



## HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION

**Thursday, April 11, 2019**

Community Meeting Room

Palo Alto Civic Center

250 Hamilton Avenue

7:00 PM

REGULAR MEETING

### **ROLL CALL:**

**Commissioners Present:** Brahmbhatt, Kralik, Lee, Smith, Stinger, Xue

**Absent:** O’Nan

**Staff:** Minka van der Zwaag, Mary Constantino

### **I. ROLL CALL**

Chair Kralik: Good evening and welcome to the Human Relations Commission regular meeting of April 11, 2019. We begin with a roll call.

### **II. AGENDA CHANGES, REQUESTS, DELETIONS**

Chair Kralik: Agenda, changes, requests, and deletions?

Commissioner Lee: I move the agenda as is.

Chair Kralik: Ok not hearing any we will move forward with oral communications from the public.

### **III. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS**

Chair Kralik: We do not have any public comment cards.

### **IV. BUSINESS**

#### **1. Learning Series – Presentation by Avenidas regarding their transportation programs and about their programs for immigrant communities.**

Chair Kralik: We’ll begin with the business of the Commission, the Learning Series. We have a presentation by Avenidas regarding their transportation programs and about their programs for immigrant communities.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Ms. Minka van der Zwaag: Great well it's my great pleasure to introduce Jyllian Halliburton. She is the Volunteer Director for Avenidas. Jyllian, why don't you come join us here at the table.

Ms. Jyllian Halliburton: Sure.

Chair Kralik: Jyllian welcome and thank you for sharing your time with us this evening.

Ms. Halliburton: Thank you, thank you for having me.

Ms. van der Zwaag: So, I will just...

Ms. Halliburton: Oh ok, do we want me to run the...

Ms. van der Zwaag: Oh yes, why don't you sit down here, I'm sorry.

Ms. Constantino: It doesn't have a clicker so.

Chair Kralik: Well do our best to have the camera focused on you instead of on any of us so our...

Commissioner Lee: Jyllian, did you want us...

Chair Kralik: ...ratings will improve.

Commissioner Lee: Did you want us to hold our questions until the very end or did you want us to ask them as we go along? What is preference?

Ms. Halliburton: I'm fine with whatever you guys want to do.

Commissioner Lee: Does the Chair have a preference?

Chair Kralik: Yes, let's hear their whole presentation. I would just tell you my background. I was living in Pleasanton for about 10-years before I moved here to Palo Alto and we had a senior center. We had a fairly huge senior center with a lot of activities for a lot of different groups and so Avenidas seems to me to be taking that role here in Palo Alto and I'd love to hear about what you're doing.

Ms. Halliburton: Ok, great. I don't know if am I being heard?

Ms. van der Zwaag: You are.

Ms. Halliburton: Okay, it doesn't sound like it to me.

Ms. van der Zwaag: It's not a true projection.

Ms. Halliburton: So, there's so much more that we do at Avenidas besides what I'm presenting here but today I was focusing on the transportation specifically and the programming that we've been doing to reach out to immigrant communities. So, if you have additional questions about Avenidas I'm happy to answer about any of our programming. I'll go ahead and start with our current transportation program encompasses sort of three times in my mind. We have our own volunteer driver program which has been around for I think probably about 15-years. I've been running it for about seven. Basically, what we do with volunteer drivers using their own cars we provide medical, social, and basically any type of ride to people who are no longer driving. So that they stay engaged and active and healthy in the community. In addition to that supplementary to the Door to Door Program, we use Lyft. We were actually one of their beta tester sites that they originally started with a concierge tool that was now a pretty widespread thing that they use a business model desktop various on Lyft; different from the app on your phone. We use that to schedule rides as I said for Door to Door when we're short on volunteer drivers but we also use it for on-demand rides as well. We can actually go outside of our usual coverage area to then with the volunteers normally do by using Lyft. Then we also do teach workshops on how to use Lyft on your phone for those seniors who are more tech-savvy and interested in doing that so they have the empowerment to do their own rides. We're probably going to also add Uber; it's just because we had the partnership with Lyft, we kind of focused on Lyft but we'll probably...

Commissioner Smith: (inaudible) on community also?

Ms. Halliburton: Yes and we really actually really liked their model. When we met with both companies, they were very eager to work with us and they started the company with a little bit more of a community focus and safe ride mindset that we liked which is why we picked them. We've actually been working with them now for 3-years. Avenidas Village was also used as a pilot. The Avenidas Village is an additional program that we have that allows seniors to stay in their home on a larger level than what Avenidas provides at a membership cost. We actually were apart of a pilot program that Uber did with a caregiving agency as well which led to their new Uber health rides that they do. So, we might actually start working with Uber as well in the future using those types of rides. The other thing that we provide at Avenidas is we are a source for transportation information. I have had some various volunteers who have been part of the senior mobility ambassador programs that the VTA and SamTrans do that have been able to be on site and train people how to use transportation. I would like to try to bring that back. We also house the schedules for VTA, SamTrans, Marguerite and the City Shuttle in our downtown location and they're sort of a hub for transportation. So, we also put out a resource list which I show there, the paratransit and the private transportation agencies, as well as public transportation; which helps people because with our Door to Door program we cannot provide paratransit because we're using volunteers with their own cars. We're actually revamping our website and I hope to have a really great interactive page that's transportation-specific with that information. Yes?

Commissioner Smith: How significant is the transportation component in the overall scope of Avenidas? It sounds like it's a real lynchpin. I just don't want to...

Ms. Halliburton: Yes, last year we provided 3,600 rides. We don't so much provide rides to

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Avenidas but rather provide rides to seniors to get out of their homes to get to medical appointments or social outings or running errands; grocery shopping that sort of thing. It is just pivotal and just amazing for the people who need it. Overall in numbers and I don't know percentage wise. I could probably get back to you on that about how many people are actually clients of transportation and members, that sort of thing. It's very crucial to the people who rely on it and it ties in with our social services because it really helps people from declining by being isolated at home. So, the value that it brings, even if the numbers aren't huge, is really, really valuable to those people and the family members of those seniors. So, kind of along with what I just said I would say for Avenidas downtown, which we're now calling Avenidas at Bryant because we now have basically three locations. Most of the Avenidas participants do drive to classes and activities here which I have a future slide. You know we are going to try to work on that a little bit because parking is an issue and I know that there's been a lot of City effort to try to reduce traffic flow downtown. I've been on a lot of Committees working on that in the past. A lot of people do walk because we are close in proximity to several senior residential facilities like Channing House, Webster, Lytton Garden, so we do get people walking over. They do take rides sometimes if they're coming for a class or something to Avenidas and do also get rides from family, friends, or fellow classmates. There are people who take the bus and I would say there are very few people who actually bike to Avenidas. We do have more people biking at Cubberley so I was trying to differentiate the population and the transportation between sights. So, the next one is Cubberley, some things are similar but I would say there are probably more people taking the bus and biking to Cubberley. Again, walking if they live at Stevenson House which is pretty close by or there're some other senior residential facilities that are also in Mountain View that are close by because we're right at the border. Then we do get people carpooling for this, the New Chinese Senior Programming initiative, that we're doing which I'll go into in later slides. We do have more carpooling going on for classes as well as the bus activity and the rideshare. Where a family either uses Lyft to plan a ride for their parent or the person themselves, the senior themselves will do it. We do have people at Cubberley coming from everywhere, from Redwood City to Campbell, which is pretty good that we're going a little further south. I think because we're located further south than we typically would for Bryant Street. Then we have added also at Cubberley a special voicemail line that is bilingual because we are trying to attract more Chinese seniors. Eventually other populations as well but because the Chinese population was the largest one in Palo Alto, we're starting with that. So, we're hoping that we can invite people to call if they have questions about all the programs including transportation.

Commissioner Lee: Do you happen to have a sense of what the break down is between the different transportation modalities? Is it 50 percent who are driving versus 40 percent walking or just generally speaking how would you weigh the percent?

Ms. Halliburton: On my things that we're going to do in the future slide I have a survey so I can't answer with actually a data but I just know from working there for 14-years that a lot of people drive I would say. It's probably a much higher percentage I think that drive unfortunately and we are going to try to work on that because we do want to change that. I think the older generation in this town is used to driving and they will just drive until they can't anymore.

Commissioner Lee: And the population who may no longer be able to drive, do you find that

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

they were able to find suitable alternatives to get to Avenidas or to get elsewhere through the various programs that you offer or is there a segment that are being sort of lost because they can't drive or access one of the other ones?

Ms. Halliburton: I think that we do a pretty good job with outreach so I think people do know about our transportation program. So, I don't think there's probably a huge group that's lost but it's hard to know that because if you don't have a measurable of people who are not reached its kind of hard to say. We did do a market research project which may have actually included that. I could find out and get back to you on that. I'm not sure if they include transportation.

Commissioner Lee: Well, that's probably a good testament to all the work that you're doing if the percentage of sort of lost is very, very low, and so...

Ms. Halliburton: I mean – yes and I think...

Commissioner Lee: (inaudible)(crosstalk)

Ms. Halliburton: ... well also I mean I know I have it easy because I think Avenidas is so well known in the community that people do know to come to us when they need anything if they're older. So, they sometimes will just call with like I need help with X, Y, and Z and our social worker may lead them to all the different available resources. So, in that sense, the outreach is easy because the name is known pretty well in the community but I think we could actually still always improve our efforts in transportation outreach. I think the problem that people run into though is if they're starting to get isolated, they aren't always reaching out for themselves. So, we probably need to do more outreach toward adult children and maybe younger seniors so that they are aware before they really need it. I think that people can start to sink into depressions and things too if they're isolated and not getting out and they don't really think to call. We're actually trying to work on how we also might cross-market more within Avenidas because we have our Handy Man Program, our Transportation Program, the Social Work Program, as well as all of the activities so that we can reach people before they start to decline by getting them involved with whatever needs they have. Not just calling to go into one siloed service, just have a outreach toward everybody in the community.

Commissioner Lee: That's great.

Ms. Halliburton: Thanks. Ok so especially now that we're back downtown - we are trying to increase awareness of the transportation options by having more workshops and classes. That will help to educate all the seniors on different rideshare and public transportation options and help decrease the parking issues and the traffic downtown as I mentioned earlier. I know that's a big concern with the City. We also, in a positive way, hope to encourage seniors who should be limiting their driving to use safer options but also by doing it in an empowering and engaging way. That isn't like we're going to take your keys away and make it a negative thing. Its like look at all these options you have now, you live in the age of Lyft and Uber plus programs like ours that can actually allow you to stay mobile when in the past that wasn't an option. We have in the past actually had a transportation conference with speakers and sponsors and people from different agencies and it's been a few years since we've done that. It was quite successful and

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

again, it brought a positive outlook on transportation as opposed to like oh gosh, I've got to give up the keys. We also have in the past hosted VTA and SamTrans Senior Mobility Specialist. We did some at Cubberley to while we were there and we'll continue to do more of those. They come and explain to people how to actually ride VTA and SamTrans. We did in the past also have a series that was initially started by the City called Find Your Way. Avenidas took that on as well where we also did take people out to literally show them this is how you use the machine at the train station, you can have them lower the level if you need to have help stepping on, and walk them through step by step. So, I'd like to bring that back as well. We will continue doing the workshops I mentioned on Lyft and Uber. We also, as I said too, we'll be disseminating the transportation options about paratransit and public transportation options. Well, there's the Santa Clara County Transportation Commission where all the non-profits that provide transportation from Palo Alto to San Jose are meeting to try to figure out how, as a group, we can have a little bit more power to heed for the increased needs and demands on transportation programs. In terms of reaching out to the immigrant community, we're wanting to translate all the materials beginning with Mandarin. Eventually, we'd also like to do Russian which is also a large population in Palo Alto and Spanish and other languages. We want to continue doing more outreach to immigrant communities and also so more, as I mentioned, surveying of immigrant communities on transportation needs. How are we engaging currently with the Chinese senior community? We initiated a task force to come up with ideas which involve both Staff and Chinese members of the community who could give us input on what would work and wouldn't; how to reach people. We worked on that for a year and we also initially surveyed people at Stevenson House, Lytton Gardens, and other areas to ask what interests they had for activities. We started to create programming based on the survey results and recruiting bilingual volunteers to support the programs and translate materials. The best thing that's happened so far is we were able to hire Pinki Fung who's amazing and she is our Diversity Outreach Specialist who's again starting with the Chinese population but she's also going to grow the program to include other groups as well and bring a lot more programming that will attract people. I will be working with her on how we can get the transportation information out to those different groups as well. After our initial survey, she also did a survey as it mentions here that included speaking with people who are I guess Zeng Heng Chinese, Chinese-Pilipino, and Taiwanese members of the community because the language and interests can be different. So, we want to make sure that we cover everything and we also hired Susan Lam at our Rose Kleiner Center. I don't know if you guys are familiar with our Rose Kleiner Center. Its an adult day health program so people who have cognizant or physical limitations who are not independent seniors, they can go to this day-long program. They live at home with family or by themselves...

Commissioner Smith: Where is it?

Ms. Halliburton: It's in Mountain View, it's located in Mountain View but we serve the whole peninsula like Avenidas does. So, we have a person there who's got a nursing background and she can do more medical outreach or outreach to medical providers to let them know about the need for people to go to programs like this to thrive. Also, to specifically reach out to immigrant communities who aren't always aware that programs like this exist and can support their families.

Commissioner Lee: I think Pinki is really great, I met her a couple of times.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Ms. Halliburton: Yes, isn't she great?

Commissioner Lee: Yes.

Ms. Halliburton: She's just like the most enthusiastic person and she's just multi-lingual and she just draws people.

Commissioner Lee: She's very fantastic.

Ms. Halliburton: She spoke highly of you as well. So, on the note of Pinki and programming for the immigrant communities – well before I go on do you guys have any transportation specific questions you wanted to ask?

Commissioner Smith: Yes immigrant questions.

Ms. Halliburton: Ok, anybody else?

Commissioner Lee: On transportation is there anything that you think that the City could do better, could assist with in terms of helping make it easier for our senior citizens to get around town, to be mobile, to be social, just to be empowered to be engaged? Is there anything that you think we could slightly do better?

Ms. Halliburton: There is one thing that I think we have maybe spoken to someone in the past. I had a coordinator who in the past I know spoke with someone at the City, I'm not quite sure who it was but because we realized we provide so many rides from people's homes to PAMF all day long for medical appointments. We had an idea to try to partner with the City shuttle for the down times of the day when it's not running as frequently to try to ferry people to PAMF just because that would then take a little burden off the load of the volunteer drivers who's schedules are often very full and tight to be able to provide additional rides. Not that they wouldn't still do PAMF rides but just that we do have some schedules where you're just back and forth to someone house and to PAMF and the next person to PAMF. So we'd be interested in talking with the City about that if that were an option, I'm not sure. That just pops off the top of my head but I could probably think of more ways that we could collaborate and I think any support the City can give to us is great.

Commissioner Stinger: Yes, I just have to interject for just a second. I used the service a lot when in several crisis situations with my mom. The ride was great but more important was the attitude of the dispatcher on the other end just listening to this crisis and I thought he's not going to like this and he said no problem. I really appreciated that attitude. I also appreciated that you would cross the line into San Mateo County because so many ride services are county line and they would drop the senior off and say you've got to walk the rest of the way. It's like um, not really and so that leads me to think there might be some grocery shopping in Redwood City that's less expensive and more...

Ms. Halliburton: That's a good point. No, thank you for bringing that up. We are one of the few agencies that cross county lines and so we do get a lot of rides that would either possibly not

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

happen or would run into a lot more red tape with the county-run programs and stuff. In the Santa Clara Transportation Commission, I mentioned earlier I find there's a little bit more of a south bay focus there so that's also a little tricky because we do tend to provide rides more Sunnyvale to Redwood City just because of logistics and proximity. So, we're always in a little bit of a funny spot because then also the same thing with San Mateo or San Mateo County is that it runs up to San Mateo itself when I go to meetings and things and we kind of taper off around Redwood City/San Carlos. So, there is that sort of in-between peninsula area that crosses county lines and can be complicated and I appreciate you giving that feedback about the dispatcher. That's one of the things I think that people really like about the program is not just the ride itself but the dispatchers and the drivers are just wonderful and just make people feel good and relationships develop between the drivers and riders for years sometimes. I have some drivers who've been driving for 10 plus years and just that extra touch. If we do a Lyft ride that's fine but are you sure you don't have a volunteer driver available because they really like the ones that they know and we actually have one paid driver as well; a part-time paid driver. So, we do definitely get the requests because of the personal connection, I think that really does help. Thank you for saying that.

Commissioner Lee: I was very encouraged by some of the partnerships that you mentioned with Uber and Lyft. Could you speak to how those came about? Was that something that Avenidas had done the initial outreach to or did they come to you? I think given that we're here in the heart of Silicon Valley we can encourage and help other non-profits follow your example in terms of using tech and partnering with the private sector and vice versa with the public sector I think is all fantastic things.

Ms. Halliburton: Yes, exactly because we're here where it's happening. We approached them, we didn't actually know they had the concierge tool but we just approached them wondering how we could have them help us meet the demand because before we used Lyft, we actually had waitlist on Sundays and we couldn't provide all the rides that were being requested. So that was hard to say no as you were giving an example of being in distress and so Lyft has given us that ability to fulfill the need and as I said earlier too, we found that they were more receptive to work with us. I think Uber has changed over the years so they may be a little more so but it would be – yeah, sorry, uh huh?

Chair Kralik: I was just going to say Steven was going graciously giving you another 5-minutes of his time of his presentation because he's agreed to hold off his questions until the end and I know we have another 10 slides.

Ms. Halliburton: Ok so yes, I'll go through them quickly, that's fine, sorry but I would love to talk more about what you asked.

Commissioner Lee: Sorry about that.

Ms. Halliburton: No, no, no. Let's see I guess I kind of talk on this a little bit. We have this task force at first for the Chinese programming that led us to do events for the Chinese holidays to spread the word that we were starting to do this. We hired Pinki Fung who I mentioned and she started to create new classes and finding instructors. We kicked off what we call Culture Club

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.



which I'll explain in a minute and she's been doing especially a lot of outreach like the Palo Alto Chinese School outreach event at Mitchell Park. That's like 500 people, we did it last year too, it's amazing, and then we just did our kick off for Cubberley Day on March 23, a few weeks ago, and we had about 250 people who came. I think you're even in the picture of the whole article. The mission of Culture Club is what it says there, to promote health, wellness, and recreation in culturally appropriate programs to a diverse senior community and to encourage cultural sensitivity through educations and community engagement. So, the Cultural Club membership that they created is for a limited time and it's just a way to introduce people to this new programming because people are used to what we already do. So, when we have something new like this, we have to have a way to excite them and catch them. We're trying to have all the classes be bi-lingual or multi-lingual; English; Mandarin; and Cantonese for the time being. We also do have non-Chinese participants who are coming as well as Chinese members which is nice because they can exchange...

Commissioner Lee: Is that \$20 per month or is that \$20 for an entire 6-month trial?

Ms. Halliburton: I think it's just \$20 for the 6-months.

Commissioner Lee: Oh wow.

Commissioner Smith: That's a deal.

Commissioner Lee: That's a deal.

Ms. Halliburton: Our membership isn't very expensive to begin so.

Commissioner Smith: (inaudible)(crosstalk)

Ms. Halliburton: Yes, no I want to take all of our classes all the time, we have a lot of good stuff going on. Yes, already existing members were included so that we could draw more people to come to the classes. So, the access to Culture Club will be included on all levels going forward as well. Just to give you an idea of what we have been since the fall of last year and up till now. We have Tai Chi; it's always been a popular class. We had a nutrition workshop and singing is big; from our survey singing is a big draw for people and we have it in the form of karaoke and this vocal training. We did some festivals like I mentioned. There's a mid-autumn festival, we drew a huge crowd for that and then we just had this, the Culture Club grand opening that I mentioned. So, I think you're in there, yes you Steve. Yes, you're there, right there. That was the ribbon cutting and some of the people there were involved with the Chinese Task Force that initially started the programming and over 250 people came. Pinki had amazing dance performances, I mean just so much going on, it was great. The other program that's staying at Cubberley is another program of mine that's called Avenidas Blooms in which we repurpose donated flowers and donated vases and deliver them to senior residential facilities. So, they're going to be sharing the space at Cubberley as well as we're going to have other programming as well but those are the two main attractions. So, this gives you an idea of the things that Pinki is offering and how they work. As you can see, they are bi-lingual, some of those were in the last slide, there's this karaoke mingle that's really popular, the Chinese brush painting is really

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

popular. It's really fun when it's going on because there's all this hub-bub in the room and we've had Mahjong I guess this is Mahjong Brain Exercise so that's a little bit different. This Yuen Ji Dance is new to me and I guess it's a combination of Tai Chi and dance. Then line dancing is very popular and we're having this new jewelry making coming up in the spring and there're some other classes to that coming but that's just a sampling. Oh here, sorry, ping pong, Lotus dance is something that we've been offering for a long time, it's very popular. It's kind of a mix of everything, hip pop and Polynesian dance and different Asian style of dancing. I think this is - she was just mentioning the events that's she's doing. So, this is what she'd like to bring in the future, again this is a result of surveys that we've done and what people are asking for. Let's see and then just to give a current snapshot of what's been going on since we've started the Culture Club, we've got actually 70 new non-English speaking new immigrants who've joins which is actually quite great. It's pretty high. Most instructors are, as I mentioned, actually, most of them are tri-lingual, definitely bi-lingual so they can engage everybody who comes. We've been having like I said, a nice blending of both the English and non-English speakers so that they can make friends and learn about other cultures and just get engaged. So that's sort of a snapshot of what we're doing and tying that back to the transportation, as I said, Pinki and I will be working together to on how we might better communicate to the people coming to Cubberley for these classes on how we can provide transportation to them specifically both through translation of information and hitting the right targeted outreach locations and events to communicate that.

Chair Kralik: Could you share a little bit about yourself and how you became interested in this mission and (inaudible)(crosstalk)

Ms. Halliburton: I'm actually from Palo Alto, born and raised here. Although I didn't live here continuously but when I came back to the community, I had a friend who actually worked at Avenidas. She was the grant writer at the time so that's how I learned about it and I worked in Bio-Tech which is interesting but wasn't really my thing. So, when I heard about the position opening, I jumped on it because I was always wanting to move into the non-profit sector. My dad at the time too had been diagnosed with Parkinson and I just wanted to be able to spend more time with him and get more introduced to the world of aging and all that it is to take that journey with him. So, I was really happy to have had that all happen at the same time and he had Parkinson for 12-years before passing away and so we were able to just spend time together and I was able to help him which was nice. I love what I do, I love working with the volunteers, we have actually 375 approximately volunteers total for all of our programs. I didn't really go into the volunteer program here except the transportation program but we have a lot of thriving programs that again engage seniors to stay active. The volunteers tend to be probably the most active and independent and healthy seniors and they are just really interesting and fun to work with. Really amazing people so that's what I love about it.

Chair Kralik: We're very grateful for your time and we're very grateful for your commitment. Commissioner Brahmbhatt is here and maybe she has a question about the transportation. I don't know if you have a thought about it.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: Thank you. I don't have any questions.

Ms. Halliburton: Thank you, thank you for having me.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Chair Kralik: You have her blessing. Thank you.

Commissioner Smith: Thank you.

Chair Kralik: Very good. Thank you so much.

Commissioner Lee: Thank you.

## **2. Discussion and consideration of update to the Emerging Needs Fund policy.**

Chair Kralik: We're going to move to a short discussion about the updates to the Emerging Needs Fund policy. Staff has the action step here so Minka, would you help us through that?

Ms. van der Zwaag: I do, I have to get my glasses on but now I can see. So, Emerging Needs Fund as you saw from my background piece has been around for about 2-years. Council was gracious in offering \$50,000 a year to help meet emerging and critical needs between the HSRAP time periods. It's been operational for a couple of years so I thought it was a good idea to look at the policy and to see what's working, what's not working. I sent it out to the Commissioners; at least three-fourths of you have been at least on one of the subcommittees to review an application. I took the ideas that I got and I made some drafts to this. So, I would suggest maybe if you take out the copy that says draft revised copy and then I'll go over. I have my copy that goes over the changes. I had at one point thought I'd give you the one with track changes and it just became too cumbersome to work with. I did give you the current copy but I don't even think that's that helpful to do a comparison now. So, I'd like to go over the draft changes and then open it up for questions and comments. Then at that time, I'll take any more suggestions and we'll go from there. So, at this point the draft changes is the name and that's something I'm totally open for suggestions. I really actually don't think this name works. I think it's to close to the HSRAP to work but I couldn't think of anything and I needed to get this out to you all. So, I just left it as that but as things are currently written here it's going to be a little beyond just calling it an Emerging Needs Funds. That really wasn't a true reflection of what it was so that was one thing that I'd like to look at. So, one of the key changes that I made is to change it from 3-years to 2-years. I think we had it at 3-years at first probably for a couple of reasons. Probably so it wasn't exactly the same as HSRAP and also because we didn't want people asking for money again to quickly. Well, that has actually turned out not to be the case, people are not asking for money as quickly as we thought they were and I thought it was fine to move it to 2-years. Grant up to \$10,000, I know there were some that felt like you haven't gotten that many requests, we'd love to be able to if someone has a great project to be able to get to \$10,000. I strongly recommend against that for the following reason; \$10,000 is actually a pretty decent grant amount. There are a lot of HSRAP grantees that are at the \$10,000 level, they also filled out a 40-page application and were scrutinized over multiple meetings to get that \$10,000. These folks for these programs it's 10 questions, no more than three pages and I really feel like to give an agency more than \$10,000 I really want to do due diligence on behalf of the City and have them take the time to fill out a more fuller application to get a better sense of their organization. So, I'm strongly recommending against any increase. The other thing that I did was in taking some of the suggestions from folks is you'll see here instead of just Emerging and Critical Needs, I put Emerging Critical and let me back up. Emergency needs were always there,

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

that's pretty much the same. What I did take off because it just didn't seem to be necessary anymore is some qualifications like all applicants could qualify for this, if you're an HSRAP grantee this is your subsection of this policy and really looking at it. That just didn't seem to be necessary anymore so I took that away so the Emergency Needs language is pretty much the same. I think at Mary's suggestion and our earlier oversight I added fire to that. Then I divided up Emergency and Critical Need and Critical Needs are pretty similar to what it was before. I think I added the word urgent, that was a suggestion that came up to me although the first line says that wasn't evident during the original HSRAP funding period that's a trigger for people who are in HSRAP but I didn't feel the need for then to put parenthesis HSRAP grantees only. Then I added this third one or changed it's meaning a little bit to the Emerging Needs and that says a need that has not come up before or the approach to addressing the need is new even though it may not rise to the level of an emergency or critical need. I think that was really a barrier to a lot of people when they looked at the application they say, you know this is a real need in the community but can I really provide the documentation that says it's an emergency or it's critical but it's still a very important need. The second thing I added is and Mary and I did a lot of wordsmithing and (this was based on suggestions) that I got is to develop or expand a program or service that will enhance the quality of life for vulnerable populations. I just didn't want to open it and say hey anybody have an idea? We're here for your idea but I did feel like well if there is a need and what you will be doing will be addressing the need of a very vulnerable population in our community, I want an opportunity for this grant program to be able to consider that. I also added as you will see that grant requests will be prioritized for funding in that the order of need below. As it stands now, we get maybe one, maybe two applications per application deadline so this need has to be prioritize it based on the level of need really hasn't come into play but I did want that in there. For instance, if with this expansion of the grant if it approved, I wanted that opportunity to say ok we had this agency loose all of their equipment to do X, Y, Z, and they'd like to start a new program. Yes, it will affect frail elderly seniors and it's important but this agency is going to be non-operational in this area and I wanted some guidance to the Review Committee to be able to say hey, are we giving some guidance on what is more important, not just our personal opinions? So, that is something I added.

Commissioner Lee: You mean in the order of like emergency needs...

Ms. van der Zwaag: Emergency need is first, then critical, and then emerging.

Commissioner Lee: Gotcha, ok. I might just add some numbers in front of those.

Ms. van der Zwaag: So then yes, we can certainly do so. Then on Page 2, under the application process, it was also pointed out to me that there wasn't enough clarity on when someone could apply. I thought it was clear enough before when it said an emergency need, just contact me and below it said critical and emerging needs these are your deadlines but that wasn't clear based on the calls that I got, based on other people that reviewed it. So, I just added some clarity to the language of an emergency need, that it can be any time by emailing me. That's because I at least want to be able to say ok, do I really think that before they take the time to fill out an application does it really fall under the category of an emergency need? I tell people once they contact me, I'll tell you if I feel like it fits in this category. I can't promise ahead of time that you're funding will be approved. Then the last...

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Commissioner Smith: I just have a question on dates.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Yes.

Commissioner Smith: Is that suppose to be December 1<sup>st</sup>, 2019?

Ms. van der Zwaag: Oh yes, yes.

Commissioner Smith: Why wouldn't it be September/October?

Ms. van der Zwaag: It's every 3-months. These are just placeholders so some of these might be Sundays or Mondays when I didn't...

Commissioner Smith: Oh, I was going to say shouldn't we start on October 1<sup>st</sup>? October, November, December?

Ms. van der Zwaag: No, our fiscal year is July 1<sup>st</sup> so then...

Commissioner Smith: Ok, that makes sense.

Ms. van der Zwaag: ... we'd go that way but these are just place holders. If I look at it again that may not be the actual dates. The selection process, it was suggested that we don't include non-HRC members on that and I did seriously consider that. I think at this point for folks that haven't been on it I have had two HRC members, then I've asked a colleague in my department, usually someone who does grant writing or grant managing on a regular basis for their job and I have felt like that perspective of someone who sometimes is, sometimes not as familiar with the non-profit world. They have that interesting perspective on things and I would suggest that we keep that. Mary and I take them in but we are not voting members. So...

Commissioner Lee: Has it always been someone from CSD?

Ms. van der Zwaag: It has been someone from CSD just because logically it doesn't. If this says CSD it actually doesn't have to be. It could just be...

Commissioner Lee: But that's been your preference?

Ms. van der Zwaag: ...City Staff members. I'd have to think other departments in the City, obviously, the Libraries write grants all the time so that could easily be changed to a City Staff member. I think when I wrote this, I was just in the guise of it's always easier to ask a colleague in your own department than it is to go across department but that could easily just be another City Staff member.

Commissioner Lee: Gotcha.

Ms. van der Zwaag: So, that's a quick overview just to give you an idea of how this works. Council approved this policy based on the thought that these would go for critical and emerging needs. That was the whole discussion that they had during a Finance Committee meeting a

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

couple of years ago when they established this fund. When this was written last time it went to Council so at this point I will take your suggestions in hand and then I will have discussion with my Supervisor Monique and then we'll have to make a discussion at this point do we feel like this has strayed too much from what the Council originally thought of as emerging or critical needs? Do we not and if we do and if it's something that this Commission feels really strongly about then we would have to look into the process do we bring it back to Council, do we bring it back to a Council meeting and then I could report that back to you all. I don't have that answer for you tonight because I wanted to have this conversation first so that ends my presentation. I'm happy to take any questions.

Commissioner Smith: Do you believe the changes will increase the effectiveness of the grant?

Ms. van der Zwaag: Yes, I do. I believe that the two bullet points under emerging needs will allow more agencies to apply and also the change from 3-years to 2-years. That is my hope.

Commissioner Smith: Ok, perfect.

Commissioner Lee: I really liked the two bullet points that are under emerging needs. When I was reviewing this, I was trying to think is there a way that we can encourage innovation and sort of the work that our non-profits are doing. Sometimes it's hard for them to get start-up funding to try out new programs without numbers on it so my read of it is that some of those elements are being incorporated here and so I appreciate that.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Right. There was a couple of suggestions to use language such as innovation grant or use this as a pre-type of HSRAP grant. My concern by using words like innovation that strayed it too much from its original purpose. Like I said I can't tell you at this point that in its current proposed language where that will go. May need some approval that may not get approved in the end but I just really felt that strong of a language like innovation, starter grants, that was not the original intention.

Commissioner Lee: Do you feel like the spirit though is – I read the...

Ms. van der Zwaag: I'm hopeful.

Commissioner Lee: ... the approach to addressing the need is new. I feel like that sort of the spirit of it as well as to develop or expand.

Commissioner Smith: I would say if we want to do an innovation grant we should propose that to the City because at the end of the day, as somebody who has been on Boards of non-profit and runs a non-profit, emergence and emergency and critical needs can happen as simple as losing funding streams, there could be a demand, and a pressure. We don't want the fountain to be empty when somebody that is doing community work goes to this to get that funding. I think that's a very clear thing and we don't know whenever the market changes stuff happens, we still have to be able to fund the senior programs and kids' program that is in endanger because if we chase innovation, we underlie some of the other stuff.

Commissioner Lee: Well, I think Minka was trying to be very thoughtful with respect to that concern in terms of the funding prioritization of emergency needs comes first, then critical needs and then this sort of new category in my eyes.

Commissioner Smith: I would be strongly opposed to that. I understand the 2-year thing, I think it's really strong and I love the order but I would be opposed to putting any language around innovation. There are a ton of non-profits, and having sat on the Emerging Fund Board, that are trying to do stuff that just can't find funding and this I think is a very critical part.

Chair Kralik: I wanted to ask you a question about the progress of the grantee to address the need that they identify on an ongoing basis and can you give me an example...

Commissioner Stinger: Right.

Chair Kralik: ...of where that has happened and where it works?

Ms. van der Zwaag: You know all the grantees up until now except for one was an HSRAP grantee and they applied for an emerging needs fund for things that were not part of the HSRAP cycle or fell into the emergency need categories. In the case of CASSY when there was the death at the beginning of the year, last year, at Gunn. I would say there is one grantee that we helped within an emergency need that did apply and is being recommended for HSRAP funding this time and that's Ada's. So, they went up a little bit, they got like \$2,500 with this program to repair some equipment that broke down and now they're being recommended for a little over \$5,000. So, because the volume has been so low, I have not seen it, if that was the intention of your questions, as a jumping point before a pre-HSRAP jumping point. I haven't seen that yet because of the low volume.

Chair Kralik: Ok.

Commissioner Stinger: I'd like to ask about the funding no more than once in a 2-year period. I can see that if somebody has come in with Grant A and then they have another Grant B and seeing that they're different but maybe we want to limit it to one grant but I wonder about an organization that needs renewal at a second year to continue a program. If there is available funds and I mean there could be caveats around it so we don't encourage it but I would hate to see something get so close to being finished and then not being able to complete the task.

Ms. van der Zwaag: I hear you; I'll answer then in two ways. I think going from three to two feels like a jump for me as well because the real intent of this and the real intent that we heard from Council is help people in certain situations. If you look at the funding expenses, it really says that this isn't intended to support ongoing program work. Now the program work can be ongoing in the sense that that program might have a crisis at that point. They usually get in that state of crisis when Washington is holding the funding back or that one funder is going down and that program needs to get going right now and they believe by next year but I don't have a comfort level about having this be a mechanism for people to support a program multiple years.

Commissioner Stinger: I guess I think the examples we used when we went to Council where the

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

backpacks were stolen from...

Ms. van der Zwaag: Right.

Commissioner Stinger: ... and so I could see the grant being we want to replace the backpacks. Then we realized subsequently well there were no locks or we didn't have a secure facility so a renewal would allow us to finish the job.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Right I think the intent of this was that to the level that we can and it's like a package that we're addressing. We're addressing that package and we're hoping the package doesn't have anything fall out of it that you need to take care of another time.

Commissioner Smith: I think most organizations, particularly when you do benevolence or caring for others, will have a policy that limits how much you can give to one party because again you don't want to drop the pool. This is just a bridge. I guarantee you if you don't put a limit on it the same people will come back to you every 6-months. I'm guaranteeing it to you. I think as a community, to be responsible, we have to say we'll help you this one time but you have to be self-sufficient as an organization or we can help with this one need and then there are other mechanisms we can point you too. If you make this a free for all Minka will be dealing with the same person every 2-months asking for help.

Ms. van der Zwaag: And to be honest I may come back to you next year and say I want to change it back to every 3-years instead of 2-years.

Commissioner Stinger: Our experience has not been that we have...

Ms. van der Zwaag: No, our experience has not been and I don't expect this huge change but I'm doing this to open it up a little bit but I didn't – I...

Commissioner Stinger: I guess I see your point and it makes sense to me except that that's not been our experience. Maybe...

Commissioner Smith: We have safeguards.

Commissioner Stinger: Well and we still do. Maybe the answer is not to change – in addition to the changing of the copy I know you advertise it a lot but maybe somehow make it more well known in the community.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Right, that's a discussion that Monique and I initially it was our HSRAP grantees, our CDBG grantees, and really, I send it out to everybody that is on the bidder's list for HSRAP so that's about 35 to 40 local non-profits and it's more non-profits in the human service field so we are catching that net for human services non-profits in Palo Alto or serving Palo Altans. It's not completely comprehensive but it's not as limited but that's a conversation we need to have as well.

Commissioner Lee: Well, and the Committee itself and the fact that the City Manager as to sign

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.



off is in itself an additional check to make sure that public funds are being used appropriately. I'm wondering if you have any sense of a lot of the agencies that do such great work in our community do such broad work. Avenidas came and told us about an overwhelming amount of different things that they do. Have we seen or could we envision a scenario where they have an emergency or critical need in one sort of sector that they provide services on? Then next year they have another emergency or critical need in a different type of service that they provide and would limit just to one organization limit our ability to serve two different kinds of emergency or critical needs?

Ms. van der Zwaag: Right it's certainly can. I've run into that once in the last period where an agency forgot that they had asked or the agency was big enough so they didn't realize their one aspect of it had asked for money. When actually the new need that they were hoping to apply for which as I said they couldn't as the policy was completely different. So, I do see that, I'm more of the cautious type. I'm kind of like well let's do this change, this is quite an opening the door I think for the emerging needs and then if we want to say let's look at this again in a year instead of 2-years and see where this takes us, we can go from there.

Commissioner Lee: Can you remind us, when was the last time Council approved this?

Ms. van der Zwaag: I have it in my report. It was March 2017.

Commissioner Lee: Ok so not that long ago, ok.

Ms. van der Zwaag: No, it wasn't that long ago at all.

Commissioner Lee: Ok thank you.

Chair Kralik: Minka thank you for all your hard work on this and your next step is to...

Ms. van der Zwaag: My step next, if I hear consensus that you feel good about this then I will review this with my supervisor and then I can provide feedback at the next meeting as far as what the next steps are for this.

Commissioner Smith: Do we need a motion for that?

Ms. van der Zwaag: You can make a motion to...

Commissioner Smith: Continue the work?

Ms. van der Zwaag: ...forward – that you are recommending that the Staff draft, you can do so.

Commissioner Smith: Chair, can I make the motion?

Chair Kralik: I would be honored to have you do that, go right ahead.

## **MOTION**

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Commissioner Smith: Thank you. We'd like to make a motion that the Emerging Grant paperwork process be continued by Staff and see where we end up for further discussion by this Board.

Commissioner Lee: I'm sorry, I don't know what that means. Can you clarify?

Commissioner Smith: Basically, Staff's going to work on it, bring it back to us, and when we have further discussion on it because Minka said you just wanted us to say you can do further work on it, is that correct?

Ms. van der Zwaag: No, basically this is it.

Commissioner Smith: Ok.

Ms. van der Zwaag: What I'm saying is that you are...

Chair Kralik: We're approving it.

Ms. van der Zwaag: ... you're recommending to Staff that you are comfortable with this language and then I will take the next step. Then I will let you know at a...

Chair Kralik: Would you like to revise your motion?

### **MOTION REVISED**

Commissioner Smith: Oh, of course, I'd love to revise it. I would like to motion that the Commission recommends that the Emergent Grant proposal rewrite is recommended by this Commission. I think that's the correct way?

Chair Kralik: It's good. Commissioner Brahmbhatt.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: No, I mean will there be a second? I just had a comment. I think Minka wanted to discuss the name, we didn't discuss the name portion of it.

Ms. van der Zwaag: We can do that now or you can just send me suggestions. Yes, but thank you, I was going to say that.

### **SECOND**

Commissioner Lee: I will second the motion and if I could...

Chair Kralik: Well, let's open it up for discussion now. Anybody want to discuss that?

Commissioner Lee: Yes, if I could...

Commissioner Smith: Is there unreadiness right?

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

## **FRIENDLY AMENDMENT**

Commissioner Lee: If I could propose a thought or a friendly amendment. Now I like the process that Minka has laid out. I think given that this was last reviewed in March of 2017, I think it's appropriate for us to recommend the revised copy as presented. My sense from our discussion here is that we have a lot of different thoughts on it and so I think if we can add to motion that perhaps the HRC will form an Ad Hoc Committee to discuss some of the ideas that have been presented here in greater detail. So that when the opportunity arises again to make any sort of revisions, that we have those ready to go so to speak the next time around.

Ms. van der Zwaag: I hear you but after we operationalize it, some of those suggestions may play out to be a lot different.

Commissioner Lee: Sure.

Ms. van der Zwaag: I'm fine with the idea of an Ad Hoc Subcommittee, I think that might be more relevant in 1 to 2-years times when we look at it now instead of thinking of ideas that...

Commissioner Lee: So, my suggestion would be to in 1-year form an Ad Hoc Committee to reevaluate how the new policy is going and to further dig deep into some of the ideas that we all came up with. There seems like there's a lot of...

Chair Kralik: Is there a second for that amendment?

## **FRIENDLY AMENDMENT DIES DUE TO THE LACK OF A SECOND**

Chair Kralik: Ok, let's go with the first one and not hearing any further discussion, could we vote on the first motion? All in favor? Any...

Ms. van der Zwaag: Thank you all.

## **MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY 6-0 WITH COMMISSIONER O'NAN ABSENT**

Chair Kralik: Alright it carries unanimously, thanks you so much.

Commissioner Lee: Thank you.

### **3. Update and next steps from March 11, 2019, LGBTQ Summit**

Chair Kralik: Ok we'll move forward in our Commission meeting to the third item of business which is the next steps from March 11, 2019's LGBTQ Summit that was run by Staff, Commissioners Lee and Stinger. I attended and it was a good experience held at the Art Center meeting room. We'll try to stay on track if we can so let's see if you guys can make up about 10-minutes with your presentation, ok?

Commissioner Stinger: So, to 8:10?

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Chair Kralik: It's another 20-minutes...

Commissioner Smith: I'll time it.

Chair Kralik: ... or so.

Commissioner Smith: I can time it.

Chair Kralik: Sure.

Commissioner Stinger: I'm going to review what we did on March 11<sup>th</sup> at the LGBTQ Working Summit. The intent of the presentation is informational but also to have your support for our continuing work which will probably take us into next year. I think we have some exciting opportunities and I want you to be aware of them. Thank you. What we're going to look at is the purpose, attendees, discussion questions, the outcomes, and the continuing work. The purpose of our working summit was to bring decision makers from key service providers and agencies together in a fresh forum to assess the needs and select some initiatives for programs, services, visibility and/or space to benefit our population in Palo Alto. The focus came from the work that we had done prior and the Listening Forum and in the survey work. We also hoped that the individual efforts which have been successful but could be more successful would be enhanced by partnerships that would form at the meeting. The attendees, we had about 35 – 34 to 36 people, I think...

Commissioner Lee: Do you want me to do the clicking for you?

Commissioner Stinger: Thank you. Representing – yes, I will let you do that, thank you. County and City governments, service providers, faith-based communities, and our City and school librarians. I wanted to show this to you so you could see that we had a breadth of people. They were the leaders in their organizations and it was really quite overwhelming. We had a list of maybe 5 key people that we really wanted, we sent out the invitations, and we were overwhelmed by the response. The power in the room when we walked in that night was somewhere between positive and scary. The format of the meeting was to have two discussion questions. We had people sitting at tables, randomly sat at tables to discuss what are the issues and needs. They presented those to us and then we went to second tables where we were more selective. If they had a particular need they wanted work they sat with that group and came up with an implementation or a proposal. This is where I can make up a lot of time. I just wanted you to see the number of ideas, the stickies that came up and the representative ideas; needs and ideas that were discussed. I have to admit that stickies get lost so these are some of the representative stickies.

Commissioner Smith: There was a bigger pile?

Commissioner Stinger: There was a bigger pile and I'm sure that we could figure it out if we wanted to but this gives it the idea. The process led to five areas of potential explores; visibility, activity, education/training, government/local services, and space.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Commissioner Lee: We basically just grouped all of the stickies together and those were the five categories that came together. Then we broke out in the second question based on each of those five categories.

Commissioner Stinger: So, a group sat together to say what do they want to do for visibility and that happened to be the table that I was sitting at? I truly expected that group to say we want to put banners up, we're going to have a button, we'll have door signs and they were like no, that's gone, that's passed. You can do that so easily without really making a commitment. We want to do something like have third Thursday, fourth Wednesday every month we're here to do something educational, do something social, intergenerational, it could be movies. Different groups wanted to sponsor movies, bingo, family day, Palo Alto University wants to do a movie night, the Y wants to do bingo night, we can have family educational programs so that was the Visibility table. They were great.

Commissioner Lee: So, I was actually at the activities table and there were some comments about having LGBTQ specific events but also just a sense of wanting to make sure that the community was very visible in all of the existing community events that we did. So, a lot of the folks at the table are involved with planning a lot of these events and they were like oh, of course, we can work on that right away. So, it seemed like just the fact that it was brought up in the meeting, it was something that was so obvious but no one had ever thought about that. That led to folks saying yep, that's definitely doable just in terms of making sure that we do proper outreach to LGBTQ community to make sure that they know these events are going on and how they may participate. There may be ways to incorporate just greater awareness or topics around LGBTQ as part of a larger effort that they're working on.

Commissioner Stinger: Our representative from City Parks and Rec took that on and is already taking steps to work on a movie series and deliver that to families in early summer. Education and training, particular focus was – I'm going to move through these quickly – was a resource or a reference center in the City's libraries.

Commissioner Smith: That's a great idea.

Commissioner Lee: I think the interesting thing that came out of this was there was both a need to provide programs and resources for folks who are actively in need and in search of these services. In light of our unique demographics, also finding ways to provide those resources to folks who may not be actively looking for them and embedding them in some larger topics that might make those events and resources more accessible to particular segments of our community. In particular new immigrants and Asian-American population who may not actively be looking for those resources but find ways to embed those in larger events so that people get those resources without – yes.

Commissioner Stinger: Then the fourth of the five tables was government and other local services and the focus there was on providing sensitivity training, initial training and refresher courses for people who work with mostly our young people.

Commissioner Lee: We know that the City has already done that and is already doing that in

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

some context. So, we just want to make sure that we acknowledge all of the great work that the City is already doing...

Commissioner Stinger: Thank you.

Commissioner Lee: ... on that front.

Commissioner Stinger: And request that we continue that programming because it's very valuable and appreciated. There was a suggestion that application forms could be reviewed to make sure that they are inclusive and consistent across departments and could be a model.

Commissioner Lee: Not only forms but any sort of government document or publications. Just wearing that lens to make sure that it's as inclusive as can be. From my standpoint that might be something that one of us could easily do just by going online and taking a look.

Commissioner Stinger: And just making sure that the language is contemporary and consistent across departments and across government and non-government organizations. There was a focus on all gender restroom signage. The county has a program now of providing free signage...

Commissioner Lee: So small businesses.

Commissioner Stinger: ... and we could help promote that through or we could consider leveraging communication with the Chamber to reach out to small businesses and provide signage to increase compliance with state law. Acknowledgment, that mental health and other behavioral health services are inadequate for the LGBTQ homeless but the partnerships with the Opportunity Center need to be explored. That was a little beyond our scope the first evening. There were some other proposals that were also beyond the scope of the first evening so the agenda for the second meeting could be expanded to examine those. Let me talk about that in a second. The piece that we did not look at was space and that was because we had some illnesses that prevented people from the county from coming but that work is progressing. That will be a focus of the next summit in May and I think that can become a priority for our Committee. We hope - with the approval of the Commission - to look at either dedicated space or an RV , a mobile unit, that could provide mental health, physical and medical help to LGBT communities.

Commissioner Lee: With respect to this category if the Commission would like for us to work on it, it may require more involvement from the City or the county. It's certainly not something that the agencies could necessarily do purely on their own. I think in some of the other categories there was a sense that a lot of that can be done by the agencies themselves. Just getting together but this particular category on space, if we wanted to pursue it may just require more facilitation from us or probably more so from the county.

Commissioner Stinger: Fair.

Commissioner Stinger: The continuing work would also be to, as I said, to continue the development of the proposals that were made at the first meeting. Look at second level proposals, some of the people would be ready to take on something different. We don't want this

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org) . This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

to be permanently sitting in our court so we do need to identify a Steering Committee so that we can ensure that this is a sustained effort and sustained commitment. It was interesting when I think I asked for an Advisory Board. Nobody wanted to do that. A Committee? Oh, yes, we could do that. So, we have interest but we need to formulate that and finalize it. We're doing a survey now, a doodle, to pick a date and I think we'll do it May 8<sup>th</sup> or May 10<sup>th</sup>.

Commissioner Lee: I mean there was so much energy and so much passion in that room and just so much momentum we just ran out of time. So, Valerie and I think that another group meeting might be warranted just to get them together. So that hopefully they can further discuss some of the things that we talked about at the first meeting and help give them that continued momentum. So that can be done individually or in partnership with other non-profits. We just gave them the framework or how would you describe it?

Commissioner Stinger: There needs to be some initial kick starts that couldn't happen in one 2-hour session. It may be a second meeting is appropriate but for space, we definitely need to come back together to have the group say these are the types of facilities either temporary or permanent that we need.

Chair Kralik: Would you entertain some questions?

Commissioner Stinger: Please.

Commissioner Smith: It sounds like an amazing program, congratulations on great execution, great attendance. You guys are making a reference to a second step group. Is that the desire to get all of these 30 back in a room or is it a desire to get 10-15? What does that look like?

Commissioner Stinger: The desire might be to get 35, the implementation will probably be 20. We'll do it with...

Commissioner Lee: I think as many as we can get, right?

Commissioner Stinger: Yes, attendance and a zoom – internet access.

Vice Chair Qifeng: May I make a short comment? So, thank you for doing such a wonderful program. So, lately, I took my son to a few colleges so where ever we went LGBTQ is a big issue. All the colleges are trying to make sure that they have a good education program in place making sure all students are aware and to protect the LGBTQ community. So, I feel as a City, our Committee Members are doing wonderful jobs. When I talked to those students, reps, and the professors about this we feel no matter where we go, we as a county put in lots of effort and energy in protecting this community. I was thinking certainly I would appreciate the great work that you guys did.

Commissioner Stinger: Thank you.

Commissioner Stinger: I think one of the telling comments was somebody walked into the room and just said, I didn't know there was this much energy in the peninsula and that was really

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

satisfying to say that we could be that conduit for social, educational, and psychological help.

Chair Kralik: Well, we look forward to the next update. I was there and I second all your comments about the energy of the room and you know the issue of space did come up at my table. There were a lot of thoughtful ideas about it so I do think spending a little time on that is important because people had some very good local ideas. The other thing that I would say is that just by holding this nice summit you provided a space here in our community for a very productive discussion where people identified needs and ways to implement programs that would resolve those needs. So, I think that local in the Art Center was just a fabulous safe environment for people to express themselves. It worked out really well. The sandwiches were good so thank you, Staff.

Commissioner Lee: Staff did such a good job organizing everything.

Chair Kralik: I mean maybe that was some of it, people got fed and that was cool. Great work.

#### **4. Update and next steps from the March 7, 2019, Building Community – One Conversation at a Time.**

Chair Kralik: I was going to turn to the next agenda item to stay on track and this is the Building Community group. This is also Commissioner Stinger but Commissioner Smith did some great work on this as well. You know as we build on these successes, I know that one of the things, when we look for topics that has come up a recent vintage, is the potential topic of how we speak civilly to one another. So, I hope you guys can address that because I think one of the productive ways that we as a Commission can lead in civil discourse is to teach people how to productively discuss their differences. The one thing that I would say is that when we were present in let's say the LGBTQ Summit, we all tried to as Staff and Commission Members be part of each table. We have another resource which we all know about which is the mediation group and they're tremendous in terms of their training and in terms of civil discourse. That could be a wonderful way to integrate them into our mission. So, without further ado, I'll just ask Commissioner Smith and Commissioner Stinger to report on Item Four.

Commissioner Smith: We had a phenomenal first community conversation. We were honored to have Dr. Dina Sterling from the Stanford GSB who has been doing research and study on gender equity. She handled the room in a very compassionate and learning manner. We had some really good break out table time and I don't know about everybody else's break out table but I felt like the conversation was really rich and deepening and opened my eyes to certain biases that I had or certain things around gender equity that I was really challenged with. I think the thing Dr. Sterling is so, so seditionously pointed out is that some of our biases we don't even realize that they're there. Even around gender stuff so I felt like it was a great first start. I'd love to thank the Commission for its overall support. Commissioner Kralik was there, Commissioner Lee was there, Staff was amazing as usual.

Chair Kralik: I remember the cookies; they were all so good but no I actually sat with the speaker and...

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.



Commissioner Smith: We were in the same group.

Chair Kralik: Yes, and she was a fantastic person to talk to about her background and I shared some of my own family issues with her. Issues about my wife's career...

Commissioner Smith: That was powerful.

Chair Kralik: ...and how difficult this issue of gender equity has been. It is not easy in different environments; whether it's engineering; whether it's science; whether it's government. We're seeing wholesale changes and I think recognizing this is a very viable current topic was sort of the first thing in my mind that I noted and people were ready to chat about it.

Commissioner Stinger: That was one of the things that I noted. That it's more about implicit bias than legislative change and providing the venue and opportunity for people to talk about it and recognize their own biases and their own behaviors in a safe space was very valuable. I think the process could be extended to other topics.

Commissioner Lee: I really appreciated the conversation at my table. For the most part, I tried to mostly listening as a man but I did participate a little bit. Nothing really surprised me just because I've been very steeped in gender equity issue for the Commission for the past year or so. What I found interesting was just how intertwined some many of these issues are. How gender equity plays off of the "always on culture" that we have here in Silicon Valley, the pressure that our kids feel in our schools to go to the good school and get the good job and just to be the breadwinner, just how intersectional a lot of these are and how they intersect with gender equity and so many of the other issues that come across our table as Commissioners. So, I appreciated the opportunity to really delve into some of those intersections in greater detail than perhaps I'm use to. So, I thought it was a very great event so thank you Valerie and Kaloma for organizing that.

Commissioner Smith: Thank you. I'm grateful that the event had an impact on people. Me and Commissioner Stinger had a follow-up phone call because we wanted to figure out ways to continue community conversations that made sense. We felt like we were not in the right position to dive into our next topic immediately which was ethnicity. Even as we heard in the Avenidas presentation we felt like that needed a September time frame, we needed to do some more groundwork, I think May would have been too quick to really get and dive into that. We wanted to offer to the Commission to partner with another event that's happening in the community. Dr. Jennifer Eberhardt just released a book called Bias. She is a MacArthur Fellow; she has done some phenomenal work with the Oakland Police Department with watching the body camera tapes. It is amazing that the idea of bias, we generally look at it as a race issue but even African-American police officers are more likely to shoot black suspects in the bias test because it's an American bias; it is not a racial bias. She is partnering with the University AME Zion Church which I pastor and the Palo Alto League of Women Voters to come and speak on her brand-new book. She was on MPR the other day.

Commissioner Lee: What is her name?

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Commissioner Smith: Jennifer Eberhardt, the name of her book is Bias, she's a Stanford Professor, she runs that entire department, she was actually the one that did all the research with the Oakland Police Department. I think it's an easy win for us to be part of something so I leave it to my fellow Commissioners.

Commissioner Lee: When is that – has that been scheduled?

Commissioner Smith: May 1<sup>st</sup>.

Commissioner Lee: So, we would need to vote as a Commission to what, co-endorse that event?

Commissioner Smith: You can co-sponsor it and...

Commissioner Lee: Well sponsoring is if the City gives money, right? So, we'd be endorsing the event?

Ms. van der Zwaag: That is not on the agenda so you can't do either of those.

Commissioner Lee: Gotcha.

Ms. van der Zwaag: I would also differ to the Chair because there is the desire to come up with a policy for endorsing events and so forth. So, I will differ to him but what day was it? May what?

Commissioner Smith: May 1<sup>st</sup>.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Yes so that's not possible unfortunately because it's not agendize.

Commissioner Stinger: We can't vote under next steps of building a community?

Ms. van der Zwaag: This is a discussion item; it isn't an action item.

Commissioner Stinger: Oh, I see.

Commissioner Smith: Thank you so much, hopefully, you guys can make it.

Commissioner Lee: Can I ask for some clarification from the Committee? Is it the intention that the Committee as currently constituted would plan all of the community conversations? My memory may be serving me incorrectly but when we discussed this at the retreat my initial understanding was that the Committee would work on the framework that would be repeatable. So, the specific conversations themselves may be done by different Commissioners each time. I'm wondering what the intention is? Would you like to continue the two of you to do all of the Community Conversations?

Commissioner Smith: My understanding of it was in this year our job was to come up with a framework. Our mandate was to make suggestions and recommendations and to see if we could start developing formats for community conversations. We, in our initial discussion, had not so

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

finely parsed out the different parts of it because we were unsure of what it would look like. I wish I had known about agenzizing the item because I thought it was under the mandate of this group to actually present and the last two weren't action items. They were just what we did so I'll know for next time to make sure that we put it under an action item.

Commissioner Lee: Without going into great discussion on it I think some topics that I would throw out as potential community conversations are on housing and not necessarily on a specific housing policy or housing project or a state bill but really how do we have conversations about who we are, where do we come from, how do we get to know each other as members of the same community? Notwithstanding our differences of opinion on housing and I think housing is a very divisive issue. I've certainly, in my neighborhood association, heard stories of "nimby's" who have been told by "yumby's" that they should leave town and vice versa. That's the sort of rhetoric..

Commissioner Smith: East Palo Alto gets so spicy at Starbucks.

Commissioner Lee: It's that sort of rederick that sort of disturbed me. Even if I disagree with someone on policy, I would never suggest that someone leave the community so that might be something to consider doing a community conversation.

Chair Kralik: How is the subcommittee able to receive suggestions from other Commissioner on topics? I mean because we have a limit on the number of people that can discuss topics but is there a mechanism in place for folks to say to Commissioner Stinger and Commissioner Smith...

Ms. van der Zwaag: Anybody can send them to me and I will send them too whoever is serving on the subcommittee.

Chair Kralik: Ok, I think that's a great idea. So, Steve, if you have those ideas, I think our mechanism would be in place and that would help us with our commitment to holding clear public meetings.

Commissioner Lee: Could I please ask for some clarification from the Chair though? Is it the intention that the current committee actually plan some sort of community conversation number two and number three? Again my... (crosstalk)

Commissioner Stinger: Can I make a suggestion that we (crosstalk)...

Chair Kralik: I'm particularly excited to have...

Commissioner Stinger: ... take that on at the retreat?

Chair Kralik: ... these two Commissioners work.

Commissioner Lee: No, it's not (inaudible)(crosstalk)

Chair Kralik: So, unless that excitement wains with the members of the Commission, yes is the

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

answer to your questions.

Commissioner Smith: We also did ask in I think it was September or October meeting for ideas. So, our work was based this year on that. We are totally open to ideas. What I would like to know moving forward and for the record tonight is if our Committee wants to have an event, what is the process moving forward? I know for our first event I just gave reports along the way so I just want to be clear what is the mandate to do community conversations, what is the process? Do I need to send an agenda item that is an action or where would that fall into business?

Commissioner Lee: I mean my sense is that would fall under our discussion about how do we want to endorse or sponsor events either jointly with others or individually as a Commission.

Ms. van der Zwaag: I think he's asking...

Chair Kralik: Let's seek guidance here.

Ms. van der Zwaag: ...I think he's asking two questions. I think one is, is the mandate just for the two of them to come and say hey we're working on this event, this is what we think, X, Y, and Z, and at this point yes, as the Ad Hoc Subcommittee you are. As far as the second aspect of it I would not want to just in the guise of a report. Even if this was an action to say hey can you endorse this other event? I am anxious as soon as possible to have an operational policy for supporting and endorsing events so that everybody who has one can run it through that process. So, I've been looking forward to that.

Commissioner Lee: So, if I'm understanding what I just heard, on the first point if the Committee wants to put on a stand-alone HRC event then they have the mandate to do so already.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Correct.

Commissioner Lee: If it's a joint effort with another group or attaching to another existing event that would require going through the process or?

Ms. van der Zwaag: I'm not saying that. No, actually I'm not saying that specifically if these two Commissioners said hey, the League of Women Voters is going to work with us on this event and so forth. My understanding with this specific event it's their event that they are hoping to have the HRC's event as support of. Then I say it needs to go through just this process. If it's the other way around if you're saying hey University AME Zion, hey League of Women Voters, American-Muslim Voice, do you want to partner with us on this event? I don't really feel like I want to set up a process that those folks have to come to you and say is it ok that X, Y, Z organization works with us on it. So, I see it as the one aspect and I'm, like I said, anxious to see that operational as soon as possible.

Commissioner Lee: Just a point of clarification, so the Committee can have up to three maximum, right?

Ms. van der Zwaag: That's correct.

Commissioner Lee: So, I'll just put it out there, if the Committee would like additional assistance, I'm offering my assistance if you would like it or if none of my colleagues show interest..

Ms. van der Zwaag: You know I think in all honesty we're getting towards the next agenda item which is the retreat (crosstalk)

Chair Kralik: Right, let's go there.

Ms. van der Zwaag: I'm not saying it for the same reason you are. I'm saying it for the reason that at the retreat a lot of these things kind of reset to a way that people can honestly say hey, that's something that I'd like to help with next year. That's something I'd like to help with next and it's not that the point that this Committee is trying to be exclusive. I think that was the Committee to do this event.

Commissioner Smith: Last year.

Ms. van der Zwaag: When we're in June all things are back up again.

Commissioner Smith: Well, I think...

Commissioner Lee: Just a point of clarification, I mean my understanding from what I heard from Commissioner Smith today was that the original understanding was to create a framework and a format which is different from actually putting on the events. We can talk about that later so my understanding of what the committee was going to do was slightly different.

Ms. van der Zwaag: I hear that but I think with all the best of intentions (crosstalk)...

Commissioner Lee: No, of course, yes.

Ms. van der Zwaag: ...these two Commissioners started that and the conversation morphed and they had some great ideas and they kind of came up with a wonderful event and that's where we are right now.

Commissioner Lee: Just the last thing that I would say is I just want to echo what the Chair mentioned in terms of utilizing the Palo Alto meditators. I spoke with some of Project Sentinel's Staff and that was sort of an idea that also came up in terms of these are folks with lots of expertise and training; how might we leverage them in some non-traditional ways or ways that they may not necessarily work in but would put skills to work. So, I would echo and agree with that point.

Chair Kralik: Commissioner Smith.

Commissioner Smith: That one thing that I'm a little put back with is generally when a Commission deals with issues, whether it's an event, a thing. The reason we have Robert's Rules ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

of Order is for the Commission to vote on its priorities. So, is that not a process?

Commissioner Lee: Personally, I would prefer there to be more of a process. Even though we talked about all of these things at the retreat we never formally adopted them. I went back through the minutes and I think there was consensus but we never actually formally adopted any of them.

Commissioner Smith: Ok.

Commissioner Lee: I would prefer a more rigorous process but that's my philosophy.

Commissioner Smith: Well it is a rigorous process because it is. One of the things that I always want to be clear on is we run our meetings as a governing structure of this community through Robert's Rules of Order which is a standard for how Commissions and Committees meet. It is pretty rigorous if followed. I think we ought to be careful adding infrastructure that makes things more complicated when we already have a structure which is motion, discussion, on readiness vote. So, I think the issue needs to lie tonight but as we start really talking and discussing this, we either do it with the standard which is Robert's Rule of Order or we start doing different things. If something listed as a discussion which is fair then it can't be an action so we need to make sure that we're applying all the same standards across everything. Thank you.

Commissioner Stinger: Can I make a closing comment? May I make a comment?

Chair Kralik: Please.

Commissioner Stinger: At the risk of being redundant I really want to say one of my takeaways from the first event we did was that personal invitations are very important to increase attendance and show our involvement and concern for the process and topic. Pastor Smith with the League of Women Voters are doing a huge job putting together the May 1<sup>st</sup> event and I would hope that if I could send out an invitation to each of you, you would attend and forward it to your friends. Jennifer Eberhardt is just a fabulous speaker. You'll remember that my passion has been implicit bias. I've tried to make that my portfolio and I've wanted to have her speak to us several times and we just walked into it. I think it's going to be a wonderful event.

Chair Kralik: It just sounds to me like we underestimated your readiness here and we won't do that again.

Commissioner Smith: Thank you.

## **5. Discussion on the upcoming June Human Relations Commission Retreat**

Chair Kralik: Let's move onto the fifth item which is the June Human Relations Commission Retreat. Staff is the speaker.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Right so last year we did our retreat in June and I think we felt like that was a good timeframe to do so. Yes, sir?

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Commissioner Smith: I'm gone every week but one in June. That would be the first.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Well that's going to be challenging so you better change those airline reservations.

Commissioner Smith: I can tell you they cost a lot of money.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Ok, well we will need to see that. That is our intention to do it in June. I know I am gone in July so the intention to do it at that timeframe is that we have our new Commissioners on board. We can get them involved right away and throughout the summer we can massage the programs and policies that you all are interested in so that when September happens its kind of off and running so that is the hope. I have been in touch with the person who did it last year. I had made no promises but I had the feeling that she had some really strong facilitation skills to be able to work us through some challenging conversations and to come out with a good product at the end. So, I said that would be something that we would be discussing tonight. This type of meeting usually has the same kind of elements. We talk about what we did last year, what was successful, what were some of the challenges, we talk about what we want to do the next year. Last year we did spend some additional time getting to know each other, coming up with some group agreements on how we wanted to work together. I think it would probably be helpful to say hey, let's look at what those were, did they work for us, did they not work for us? We also had talked about coming up with a process which we've followed to a point as when we had new opportunities presented to us, how do they fit in with what we already agreed to do and what process we would follow to slide something new in? So, we did have some good conversations with her and I am willing to support the cost of a facilitator again but at this point, I'm just opening it up to what you, as a Commission, feel would be important to have? Sometimes there's a subcommittee, sometimes one person works with me, so I'm just opening up the conversation now.

Chair Kralik: Did we have a June retreat last time or an August retreat?

Ms. van der Zwaag: We had a June retreat; it was like the second Saturday in June.

Chair Kralik: Ok.

Commissioner Smith: I just looked at my calendar Minka.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Yes sir.

Commissioner Smith: I can do the 1<sup>st</sup> and the 15<sup>th</sup>.

Ms. van der Zwaag: What I can do is or maybe tomorrow Mary can send out...

Chair Kralik: Is that a Saturday, the 15<sup>th</sup>?

Commissioner Smith: Yes.

Ms. van der Zwaag: ...a Doodle poll for everyone.

Commissioner Smith: I leave the next...

Ms. van der Zwaag: It's going to be hard because we are going to have two Commissioners and my understanding interviewed the 29<sup>th</sup> of April and then appointed sometime like the first or second week of May. So, they may be at the May meeting, they may not. That seems pretty similar to what it was last time, that it was a pretty quick turnaround. That for some of you your first meeting was the retreat and I heard some good things that were a real good way to get acquainted with everybody and our processes and so forth.

Commissioner Lee: I really enjoyed last year's retreat and I thought the facilitator was really great. I think my only constructive feedback on that was I felt like we needed .5 more time, like half an additional session, just really get into the nitty-gritty of things and finalize things. It seemed like we had a general outline of what we wanted to do but there were a couple of months where we kind of just floating there.

Ms. van der Zwaag: You felt like you needed that as a facilitated process or...

Commissioner Lee: Not necessarily as facilitated but...

Commissioner Smith: I think it would be good to have another facilitator process. Maybe not that day but later, like a zoom call or something or something maybe a little bit later in the year to see if we're sticking to what we talked about.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Well we couldn't do a zoom call because we'd have to worry about the Brown Act. It could be that we could, if she's willing, invite her to the next HRC meeting to work through our process there or if the Commission would be willing to take an afternoon break and come back for a couple of hours. Do you remember how long it was? Was it 9:00 to 2:00?

Commissioner Stinger: It was 9:00 to 2:00 or 9:00 to 3:00. We did a long session.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: It was long.

Commissioner Smith: It was long.

Commissioner Lee: I thought...

Commissioner Stinger: I think if we spent a lot of time and it was well spent on different communication styles and identifying north, south, east, and west. That was interesting and maybe we want to repeat it but I think if we replace that with our issues for next year and discussion and really spend more time than on honing down from the proposals to...

Ms. van der Zwaag: So, we had a Work Plan when we left the door.

Commissioner Stinger: I would be more comfortable with that.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.



Ms. van der Zwaag: 9:00 to 3:00.

Commission Stinger: On a Saturday.

Commissioner Lee: I think it's a good time spent. I mean the more time we can do it up front the less time hopefully, over the course of the year, we could spend trying to find our way.

Ms. van der Zwaag: So, between the 9:00 to 3:00 timeframe people would like to have a Work Plan when they left the door or there was one suggestion for a two part? I mean this helps me in having discussions with Nancy.

Commissioner Lee: I mean I think there's some benefit in taking a break and coming back to it. Whether that's taking an afternoon break or something the next day or the following weekend but it should be, in my opinion, within close proximity to that first session.

Ms. van der Zwaag: We did an hour and a half on team building. Mary is bringing to my attention so that was an awfully long time so I think that could be looked at a little bit different. We made decisions for that retreat based on the needs of the Commission at that time. At that time, we really felt there was a need for people to come together, to be able to understand each other and build the HRC as a team. We would need to make that decision if that's still the need with two new members. I mean in all honesty at that point, once two new members are on, it would be Commissioner Lee and Commissioner Stinger who are the longest-serving members. So, it's a very young Commission in that way.

Commissioner Smith: You guys are teenagers.

Chair Kralik: Well I think we should go for an action item which is to approve the June summit or the June retreat. Could someone make a motion?

Commissioner Lee: Can I make the suggestion that perhaps a Committee of yourself, the Vice-Chair and our former Chair maybe work with Minka on the detail on that or do you think that's not needed?

Chair Kralik: You know it's just to discuss. Do you want to have a...

Commissioner Lee: So, I'll make the motion to approve a June Commission retreat and that an Ad Hoc Committee consisting of the Chair, Vice-Chair, and Commissioner Stinger work on the specifics with Staff assuming Commissioner Stinger is willing to serve.

Chair Kralik: Yes, why do we do this – what I'd like to do (crosstalk)

[many people started talking at once]

Ms. van der Zwaag: I think this is really ironic because Commissioner Lee was the one who said to me that he'd like to have a process for how we establish who gets selected or who is chosen to be on Commissions (inaudible)(crosstalk)

[many people started talking at once]

## **MOTION**

Chair Kralik: Let me do this, I'll make the motion that the Commission approve a June retreat and if we can get a second then we have...

## **SECOND**

Commissioner Lee: Second.

Commissioner Smith: Second.

Chair Kralik: Ok great and let's have a little discussion about who would like to participate in the planning.

Commissioner Smith: Not I.

Chair Kralik: Ok. Commissioner Stinger is that something you really want to do or is that...

Commissioner Stinger: Really want to do? Willing to do?

Chair Kralik: No, I just...

Commissioner Stinger: Willing to do.

Chair Kralik: ... I mean because I think...

Commissioner Stinger: I think leadership can carry...

Chair Kralik: Yes, I think it's fine. Why don't we do it that way? We'll keep it informal and...

Commissioner Stinger: I think that'd be fine. Thank you.

Chair Kralik: It's nice to volunteer people.

Commissioner Lee: I mean I'm willing to volunteer myself. I mean we just have a relatively young leadership team this year but maybe staff will (inaudible)(crosstalk)

Commissioner Smith: Can I push back on something?

Chair Kralik: Sure.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Commissioner Smith: How many Commissions have you been on?

Chair Kralik: Two.

Commissioner Lee: How many Commissions you've been on?

Commissioner Lee: Seven.

Commissioner Stinger: How many Commissions you've been on?

Commissioner Stinger: Three.

Commissioner Smith: Ok I don't think we have a young Board. Thank you. It might be young to this organization but I've served with some distinguished Commissioners and this is not a rookie team.

Vice Chair Qifeng: I'm new.

Commissioner Smith: Me and you yes but I think...

Chair Kralik: I think we're ok.

Commissioner Smith: I think we need to stop using the language but no, I just said you are wise.

Chair Kralik: Alright let's have a vote on – we have a second. Good discussion, thanks. All in favor?

## **MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY 6-0 WITH COMMISSIONER O'NAN ABSENT**

### **V. Reports from Officials**

#### **1. Commissioner Reports**

Chair Kralik: We're going to move onto the report from officials, Commissioner reports. I'd just like to begin. I always like to talk about things that I do. I'm very proud today to have attended the Volunteer Recognition Luncheon for the San Mateo Ombudsmen services. I'm one of 38 volunteer ombudsmen and we make every year 5,000 visits and advocate for over 10,000 residents. I know that Santa Clara County has a similar group but this was a really exciting luncheon. Vick Lee was the host and received an award. He's a personality on Channel 7. There are some tremendous people there. There was a gentleman who received a service award for 25-years, he's 92-years old who has worked as an ombudsman for 25-years straight advocating for the needs of long-term care residents with memory issues as well so it's wonderful organization. I think a real commitment to the community and I was just very proud to show up. So other Commissioners, if you'd like to give a report go right ahead. Vice Chair?

Vice Chair Qifeng: I have nothing to report.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Commissioner Smith: I had a great time speaking with the Kiwanis Club. I spoke some other place but I forgot it. Yes, I did one or two other community speaking engagement. I just can't remember what they are off the top of my head but thank you. Bye.

Chair Kralik: Commissioner Brahmbhatt.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: I've started a Big Kid Circle for Kids from the Indian heritage and just started discussing issues they see in schools and things like that. It's been good. Some of it was inspiration from seeing all the work that companies and people come and do here and from hearing all of your stories. Is this my last one or is the next one?

Ms. van der Zwaag: You have one more.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: Oh, next one because if the new Commissioners come you said in May then wouldn't that be more than...

Ms. van der Zwaag: Oh yes, then technically they don't start until June, that's right. Your term is until the end of May.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: Till the end of May, ok, so then I have one more last one before I say...

Ms. van der Zwaag: Right.

Chair Kralik: We'll bring a cake or something I'm sure.

Ms. van der Zwaag: We would have not have let that passed.

Chair Kralik: Yes there would have been a huge party here so that was a giveaway. Ok, Commissioner Stinger.

Commissioner Stinger: I have an announcement from County Supervisor Cindy Chavez is sponsoring a program on Children Senior Family Committee, special hearing on sexual assault and domestic violence. That was the first program that one of the Commissioners did when I joined the Commission and the county does fabulous work. So, I will not actually be able to attend but I was hoping that I could share this notice with other people.

Commissioner Smith: One other notice from the county, the County Santa Clara is giving away \$5 million, \$1 million for each district to support activities of underrepresented and minority or underrepresented communities in three significant areas; capital improvement; events or archival work. You must be at the April 16<sup>th</sup> session and I can send you the info. You must have a quick outline or a quick paragraph or two on what you want to do by June and the grants get issued in December. I think for communities that are looking for stuff, this is a great opportunity.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: Thank you very much.

Chair Kralik: Alright, Commissioner Lee.

Commissioner Lee: Thank you, Chair. So, I attended Cubberley Day, that was fantastic seeing all the different groups who operate our of Cubberley. During that event, I also attended Avenidas's Cultural Club ribbon cutting so that was fantastic to meet some of the other very engaged Asian-Americans in our community and all the great things that they are working on. Commissioner Stinger and I attended Mt. View's HRC's Civility Round Table. It turns out their staff person is someone from my past. She staffed the council member who represented my district growing up at San Jose. So that was a nice little reunion there but I think we got some good ideas of things that may or may not work for Palo Alto so that was a great event to attend. I also attended LifeMoves, they had a Homelessness Thought Leader luncheon which I thought was very fantastic just to see all the people along the peninsula who are working on homelessness in their respective ways. I met with Ryan Flout I believe from the Outlet; he had some follow up thoughts that he wanted to share with me following our LGBTQ working session. Let's see, I did want to make an announcement that I believe ACS is having their Spring for Support Luncheon on April 24<sup>th</sup>. It's here at the JCC and I'm planning on attending that and I would encourage my fellow Commissioners to as well just given the very important work that they do here in Palo Alto. I'm sure there are other things that I attended and did as well but I will leave it at that.

Chair Kralik: Great.

Commissioner Lee: Thank you.

Chair Kralik: (inaudible – off mic)

Ms. van der Zwaag: Principle.

Chair Kralik: We have a very nice person in the audience tonight. you've been so quiet.

Ms. van der Zwaag: So that is Monique le Conge who is the Director of Community Service and Libraries...

Chair Kralik: Wonderful.

Ms. van der Zwaag: ... and my Supervisor.

Chair Kralik: Oh, hi, how are you? Well great to have you aboard, as you can see Minka's behaving so...

Ms. leConge: She's been behaving all year. It's all fine.

Chair Kralik: We want to give you that good report.

Commissioner Brahmhatt: Yes one time I questioned her in that we were thinking she was from the newspapers or something like that. I'm like why...

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Chair Kralik: Ok, well thank you for watching over us, we really appreciate that.

## **2. Council Liaison Report**

No Council Liaison report.

## **3. Staff Liaison Report**

Chair Kralik: The Staff Liaison report, we're excited to have our two Staff members present.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Ok, just a quick report. At this point, it looks like we might have a joint study session with Council at the end of August. So, I do not have a date, it was just end of August, so we will see. The Council is often very impacted so sometimes those are moving dates so we haven't had one in a couple of years. So what that is, well the last time the conference room was still available, next time it may be in Chambers and it's really to share with Council what we've been doing and what you've been doing and your thoughts for the next year; which makes it even more critical that you work on your goals in the early summer session. So that's coming up.

Commissioner Lee: Can I ask a question about that? So, this would be my second joint session with the Council and I'm wondering have any of the other Commissions in their joint sessions ever gotten an actual formal direction from Council in that meeting?

Ms. van der Zwaag: Not in my recollection. Usually...

Ms. le Conge: It's a study session.

Ms. van der Zwaag: It's a study session.

Commissioner Lee: Ok because I know that at least me and a couple of Council Members have indicated an interest in there being more direction from Council to the Commission as to some of their priorities.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Right.

Commissioner Lee: I know it just hasn't come together yet so I don't know how that...

Ms. van der Zwaag: The hope is once the Council has had that study session, when they are doing their planning, they feel a need for the HRC to take on a study or a project for them that will come down the line. That's really a time for them to speak as individuals to give comment and feedback but it's not a point where the HRC can go back and say oh, we got Council direction to do X, Y, and Z.

Commissioner Lee: So, it's really up to Council initiative if they wanted to follow up with something specific.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Correct.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Commissioner Lee: Thank you.

Commissioner Smith: But isn't the mandate of our Commission to explore the community to feed information to Council for spots they might not see information on?

Ms. van der Zwaag: It's kind of goes both ways.

Commissioner Smith: Ok.

Ms. van der Zwaag: So there are things that are on your list to do, there are things that they could give you to do but they welcome you being the eyes and ears in the community and bringing issues to their attention that should be addressed and their level and not at Commission level. Whether they choose to take them up is really their decision but yes, it definitely can go both ways.

Commissioner Smith: Ok, thank you so much.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Ok. The Request for Proposal for Mediation Administration, that should be going out early next week. The other thing that I followed up and I did not do this with the intention of stopping any future HRC conversation on it. I just for diligence did some follow up was with the concern that Commissioner Brahmhatt gave regarding the vote for Chair and Vice Chair and the concept of that if in the vote the person with the most votes get to be the Chair and the person with the second less votes would be the Vice Chair. The feedback that I got from the City Attorney is that any vote to take any action by the Commission needs four votes. So technically if it's a vote the top vote-getter in that situation got four votes, the second vote getter would be three votes. So, the HRC in the Municipal Code are any Commissioner can't take a vote unless a majority of the Commission designates that action. So, if the motion was this person will be Chair, this person will be Vice-Chair and it was in one motion and that ticket got four votes. Then that would constitute a majority of the Commission and something that would pass but it can't just automatically be that because by default something to pass, it's going to be four and then the second person got three. The Commission cannot take action on something with only three votes. So that doesn't mean you all can't have any other further discussion on that but that is in the Municipal Code, it is the same process that all other Commissions follow so I just wanted to give you that information back. I am off next week but Mary will be here.

## **VI. TENTATIVE AGENDA FOR NEXT REGULAR MEETING: Thursday, May 9, 2019.**

Chair Kralik: We're going to move onto the tentative agenda for the next regular meeting. I see here a date, Thursday, May 9<sup>th</sup>. Is that the next regular meeting?

Ms. van der Zwaag: Should be.

Chair Kralik: It says selection of a Commissioner to craft Human Relations Commission Recognition Policy. I don't know is there another suggestion for our agenda next meeting? Go ahead, Commissioner Stinger.

Commissioner Stinger: I wonder if you would be interested, Deepali, doing a learning session or

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

a learning series for us. I'd be interested in what issues your surfacing with the population with teens that you have in your circle.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: Oh, you wanted me to share some of that?

Commissioner Stinger: If you would please.

Commissioner Smith: This meeting or next meeting?

Commissioner Lee: Next meeting.

Commissioner Stinger: Next meeting, yes.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: Yes, yes, sure, I can do that.

Commissioner Stinger: That'd be great.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: Yes, no, I've been hosting...

Chair Kralik: Ok I heard three seconds to that so I think she's on. We're going to give you a little bit of a platform on way out.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: Basically, I found it very helpful when I was growing up in middle school and high school we would sit and do a prayer and meditation and so I wanted to give something similar to my son growing up. So, what we do is once a month we invite kids who are in middle school or high school and sit in a circle. We do meditation and then we talk about whether they feel they are Indian, whether they feel they are American, things like that. If they see something of...

Commissioner Stinger: I'd really like you to elaborate on that. I think that is fabulous.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: Bulling issues or whatever is on their mind. There was this movie that they watched; one of the popular movies was the – The Hate...

Ms. van der Zwaag: The Hate You Get.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: The Hate You Get, that was being discussed in school and so we had a discussion on that.

Chair Kralik: Would you kindly talk to our Staff members about how to frame the agenda item? Would that be ok? Just maybe send them an email a framing of it and we'll put it on the agenda?

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: It's – yes, I can send them an email, think about it and how to phrase it, and then...

Chair Kralik: Great, thank you very much for doing that.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.



Commissioner Brahmbhatt: It's interesting, a lot of those kids usually will not talk to their parents but when they are in a circle, they feel part of the community and...

Chair Kralik: Wonderful.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: ... things come out and they say things. So, it has been good.

Chair Kralik: Ok, Commissioner Smith, you had an idea for the agenda?

Commissioner Smith: Process, we discussed it tonight so might as well make it an agenda item. What are recommendations for the process we discussed tonight?

Chair Kralik: I think that's what this is, is that what this item is?

Ms. van der Zwaag: Well, no, you have suggested that a Commissioner be selected next time.

Chair Kralik: To develop the policy around the process.

Ms. van der Zwaag: You can or you can just select a person or a subcommittee or now that can come back next time as the process.

Commissioner Smith: I nominate Commissioner Lee to be one of the people on that.

Chair Kralik: Well, yes. I think one of the things that I noticed is that it's a little bit difficult to have a Commissioner that's serving on the Leadership do that. So, if you have ideas about how to craft a Recognition Policy that would be great.

Commissioner Smith: Oh no...

Chair Kralik: I actually...

Commissioner Smith: ... I was talking about the event policy and the endorsement policy. That's the one I wanted to discuss.

Chair Kralik: I think what we should do is we should make this both not only the recognition but the event and endorsements as well. Do I have a second that?

Commissioner Lee: I'll second that.

Chair Kralik: Ok so we'll broaden that if we can.

Commissioner Lee: I would suggest that we even broaden it even further, I mean what Minka mentioned in terms of needing four people for the Commission to take any action. That provision of the code really resonates with me and I'm a very structural and process person and I think we may need to get back into the habit of doing more votes to authorize Commission action. So, I think it's more than just events and recognition but also just general process so if we can fold

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

that in there if the Chair thinks it's appropriate?

Ms. van der Zwaag: I caution against making something so big a process for four votes seems different than coming up with a process for endorsing events.

Commissioner Smith: That sounds more like a class on Robert's Rules of Order than a process.

Commissioner Lee: I can do that too.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Which now its Rosenberg's Rule of Order.

Commissioner Smith: It's Rosenberg now?

Ms. van der Zwaag: It is Rosenberg, I went to a training.

Commissioner Smith: Did somebody change it? They stole my rules. No.

Ms. van der Zwaag: See Rosenberg's Rule of Order, that's what the City follows now.

Commissioner Smith: So, I think there are two different things, the Commission understanding how we should work in a meeting and what we should vote on is I think a review of Rosenberg/Robert/Roberta – I want to cover everybody – Rules of Order. Then I think what we're talking about here are two very specific operational things that need to happen which is endorsement or retirement, what is it? Retirement?

Commissioner Lee: Recognitions.

Commissioner Smith: Recognition and events.

Chair Kralik: I think one of the big criticisms is we have to have some effort in the game with events. We can't be latching on our preponderate things that we don't do anything for and so that is just one example of where I think we need to have a senior leader or Commissioner. I will tell you that I will likely propose Commissioner Stinger to be the person that crafts this and I will likely propose Commissioner Smith to be the person that administers it. The idea is that we have to have a mechanism to feed proposed recognition of events, people, co-sponsorships so that we don't go over the number of Commissioners with respect to the Brown Act. What I was envisioning, just so that you know this, is having a short-written proposal that says if we have these things and someone proposes it to Staff or Commissioner Smith then he would then bring that up to Staff as an agenda item that could be voted on. You know my short experience has been that too many people talk about it ahead of time and then we run into issues that we had in the very first meeting where there were four people discussing some kind of a promotion of a library event. There were some really good comments about that, the one comment that I heard was well what do we do for that event? So, I want to just frame this in a way that is selection of the Commissioner to craft the Recognition Policy, the policy for co-sponsorship, the policy for promoting events, as the Human Relations Commission. Once we select that person then that person would next have one individual who would be responsible for that. That's where I was

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

going with it, that's the kind of thing that I want to discuss.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Can I just interject? We're getting really close to discussing something like an agenda item.

Chair Kralik: No, I'm trying to describe the topic a little bit better.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Right I definitely hear you Chair but the extenuating conversation on this. I think at this point the decision has to be one of two things. Either you are selecting the person next time to develop the policy...

Chair Kralik: Yes.

Ms. van der Zwaag: ... or you are having someone do that between this meeting and next you're reviewing the policy next time. I think that's the decision now.

Chair Kralik: I think the way it's written is fine which is to select the Commissioner to craft the Recognition Policy etc. as we have stated.

Commissioner Lee: So, the policy itself wouldn't be finalized potentially until June?

Chair Kralik: That's right, that's right, and that would give the person...

Commissioner Smith: What is the motion? I'm so confused on...

Ms. van der Zwaag: It's not a motion.

Chair Kralik: No, it's just the agenda item.

Ms. van der Zwaag: The agenda item.

Commissioner Smith: So, what is the agenda item for next time?

Commissioner Lee: To select someone to work on it.

Commissioner Smith: What was the second option Minka gave?

Chair Kralik: Well you could do any either way.

Commissioner Smith: You said we can pick somebody now?

Ms. van der Zwaag: No, in listening to the conversation I'm just saying your option is to select the person to do it next time. I don't specifically...

Chair Kralik: That's not an agenda item this time, unfortunately, right?

Ms. van der Zwaag: I'd have to maybe defer to Monique. I don't think every time you select someone to do something that it needs to be agendaize?

Commissioner Lee: Well, it would be an action of the Commission, right?

Ms. leConge: It would be an action item, of the commission.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Because my understanding was sometimes people say oh ok, you do that and it doesn't have to be a vote but...

Commissioner Lee: I mean we haven't really followed that process.

Ms. van der Zwaag: ... I have my direction here.

Ms. leConge: I mean you guys are very consistent in your application of that and so to do it seems (inaudible)(crosstalk)

Ms. van der Zwaag: Ok.

Ms. leConge: (off mic) So at the next meeting would be deciding who or if there's an Ad Hoc or whatever but you'd also have a discussion about that item and making recommendations.

Ms. van der Zwaag: I appreciate that – I can't even think of the...

Ms. Constantino: Explanation.

Commissioner Smith: Explanation.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Not explanation but that...

Ms. leConge: Collaboration?

Ms. van der Zwaag: Not that furthering of the topic that it could be picking the person but it's already that this group could give that person ideas.

Ms. leConge: Oh yes, I mean it's a discussion and an action item or (inaudible) people but your discussion can be about the item and providing input.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Right, I realize that but as it was written I don't think was the intention but I think that is a good segue.

Ms. leConge: But I think that is what you guys want to do.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Yes.

Commissioner Smith: Yes.

Chair Kralik: I have another agenda item that I'd like to propose which is an update on the bias

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

conference that Commissioner Smith has identified. I wondered if someone would second that.

Commissioner Smith: I will second that heartedly.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Is the Commission interested, I'm not sure what I would do, possibly our City transportation Staff but hearing another conversation about transportation in another aspect? I mean there is the City Shuttle Program, I'm not sure what their Staffing is like now if they have the capacity to send someone. Is there another transportation for vulnerability aspect because that's what we're really – that's kind of the framing of this conversation. Are there other suggestions that people might have that I could look into?

Chair Kralik: A learning series again?

Ms. van der Zwaag: No, no, no within the learning series of transportation. So, we asked Avenidas, I know there's an interest in having City shuttle Staff but is there another person or agency that might have information on transportation needs or transportation provisions for vulnerable populations that you'd like to hear from?

Commissioner Lee: Perhaps Vista or something with abilities dimension to it.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Ok.

Chair Kralik: I could see some public entities that provide transportation. Also, Stanford University and their transportation systems as well.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Ok, thank you.

Chair Kralik: Could also be the Caltrans or other bus groups.

Commissioner Stinger: What about – I don't know if VTA could speak to us about Route 22 changes.

Ms. van der Zwaag: They – actually it was in the paper that they're not going to cut the overnight service.

Commissioner Stinger: I missed it.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Yes.

Commissioner Stinger: Thank you.

Ms. van der Zwaag: You're welcome.

Commissioner Smith: You're not cutting overnight service?

Ms. van der Zwaag: They're not going to cut overnight services.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Commissioner Smith: A lot of people are very happy about that.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Yes, I know and that's all that – oh yeah, it wasn't my section still.

Commissioner Smith: I think we're done.

Commissioner Lee: Mr. Chairmen I have a couple that I'd like to suggest.

Chair Kralik: I'm excited to hear it.

Commissioner Lee: This one is not new; I think we mentioned it at the last meeting. To the extent that the Chief is available to give us a presentation on SB-1421. I believe he was unavailable this time around.

Ms. van der Zwaag: He was unavailable. There was an article today in the Palo Alto Post that there was the two cases were released. So those two cases where that were in question were released. I don't have any more information other than what I saw in the paper today.

Commissioner Lee: Can we tentatively see if he's available? I think you had expressed interest in having him come as well, Chair.

Commissioner Smith: The question becomes if they are released is there still a topic to talk about?

Ms. van der Zwaag: That would be my question and also Commissioner O'Nan I know had a meeting with the Chief in...

Commissioner Smith: I also did.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Thank you and Commissioner Smith in their roles as Liaisons.

Commissioner Lee: I think that there's still value to the public in having him come and present and provide a forum for the community to talk about it. It's sort of split up and down California as to whether you should release it or not. I'll have to take a look at the article to see if it changes anything on it but...

Ms. van der Zwaag: I would leave that to see if you have a second and I'd need to check in again with the Chief and his Staff.

Commissioner Lee: Is there a second for that request?

Commissioner Brahmhatt: Yes, sure, I can second that.

Commissioner Lee: Thank you. Also, the County Board of Supervisors has directed their staff to come back with proposed changes to their ICE Policy. Given that this Commission in the past I believe we sent a letter of endorsement for one of the Senate Bills on that topic to Sacramento.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

So, I think it may be timely for us to revisit that discussion and if necessary, weigh in on it. I know their Human Relations Commission did not have a chance to do so just given how the timing worked but given that this Commission has expressed interest in it. We may want to form an Ad Hoc Committee to see if we want to take any action on it or maybe we made the decision is no but I think that might be an interesting topic. Then my last one is sort of a question...

Chair Kralik: Oh, pause a second.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Can we have a...

Commissioner Smith: I second, I second the ICE.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Can you repeat? It's a State Senate Bill (inaudible)(crosstalk)

Commissioner Lee: No, the County Board of Supervisors has directed their Staff to draft revisions of their ICE policy and it happened what, maybe yesterday or the day before.

Ms. van der Zwaag: The Police Department or for what?

Commissioner Lee: It probably would involve the Sheriff Department, right? Yes, it was just how the county interacts with the state and federal...

Commissioner Stinger: They made exceptions to the Hands-Off Policy.

Ms. van der Zwaag: I think if this is something that does get a second, I'd need some more clarification...

Commissioner Lee: Sure.

Ms. van der Zwaag: ... and to check with our staff if there are any operational policies that would be affected at all. That could (inaudible)(crosstalk)

Chair Kralik: I'd like to know what is the topic because...(crosstalk)

Commissioner Lee: It's the county's ICE Policy.

Chair Kralik: Right but that's a news item so do you want to review their new policy...

Commissioner Lee: I'd like the Commission...

Chair Kralik: ... or would you like somebody to come and talk about the new policy?

Commissioner Lee: No, I'd like the Commission to consider whether we want to weigh in on the proposed changes.

Ms. van der Zwaag: To the county's policy.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Commissioner Lee: To the county's policy, yes.

Chair Kralik: Ok, should we wait until they are made?

Commissioner Lee: I mean I think it's an evolving discussion so we can at least get the ball rolling in terms of forming an Ad Hoc Committee to look into it.

Commissioner Smith: When will the county make its first report on it?

Commissioner Lee: I don't know but this body only meets once a month. So, if we wanted to start looking into it, we'd have to authorize it at this meeting.

Commissioner Smith: So, can we make an investigative look so we have clarity so we know what do next time?

Chair Kralik: Yes, why don't we have the Staff look into how to get updates on their draft policy and then we can decide if...

Commissioner Smith: But even if we even have a Commissioner come back and say this is what their draft policy is and this is what they're saying and this is compared to our previous statement that we made on this...

Commissioner Lee: So maybe the agenda is an update from me. I'll do some research into it and provide an update on what's going on and what their timeline is. If we can also make an action item should the Commission at that time decides that it wants to form an Ad Hoc Committee it has the option to do so at that meeting?

Chair Kralik: I'd like to see...

Commissioner Stinger: Can I make a suggestion?

Chair Kralik: Yes, I'd like to see someone from the County's Supervisor's Office provide us with an update to tell us what is their outline, what are they trying to do so that we're not operating in the dark. I think given that there's been a vote and there's an activity, someone there – I don't know Minka if you can make a contact to have someone report on their operation in trying to change it. They may describe steps of meetings; they may describe timelines but I would suggest is maybe the action item or the agenda item can be a report on the Board of Supervisor's efforts to change the ICE Policy. So that we're operating in light as to what is going on and maybe we can actually participate.

Commissioner Smith: Can I make a recommendation? I think we would need both paths because what I've found often times with most situations there is definitely two perspectives. So, the county could provide a perspective that says this is our thinking, Commissioner Lee could research communities that are impacted by it and say this is the thinking. So, I think in order for a Commission to have real good clarity on it, not only do we need to hear from the governmental body, but we also need to hear from the community body.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.



Chair Kralik: Well we could, in fact, I think we could follow it up with agenda items that would include discussions.

Commissioner Stinger: Can I make a suggestion?

Chair Kralik: Yes, please do.

Commissioner Stinger: I think if you can do some of the leg work and raise the questions, not the answers. We've been contacted by an immigration specialist who wants to work a program. Maybe if that becomes a priority for next year, we would know the questions to frame the program.

Ms. van der Zwaag: I think I'd like a lot better understanding about the timeframe for all of this to be able to move forward on whatever type of conversation that the HRC may want to have on that. So, I would think that is the first step.

Commissioner Smith: I think at this point there should some exploratory work...

Ms. van der Zwaag: Right.

Commissioner Smith: ... per the Chair something to the county that says you have put together a Commission, what even are you putting – why is this Commission even together to change – what are they changing and what is the goal? Because we – right now – like to the Chair's point, all we have is a headline. We're also going to ask Commissioner Lee to do some more explorations from some other source and we're going to determine if the next time does this warrant a further discussion or not a further discussion?

Ms. van der Zwaag: I think I want the first step to be just I'll be in contact with my contacts at Supervisor Simitian's office and to get a better sense of it. Then I can be in discussion with the Leadership team but if this is something that's is it going down in the next month, 2-months? Are they doing all this work over the summer, the Boards going to consider this next December? So, I don't have any idea of a timeline so I feel like I need to get a better understanding of that. If you have some information Commissioner Lee you want to forward to me but I'm not saying no to the next agenda but I feel I have no sense of this to be able to inform how the HRC could best discuss this.

Commissioner Lee: That's very fair.

[many people started talking at once]

Commissioner Smith: So where does this leave us?

Chair Kralik: No, we have an agenda item but the agenda item is subject to inquiry by Staff and I think that's the best way to go based on the fact that the Staff needs an understanding.

Commissioner Lee, you have one more item? (crosstalk)

Commissioner Lee: Just one more...

Commissioner Smith: Can I...can we stop for one second? Just because I've been working with a lot of people of faith and action, Luis Angel and some other people in the immigration things. I brought this to San Mateo and down in Santa Clara, I think in order for us to do fairness to this we're going to need more than the county perspective. I don't feel comfortable hanging my hat on that.

Ms. van der Zwaag: I'm not just saying the county's perspective. I would try to get an understanding from the county on the process and the timeline. That doesn't mean just the county perspective...

Commissioner Smith: Ok.

Ms. van der Zwaag: ... but that's what I don't have a sense of now. This is the first time I'm hearing of it and I'd like, again as I said earlier, is this something that's going to be a quick turn around on the June Board agenda? Is this something for December? That's my first step just to get a better sense of that part of it.

Commissioner Smith: Ok.

Chair Kralik: The other thing also is that I think to the extent that we identify the ability of members of our Commission to participate in meetings. I think this inquiry that Staff does could, in fact, allow us to have an impact on this issue. Go ahead, please.

Commissioner Stinger: If I can read this, the vote was taken two days ago to explore the policy. Two proposals put forward by the Board were authorized for Staff and local law enforcement to investigate possible mechanisms for a policy shift and report back within 60-days.

Ms. van der Zwaag: That's great.

Commissioner Smith: Did they – have they clarified what they're shifting in the policy because the Immigration Policy is like about this thick?

Commissioner Stinger: I think the policy change was with regard to immigrants without papers who have a criminal record.

Commissioner Lee: So, if this Commission wanted the opportunity to weigh in on non-city policy or legislation, which is within our purview, it seems like it's pretty time sensitive but I'll differ to staff on that. My last point or recommendation for our next meeting is let me ask a question. Do we happen to know when the Point in Time count and report will be done?

Ms. van der Zwaag: The homeless HUD count? That is usually – yes, I should know that. Did they talk about that at the SPIN meeting? When the PIT count..

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Commissioner Lee: But it's not anytime soon though, right?

Ms. van der Zwaag: No, I don't think its...

Ms. Constantino: It takes a while.

Ms. van der Zwaag: ... it takes a while. I think the next one isn't until next year. It's not in the summer period, it's usually...

Commissioner Lee: Ok, then I'll hold my request on that.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Ok.

Commissioner Lee: Thank you. That's it, thank you Chair.

Chair Kralik: I think we've reviewed everyone's proposed agenda item. If I left something out or someone out could you speak up now?

Commissioner Smith: I think you did an excellent job.

Chair Kralik: Ok.

Commissioner Lee: I move to adjourn.

Chair Kralik: We'll go ahead and adjourn the meeting and thank you very much for your participation.

Commissioner Brahmhatt: Thank you.

## **VII. ADJOURNMENT**

Meeting adjourned at 9:31 p.m.