



# Planning & Transportation Commission Action Agenda: May 11, 2022

Council Chambers & Virtual  
6:00 PM

## Call to Order / Roll Call

6:02 pm

Chair Lauing: Good evening, I'd like to call to order the May 11<sup>th</sup>, 2022 Regular meeting of the Planning and Transportation Commission and we're going to go to our Resolution on hybrid meetings with Miss Tanner.

Rachael Tanner, Assistant Director: I think, so we need to take the Roll first, to have a quorum?

And then, I can't remember what we used to do.

Chair Lauing: Ok. Do you want to call the Roll?

Ms. Tanner: Let's do that, then we'll do the resolution after that.

Madina Klicheva, Administrative Assistant: Chair Lauing?

Chair Lauing: Present.

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. Klicheva: Vice-Chair Summa?

2

3 Vice-Chair Summa: Present.

4

5 Ms. Klicheva: Commissioner Chang?

6

7 Commissioner Chang: Present.

8

9 Ms. Klicheva: Commissioner Hechtman?

10

11 Commissioner Hechtman: Present.

12

13 Ms. Klicheva: Commissioner Reckdahl?

14

15 Commissioner Reckdahl: Present.

16

17 Ms. Klicheva: Commissioner Roohparvar?

18

19 Commissioner Roohparvar: Present.

20

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. Klicheva: Commissioner Templeton?

2

3 Commissioner Templeton: Here.

4

5 Ms. Klicheva: We have a quorum.

6

7 Chair Lauing: Thank you.

8

9 Ms. Tanner: Excellent. Thank you. members of the public who maybe wanted to participate in  
10 this meeting, you can do so if you are in the Chamber, I don't think we have anyone in the  
11 Chamber who'll be participating today. If you'd like to give a speaker card to Miss. Madina  
12 Klicheva, she can help you to give public comment if there's items you want to give public  
13 comment on. Pursuant to AB 361 this commission meeting will be held as a hybrid meeting with  
14 an option to attend by teleconference and video or in person, and if you want to join online you  
15 can go to <https://zoom.us/join>, you can enter Meeting ID 916 4155 9499, again 916 4155 9499  
16 and then you can join the zoom meeting that way. Or, if you want to use a phone you can dial  
17 1-669-900-6833, and again enter the Meeting ID: 916 4155 9499. Also pursuant to AB 361 we  
18 have some Planning and Transportation Commissioners who are joining us online via the zoom  
19 platform. Thank you.

20

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Okay, thank you.

2 **Oral Communications**

3 The public may speak to any item not on the agenda. Three (3) minutes per speaker.<sup>1,2</sup>

4 Chair Lauing: This is the part of the meeting we do oral communications where anyone from  
5 the public can speak about any issue that is not on the agenda. There is no one in Chambers at  
6 this time, what about online speakers?

7

8 Ms. Klicheva: Yes, we have one raised hand from Carrie Arkin.

9

10 Chair Lauing: Okay, go ahead.

11

12 Public Speaker Carrie Arkin: Good evening, can you hear me?

13

14 Chair Lauing: Yes.

15

16 Public Speaker Carrie Arkin: Good evening Chair Lauing, and Commissioner's I want to bring to  
17 your attention something that I think was left out of the Castilleja hearing, which I think is very  
18 important. I want to first of all, just make sure you all know that the Planning Department are  
19 responsible for all permits and conformance for, with all applicable Code and Regulations for all  
20 buildings in Palo Alto. So, going back to the variants. The PTC voted on Castilleja project in 2020.  
21 At that time, the actual gross floor area was in question, so City Council hired Dudek to verify

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 what the square footage was in November of 2021. This was published in November 2021. So  
2 five months ago the PTC had this information, it was public knowledge that there was a 47,300  
3 square foot variance that Castilleja was asking for, for their non-conforming existing buildings  
4 which were five of them, to today's Castilleja plan of one large building. The Code requires that  
5 once you demolish a non-conforming building, square footage, you can't just replace, you need  
6 a variance. Are you, the Planning Commission approving the planning Staff's report where  
7 they're granting a variance, I'm not sure who, either the Chief Planner, the Director of Planning,  
8 City Manager, or City Attorney? Shouldn't Castilleja have to follow code just like every resident,  
9 developer, non-profits that wants to tear down and replace existing structure. Once Castilleja  
10 tears down these five non-conforming buildings of square footage, they have to comply with  
11 current code. That's why we have zoning laws. That's why you are the Planning Commission, to  
12 rule on keeping these, this enforcement. It now seems as if the City, I guess the City Planning  
13 Department, but I'm not sure who is signing off, is giving Castilleja an extra 47,300 square feet  
14 for their building. I think that you need to weigh in on this, it's your job, I hope you can  
15 deliberate about this variance. I think it was a mistake, there were plenty of mistakes made  
16 with the Castilleja application, I think this is one glaring one. And, it gives so much extra land to  
17 Castilleja for their new building. I don't think you really weighed in on it, I think you weighed in  
18 on all the cut, parts of the cut, but this should have been a separate kind of hearing or a  
19 meeting where you deliberated about the actual square footage. Thank you for your time.

20

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Are there any other public speakers?

2

3 Ms. Klicheva: No, we don't have any raised hands online right now.

4

5 **Agenda Changes, Additions and Deletions**

6 The Chair or Commission majority may modify the agenda order to improve meeting management.

7 Chair Lauing: Okay, thank you to the one that we had, and we'll move on to Agenda Changes,

8 Additions and Deletions, if there are any, from staff or Commissioners?

9

10 Rachael Tanner, Assistant Director: No changes from Staff.

11

12 Chair Lauing: Don't see anything from Commissioners, okay, so we'll go to the City Official  
13 Reports, Assistant Director Tanner.

14 **City Official Reports**

15 1. Directors Report, Meeting Schedule and Assignments

16

17 Ms. Tanner: Good evening Chair and Commissioners, good to be with you all tonight. Just a few  
18 updates. Hopefully those who made it had fun at the May Fest Parade this last weekend. We  
19 are looking forward to continuing to get out and make sure that we can continue to have in  
20 person activities, I know that's very much fun for all of us, I know myself included. We are, as  
21 you may know, experiencing a slight uptick in the County and in the State Covid transmission;

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 so we're just asking people to be mindful and aware as you go out in whatever you are doing,  
2 whether it's wearing masks or just taking other precautions, testing often, as we know the sub-  
3 sub variants are very evasive and hard to detect as various times, but right now there hasn't  
4 been any changes in City policy and so we'll update you if there are changes in our protocols  
5 here at the City of Palo Alto. I also am going to pass it over to Ms. Sylvia Star-Lack who is going  
6 to reintroduce a staff person and make a few announcements.

7

8 Star-Lack, Transportation Manager: Thank you Ms. Tanner. Good evening Commissioners I'm  
9 Sylvia Star-Lack the Transportation Planning Manager and our Chief Transportation Official  
10 couldn't be with us tonight which means I have the distinct honor to reintroduce to you Rafael  
11 Rius, Senior Transportation Engineer who is rejoining the city after a short intermission. He is  
12 here tonight, and he, I'm also here tonight to announce that he will be the Office of  
13 Transportation's liaison to the Planning and Transportation Commission moving forward. So I  
14 just wanted to welcome Rafael back to the city, we are so excited to have him back. The other  
15 item I have is to announce that Bike Month is here, May is Bike Month and Bike to Where-ever  
16 days is the whole month. We hope that you are biking as much as possible in the month of May  
17 when the weather is lovely, and it just feels great to bike in town. A couple things I wanted to  
18 note are that our local volunteers are running three energizer stations over two days, Friday  
19 May 20<sup>th</sup> and Saturday May 21<sup>st</sup>, and on Friday May 20<sup>th</sup> between 3:30 and 6:30 p.m. you have  
20 two choices. There's an energizer station where you can pick up information, free swag,

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 sometimes there's snacks. The first one is downtown on City Plaza facing Bryant Street, and the  
2 second on Friday May 20<sup>th</sup> in the afternoon time, is the California Avenue Plaza at California  
3 Avenue and Park Boulevard right there by the CalTrans station. On Saturday May 21<sup>st</sup> between  
4 2 and 5 p.m. there'll be an energizer station at Mitchell Park [unintelligible]. So, if you're out  
5 and about on your bike running errands, you can stop by one of those energizer stations and  
6 pick up some fun items. I hear that there will be some "I Bike Palo Alto" t-shirts available for,  
7 that might be distributed, so, get there early.

8  
9 Ms. Tanner: Thank you, and I wanted to ask Mr. Rius if you wanted to say something, because  
10 otherwise your face will not come up on zoom and it would be a somewhat interesting  
11 introduction. Do you want to just share a few words?

12  
13 Mr. Rafael Rius, Senior Transportation Engineer: Sure, I'm not really prepared but thank you for  
14 the warm welcome back. I'm glad to be back with the City and looking forward to working with  
15 everyone, with all the Commissioners and this Commission, and I'm looking forward to it. Thank  
16 you for the warm welcome.

17  
18 Chair Lauing: Welcome back.

19

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.



1 Ms. Tanner: I can see that he's one of the favorite traffic engineers I've ever worked with, so,  
2 we're glad to have you back, for sure. With that, that ends the City's official reports and I'll give  
3 updates on upcoming meetings at the end of the Agenda on the Upcoming Meetings item.

4  
5 Chair Lauing: Okay, any questions of staff from the Commissioners? Either Transportation or,  
6 did I miss anybody?

7  
8 **Action Items**

9 Public Comment is Permitted. Applicants/Appellant Teams: Fifteen (15) minutes, plus three (3) minutes rebuttal.  
10 All others: Five (5) minutes per speaker.<sup>1,3</sup>

11  
12 Chair Lauing: Okay. Then we will move on to your first Action Item which is a review and  
13 recommendation to the Finance Committee and Council on a proposed 23-27 Capital  
14 Improvement Plan and Comprehensive Plan Compliance also known as the CIP's and of course  
15 the Comp Plan. So that's the item. And, I think Ms. Moitra I believe you have a presentation?

- 16 2. Review and Recommendation to Finance Committee and the City Council on  
17 Proposed 2023-2027 Capital Improvement Plan and Comprehensive Plan  
18 Compliance

19  
20 Ms. Chitra Moitra: Yes, yes I do, just give me a brief second, I can share my screen.

21  
22 Ms. Tanner: Great, while she's bringing that up, I'll just let you know you can see on your  
23 participant list, we have a number of participants, array of City Staff are here, so we have staff  
24 from our Departments who are proposing the different Capital Improvement projects, and so,

---

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.  
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.  
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 as you may have questions, we need to direct those to the appropriate department. Ms. Moitra  
2 take it away.

3 Ms. Moitra: Yes. Thank you Rachael. Good evening Commissioners, I am Chitra Moitra Planner  
4 for long range planning. Tonight, we come before you requesting the review of the new CIPs  
5 which have been added to the 2023-27 budget book along with the review of the new CIPs, the  
6 review would be, you can also suggest any improvements or additions or any new CIPs that you  
7 think are missing from this year for your next years, to be added next year. So, this, along with  
8 that, we can convey your suggestions and your recommendations to City Council and Finance  
9 Committee via the letter tonight. So every year we, the City Departments prepare a list of CIPs  
10 based on the citywide infrastructure need and as well as City Council's priorities. This year also,  
11 the different departments have provided, proposed twelve new CIPs. And Planning Department  
12 staff links each CIPs with the Comprehensive Plan Element, goal and policy and for, and figures  
13 out the compliances with them and also adds information on what type of Board review is  
14 required for the CIP as well as if any environmental review is required for the CIPs. This year we  
15 have in our budget book, 174 CIPs, these are a mixture of new and continuing CIPs and as I  
16 mentioned before there are twelve CIPs, new ones this year, and that approximately makes up  
17 7% of the CIPs this year. The Commission would be focused on the new CIPs. And the remaining  
18 162 in the book was reviewed by PTC in previous years. This, these are the list of the new CIPs  
19 which we have included this year. As you can see, some are related to improvements in the, for  
20 the Palo Alto Airport infrastructure, the Cubberley Community Center and improvement of the

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Fire Training Facility we have in the city. On the rest here, we see are streetscape  
2 improvements as well as infrastructure improvements for different parts of the City. So, these  
3 are the twelve new CIPs you see here. This year of the twelve new CIPs we find that six of the  
4 new CIPs align with the environmental, Natural Environmental Element of the Comp Plan. Three  
5 with the Community Services & Facilities Element, two with the Land Use Element, and one  
6 with the Safety Element. This pie graph shows the distribution of all CIPs in the budget book,  
7 and as we can see that the majority of the, about 48% of the CIPs are aligned with the Natural  
8 Environmental Element and 30% with the Community Services Element and so on. So this  
9 extensive analysis of the individual CIPs with the Comprehensive Plan Programs and Policies  
10 shows that all the CIPs, all twelve of them, are consistent with Comp Plan and hence Staff  
11 recommends, hence Staff requests PTC this recommendation to find all the CIPs consistent with  
12 the Comp Plan and forward the recommendation to the City Council and the Finance  
13 Committee. As next steps, these, both the City Council and Finance Committee is reviewing this  
14 May and June, the budgets and the final budget hearing will be on the June 21<sup>st</sup>, when the  
15 Council will adopt the budget. So, this is my short presentation and Staff and myself, we are  
16 here, City Staff and myself are here and if you have any questions on any CIPs, we are here to  
17 answer your questions. Thank you.

18

19 Chair Lauing: Thank you very much. And we'll see if there's any Public Comment on this issue,  
20 again, there's no one in Chambers.

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20

Ms. Klicheva: And no raised hands online.

Chair Lauing: Okay, we'll just give it another few seconds to see if anybody was planning on speaking on this item.

Ms. Tanner: If anybody is attending online, if you want to raise your hand to speak, now is the time.

Chair Lauing: Okay. I just wanted to reference the, one of the parts that Ms. Chitra spoke to which we saw on Packet page 9, so that we can, if we chose to, suggest improvements in economy or efficiency which might be affected in various ways but we certainly don't have to. So, just wanted to let you know that is an option if we chose to. And I think just procedurally it would be helpful if we just went through each one and all commented at the same one at the same time or if you'd like we can, for example just group the ones about fire. So, if that's alright, we would start on page 10 with the airport ones. And we'll open it up to Commission comments, I see Commissioner Reckdahl down in Alabama is calling in tonight. Go ahead.

Commissioner Reckdahl: I just had a general question that applies to all of them. In the Environmental Review column some of the, I'm looking at the pullout that was in the Staff

---

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Report, and some of them say they are exempt, and some of them say they will be, and other  
2 say that they will need a CEQA and some of them say they may. Can Staff give a quick summary  
3 of why they would and why they wouldn't.

4

5 Chair Lauing: Yeah, I had that same question actually.

6

7 Commissioner Reckdahl: Ah, great minds think alike.

8

9 Chair Lauing: I guess.

10

11 Ms. Moitra: So, for those which are exempt, those are under CEQA, those are like basic minor  
12 repair and maintenance of the existing facilities so that's why they are exempt. And, some are  
13 the bigger projects which actually need an EIR and you know CEQA, you know CEQA review,  
14 there are some like that, and based on the, and then again some actually do not need the CEQA  
15 review at all if this is like something, something like vehicle upgrade, or things like that. So,  
16 these are the categories.

17

18 Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay thanks.

19

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Okay. Who wants to open the comments on Fire. Oh, I see, sorry Commissioner  
2 Chang had her light on.

3

4 Commissioner Chang: Thank you.

5

6 Chair Lauing: Airport, Sorry.

7

8 Commissioner Chang: So, I had first a general question. How do things advance to this stage,  
9 where they are added to the budget. So, is it from direction from City Council, which I think is  
10 the case for some of these items, or is it because of a different planning effort by Staff or  
11 priorities in the Comp Plan? I'm just wondering, just for context, what's the process that then  
12 says that these twelve are for this year. How did they get here?

13

14 Ms. Moitra: I will let Paul speak to that. Paul.

15

16 Paul Harper, Budget Manager: Good evening, Commissioners. Paul Harper with the Office of  
17 Management and Budget. So we have an annual budget process where departments bring  
18 forward projects that they would like to include in the upcoming 5-year Capital Improvement  
19 Plan and typically, you know, it goes through a review process of you know, is it a necessary  
20 project, does it meet sort of the criteria that we have where it's over \$50,000 dollars, its for an

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 asset that the city would be adding, and then essentially it gets reviewed by a number of  
2 Department Directors in the budget office and the City Manager's office to determine which  
3 projects are ultimately put into the 5-year plan. It's also a little bit depends on funding and if  
4 there's funding within the particular funds where each project is added each year. You know,  
5 it's mainly a restriction in the general capital improvement fund, or the fund 471 Fund because  
6 that's restrained by the money coming in from the general fund, money coming in from TOT  
7 Tax revenues, and so over the past couple of years those have been very constrained due to  
8 impacts from the pandemic, but yeah, it's essentially it's a process that we go through every  
9 year in order to determine which projects move forward as part of the budget every year.

10

11 Chair Lauing: Okay Airports. Commissioner Hechtman.

12

13 Commissioner Hechtman: Thank you. Let me actually start with kind of a general observation  
14 from the end of the staff report where, and incidentally I really appreciate how succinct and  
15 clear the staff report was to walk us through these twelve new CIPs, it made it very easy to  
16 work through the list, but I, and I noticed at the end, we have I think it's 174 CIPs with the new  
17 twelve, and incidentally Ms. Moitra can correct me, I think earlier this year when we were  
18 having our annual review of the CIPs, we had nine completed, so if I'm remembering that  
19 number right. So, we've completed nine, we've got twelve new ones, so, I'm always concerned  
20 when I see this number 174 ongoing programs that Staff throughout our Departments have to

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 monitor and advance and so, I'm pleased that we're not growing that number too fast. So, but  
2 the thing that caught my eye, of course we're here as Planning Commissioners, Planning and  
3 Transportation Commissioners, is that when I look at the breakdown of 174 programs, only 28  
4 of the 174 are categorized as primarily Land Use which is 15, or transportation which is 13. So  
5 that's 28 out of 174 which is, I don't know-20%, not a very high number. Maybe that's, and so I  
6 was just curious about that because, you know in my work I talk to Councilmembers a lot, and if  
7 you ask a Councilmember how much of their work, the work that comes before them is Land  
8 Use, they'll say, they'll routinely say it's more than 50%. Some of them say a lot more. So, I  
9 would have thought a lot of our policies would be Land Use policies. Now maybe it's a matter of  
10 semantics because we've got 84 in the natural, what do we call it, Natural Environment, right,  
11 and that's, I would suggest that's an often a subset of Land Use, maybe a more particularized  
12 description. But, I just thought that was interesting that the way these CIPs have developed  
13 we've, we have this, I'm not going to say over-emphasis, but numerically significant proportion  
14 that's focused on the natural environment compared to all the other needs of the city. And so,  
15 I'm just putting that observation out there for what it's worth, but I do think in developing  
16 programs as we go forward, in this process that Mr. Harper just described, we really have to  
17 think, we have to kind of step back and think about where the holes are. And maybe right now  
18 there aren't so many holes in our natural environment, our programs for natural environment,  
19 and maybe we need to think about where there are holes and focus to the extent we can on  
20 those items. So that's my general comment. Specifically on the Airport Items, I just had a

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.



1 question about the funding, items 1, 2, and 3 all provide for the same funding. Ninety percent  
2 from a FAA grant and 10% match from the Airport Enterprise Fund, and my question to staff is,  
3 are these secured funds that we have received or are these future funds that we've been  
4 promised, or future funds that we're just hoping we get?

5  
6 Andy Swanson, Airport Manager Department of Public Works: Andy Swanson, Airport Manager  
7 Department of Public Works, and the funds are part of the, it's a 5-year plan so the funds are  
8 applied for on the year for the grant, it's part of a grant cycle of, with the FAA, that's the 90% of  
9 the funds. The 10% match comes from the Airport Enterprise Fund and so it's planned out  
10 through our, through our ACIP which is the Airport Capital Improvement Plan with the FAA and  
11 then our CIP plan with the City. The funding comes in on the year, it's very competitive and  
12 prioritized with the FAA, it's a, I don't want to say long process, but it doesn't always happen on  
13 the year, sometimes it gets moved but I hope that answers your question.

14  
15 Commissioner Hechtman: Mr. Chair, if I could just follow up. Thank you for explaining the  
16 process, what's our level of comfort that in the 5-years that we're budgeting for that we'll be  
17 able to go through those processes and get the funds that we need to do the work in these  
18 three airport categories?

19

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Swanson: Pretty, pretty high level of confidence, just in the past, little over 4 years, the  
2 projects we've done, there's been about \$43 million in projects at the airport, just to kind of  
3 update everyone, the airport was transferred back a little over seven years ago from the  
4 county. All the work we've been doing at the airport is really, I think the best example is the  
5 road going into the airport, and the need to rehabilitate it, and that's pretty much what we've  
6 been doing since we transferred the airport back and have been very successful and  
7 competitive with the other airports in obtaining that money.

8  
9 Commissioner Hechtman: Alright, Thank you. And then one more question on Item 3, which is  
10 the airport parking lot electric vehicle charger installation, the description, I was a little unclear  
11 of whether we're in the design phase or we've got the design and this is the installation phase.  
12 Can someone clarify that for me.

13  
14 Mr. Swanson: Yes, Andy Swanson again, I'd be glad to, I would like to have been further along in  
15 that project, but again, with the match money and the small Enterprise Fund the airport's, the  
16 Enterprise Fund, it's what we, we just have to go as quick as we can and that's what we had  
17 available so it would be design only in that portion of it.

18  
19 Commissioner Hechtman: Alright, Thank you.

20

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: I had a piggy-back comment that I wanted to ask you as well since you are up.  
2 Mine was sort of like the FAA is being since and generous to us, why are they so enthusiastic  
3 about our airport or is that we're enthusiastic about our airport?

4

5 Mr. Swanson: Well, it's (interrupted)

6

7 Chair Lauing: It's a serious question, like why are we so important relative to FAA being  
8 interested in funding this?

9

10 Mr. Swanson: Well, I think it's that we're a very busy general aviation airport, it plays a role in  
11 the National Transportation system and so it's a very, we actually rank very high and that's why  
12 we're very competitive, I think with the other airports, of course not the larger airports in the  
13 bay area, but the other general aviation airports, we're, as of now we are the busiest general  
14 aviation airport in the bay area.

15

16 Chair Lauing: Okay. That's the exactly the kind of data I want to hear about, thanks.  
17 Commissioner Chang.

18

19 Commissioner Chang: Thank you. So, I had an additional piggy-back clarification question on  
20 what Commissioner Hechtman was asking about. So, I took all of these items and then looked

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 at what the budget was for them in the big binder that we were given. And so for example, for  
2 the first item, the Airport Zero Emission Fleet Replacement program, it looked like that was a  
3 \$350 thousand dollar one-time expenditure, is that \$350,000 dollar total amount of the project  
4 before the FAA contribution, or after?

5

6 Mr. Swanson: That's the total project.

7

8 Commissioner Chang: Ah. So, if, so then the 90% presumably then if we get the grant, then Palo  
9 Alto's only paying \$35,000 out of the \$350,000, correct?

10

11 Mr. Swanson: Correct.

12

13 Commissioner Chang: Okay. Thank you. And then, in line with kind of Commissioner, Chair  
14 Lauing's question, where was it, sorry, I think it was Commissioner Hechtman who was talking  
15 about it, for Item #3, where we're in the planning phase for the EV chargers, is there any way to  
16 accelerate that so that we just have at least one charger actually installed, because the number  
17 of, of like EV's has increased so much, very recently even, because of the war, and gas prices, so  
18 I was just wondering how much flexibility is there in this, in, especially since we were asked to  
19 think about things that maybe we should, that should be added.

20

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Swanson: That's an excellent question, and if there was a way to do that, and we are going  
2 to look at that, right now that was what we could do with our budget. There are some other  
3 FAA programs we're looking into to see if there was a way to at least accelerate that possibly  
4 coming back at mid-year if monies were available but at this time that's where we're at with  
5 that.

6

7 Commissioner Chang: Thank you.

8

9 Chair Lauing: Commissioner Reckdahl.

10

11 Commissioner Reckdahl: Yeah, I had a question, in the packet it said up to 90% could be paid, is  
12 that typical that it is 90 or is it typical that it's lower, what would be a typical reimbursement?

13

14 Mr. Swanson: Yeah, it does change from time to time, it has in the past, and it's , its in the  
15 Authorization Bill. So, the current Bill, it is 90%, so that's what it is, it's been 95 [%] years ago,  
16 now it's at 90, at one point it was at 100%, here just a few years ago, but that was due to the  
17 Covid, there was a two-year time that it was actually at 100% but that's passed now. To answer,  
18 yes, 90%.

19

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay. Some of these numbers are pretty big but when we're only  
2 paying 10% it makes it much for palatable. But where does the 10% come from, the Airport  
3 Fund, is that, do we fund that through the General Fund, or where does it get the money?

4  
5 Mr. Swanson: No. It comes from the Airport Enterprise Fund so it's generated from the airport  
6 through the users, fuel tax, and all the revenues generated from the airport. No General Fund  
7 dollars are used.

8  
9 Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay thank you. That's all.

10  
11 Chair Lauing: Any other commissioners on this item? Commissioner Summa, Vice-Chair Summa.

12  
13 Vice-Chair Summa: Thank you and thank you to staff, everyone who's here tonight taking the  
14 time to answer our questions and thank you to my colleagues who asked really good questions.  
15 I don't think I have anymore questions at this time about the airport, but I'll just mention that  
16 the projects seem to be in keeping with our goals in the Comp Plan for the airport. And that's it.

17  
18 Chair Lauing: Okay thanks. Anyone else? Okay I think we can move on to the next item, which is  
19 Cubberley Center redevelopment. Who wants in on that one? Commissioner Hechtman?

20

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Hechtman: I just want to say I was really excited to see this, as a CIP. All three of  
2 my kids went through pre-school family at Cubberley, I'm pretty sure I lost my wedding ring  
3 camping out there overnight to sign my kids up for summer camp, for those of you who  
4 remember we used to have to do that. I think it's a jewel in our city and anything we can do to  
5 bring more vitality and more use and more community to it, I just think is a win. So I'm really  
6 happy that we get to recommend that this be a new program.

7

8 Chair Lauing: Vice-Chair Summa your light is on.

9

10 Vice-Chair Summa: Yes. I agree that Cubberley is a jewel in our community, although we've had  
11 so many exercises, I don't know how many, maybe staff could remind me, of design charrettes  
12 and thing of that nature for Cubberley and they always kind of end up being put on the shelf  
13 because we don't have clear understanding of how the PAUSD and what their needs are going  
14 to be and how our 8-acres of the site, which I don't even know if those are contiguous to be  
15 honest, but I know they are very regular, the shape, how that all interacts. Until we know what  
16 the school is going to do, it's kind of hard for us to plan Cubberley. I was just wondering if Staff  
17 could comment on that and how this study will be different than previous studies perhaps.

18

19 Chair Lauing: I think I saw our Community Serv.. there she is. Kris O'Kane why don't you address  
20 that.

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19

Kristen O’Kane, Director of Community Services Department: Sure. Good evening Commissioners, I’m Kristen O’Kane Director of Community Services Department. So, you’re right, there have been numerous versions of a Master Plan for Cubberley. The most recent being in, I believe it was adopted in 2019, so since that time the school district has changed it’s vision for their portion of the site, which is contiguous to the City’s portion. So the City owns 8-acres and the school district owns 27, we’re still in conversations with them though about potentially doing some sort of land swap, or purchase from the school district by the City of some additional acreage there. And, since there is a change from the school district’s plan for the site and how much acreage the City might have, we would need to do a new study, however, there was a lot of great information that came out of the last Cubberley Master Plan and I think we could absolutely build off of that Master Plan and use a lot of the information there to inform the next step. So, I don’t think it’s a complete waste, definitely will head us in the right direction and help inform our next step.

Vice-Chair Summa: And is it being planned for a little bit later in the cycle, as I recall.

Ms. O’Kane: It is and (crosstalk) a lot of that has to do with staffing bandwidth so the Community Services Department has a lot of other initiatives that we’re looking at right now, a

---

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson’s presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.



1 skate park, a potential new gym, and we just don't have the staffing to take on another large  
2 project at the time.

3

4 Vice-Chair Summa: Okay, and I certainly don't think it's a wasted effort at all, I was just curious  
5 about the timing, so thank you very much.

6

7 Ms. O'Kane: You're welcome.

8

9 Chair Lauing: Commissioner Chang.

10

11 Commissioner Chang: I had a related question which was when we, for the last cycle, the last  
12 Plan that you said the, Ms. O'Kane said was adopted in 2019, she believes, was that also, was  
13 that plan in process also funded by the CIP?

14

15 Ms. O'Kane: It was. So, there was a Cubberley Master Plan CIP that funded that and also the  
16 school districted funded half of that. So, it was a cost share between the school district and the  
17 City.

18

19 Commissioner Chang: Got it. So, this one we would be embarking on our own then, separate  
20 from the school? And then one of the questions I had related to that, in terms of scale or let's

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 say dollar amount, how big is this planning effort with the \$314,000 planned for in the next 5-  
2 year cycle compared to the last one? I'm just trying to get a sense of how much work we'll be  
3 doing relative to the last planning effort.

4  
5 Ms. O'Kane: Yeah, that's a great question and I don't think we have an answer right now, it  
6 hasn't really been scoped. I will admit that this item in the budget is sort of a place holder for  
7 that work and once we have a better idea of how much acreage we're working with, and sort of  
8 what our scope for the site is, we'll have a better idea of the cost and what it will take to  
9 complete that work.

10  
11 Commissioner Chang: Okay, thanks. Do you know how much we budgeted for the last one?  
12 (crosstalk)

13  
14 Ms. O'Kane: Yes, it was, I believe \$560,000 which was against what was split with the school  
15 district.

16  
17 Commissioner Chang: Okay, thanks, that's just helpful to set sort of an order of magnitude  
18 context, thanks. Appreciate it.

19  
20 Ms. O'Kane: You're welcome.

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20

Chair Lauing: Commissioner Roohparvar.

Commissioner Roohparvar: This is a question for Ms. O’Kane. Were we, correct me if I’m misremembering, but were we thinking about putting workforce housing near Cubberley? Are there still discussions around that? It was a while ago where we discussed it, I want to say it was over a year ago.

Ms. O’Kane: Right. So, there was a discussion of housing on the site. The workforce piece was a conversation with the school district and possibility of having teacher housing on the school District’s property. The housing that was planned, well not planned, the housing that was proposed for the City’s site was not for workforce. It was just regular housing.

Commissioner Roohparvar: Are those discussions still live? Is that still an option? (crosstalk)

Ms. O’Kane: I think anything could be an option. I know that for the school District it’s off the table, I can’t really speak for them but the last I heard that was their decision for the City... we haven’t made a decision.

Commissioner Roohparvar: Yeah. Thank you.

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson’s presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20

Chair Lauing: Commissioner Reckdahl.

Commissioner Reckdahl: Yeah, when I saw this on the list I had mixed feelings, and it's something that we really need to do but, we've had so many disappointments. Kristen probably has PTSD over the last version. But it's something we have to do, and it makes me feel better that it's [unintelligible] through fiscal year 2026, that will give some time to figure out what we want to do with the land slot and other things so, if it were next year, I think it would be a little premature but I think where its preleased I think it's appropriate.

Chair Lauing: Other Commissioners? No other comments? Okay. Then let's move on to the next one which is the Fire Training Facility Replacement and it is item number 5. Commissioner Chang.

Commissioner Chang: Would it be okay if I just ask one more big picture question right now?

Chair Lauing: Of course.

Commissioner Chang: So, I was a little slow on the uptake here, I wanted to follow up on a comment that Commissioner Hechtman made about maybe not... maybe this... I think he was

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 saying something about this coming to us earlier in the year. I do know that Ms Moitra was here  
2 earlier in the year. But, that wasn't for the CIP, correct? That was for general Comp Plan  
3 programs, not necessarily Capital Improvement.

4

5 Ms. Moitra: Yes, yes you are right. That was for Comp Plan program implementation and this is  
6 for CIPs. Totally two different issues.

7

8 Commissioner Chang: So, I wanted to mention that because I was a little confused too, so then  
9 when Commissioner Hechtman mentioned nine items complete, it's actually completely  
10 different bucket of programs rather than Capital Improvement projects, Correct?

11

12 Ms. Moitra: Yes.

13

14 Commissioner Chang: Okay, so then I also wanted to verify with you that the reason why we're  
15 seeing this particular distribution in chart on Packet page 14, where most of the, where the  
16 vast, where the largest proportion of the projects are Natural Environment Element, that's  
17 because of the nature of a Capital Improvement project, it's not necessarily where the City's  
18 spending all of its time but because Capital Improvement projects are of a particular nature,  
19 that's why they all tend to be in this Natural Environment Element.

20

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. Moitra: Yes, and on top of that I should say that the scope of the Natural Environment  
2 Element it should look over air quality, water resources, any kind of infrastructure development  
3 is included in that, a lot of it. That's why you see such a huge number of CIPs aligning with the  
4 Natural Environment Element.

5  
6 Commissioner Chang: Great, thank you. I just wanted to clear up the confusion in my own mind,  
7 and make sure we're all on the same page. Thanks.

8  
9 Chair Lauing: Commissioner Reckdahl.

10  
11 Commissioner Reckdahl: Yeah, I had a question about the current Fire Training Facility, it's on  
12 Stanford Land, do we pay rent for that, how's that arranged right now?

13  
14 Chair Lauing: There's the Chief. Go ahead.

15  
16 Geoffrey Blackshire, Fire Chief: So, we use that facility as part of the contract that we have with  
17 Stanford. We also occupy that fire station on Serra and Campus and that's just how we occupy.  
18 We don't rent it, it's just part of the agreement, that it's on the property and we have access to  
19 it, so that specifically is not separate from the agreement. However, it's brought on here  
20 because in the most recent contract with Stanford, there's no guarantee... or it's in the contract

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 that Stanford is responsible for replacing, rebuilding, or maintaining that training facility, so if at  
2 some point, right now there's no plan to, but if at some point they relocate the fire station to  
3 another area on campus, there's no obligation or expectation that they would include a training  
4 center for the Palo Alto Fire Department.

5

6 Commissioner Reckdahl: And how does that work, do we rent that space or do they give the  
7 space to us in exchange for services?

8

9 Chief Blackshire: No, it's not necessarily a rent, it's just... it's part of the agreement that we  
10 occupy that Fire Station to provide fire and EMS services on campus. And so, all the facilities on  
11 that ... so it was partial fire and part of the Department of Public Safety, the Department of  
12 Public Safety on Stanford relocated to a new building, so right now fire is the only one that  
13 occupies that building. But, the... prior to Palo Alto Fire's agreement, that training center was  
14 for the Stanford Fire Department.

15

16 Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay. And is there any desire to rebuild it? Right now at the same  
17 location.

18

19 Chief Blackshire: A new facility would be desirable in any location. But, right now, when we did  
20 the most recent agreement, it was just for services and knowing that the condition of that

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 building and not knowing the future of whether the fire station will stay on that location and  
2 where it will end up, Stanford representatives did not want to include that building in the  
3 agreement.

4

5 Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay, and so we want to have this training facility for our own  
6 purposes.

7

8 Chief Blackshire: Absolutely. You know it's vital that the Fire Department... or the fire fighters  
9 here in Palo Alto have a training facility to maintain their skills, it's all the department's in the  
10 County, several counties. They do have a training center at one of their fire stations for  
11 example, Mountain View they have one, one at Station 4, Sunnyvale has one that actually it's  
12 on Station 2, [unintelligible] station 1, San Jose is currently rebuilding a new fir... new training  
13 center in their city. So, every agency has their own training facility. Ours is on Stanford campus  
14 and that building is owned by Stanford. It has not been maintained or updated, and there are  
15 components of it that we just can't operate on because of safety issues.

16

17 Commissioner Reckdahl: Although we still use parts of it.

18

19 Chief Blackshire: We still use parts of it. The latest thing we did, we purchased a... I guess the  
20 best way to explain it is ... it is a conex box type module that we can use for some fire training,

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.



1 search and rescue, we can smoke it out, we can drag hose through it, put a ladder against it, but  
2 it is not the same, it doesn't provide the same level of training where the current facility is a 4-  
3 story building that simulates a high rise so we can practice connecting to a riser, taking hose up,  
4 repelling off the top, doing ventilation operations, etcetera ... forcible entry. Most of what we  
5 use it for right now has been modified by you know, the training division of the Fire  
6 Department. But again, the building will not be maintained by Stanford University.

7

8 Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay. And is it feasible for us to share facilities with another city?

9

10 Chief Blackshire: Feasible, well the issue we have right now... so when we typically do training,  
11 we have to take those units out of service because they're conducting in training, and if we get  
12 an emergency they may have their hose all pulled off the fire engine, or the ladders... all this  
13 equipment is pulled off the engine, and for them to be available and respond to an emergency,  
14 in eight minutes or less, is pretty... unrealistic. So, at the rate that we are at right now, and the  
15 resources we have available, before we had more units and our deployment was different, but  
16 due to the reductions of budget and the way we had to modify our staffing model and  
17 deployment model it's not as easy for us to take a unit out of service to send to another agency  
18 so the closest ... so, say we sent... we partnered with Mountain View, to send units all the way  
19 into Mountain View one engine or two engines to do training would really draw down the

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 resources available in the city, and we may, you know, we likely will not be able to serve the  
2 City as efficiently with the units in the City, within the boundaries of Palo Alto.

3

4 Commissioner Reckdah!: Okay.

5

6 Chief Blackshire: Ideally, we would have one in the City, and that's why we would like to have a  
7 feasibility study and we budgeted for that, and the current budget request we asked for money  
8 to do a feasibility study and partnership with Public Works Department to see if it is feasible to  
9 have a training facility somewhere in the City. Where it would be located, how much would it  
10 cost, and the worth of it. So, whether or not it would be in another City, we could have that  
11 conversation but what we do is have to factor in how long our units would be outside the city,  
12 how would they be available, would the city that we're in provide the resources in Palo Alto  
13 while that unit is out, there's a lot to consider for something like that.

14

15 Commissioner Reckdah!: Now if we built this facility, would there be other parts of the City,  
16 whether it be utilities, or police, that would want to use it for their own training?

17

18 Chief Blackshire: You know, I think the more we can... our motto collectively when we respond  
19 to emergencies, we involve utilities, we involve PD, and then other departments to complete  
20 and close down incidents, so if we were able to collaborate with other departments within the

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 city to get a really effective training center, that would be ideal. I would really like to have...  
2 that'd be great if we had a center where PD could use some of the components of it in training,  
3 as well as fire. Again, don't know what that would look like, and I'm sure there are probably  
4 some models around the country somewhere, where they have a collaborative occupancy like  
5 that. So, you know, I would definitely be open to having other departments be able to utilize  
6 the training facility as well.

7

8 Commissioner Reckdahl: Thank you, that's very useful.

9

10 Chair Lauing: Commissioner Chang.

11

12 Commissioner Chang: Thank you and thank you to Commissioner Reckdahl for asking most of  
13 the questions that I had. One kind of follow up question I had, is it correct that Stanford no  
14 longer has their own Fire Department then?

15

16 Chief Blackshire: That is correct. We ... Stanford had their own fire department in, I want to say  
17 1976 or 74 that we joined. We actually merged with the Stanford Fire Department and there  
18 members became part of the Palo Alto Fire Department and we had an agreement, signed to an  
19 agreement to provide those services since then. Since that contract, that's how we've been  
20 serving that community.

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20

Commissioner Chang: One more question. So, is Palo Alto Fire the only... the only group that is using the current facility in any capacity then, that's on Stanford's land?

Chief Blackshire: Primarily it is the Palo Alto Fire Department, right now we are partnered with a joint fire academy with Milpitas and County Fire and the agreement is that we would share resources and so we are using the training tower in Milpitas, and we are using the training tower in... I want to say it's in Campbell, is where County Fire's training center is. And then in some cases Palo Alto is also primarily for Palo Alto but on occasion, for example, in the academy we will have other agencies utilize what we have to offer, and, that was the real reasoning behind purchasing this module for training, is for this fire academy that we have currently going on right now.

Commissioner Chang: Okay then, so ultimately, as part of the study, that this CIP is supposed to fund, we'd also be looking at... the analysis would also include where we might be able to share some of the cost with other municipalities that might want to use our facilities also for some purpose, is that correct?

Chief Blackshire: In this case, it could be. What we've done in the past for the Fire Academy is if we had sent our personnel to... our recruits to other agencies, mostly with Sunnyvale, because

---

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 our timing with hiring has lined with up with them, I believe, with an exception with the  
2 academy that we are currently in, I believe the last five to six academies were with Sunnyvale,  
3 again they have a very robust training center and they have the room for that and we just can't  
4 accommodate an academy of 15 people to do all the skills that are required for a fire fighter  
5 one, California State Fire Fighter One Certification, we just, we aren't able to do all the... have  
6 the resources to provide that training. So, you know, they have their own... you know, again,  
7 the whole purpose of this is the share resources in an academy, it's a collaborative effort, it's a  
8 joint bi-academy. San Jose, which is a very large department, they are a metro sized  
9 department and County fire is very large as well, they typically have their own, but they have  
10 also been open to doing joint fire academies. Primarily this would be for Palo Alto but it would  
11 also give us the opportunity to host as we have in the past before, the condition of the tower is  
12 unsuitable to provide for a full academy.

13

14 Commissioner Chang: Great. Thank you so much for giving us all this useful information Chief.

15

16 Chief Blackshire: You're welcome.

17

18 Chair Lauing: Commissioner Hechtman.

19

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Hechtman: Thank you. So, I first want to thank Commissioner Chang, on the  
2 overview point for clearing up, I was confused and now I'm not because the, you and staff  
3 walked me through it, so that was really very helpful to better focus me. On this item, the Fire  
4 Training Facility Replacement, so it's my view that police and fire are the two most important  
5 services that this city or any city provides for its citizens, and because those two departments  
6 are dealing with life and death issues, it's paramount that that the personnel that staff those  
7 departments be adequately trained and ready to respond to anything that occurs. So, with that  
8 mindset, I was really concerned when I read the description that's here in our Staff Packet on  
9 page 11, with that in mind. Because here's what I see in this Staff Packet. We have a current  
10 training facility on Stanford, but it's unsafe to use. So, to me, that tells me that we're not using  
11 it because that would be unsafe for our fire fighters. We got a temporary trailer to perform  
12 some of the training activities, that suggests to me that they're not able to all the training  
13 activities. We're talking about a feasibility study to be done in 2024, and assuming that happens  
14 on time, it would be shocking if we build our replacement facility in even three years after that.  
15 So, 2027, five years from now. So, the concern I have is how do we keep our fire personnel  
16 adequately trained until we have that new facility? And, do we need to condense this time  
17 frame that we're considering in this CIP, to accelerate the process of getting a facility that will  
18 provide all the training tools that the Chief and his staff need to be adequately trained and  
19 ready to perform their emergency services in our City. That's my question, am I understanding  
20 the current situation with availability of training accurately from the report here?

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Chief Blackshire: Yes, if that question is directed towards me I would absolutely agree and we  
3 know that this is going to be a long term project, effort, that's why we're trying to get... you  
4 know we've been talking about it for years, matter of fact when we finally came into a new  
5 agreement with Stanford and they said they weren't going to replace that building, we knew at  
6 that time that it was going to be an issue that we had to deal with and didn't know how quick  
7 we can get it done or even get the, you know, what ideas did we have for it. So, timing is an  
8 issue, how we're going to get the training done? You know, we've had to be real creative on  
9 trying to fill gaps in our training to get the appropriate training done, especially when we do our  
10 own academy, you know, we'll have to take our recruits elsewhere, but it's challenging to get  
11 our personnel that are working to go to another city to provide that training and, you know  
12 Milpitas is looking at replacing their building that they had actually built in the late 90's, they  
13 had a new building. Mountain View is about to replace theirs at Station 4, Sunnyvale is also  
14 looking at some... updating their training center, so, having an effective training center is  
15 paramount, as you said. To keep their skills up, to give them confidence to preform, be safe and  
16 effective on these emergencies.

17

18 Commissioner Hechtman: And if I can just ask one more follow-up to the Chief and to the rest  
19 of the staff who's here, so, what can the... if my fellow commissioners are of a similar mind,  
20 what can we do tonight in conveying our recommendation to the City Council about the CIP

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 program that would move it faster. How do we do that if that's what the Commission wanted to  
2 do?

3

4 Mr. Harper: Paul Harper with the office of Finance and Budget. Thank you Commissioner, so the  
5 budget was funded in 2024 for this project due to staff workload issues and that's mainly in the  
6 Public Works Department, we just wanted to make sure that with all the other Capital projects  
7 that are currently planned, we wanted to make sure they had adequate time to preform this  
8 study and when we talked with staff, they did not think they would have time to put this into  
9 their workplan for 2023, so that's why it's in 2024.

10

11 Ms. Tanner: I think to answer your question proper, specifically, if the Commission did want to  
12 send this with the recommendation to Council that they try to advance this project sooner, that  
13 probably would be the extent of what the PTC can do to convey that message, either via the  
14 Motion and then what Chair Lauing does is sign a letter, which is in your packet and so that  
15 could be... we could put the Motion for example into that letter and then that would be  
16 conveyed in that vehicle.

17

18 Chair Lauing: Yeah, were you done?

19

20 Commissioner Hechtman: Yeah, thank you.

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.



1

2 Chair Lauing: That's what I was going to suggest actually and since it's so close, I would just say  
3 that that's exactly the speech that I was going to give, completely... I mean... there's nothing  
4 more important than public safety. That's what government is for. And when we can't get our  
5 firemen trained, this reminds me of a CIP that we had in the Parks Commission years ago, and  
6 we kept putting off and putting off protection for wildfires in... which park was that ... one of  
7 the big parks, and we go "Woah! Are we going to fix it after it burns down?" You know, so this  
8 has to be a top priority, there's just no question about it and this number, \$70,000 dollars is a di  
9 minimis number in the context of what we're trying to pull off so, I think if you're actually  
10 saying we can't do enough, we can't really do training, and you now do have staff to kind of  
11 work on this thing, then I think that could be an item we can deal with tonight. So, I don't have  
12 anything more to add because that's what I was going to say. The only question is if you get to  
13 the... when you get to the study, it is Land Use so where you put that is important, so, obviously  
14 that would be one of the considerations as you do the feasibility study, and how many acres  
15 you need is another thing, because it's used for that as opposed to something else. So, there's  
16 that obvious trade-off in Land Use. I think Vice-Chair Summa had some comments.

17

18 Vice-Chair Summa: Sorry, I put a page in front of this page. Yeah, I share some of the concerns  
19 just voiced by some of my colleagues and I actually think that perhaps we might recommend  
20 that the Council consider allotting, \$70k is a small amount of money and maybe it could be

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 done quicker if more money was... the analysis could be done quicker if a consultant was hired  
2 to help in this case. And, cause it is pretty concerning that we currently don't have adequate  
3 training except in a very inconvenient way, it kind of... not locally. And then I was also going to  
4 ask, is it... without getting into the details of the really complicated relationship regarding fire  
5 with Stanford and the City, is it actually the case that the... relationship that we have with them  
6 now, the deal we have with them now would allow them to close us down in advance of an  
7 alternate being available?

8

9 Chief Blackshire: Is that directed towards me?

10

11 Vice-Chair Summa: I think so. You're in charge.

12

13 Chief Blackshire: Yeah, so, you know.. as I said we still use the facility to the best of our ability,  
14 we are able to do some training with it. We supplemented that building with the container that  
15 we purchased for the current academy that we have. The concern is that, you know, it will not  
16 be maintained or rebuilt, you know, and as time goes on, the condition, it just gets older. And  
17 so, we feel that we need to address having an updated facility that can provide for training that  
18 has changed since it's been built, I don't know when it's been built, but it's... it had to be late  
19 60's early 70's, I would imagine. So again, we use it to the best of our ability. We modified it to  
20 do a lot of the training that we need to but that's something that the firefighters have done, is

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 to make modifications to it to address the training that we need to do, which is limited. So,  
2 where we will continue to use it to the best of our ability. We're grateful for that... that we had  
3 the funds to purchase this container to supplement the training that we do with the tower. So,  
4 it does is need to close down? It's not... we wouldn't use it at all if we felt it was going to be you  
5 know, so dangerous that we're going to risk... the... safety of the firefighters to do training, you  
6 know, we're not there yet. We're very cognizant of what we can and cannot do on that ... on  
7 that tower, and that's what we, that's how we provide... determine the limitations on that  
8 building, so I just wanted to make that clear, that we are still able to use it, we're cognizant of  
9 what we can and cannot do with it, but we know that... that the opportunity to have an  
10 updated facility that reflects the training that has changed since it was built, so we don't have  
11 to, again, make up our own, you know, modify our own... what are the called ... props to do the  
12 training. So, you know, again, we do what we have to do, we know that we need the training,  
13 we know that training is paramount but we feel that our firefighters deserve an updated  
14 training center that we can utilize to reflect all the disciplines in firefighting, and we also feel  
15 the citizens deserve to have a well trained fire department, which we are, but to have that all  
16 there, and I really like the idea of, you know, multiple departments and how we could utilize  
17 the training center for multiple departments and what they can use cause even on the training  
18 tower we have our firefighters built a utility prop because when we go on the scene of a fire,  
19 we have to shut down utilities, but not to the level that the utilities department does, because  
20 they can actually take the gas meter off and shut it down to the house. But, what we do, is we

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 just turn the gas off and shut the power down because those are hazards on a fire. So, again, if  
2 there was maybe a utility prop that the utility department would like to have on the building so  
3 we could work collaboratively, I'm confident, but I'm not sure because I'm not a police officer,  
4 but I'm sure there may be some opportunities for PD to utilize it as well for some of their  
5 disciplines.

6

7 Holly Boyd, Assistant Director of Public Works Department: Thanks [unintelligible], I just wanted  
8 to add, my name is Holly Boyd, I'm the assistant Director for Public Works, so the fire  
9 department brought forward this project this past fiscal year and it was included, given their  
10 concern, about the future of the fire tower. So, I know they did an immediate, kind of... kind of  
11 interim fix at mid-year and got this kind of training trailer, I'm going to call it, however we did  
12 put this feasibility study in for fiscal year '24 given from staff workloads. Our priorities have  
13 been our infrastructure plan and right now we are in the middle of the Public Safety Building  
14 construction, which fire admin will occupy once it's done at the end of next year, and we are  
15 also kicking off our design for Fire Station 4, which has been on the books for a long time. So,  
16 that has taken up a considerable amount of work time, and staff workload to get to other  
17 projects that are relatively new, so, I'm... we're pretty confident, and maybe we can do another  
18 check in next mid-year or Fiscal-24, that a feasibility study to start the process of looking for a  
19 site, because finding a site's not going to be easy, honestly. This is a three plus story tower that  
20 we have to put on some City owned land. So, it's not going to be attractive and it's not gonna

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 be easy to find a site. So, it's something that we need to have some thought put into and do a  
2 feasibility study in coordination with the fire department so we can look at all the potential  
3 sites and constraints. So, I just wanted to add some additional information.

4

5 Vice-Chair Summa: Okay, thank you.

6

7 Chair Lauing: Just for clarity, is that input Ms. Boyd, that you don't think it can move up from  
8 where it is?

9

10 Ms. Boyd: No, no okay, I do think, I don't think the Stanford site will be feasible given that, what  
11 I'm hearing from Geo and others is that Stanford University may have plans for that land in the  
12 future. So I don't think that site is going to be one of the front runners, and we're going to have  
13 to look within the City limits, at one of our City owned facility.

14

15 Chair Lauing: I was asking if you think it would be appropriate to try to move this up with an  
16 extra \$70,000 of CIP funding or if you're saying that you couldn't use it anyway until '24, Fiscal  
17 '24.

18

19 Ms. Boyd: Yeah, we don't have the staff capacity to do it right now unless we get Council to  
20 reprioritize our infrastructure projects.

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20

Chair Lauing: Okay, thanks for that clarification. Vice-Chair.

Vice-Chair Summa: Thank you both, it's very helpful to hear all that information, and ... you know, I'll just chime in with my colleagues and emphasize how important this is really, especially if we don't have any assurance of Stanford's plans regarding that property. Maybe they can find another place to put it that's in a less central portion on the land though, I don't know if that's been discussed. But I'll leave it at that. Thank you.

Chair Lauing: Commissioner Hechtman.

Commissioner Hechtman: This has been really helpful, to hear both from Fire and Public Works and to fill this out. It is a thorny problem, and incidentally Chair [note - Chair Lauing], we've spent a lot of time on this, but just so you know, I really don't have any comments on the last seven. So, maybe, some of my Commissioners are the same, maybe those will move pretty quickly. But on this one, this is important and I'm glad we're spending the time on it. The thought occurred to me, and actually I thought at one point, this is where Commissioner Chang was gonna go, that station, that training facility on the Stanford campus is also, in addition to the training, is also a fire station. Is that right Chief?

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chief Blackshire: That is correct.

2

3 Commissioner Hechtman: Okay, and that fire station provides fire protection to the Stanford  
4 campus, and because Stanford's fire department merged into ours in the 70's, we are the fire  
5 protection. And so, with that fact, I was wondering if we can leverage their need for us, to bring  
6 them to the table to share in the funding necessary to keep this training facility, to make this  
7 training facility safe and keep it that way, until we can build our new facility. It's probably  
8 something you've explored, and you know, I'm being introduced to this today, but I'm curious  
9 of what, if any, dialogue has happened. If you need help from the City Council, to put pressure  
10 in that direction, you know, what can we do for the short-term solution until you can get a new  
11 facility built.

12

13 Chair Lauing: Go ahead and address that if you'd like.

14

15 Chief Blackshire: Okay, sorry, I wasn't sure if that was directed towards me. In the short term  
16 our plan is to continue doing what we are doing, you know, as I said just be able to obtain the  
17 container through the purchasing process and the timing of it was very appreciative and again,  
18 we're using it to the best of our ability. But, the only plan we have right now is to continue  
19 using the tower to the best of our ability, to make sure that they are getting the training and  
20 staying safe, and maybe something else can come up where we can supplement what we have

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 available at the tower. So that's the plan, unfortunately we don't have a lot more than that at  
2 this time, where we can address the training that we desire to have, again, something that  
3 reflects the disciplines in fire that have changed over the course of decades from the 70's. Kiely  
4 did you like to speak on this?

5

6 Kiely Nose, Administrative Services Director and Interim Assistant City Manager: Sure, good  
7 evening, if possible, good evening... Kiely Nose, Administrative Services Director and Interim  
8 Assistant City Manager. Just wanted to provide a little bit of color on this as it is a complex  
9 relationship we have with Stanford, regarding fire services. So, we do have a agreement, frankly  
10 a lengthy agreement, with Stanford on the cost of delivering fire services and the costs that  
11 they help contribute as they obviously are the beneficiary of those services, included in that is a  
12 cost share of Capital Improvements. So, to the extent that we are making Capital  
13 Improvements, whether it be directly on Station 6, or something that's part of the fire  
14 infrastructure in whole, they will pay their pro-rata share of those, and that's already  
15 determined based on that contractual agreement. So, as we do make investments, as we  
16 reconcile that agreement, we do work with Stanford on those fair share of costs based on those  
17 terms. Obviously as Chief Blackshire has noted, we have this interim solution with this  
18 container, plus the existing tower, but obviously Stanford can potentially, likely, has other plans  
19 and we will need a new facility that there will come a time when we need to move it. And so  
20 what staff is really doing is, is raising this, obviously, so that we can move forward with the long

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.



1 term sustainable plan for a facility that meets the current day needs of the Fire Department and  
2 all the services that they afford, acknowledging this transition that Stanford is going through on  
3 their campus as well. So, I think the feedback from the Commission is heard, and I think Staff  
4 shares the same prioritization of we need to make sure that we have a facility that can support  
5 these, and so we're moving through the steps since it's not going to be as Assistant Director  
6 Boyd said, we can't just stand it up somewhere. There are gonna be impacts as it's a three story  
7 relatively not always architecturally attractive facility. And so, needing to move through those  
8 processes, we're getting that started basically. So, I just wanted to acknowledge we do have  
9 relationships with Stanford, we do have contract agreement and we'll be working with them on  
10 that, as per those contract terms. Thanks.

11

12 Chair Lauing: Any other comments on this one? Okay. I guess there are none, so we can pick  
13 this up at the end if we'd like. The next one is Bol Park Pathway, repaving and repair, 1.2 miles.  
14 Commissioner Templeton.

15

16 Commissioner Templeton: Thank you, I live in Barron Park and we use this all the time and see  
17 how often and how well loved it is and well used it is and it is desperately in need of repair, so  
18 I'm really excited to see that on here.

19

20 Chair Lauing: Okay, others? Vice-Chair Summa.

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20

Vice-Chair Summa: Thank you. Yes it is in need of repair, but I noticed that this is one probably going to be exempt from CEQA but I'm sure... I'm sure that everyone would agree it's a sensitive park location near a creek that it should... I just wanted to make the point that this should be done with a mind to... being the least disruptive to the environment there, as it's being done. So many it doesn't need CEQA, but the appropriate, you know... considerations that it's in a park that's somewhat naturalized it as it has a creek in it and those sorts of things.

Ms. Boyd: Yes. We, we do appreciate where it is and we'll be coordinating this project with, again sorry I didn't say my name, Holly Boyd, Assistant Director of Public Works, so, Public Works will be working on this project with community services as well as the Office of Transportation during engagement process and community meetings to identify the scope and everything, so.

Vice-Chair Summa: Yeah, Especially in remembering the recent toxic spill in the creek there, I think that the neighbors there are very sensitive about that, and I think it has to be paved because it's primarily a bike path. Maybe look into the best materials perhaps even permeable paving, all those sorts of things (interrupted)

Ms. Boyd: Yes

---

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20

Vice-Chair Summa: Which I'm sure staff is going to do anyway.

Ms. Boyd: Definitely. Thank you.

Vice-Chair Summa: Thank you.

Chair Lauing: Commissioner Reckdahl.

Commissioner Reckdahl: Yeah, I agree this is very important. My only hesitation is when I look at the values it's gonna be 1.4 million dollars, that seems like a lot for paving a bike path. There's some major repair that has to go on?

Ms. Boyd: Well, we haven't done a lot of investigative work we've used to come up with that cost assessment, there's some design costs in there as we will be... given the size, we're gonna, you know, put in some kind of green element, whether it be permeable paving, or some kind of feature like that. And we used recent bid items for bid prices that we've received for similar projects to come up with that, but really it's a 1.2 mile, it's quite a distance. It does include design and construction contingency. So.

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay, so that value is typical, it's not like there's some major  
2 foundation that has to be repaired.

3

4 Ms. Boyd: No, and it does not include work on the ... I think there's two bridges out there, work  
5 on those bridges are being done through a separate project so it doesn't include actually any  
6 work on those bridges.

7

8 Commissioner Reckdahl: And what is our best practices for these, you mentioned green  
9 permeable pavement. Is that a standard or is that optional?

10

11 Mr. Boyd: No, it's not a standard yet, however, we've been trying to implement, when we do  
12 large projects like this, pathway projects or projects in park, just our general capital projects,  
13 we try and implement as many green features as we can to help improve run off, I'm thinking  
14 permeable pavement might be a good thing here because it's already in our park land, so, you  
15 know run off is already happening to the natural environment on the site, so that's what... it's  
16 something that we're trying to include as part of our, Karin's probably going to help me out...  
17 our green ordinance, I'm forgetting the thing...

18

19 Chair Lauing: Sustainability.

20

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. Boyd: Yes.

2

3 Ms. Karin, Assistant Director of Public Works Department: Our green stormwater on our  
4 infrastructure. Karin North, Public Works Director of Environmental Services, so Holly's ying to  
5 her yang. So, when she does a capital project we try and figure out how to compliment it and  
6 put in some green stormwater infrastructure which is actually now required with our regional  
7 municipal stormwater permit, the new one, the Hearing was actually today. So, we're gonna  
8 have more new fun requirements for GSI, which the short hand version of Green Stormwater  
9 Infrastructure. So, and parks are an excellent way where we can compliment. So, if we're doing  
10 some kind of upgrade to a park facility, we'll figure out how to incorporate how to slow the  
11 flow of water, treat that water, potentially maybe in the future put on some cisterns and maybe  
12 other things like that but that's a bigger broader discussion. But, we are trying to figure out how  
13 to, especially with the drought, reuse and repurpose this water if we can, and capture it.

14

15 Commissioner Reckdahl: Where's the starting and stopping points for this?

16

17 Ms. Boyd: So, let's see, so this.. well I start.. Arastradero Foothill Expressway over there is a  
18 starting point and then it goes all the way over to Stanford research park over by Hanover.

19

20 Commissioner Reckdahl: Oh, so it's the whole path.

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20

Ms. Boyd: It's the whole thing. Yeah.

Commissioner Reckdahl: Oh. Okay. Okay. That makes sense... I was thinking that there was just a short little piece that goes from Hanover over to the park, but it's all the way through the park, all the way to Gunn.

Ms. Boyd: Yes.

Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay. Thank you.

Chair Lauing: Any other comments on this one? Okay, we'll move on to the next one which is Roth Building Phase One.

Commissioner Templeton: Chair?

Chair Lauing: What?

Commissioner Templeton: Do the infrastructure first?

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Sorry. Sorry. Sorry. The electric charger infrastructure installation is the next item,  
2 thanks for the correction, Commissioner Templeton.

3  
4 Commissioner Templeton: Yes, I wanted to say first of all I'm really glad to see that we're  
5 moving towards more EVs in our fleet and that we'll build the infrastructure to support them. I  
6 would also just plant the seed that cause it says in here that these are primarily intended for  
7 our fleet, if there are known hours when it won't be in use, if you can incorporate making those  
8 publicly available, I think you'd get a lot more use out of it. As a counter example, my children's  
9 local school, they have a bunch of, I want to say ten or twelve EV chargers that are not in use on  
10 the... when school is out. And, only the teachers are allowed to use it, so it's kind of wasted, it  
11 would be nice to be able to have it, you know, preferred for City vehicles and then available for  
12 others if they want to use it in the off hours. But I think this is a great project.

13  
14 Chair Lauing: Others, Commissioner Reckdahl.

15  
16 Commissioner Reckdahl: That's a ghost hand but I'll say yes, this is a good project, we have an  
17 EV and finding a charging station sometimes is a challenge so, the more the merrier.

18  
19 Chair Lauing: Okay, others on this one? Nope. Okay then, we'll move on to the Roth Building,  
20 Phase One. Hands for that? Vice-Chair Summa.

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14

Vice-Chair Summa: Thank you, so I... I think I'll refer to the big binder here, I had some clarifications I wanted to ask staff about this project. It's just phase one, and in looking on the right side of binder page 115, the funding sources schedule. I was trying to figure out what Capital Improvement Fund meant where that \$5,600,000 comes from and revenues from other agencies. So, I think what the former is, the five million six hundred, is the TDRs that are incorporated as a part of this project and I'm not sure about the other agencies and I understand the following for or all designated funds that this project, already existing funds of this project, will be utilized because it qualified for them, so, and that's... the total at \$11 million is not \$11 million out of the General Fund or anything like that, for the public, that these funds were designated for this project through historic seismic updates and TDRs and other existing funds, because when I looked at it the first time, I said how could this first, how could this be, I was just trying to understand it so, am I thinking about it the right way, I guess is the question.

15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20

Mr. Harper: Thank you for the questions, Paul Harper with the Office of Management and Budget, I'll take that question. You are correct the \$5.6 million is the TDR funding that has been reserved essentially in the Capital Improvement fund for improvements to this building. The revenue from other agencies is a grant from the County of Santa Clara to repair I believe, the roof, and some of the frescoes on the wall. And, yeah, the other funding... the funding plan for this project was essentially discussed with Council as part of the Fiscal-Year 2022 budget

---

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.



1 process, this project was just not set up at that point in time so it's coming back this year to be  
2 set up based on discussions that happened last year. Most of the other funding sources from  
3 the Impact Fee Funds will still need to be approved in terms of the final plan that comes  
4 forward, but this is staff's estimate base on the initial plans that we've seen, but those will need  
5 to be approved once the finals plans are done to ensure that the space has been designated  
6 aligns with those Impact Fee funds.

7

8 Vice-Chair Summa: Okay. Thank you, for that clarification. And I'm happy to see this project  
9 coming up and moving forward I just did want to clarify that for the public, it's not like the City  
10 is taking \$11 million dollars and putting it here. It's designated funds. Okay, thanks.

11

12 Chair Lauing: Commissioner Reckdahl.

13

14 Commissioner Reckdahl: Yeah, I'm confused about the TDR's, can you just give me TDR 101, are  
15 these TDRs that have already been sold, are they going to be sold?

16

17 Mr. Harper: They have already been sold.

18

19 Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay. Were they sold a few years ago, is this the Sea Scout's TDRs, or  
20 is this, was this recent?

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20

Mr. Harper: So, the Sea Scout ones were a part of this, they were transitioned to this project. A few years ago, there was a Council Action to shift those as part of this, Kiely, I'm not sure if you have more information on when the other one's were sold.

Ms. Nose: Sure, it's been in the teens, it's been a few years since they've been sold, I want to say they were probably sold somewhere around 2015, 2016, and once the proceeds from that sell were received, Staff's just been reserving it, pending the continued partnership with the museum, and the lease agreement and option agreement. So, the TDR's I believe were both sold for the Sea Scout Building as well as the Roth Facility as 300 Homer, itself.

Commissioner Reckdah!: Okay, so, private people bought these TDRs (interrupted)

Ms. Nose: That's correct.

Commissioner Reckdah!: And that allows, they just have them sitting on the shelf right now and eventually they'll come, and they'll do a project and they'll be able to increase the density? Is that how it works?

Ms. Nose: Yes.

---

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20

Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay, and have any of them been used or are they all just sitting on the shelf?

Ms. Nose: That I don't have the information on.

Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay. Okay, thank you. Oh, one more question, so, how does it work when someone wants to use the TDR, sometimes in a year of height limits and other things like that, they still are constrained by all the design constraints, correct?

Ms. Nose: Correct, and I suspect Assistant Director Tanner can help on the more particulars from a process perspective on this, but yes, just because someone has development rights doesn't mean that they have the ability to circumvent our existing code structures.

Ms. Tanner: I can add more detail if you're interested, I will say in my experience with the TDR program is limited, I don't know if Ms. Campbell has more detail, but it does allow for, it also depends on how the TDRs are being applied, what product they're being applied to, how they might change the building's form, but we can certainly provide more detail if the Commission is interested.

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Reckdahl: Clare, do you have a quick answer, or do you want take it offline?

2

3 Clare Campbell, Long Range Planning Manager: Yeah, we can probably take it... it's a little bit  
4 complicated, I would definitely say, but generally, I would say that Kiely was right on point that  
5 when you get your TDR's, you still need to comply with other development regulations, but  
6 TDRs have always been a little bit of a complicated project to do, so certainly I can spend some  
7 time with you if you'd like to talk through it a little bit more.

8

9 Commissioner Reckdahl: And these TDRs can be used for any purpose? For example office  
10 versus residential versus retail...

11

12 Ms. Campbell: It's not association with specifically with a Land Use, it's just associated with the  
13 building, the development of the building, and it's definitely not for, it's not meant for  
14 residential purposes, definitely non-residential development.

15

16 Commissioner Reckdahl: Oh, non-residential, interesting. And if it adds density, that extra  
17 density, that extra square footage still... it doesn't do anything with the office cap. If you  
18 wanted to use this to add office, does that extra space count towards the office cap?

19

20 Ms. Campbell: I believe that it does but I'd have to double check.

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20

Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay, Thank you.

Chair Lauing: Any other comments on this one? Okay. Next up is California Avenue Streetscape update. Commissioner or comments on that one? Conceptual design and community engagement to develop options for expanding the spaces there. Nobody? Okay. Ope... Ope, Commissioner Roohparvar.

Commissioner Roohparvar: I just had a quick question. We received a survey , does this relate to the survey that everyone in Palo Alto received about what to do with Cal Ave?

Ms. Tanner: This is the California Ave Streetscape project I believe...

Commissioner Roohparvar: Oh, sorry. No, it says Cal Ave (crosstalk) that's Cal Ave.

Chair Lauing: This is Cal Ave.

Ms. Tanner: Sorry, sorry. This is not [crosstalk] survey in terms of... Council has given the City Staff direction to have staff return with an item next money to keep the street close for 2 years while there is a study to.. which will be the study to think about the future of California Avenue

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 and look at permit closures and explore that process. Council does not need to keep street  
2 closed to do that, and through the budget process they would, you know, if they adopt this  
3 project in the CIP, that would allocate the budget to have that program take place and that  
4 expiration. So, it relates to it but it's not necessarily you know, you can have the streets open  
5 up and still do a study about closing them permanently.

6

7 Commissioner Roohparvar: Got it, okay. That's helpful, thank you.

8

9 Chair Lauing: Okay, we'll move on to the E. Meadow Circle connection to Adobe Creek pump  
10 station. Any comments on that? Commissioner Hechtman.

11

12 Commissioner Hechtman: Just one very minor one, Staff, if you wouldn't mind, when this goes  
13 to Council, insert the word stormwater after Circle, E. Meadow Circle Stormwater connection,  
14 there are... pump stations for stormwater, for fresh water and for sewer. And, I wasn't, this one  
15 actually doesn't say what it is until the last sentence of the first paragraph, but before you get  
16 there you read this existing line is discharging into Barron Creek. And so, that made me a little  
17 nervous until I got to the end of the paragraph. So, we can help the Councilmembers avoid that  
18 discomfort by just adding stormwater. Thanks.

19

20 Chair Lauing: Commissioner Reckdahl.

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20

Commissioner Reckdahl: Yeah, my question was how critical is this? Is this something that would be nice to have or is this something that has to be done?

Ms. Boyd: Good evening again, this is Holly Boyd, Assistant Director of Public Works. So this is actually one of the identified 13 projects that went as a storm drain ballot measure, I think in 2017, and it was approved, so this is one of the highest priorities in the Cities, along with it's 12 other companions, so this is actually just the next highest priority one in the Plan that is being added to the Capital Budget for the Fiscal Year 2026.

Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay, so we are constrained to do this.

Ms. Boyd: Yes. Per the ballot measure the residents voted to do these projects.

Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay. Just curious, what would happen if we didn't do this, from an engineering standpoint. Is there a flooding risk?

Ms. Boyd: Yeah, it will continue to be susceptible to flooding and high flow and high... in large rain events which we haven't had a lot of, but they are... can be intense at times. And it's actually part of a connection to a previous project that was already approved, E. Meadow Drive

---

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 system, so a lot of these projects connect together so, we do one, and then we do the next one,  
2 and then we do the next one. So, if we don't do this project, and we do the other one, we'll just  
3 be pushing any flooding issues further along.

4

5 Commissioner Reckdah]: Yeah. Okay. Thank you.

6

7 Chair Lauing: Commissioner Roohparvar.

8

9 Commissioner Roohparvar: Yeah, I had a similar question whether this was necessary given we  
10 don't have.. you know, we're in a drought. So, another question, is... does this line take water  
11 from Barron Creek that over flows and puts it into Adobe Creek? Or vice versa. Or is it Adobe  
12 Creek into Barron Creek? I was looking at it on a map and trying to figure it out.

13

14 Ms. Boyd: I believe it's Barron into Adobe.

15

16 Commissioner Roohparvar: Barron into Adobe. Okay. Okay, and then we have to do it, because  
17 it seems a bit unnecessary, but we have to do it per the ballot.

18

19 Ms. Boyd: Yes, I mean the ballot measure recommends these projects to help alleviate flooding  
20 even though flooding might not occur in all over... these are areas that have been identified

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.



1 that flood even with a small storm. So, a lot of these are going to address small storm spot area  
2 issues as well as provide maintenance upgrades for pipes that are at their end of life.

3

4 Commissioner Roohparvar: Thank you.

5

6 Chair Lauing: Commissioner Templeton.

7

8 Commissioner Templeton: Thank you. I just wanted to underscore what Ms. Boyd said that this  
9 is absolutely necessary for Palo Alto. I had the pleasure of attending a lecture on the history of  
10 flooding and flood control and in Palo Alto a few years ago, and there's a whole complex  
11 network of undergrounded tunnels and work that has been done to prevent flooding that used  
12 to occur all the time. And especially at this Bol Park, Barron Adobe area, there's a ton of  
13 flooding potential, it's absolutely necessary.

14

15 Chair Lauing: Okay. Any other comments? If not, we'll go to the Scheduled Vehicle and  
16 Equipment Replacement. Commissioner Reckdahl.

17

18 Commissioner Reckdahl: One thing I noticed about this is that the primary Comp Plan element  
19 is Natural Environment, which doesn't seem appropriate, they say that they will try to do  
20 Electric Cars but if you look at the list of vehicles that are in the Fleet, almost all of them are

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 trucks and things like that which likely would not be electrical vehicles. So, that seems  
2 something that we should fix. Because I don't think that's appropriate but from a standpoint of  
3 whether the project is good, it seems appropriate to keep the fleet up to date, but ...

4  
5 Ms. Moitra: The reason why it is in Natural Environment is because of the Air Quality. The older  
6 the vehicles are, it defects the air quality and the emissions so, that's why newer vehicles would  
7 be something which everybody would desire and that's the reason we put it in air quality.

8  
9 Commissioner Reckdahl: Is that the primary reason we're buying new vehicles, or is probably  
10 because the vehicles are old and we want more reliable vehicles.

11  
12 Ms. Moitra: I can't say whether... the reason why their buying them (crosstalk)

13  
14 Ms. Tanner: I think certainly we could say there are co-benefits so even if we need to replace  
15 vehicles because they are needed to be renewed it can also provide the co-benefits to the  
16 environment.

17  
18 Commissioner Reckdahl: Oh yeah, certainly if they're at the end of life then it makes sense,  
19 then I would agree that... but if you're ... anyway, you get premise of my point.

20

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Is it the intent with these vehicles to go all electric now? Or are some impossible  
2 to get that way, trucks, whatever.

3  
4 Mike Wong, Assistant Director of Public Works Department: So I can answer that last two  
5 questions. This is Mike Wong the interim Assistant Director of Public Works Public Services. The  
6 vehicle replacement is scheduled because the vehicles are at the end of their typical useful life,  
7 and we're trying to convert to EV vehicles, when possible, but as you mentioned, you know...  
8 the availability of EV vehicles is really scarce right now. The technology hasn't brought the  
9 vehicles forward yet, plus with the material shortages and delivery issues we can't even get gas  
10 powered vehicles right now. We're looking at, when we can, when EV vehicles are available,  
11 particularly heavy-duty trucks, as they slowly become available with technology, we're looking  
12 to convert when we can.

13  
14 Chair Lauing: Okay, thank you. Other questions on this one? Okay, seeing none. The next one  
15 up is the Joint Intersecting Sewer Rehab Phase One. Sewer trunk line. Comments or questions?  
16 Commissioner Summa [**note - Vice-Chair Summa**].

17  
18 Vice-Chair Summa: Thank you. This one like, the two previous just seem to be annual  
19 assessments of improvements needed and I do think the preference for electric vehicles has  
20 been made clear, their availability is not as clear, but this just seemed... in the absence of

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 knowing anything about sewers really, this just seems like one of those normal maintenance  
2 and improvement things that we need to do and a number of these twelve were like that, so,  
3 that's the only comment I can offer right now.

4  
5 Ms. North: This is Karin North Assistant Public Works Director of Environmental Services  
6 Division, I just want to reassure all of you that this is something that's actually imperative that  
7 we do work on, and that's why it's a last-minute Capital project cause we did an assessment on  
8 the seventy-two inch line sewer and it is deteriorating quickly, so we're trying to get this fixed  
9 as soon as possible. This is the fun of running and operating a regional wastewater treatment  
10 plant. There's always things that need to be fixed, and this one, this sewer line was from the  
11 1970's and we can see the corroding inside of it. So, they'll be lots of projects at the wastewater  
12 treatment plant because we are basically rebuilding the entire facility.

13  
14 Vice-Chair Summa: Thank you for the (interrupted)

15  
16 Ms. North: Yeah, if you ever want to come to towards the [unintelligible] sewer plant, we'll be  
17 happy to give guys a tour so you'll get a more sense of what's in your back yard.

18  
19 Vice-Chair Summa: Yeah, oh that's a great offer, thank you very much. And, thank you for  
20 clarifying.

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20

Ms. North: Absolutely.

Chair Lauing: Anything else on any of these? That someone forgot to ask on an earlier ones, or... if not then we would go back to the beginning and address the requested motion recommending to Council the proposal of the CIPs and that they're consistent with the Comp Plan 2030 Policies and Programs. Commissioner Hechtman.

Commissioner Hechtman: Can we break out at least the Fire Training facilities replacement item from a bulk motion and handle that separately?

Chair Lauing: We could, in my view we don't need to, we can just add that to this and that can be included in the Chair's letter to the Council. If Assistant Director Tanner agrees.

Ms. Tanner: How the Commission would like to structure the motion, it could be a motion to approve on the CIPs and compliance and recommend the Council expedite the CIP related to the fire, it could be two motions if the Commission wishes or one motion with two parts.

Chair Lauing: Yeah, I actually drafted some language about that in the interim here and say that plus, in addition we recommend that Council consider adjusting the infrastructure priorities to

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 include in 2023 the \$70,000 dollars CIP feasibility study for the Fire Training Facility  
2 Replacement 24000.

3

4 Commissioner Hechtman: So, I like that language, I had drafted something similar but yours is  
5 perfect so I would be supportive of that. I did have one other piece that I wanted to tag in, if I  
6 can read that (interrupted)

7

8 Chair Lauing: So just to review where we are. You're moving the Staff Motion including what I  
9 just suggested and now you're going to add a third one, that's fine.

10

11 Commissioner Hechtman: Well, I haven't made a motion yet and I really wanted to put this on  
12 the table for a little bit of discussion (interrupted)

13

14 Chair Lauing: Okay.

15

16 Commissioner Hechtman: Which could be done before or after the motion, but I was thinking  
17 before the motion, just put it out there. So, you've provided one add-on which I'm supportive  
18 of, the other add-on that I'm thinking of is that the Council consider expanding the budget for  
19 this program to include funding for adequate temporary training facilities for fire personnel  
20 until our new training facility is completed.

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18

Chair Lauing: Okay. So, you haven't made a motion yet so (interrupted)

Commissioner Hechtman: No. So that's just a concept that I'm curious about other Commissioner feedback on whether there's general support to include that in the motion or not.

Chair Lauing: Okay. Commissioner Reckdahl.

Commissioner Reckdahl: I have [unintelligible] thing outside of that, to answer Bart's [note – Commissioner Hechtman] question, I would support that also, but when I look at the other lists, these are just new projects we're approving, when I look at the ones we've already approved, one really stands out to me and that's funding this year, 5.7 million dollars for a garage downtown and that would be in conflict with the Housing Element of wanting to put housing above the garages. So, I would encourage that the staff either... or that the Council either delay that for a year or put that money towards design for the garage and housing. I don't think we want to spend money on design of a pure garage, I think that likely would be wasted.

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. Tanner: If I may, if Ms. Nose is still with us, I believe Council did give us direction to explore  
2 a garage and affordable housing so that may connect with that, I'm not sure if that's... Ms.  
3 Nose's still on the line, she's nodding.

4  
5 Ms. Nose: Yes, so right now that's really a place holder while Staff works through the direction  
6 that Director Tanner just noted. So Staff is working on a RFI that will look at use of public  
7 surface lots in the downtown core, with a preference for affordable housing. And so, we won't  
8 be making progress on any investments in terms of a downtown garage until that's completed.

9  
10 Commissioner Reckdahl: Okay, very good, that makes me very happy.

11  
12 Chair Lauing: Okay, back to any motions. Oh, sorry, Commissioner Chang just came on. Go  
13 ahead.

14  
15 Commissioner Chang: Just to say that I too would be supportive of what Commissioner  
16 Hechtman suggested, both the piece... that Chair Lauing suggested as well as what  
17 Commissioner Hechtman suggested.

18

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.



1 Chair Lauing: Alright, we've had a number of comments, do you want to just go ahead and  
2 formalize that as a motion? The original staff motion plus your two adds, which I think we've  
3 heard but we can hear it again if you'd like, if everyone likes, then we can chat about it.

4  
5 MOTION

6  
7 Commissioner Hechtman: Sure. Let me... I'm going to start the motion but I want you to read  
8 your language which, for that first element because that was stated very well. So, I will MOVE  
9 the Staff Recommendation that the PTC recommend to the City Council that the proposed  
10 2023-2027 Capital Improvement projects listed in Attachment B are consistent with the  
11 Comprehensive Plan 2030 Policies and Programs with the following two modifications to CIP FD  
12 24000, the Fire Training Facility Replacement Program.

13  
14 Chair Lauing: And the first one is to have Council consider adjusting the infrastructure priorities  
15 to include in 2023 the \$70,000 dollars CIP for feasibility study for this CIP.

16  
17 Commissioner Hechtman: And the second is to have Council consider expanding the budget for  
18 this CIP to include funding for adequate temporary training facilities for fire personnel until our  
19 new training facility is complete.

20

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 SECOND

2

3 Chair Lauing: So that's the motion and I'll second it. Okay. Discussion, from either... further  
4 discussion from the maker or ...

5

6 Commissioner Hechtman: No, thank you.

7

8 Chair Lauing: Okay. Any other? Are there any other additions that folks would like to put in  
9 here, in addition to the one on fire. If not, seeing none, we can go to a roll call vote.

10

11 VOTE

12

13 Ms. Klicheva: Commissioner Hechtman?

14

15 Commissioner Hechtman: Yes.

16

17 Ms. Klicheva: Commissioner Chang?

18

19 Commissioner Chang: Yes.

20

21 Ms. Klicheva: Chair Lauing?

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Chair Lauing: Yes.

3

4 Ms. Klicheva: Commissioner Reckdahl?

5

6 Commissioner Reckdahl: Yes.

7

8 Ms. Klicheva: Commissioner Roohparvar

9

10 Commissioner Roohparvar: Yes

11

12 Ms. Klicheva: Vice-Chair Summa?

13

14 Vice-Chair Summa: Yes.

15

16 Ms. Klicheva: Commissioner Templeton?

17

18 Commissioner Templeton: Yes.

19

20 Ms. Klicheva: Motion Carries 7-0.

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20

MOTION #1 PASSED 7 (Chang, Hechtman, Lauing, Reckdahl, Summa, Roohparvar, Templeton) –  
0.

**Commission Action:** Motion by Hechtman, seconded by Lauing. Motion Passed 7-0.

Chair Lauing: Excellent. Good work, good questions and really a big thanks to Staff for all the negotiating you did to get here on the CIPs and coming to our meeting to help us out. Appreciate that to all of you.

Ms. Tanner: I just want to second all the thanks to all the departments who joined, I know it's a group effort, so we thank you for joining us this evening.

Ms. Moitra: Thank you everyone.

Chair Lauing: And for the Staff Report, excellent. Commissioner Chang:

Commissioner Chang: I just had.. thank you to the staff for the Staff Report. I just have one favor to ask for the future, it would be... I think that last year when I looked at this it could be, that my memory is not quite correct, but I thought that last year when we looked at this item, the table that was included in the packet also included the years for which the expenditure was

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 budgeted for, as well as the amounts, and if in the future when this is brought to us, if those  
2 two pieces of information could be added to the table so we don't have to cross-reference the  
3 giant binder, that would be super helpful. But thank you so much for a really great Packet.

4  
5 Ms. Tanner: And that's having the year that the budget is allocated, I'm sorry I'm just trying to  
6 make sure.

7  
8 Commissioner Chang: Yes. So the packet has the twelve items and the description of the items,  
9 what it doesn't have is the amount as well as the years for which the amount is budgeted for.  
10 (Crosstalk) So it would be great if we had item number one is \$250,000 dollars budgeted for  
11 2027, or 2026, whatever the case may be.

12  
13 Ms. Tanner: In the future, if it's not the upcoming year, it's 2025. Yup. Okay, Great, thank you.

14  
15 **Approval of Minutes**

16 Chair Lauing: Okay, thank you. So, the next item is the approval of minutes, and this is draft  
17 verbatim meeting Minutes for April 20, 2022.

18  
19 3. April 20, 2022 Draft Verbatim Meeting Minutes

20

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Commissioner Hechtman.

2

3 MOTION

4

5 Commissioner Hechtman: I will move approval of the April 20, 2022 draft verbatim meeting  
6 minutes as revised.

7

8 SECOND

9

10 Vice-Chair Summa: Second.

11

12 Chair Lauing: That was Vice-Chair Summa second. Okay, any comments, questions, if not we  
13 can do a roll call vote.

14

15 VOTE

16

17 Ms. Klicheva: Commissioner Chang?

18

19 Commissioner Chang: Yes.

20

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. Klicheva: Commissioner Hechtman?

2

3 Commissioner Hechtman: Yes.

4

5 Ms. Klicheva: Chair Lauing?

6

7 Chair Lauing: Yes.

8

9 Ms. Klicheva: Commissioner Reckdahl?

10

11 Commissioner Reckdahl: Yes.

12

13 Ms. Klicheva: Commissioner Roohparvar?

14

15 Commissioner Roohparvar: Abstain.

16

17 Ms. Klicheva: Did she say abstain?

18

19 Chair Lauing: Yes.

20

21 Commissioner Roohparvar: Yes.

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20

Ms. Klicheva: Thank you, sorry. Vice-Chair Summa?

Vice-Chair Summa: Yes.

Ms. Klicheva: Commissioner Templeton?

Commissioner Templeton: Yes.

Ms. Klicheva: Motion Carries 6-0.

MOTION #1 PASSED 6 (Chang, Hechtman, Lauing, Reckdahl, Summa, Templeton) – 0  
(Roohparvar abstained).

**Commission Action:** Motion by Hechtman, seconded by Vice-Chair Summa. Motion Passed 6-0.

**Committee Items**

Chair Lauing: Okay, Thank you. Alright, so we move on to Committee Items, I don't think there are any older committees, right? But I want to bring up the need for a new committee in connection of the Housing Element, any connection with reviewing the Housing Element which is going to come at our... scheduled now to come at June meetings of July 8<sup>th</sup> and 29<sup>th</sup>. Thinking

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.



1 we will need two meetings the second meeting the 29<sup>th</sup> might have other agenda items. So, I've  
2 been discussing this with Director Waite as well as Co-Chairs of... the Staff Co-Chairs of Clare  
3 Campbell and Tim Wong and with the Co-Chairs, myself and Sheryl Klein, of the Housing  
4 Element because what has occurred is that HCD has changed some of their deadlines for when  
5 we have to get stuff in, and in spite of having had an extra meeting on Housing Element  
6 Working Group, the Working Group didn't get to the finish line on programs, and programs are  
7 really the specifics that HCD is looking at to ultimately approve the Housing Element and it's  
8 critical that we get those right. So, the two things ... I mean I think that everyone agrees that  
9 from Director Waite and Housing Element group and Co-Chairs and so on, is that the state of  
10 the document right now is such that we need more specificity on the programs that are listed in  
11 there. There's some things that have just too much general direction like investigate or take a  
12 look at, or maybe, I'm exaggerating for emphasis but we have to get really specific on what  
13 we're going to get accomplished to get past the rules of HCD. And also, we just get quite get  
14 done, so there are more programs that need to be done, in addition to the ones that staff  
15 brought to us, and then we added some from HEWG to the staff and we are where we are. And  
16 the plan now is to basically hand the baton to PTC as is. And so, in discussions with Director  
17 Waite, he would like an Ad-Hoc group here to work on that basically as a... initially as an  
18 extension of the Housing Element Working Group but crucially for the seven of us to really  
19 prepare by having a couple of offsite meetings and work more with staff input on new  
20 programs and more specificity in existing programs, estimated maybe a couple soon, before

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 June, and then maybe hit one in between those two. So, that's the plan, and the idea is that the  
2 three people for this committee need to work together arm in arm to kind of simplify it for us  
3 and the public and to sort of get it right. But as with all Ad-Hoc committee's there's not vote at  
4 the Ad-Hoc and Ad-Hoc comes back and presents to us the entire Commission, heres' what's  
5 going on, here's two options, or three options for this particular kind of program and we  
6 debate it just like we debate anything else, and we come up with, you know... a vote of seven  
7 Commissioners. So, just to reassure everyone, including the public, that ... none of that's going  
8 to happen at the Ad-Hoc, but the value add there is huge, to get it in a state that's ready for us,  
9 for the seven of us to debate after the three debate. So, after discussion and thought and so on,  
10 the Ad-Hoc is gonna be Keith, Commissioner Reckdahl, who has a year and a half experience  
11 already with Housing Element Working Group and has been very involved in the program  
12 aspect of that and will be excellent continuity with that group in any context, with first the Ad-  
13 Hoc and then we bring up what... well what was going on here. Like, let's say parking and  
14 housing on top of city parking lots, he can probably tell you what the straw vote was from the  
15 committee because there's that much of detailed knowledge of it, so I think that's crucial. And  
16 then I've asked Commissioner Templeton to join. Her passion around housing for years has  
17 been, you know, a illustrative of where we need to go with this. So, and then I've also asked  
18 Commissioner Chang. So, that will be the group, it has to be limited to a minority which is three,  
19 and that means the other four of us can't really interact with the Ad-Hoc at all until they  
20 present to the full group. So, that's where I'm at and I really value Tim and Clare's input on this

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 and Director Waite's in trying to say that we're behind and the Working Group is sad that they  
2 aren't finished, but hopeful that it's in good hands coming here. So we're getting it earlier and  
3 in a state that is different than what was expected but, you know, this will be one of the ways  
4 to kind of bridge the gap. Commissioner Hechtman.

5

6 Commissioner Hechtman: Thank you Chair Lauing, little bit of clarification to help me  
7 understand, so earlier this year at a couple of PTC meetings we went through the site selection  
8 process that the Working Group, and I think it's the same Working Group, had yielded, and we  
9 made our recommendations to Council and Council has acted. I'm trying to understand the  
10 nature of what the Ad-Hoc committee will do and what will be coming to the PTC, I think you  
11 said on June 8<sup>th</sup> and 29<sup>th</sup>, are these things that are part of that site selection recommendation  
12 to the HCD or are the things that are going to be coming to us in June deficiencies in our  
13 Housing Element that have been identified that are apart from wherever the site selection is.

14

15 Chair Lauing: Thanks for the question. It has nothing to do with site selection, that's a done  
16 deal. This is the program phase and it is not relative to any deficiency in the Housing Plan, it's  
17 what do we need to do relative to the new HCD regulations which are much more rigorous this  
18 year than in the last cycle, and the point is to have enough programs in there that number one,  
19 it has credibility with HCD so we get our Plan approved, but number two, so that those  
20 programs create actual housing and not just the document. So it's the program phase of the

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Housing Element Working Group and basically what should be coming to the PTC or close to, it  
2 should be close to what would have been coming from the Housing Element Working Group  
3 had they been able to finish and then we start our job as Commissioners reviewing that  
4 recommendation to us just like we did with the site selection and we made changes and then  
5 we recommended something to Council.

6

7 Commissioner Hechtman: So if I can follow up then, so are the programs that we're going to be  
8 dealing with the programs that are designed to make the housing units that we've identified in  
9 the site selection process a possible reality.

10

11 Chair Lauing: That's correct.

12

13 Commissioner Hechtman: Okay, so it is directly linked that way.

14

15 Chair Lauing: Correct.

16

17 Commissioner Hechtman: Alright, and so (interrupted)

18

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: I'll put it a different way, you know we have about seven-thousand housing units  
2 in the recommendations on sites. And this is what HCD, that's an interesting goal folks. Now let  
3 me see how you're going to get there.

4

5 Commissioner Hechtman: Okay.

6

7 Chair Lauing: And if there's teeth in the comb to get it done.

8

9 Commissioner Hechtman: Alright so (interrupted)

10

11 Ms. Tanner: So perhaps even to put a further plan not only how are you going to realize the  
12 housing that you prescribed, but how are you going to achieve other goals that the State has  
13 indicated that they want us to achieve, like a formulating furthering fair housing, which is not  
14 maybe just about the housing unit itself but where it's located and other aspects of the  
15 housing, as well as perhaps our tenant protection goals, or other goals related to the Housing  
16 Element and Commission may or may not be aware that Southern California is ahead of us in  
17 the Housing Element review cycle of the almost 200 jurisdictions into the California, only six  
18 Housing Elements have been deemed compliant. All the others have been sent back, and so the  
19 programs is a place that HCD is really taking a strong look at, so we need to make sure that they  
20 are not just aspirational but they are really achievable policy and programs that we're outlining

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 that we are going to actually work on in the next eight years and I think that's a little bit of  
2 departure from previous Housing Element cycles where it's in some ways it's like the Comp Plan  
3 where it's somewhat aspirational and you're kind of indicating the direction you want to go and  
4 HCD wants to see a bit more teeth to what we're proposing this time around.

5

6 Commissioner Hechtman: Okay. And then if I can ask a couple more questions.

7

8 Chair Lauing: Yeah, I just want to give Commissioner Reckdahl a chance to comment because  
9 he's been intimately involved in this but it doesn't mean you have to stop now.

10

11 Commissioner Hechtman: Commissioner Reckdahl do you want to start now?

12

13 Commissioner Reckdahl: Yeah, this is very important just because, well two things, one we want  
14 to make the housing real, but also HCD is being very picky so we have to scrub this and one of  
15 the problems is that when you have something like the Housing Element Work Group, they  
16 don't have authority to do this, their recommending things to Council. A lot of it was like  
17 'consider doing this or consider doing that' and that apparently does not hold water. So there's  
18 a lot of work to do to firm things up.

19

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Hechtman: Okay. So the culmination of this process is the creation of these  
2 programs that we then have to submit to the HCD.

3  
4 Ms. Tanner: Yes, and procedurally what will happen is the PTC like, type selection would  
5 recommend that the Council, you know, have these be the programs and policies in the  
6 Housing Element. And then that would be combined with the site selection work you already  
7 did to be part of Council's approval process.

8  
9 Commissioner Hechtman: And when's the deadline to deliver that package of sites and  
10 programs to the HCD.

11  
12 Ms. Tanner: I believe that, so there's the deadline and then there's when we're trying to  
13 achieve it. I believe that we are aiming to go through two review periods with the HCD, one will  
14 be this year in 2022 and the other would be in February of next year, and we would hope that,  
15 you know, they deem us compliant. It's... the deadline for our Region I believe is May or June of  
16 2023 to have submitted your Housing Element.

17  
18 Commissioner Hechtman: Okay. So, when we went through the site selection process, I'm  
19 wondering if this is an example of the kind of program that we're going to be looking at. I  
20 remember there was a letter, I don't remember what group it came from, talking about where

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 you, and I may not be remembering this exactly right, but where you are designating more than  
2 half of your below market housing on developed sites, you have to... it's not enough just to say  
3 it could go there, you have sort of... I don't know if its findings or a program to show why it's  
4 somewhat more likely that that'll actually come to fruition. So, is that an example of the kind of  
5 program that we're gonna try to be forwarding as part of this package?

6

7 Ms. Tanner: I think it could be, I think with that specific critique or advisement from that, I think  
8 it might have been Law, but don't quote me on that, I think what they were trying to get at is in  
9 what you have to show to the State is that there's evidence from other similar development to  
10 say that it's reasonable to expect this could be affordable housing. Like we have other sites that  
11 have developed in such a manner, and so we can assume that might occur again in the future. I  
12 think for programs, and I will be remiss because I have not been intimately involved with the  
13 team and they've all logged off thus far, I think that example you know that I'm more familiar  
14 with is we had Council assign us quite a good package of tenant protection work and we want  
15 to work on, so we wouldn't just say 'oh, pursue policies for protecting tenants', we would say  
16 specifically we want to pursue this specific policy which helps tenants maintain their housing in  
17 this way. So we just want to get it more specific. I don't know Chair Lauing if that (interrupted)  
18 (crosstalk)

19

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.



1 Chair Lauing: We have to get to a factual basis of what's going to happen as opposed to some  
2 good ideas that we've going to look at. And some of them are as simple as the Housing  
3 Element Working Group recommended going through with the Palmer fix which is inclusionary  
4 for purchases as well as rentals, and there's some consideration to try to get up from 15% as we  
5 tried on this Body on the rentals. Because 57% are, need to be affordable. So, it's that level of  
6 specificity that's going to have believability both for HCD and for ourselves, that we're going to  
7 be able to build it, because we have those kinds of programs there. And some of it is zoning,  
8 but in that case, we can just basically say this needs to be zoned, we don't have to have it zoned  
9 next week. It's just the promise that it's going to get rezoned and the commitment from the  
10 Council as this thing goes to HCD.

11

12 Commissioner Hechtman: Okay. Alright, I do have another question, but I've been on the, using  
13 the floor for quite a while and I see the Vice-Chair's hand up so why don't I yield and we'll come  
14 back to my question.

15

16 Chair Lauing: Yup. Vice-Chair Summa.

17

18 Vice-Chair Summa: Thank you, and I was just gonna, I was to... to Commissioner Hechtman's  
19 question about the reality of those properties changing their use. I remember that Staff had a  
20 pretty nice way, and Keith [note - Commissioner Reckdahl] or Ed [note - Chair Lauing] might

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 know this, but wha... of determining that and it was basically it was the age of the building and  
2 the value of the property versus the value of the structure and one other thing that I can't  
3 remember. So, I was just gonna, I can't remember the third thing, maybe you do Keith [note -  
4 Commissioner Reckdah] .

5

6 Chair Lauing: That was in the site selection.

7

8 Vice-Chair Summa: Yeah.

9

10 Chair Lauing: I don't remember the third one either maybe Commissioner Reckdahl does. They  
11 had a pretty mathematical formula on that but they still have to go around and do a sampling  
12 of those people, you can't just assume that X percent of them are going to. And that gets a little  
13 tough because if there's 5,000 sites, do you go and get a notarized statement from 4,000 of  
14 them... there's some pretty tricky things here that every city is facing relative to the  
15 requirements so. Do you want to comment again? Go ahead.

16

17 Commissioner Hechtman: Yeah, just my last question is really trying to understand the product  
18 that we're going to get from the Ad-Hoc so is this, we've asked three of my fellow  
19 Commissioners to form this, so are they going to, I heard you say they're not voting on

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 anything, so they're going to collaborate and try to organize their thoughts on these different  
2 programs and present us with the options (interrupted) that any of them have come up with.

3

4 Chair Lauing: Right. (crosstalk) Exactly.

5

6 Commissioner Hechtman: Okay.

7

8 Chair Lauing: So, and the current document is public on the current Housing Element site, and  
9 you'll see, I don't want to call what percentage of it is completed, but you'll see all the specific  
10 programs that are there, which ones are consistent with State Law, which ones are specific to  
11 us, and all that, so you'll see the state of it right now, and the group will work with Staff to see  
12 how many more we need and which ones are there that needs some tweaking and absolutely,  
13 let's take this one which did have some controversy even though Council's already voted to go  
14 do it, which was building housing on City parking lots. And this selection, house selection I think  
15 had four to six sites that over the 10 years could be used in that way, and there are constraints  
16 about having the assumption being that you have to maintained at least parking and so on. The  
17 programs could be written in two or three different ways coming from the Ad-Hoc and we  
18 could all have a discussion about that to make that happen, and then eventually we would take  
19 a vote on that program. (crosstalk) So, that's out in the public right now, you can see exactly  
20 where it is, it's not quite finished. So, what as I say, what probably is going to come back from

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 the Ad-Hoc is what would have come back from the Housing Element Working Group, except  
2 that we have Planning Commissioners that are more up the learning curve, on what's likely, no  
3 offense to my colleagues on the Working Group who are phenomenal but there's just more  
4 experience around the table on that, so and it's better than having seven of us do it right from  
5 the start.

6  
7 Commissioner Hechtman: Alright, then that being so, I'm glad we're going this way with this  
8 and I want to thank Commissioners Reckdahl, Chang, and Templeton for stepping up. This is a  
9 fair amount of work to be doing in the next month. So, thank you.

10

## 11 **Commissioner Questions, Comments or Announcements**

12 Chair Lauing: Any comments on that? No? Okay, other questions comments announcements,  
13 and of course future agenda items.

14

15 Ms. Tanner: I'm happy to share some of the upcoming Council meetings as well as talk about  
16 future items for the Commission, on October 16... October... on May 16<sup>th</sup> we have Objective  
17 Standards [unintelligible] oh October, Objective Standards at City Council, it's next Monday,  
18 that was where PTC did have some [unintelligible] and ARB did a lot of the heaving lifting on the  
19 Objective Standards piece. May 23<sup>rd</sup> is Castilleja, it is the only Action item that evening, so plan  
20 to be here for a robust discussion on Castilleja, and then June 1<sup>st</sup>, Council will be considering

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 the Work Plan for ARB, HRB, and PTC along with the downtown in lieu parking ban which you all  
2 recommended to be extended for three years. So, that item is June 1<sup>st</sup>. And then at our next  
3 meeting here we'll be looking at a housing project and, I don't know, it's the map related to the  
4 housing project on West Bayshore and we were planning to bring to you all later this month the  
5 ADUs but the Bayshore project is just a little more timely and needs to get addressed and so  
6 that will be coming to at the end of this month. And I'm available for any questions if there are  
7 any about future agenda items.

8

9 Chair Lauing: Did you say that the parking program update is still coming?

10

11 Ms. Tanner: Yes, and the parking program update, sorry about that.

12

13 Chair Lauing: So those two items on May 25 are still... still plan to see both of those on May  
14 25<sup>th</sup>. Other questions? Okay. Any other comments or anything? I loved the parade, that's the  
15 comment I want to make. That was really fun, it was just really fun to see the community all out  
16 and people outside and talking and laughing and all that, compared to doing everything on  
17 Zoom, which you can't do a parade on zoom. Just great camaraderie and short enough that we  
18 weren't exhausted and quite crowded... quite a crowd at the end of the park too with some  
19 music and things for kids to do, so it was really fun.

20

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Reckdahl: I think PTC did win the battle of the Commissions though.

2

3 Chair Lauing: I think so.

4

5 Vice-Chair Summa: You mean we had a higher attendance.

6

7 Commissioner Reckdahl: Yeah.

8

9 Vice-Chair Summa: Yeah, we did. It was great.

10

11 Ms. Tanner: Well, the other Commissions didn't know they were competing but we'll still take  
12 the win.

13

14 Vice-Chair Summa: It should be implied.

15

16 Commissioner Chang: So, I remember us discussing that we're going to recess, I mean it's  
17 already in the Calendar, we decided that we're going to have a recess July 27<sup>th</sup>, and then there  
18 was some noodling and back and forth about whether we wanted to make that two weeks or  
19 not, I don't have an opinion, as to whether we have an official recess, for two weeks or not, but  
20 did want to let the rest of Commission know that I'm going to be gone on August 10<sup>th</sup> which is

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 adjacent to the July 27<sup>th</sup> meeting, in case every.. anybody else wants to schedule themselves for  
2 that week.

3

4 Chair Lauing: That's a conspiracy!

5

6 Commissioner Templeton: I am penciled in for that as well but it's not final yet.

7

8 Chair Lauing: Just as long as you two didn't talk before the meeting, I'm okay with that. Okay.

9 Anything else?

10

11 Ms. Tanner: If Commissioners could just keep us abreast of their planned absences we'll just  
12 take that into consideration and make sure we have a quorum.

13

14 Chair Lauing: Okay. We'll see you at the next meeting and we stand adjourned. Thank you.

15

16 **Adjournment**

17 8:25:00 pm

- 
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
  2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
  3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.