Items**

6 None

7 **Commissioner Questions, Comments or Announcements**

8 Chair Summa: Does anybody have anything in particular? I see Templeton and Reckdahl then.

9

10 Commissioner Templeton: I am in Sacramento that day and I will try to get back in time but
11 might be late or might not make it so just so you know.

12

13 Chair Summa: Okay, thank you for that.

14

15 Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay, I guess I should add, 28th and the next meeting I will both be on
16 travel on both those. I will plan to call in.

17

18 Chair Summa: Okay, so the 28th, you're going to call in.

19

20 Commissioner Reckdahl: 28th and the (interrupted)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Chair Summa: The 17th of (interrupted)

Commissioner Reckdahl: And what's the next one?

Chair Summa: 7/13 (interrupted)

Commissioner Lu: 12.

Chair Summa: 12.

Commissioner Reckdahl: 12, yeah.

Ms. Amy French, Chief Planning Official: So, participation... sorry, so participating remotely (interrupted)

Commissioner Reckdahl: Yes.

Ms. French: And providing in advance your (interrupted)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Reckdahl: I'll send you my (interrupted)

2

3 Ms. French: Hotel location or what have you, yes.

4

5 Commissioner Reckdahl: I'll get the reservations and (interrupted)

6

7 Ms. French: Okay, we're in a new environment.

8

9 Chair Summa: Okay, if there are no other comments then the meeting is adjourned. Thank you
10 very one.

11 **Adjournment**

12 9:28 pm

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.