



## HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION

Thursday, January 10, 2019

Community Meeting Room

Palo Alto Civic Center

250 Hamilton Avenue

7:00 PM

REGULAR MEETING

### ROLL CALL:

**Commissioners Present:** Brahmbhatt, Kralik, Lee, O’Nan, Smith, Stinger, Xue

**Staff:** Minka van der Zwaag, Mary Constantino

### I. ROLL CALL

Chair Stinger: Roll call, Mary?

### II. AGENDA CHANGES, REQUESTS, DELETIONS

Chair Stinger: Are there any agenda changes, requests, deletions?

### III. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

Chair Stinger: We will proceed; I have no cards for oral communications.

### IV. BUSINESS

#### 1. Report from Ad Hoc Committee Chairs on Work Plan

Chair Stinger: I would like to begin with Item One, Ad Hoc Committee Chairs any updates on your work plans? Commissioner Smith?

Commissioner Smith: First of all, I’d like to thank Staff, Minka, and Chair Stinger, for meeting over several weeks for intensive meetings to start crafting our community conversations. I’m pulling up my notes, give me one second, sorry.

Ms. Minka van de Zwaag, Human Services Manager: Thank you.

Commissioner Smith: You’re welcome. Alright, what we’re basically doing is we will have the topic for our first event will be February 28<sup>th</sup>. We will start promotion quite shortly. The topic will be Gender Equity: What does it mean here and now? We will basically have a format of a sub-matter expert setting the table for discussion. We will have people sitting in rounds having different questions and dialog points around gender equity and what does that look like in

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

today's climate? Like many things in the world, as things change – as time changes and as the demographics in a community change the uses of words or what people are looking for does change. So, we want to really have a very open discussion to hear from all constituencies in Palo Alto speaking towards gender equity and their thoughts on it. Thank you.

Chair Stinger: Thank you. I'd like to speak to Welcoming America Week. That was completed activity and also the intro to Civic Engagement. We have worked with the library, the library has taken that over, and we'll include an introduction to civic engagement on January 24<sup>th</sup>, Thursday. Do we have the speaker for that?

Ms. van de Zwaag: I believe that will be Khashayar Alaei one of our staff members in the Development Center, formerly of the City Manager's Office.

Chair Stinger: I think we're all invited or I hope we're all invited to that at Mitchell Park Library. It will be a trial to see how it fits into the educational series that goes on monthly from September until May or June. Any other updates? I clearly have an update on Gender Identity but I'll hold that for the next Agenda item.

## **2. Report from the Ad Hoc Committee on Supporting an Inclusive Community/Being LGBTQ+ in Palo Alto**

Chair Stinger: Moving onto Agenda Item Two, a report from the Committee on Inclusive Community/Being LGBTQ in Palo Alto. You have a presentation in your Packet so I'm just going to go over it very briefly to set the stage and then open up discussion. The report before you represents the work of a summer intern, Sabrina Procter, combined with two subcommittees on the Commission. The first subcommittee from 2017-'18 fiscal year was composed of Commissioners Lee, O'Nan, and myself. We were basically charged with an assessment phase and that transitioned into a second Ad Hoc Committee which is Commissioners Kralik, Lee, and myself basically looking at implementation. There we go. This is the flow of the report and of our thinking. As a background we had a starting point, a statement of City values that you are all familiar with, it was passed by Council in December 2016. What followed from that was a prioritization on our part of focus areas that we wanted to look at and one of those was the LGBTQ population in Palo Alto. That gave us the grounds to begin an assessment of strengths and vulnerabilities. The study plan is on the next slide and that is basically the approach we took. We looked at secondary reports, published data, statistics, we held a – with the county a listening forum, and we conducted a community survey and did some in-depth interviews. The data isn't perfect and you'll see that of these limitations or well I'll tell you, the limitations that care most about is the lack of adult senior population data. The youth data is relatively available with some quirks in it but the senior data is difficult to find. The reports that we used are shown here and on the next two slides. Basically, Project Cornerstone data and hate crime data from the Palo Alto Police Department. Population estimates are imprecise but basically, we're looking at 4%-6% of our population which identifies as LGBTQ. It's not the population estimates that are important to us, however, it's really that some of our LGBTQ+ peers face life-threatening issues. That becomes a call to action for groups such as Adolescent Counseling Services, Family and Child Services, and Project Safety Net and for Stanford Children's Hospital as well. They do a good job, they offer professional counsel, and they have outreach. Project Safety Net had a focused

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

community meeting last year during June supporting and partnering with LGBTQ youth on what it truly means to be an ally. I'm going to keep on moving, I'll tell you...

Ms. van de Zwaag: Folks have it in front of them; I think you can just keep on moving.

Chair Stinger: I just wanted to illustrate in this slide the difference – in the experience, our LGBTQ youth have compared to the general high school population. In moving on, to further call it out, these are some of the stats. LGBTQ, the average only 18 out of 40 assets is compared to 21.4 assets for all students surveyed. They are three times more likely to attempt suicide, one and a half times more likely to use drugs and alcohol, and fewer than 22% report positive family communications. Again, these are areas Project Safety Net and Adolescent Counseling Services are doing sound work to change these harsh statistics. That was basically what we learned from our secondary published reports. We went on to a Community Listening Forum a year ago or 8-months ago and to reiterate we're indebted to the County Office of LGBTQ Affairs for providing the structure and the support to conduct the Listening Forum, complete with a recorder. In your printed copy you see the cover slide that she did and the last slide that she did of what we heard. So, what we learned can be summed up in the next slide that there are some strengths and there are some vulnerabilities. Progressive attitudes and talk are not always matched in the LGBTQ experience. Discussion question four was what do you think should be the top priorities that we, the Office of LGBTQ Affairs, the City of Palo Alto, and community members can do together to improve the lives of LGBTQ individuals and the families in the communities? From that discussion, we have three priorities; diversity training, safe space, community conversations. It should also be noted that the county office, this is not shown in the slides, do have a countywide intuitive on deescalating or dealing with hate crimes. One of the discussion questions was this: LGBTQ individuals sometimes experience violence and can be victims of crime. Often these crimes go unreported. What can we do to prevent hate crimes from happening? What can we do to encourage victims to report crimes and how can we better support LGBTQ victims of crime? The top response is -- from the participants at the Listening Forum where better reporting, anonymous tip lines, by standing training, and more police interactions training so that – communications to explain how hate crimes impact individuals and maybe walking with a cop. Moving on from the Listening survey we also conducted a community survey that was initiated at the Listening Forum and remained open until June. We have 108 responses – oh and we're back.

Ms. van de Zwaag: You're back so...

Chair Stinger: The Listening Forum, two recordings from that, the summary, survey start, and what did we learn from the community survey? It basically reinforced some of the things that we know. Most people in Palo Alto are accepting but LGBTQ experience negative behaviors which they attribute to their identity and people still make hurtful mistakes. It isn't easy being an ally. From out here, our direction is shown to be youth and transgender individuals particularly cultural events, exhibits, festivals, recreation classes, and sports leagues. Moving from the quantitative data to the qualitative data, comments enrich the quantitative results. There is invisibility that stems from the absence of awareness of LGBTQ specific concerns and can result in community misunderstandings. So, what we have at this point is a reasonable underpinning to any recommendation we want to make. We have generally supportive community attitudes, and

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

we have some models for space although, as we reiterate a couple times in this presentation these spaces are at a distance from North County. We have some vulnerabilities, the most significant one that was expressed by youth is the ability to communicate with immediate family and their ability to feel integrated into the broader community or feel integral; feel center to the growing community. The vulnerability that we can't ignore is the absence of space so seeking an avenue for the HRC to have added value to the programs that are currently going on in the community and to the needs that were expressed. This seems to sum up the current situation and provide a vision. It feels invisible but not hostile. What we need is to enhance community awareness and education. The recommendations that we're making and that I will take some time with are to convene a Palo Alto LGBTQ summit, to build a structure that would formalize an advisory body, and leverage the expertise and involvement of existing service providers and agencies. To focus efforts on programming, visibility, space, to develop messaging, and to use some early programs as pilots and bridges to hopefully establish something –I guess what we're saying is to start small and see where we can expand our efforts. The sequence is described here but I just want to emphasize that the tone is to start small, piloting programs, and I'm using programs in a general sense. Not a Human Services or not an Office of Community Service sense; program being an ongoing, repeated event and looking more at just programming in the general jargon. We want to start small, see how we do, measure outcomes, and then pursue further programs. The pivot point is this, at the outset, we were holding a Listening Forum, and we wanted to identify one program, one event, one resource that we could recommend to the Community Services. Actually, in that regard, the Community Services has done a sensitivity training for summer recreation staff. As we looked at the programs, we saw there were so many rich ideas and that we didn't just want to let them go. They are way beyond the scope and charge of the HRC but we hope that if we brought together service providers, we could see what kinds of partnerships we could leverage. What kind of alliances could accomplish something more and the hope is that from this group that's assembled we can set a priority and carry that through with the direction of a formal advisory board. With that, we move to the summit objectives and that is what the subcommittee, Commissioner Lee, Commissioner Kralik, and I are working on right now. A rough timeline is to go away. Well, looking at the paper the rough timeline for the road ahead is to have our working meeting in February and then to continue on to activity plans and implementation in the second half of the year. I do want to make some acknowledgments right now. First, to someone who is not here, Sabrina Proctor worked very diligently as a summer intern with Human Services. Thank you for allowing her to spend time on this. Julie Solomon who is here, thank you from the Mountain View HRC, was a guiding light. I piggybacked off of a lot of what resources you had identified and shared so generously. Minka and Mary helped immensely setting up our Listening Forum. They helped me this summer with identifying a work plan for our summer intern. Commissioners Lee, O'Nan, Kralik, in the past and moving forward. A huge outreach to the Santa Clara County, Maribel Martinez the Director has been immensely helpful not only in doing a Listening Forum but in answering questions that I've had along the way and giving me feedback. So, I'd like to open it up now for our Commission, first any questions or do I have any oral comments before I move to...

Ms. van de Zwaag: (inaudible)

Ms. Julie Solomon: Do I need to hit a button?

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Commissioner Smith: It's on.

Ms. van de Zwaag: I don't know.

Commissioner Smith: It's on.

Ms. Solomon: Oh, it's on?

Ms. van de Zwaag: There we go.

Ms. Solomon: Ok great, thank you very much. Good evening Commissioners, my name is Julie Solomon, I'm a resident of Mountain View, and I'm the Chair of the Commission HRC. I served, as Chair Stinger referenced; I served on Mountain View HRC's LGTBQ+ Needs and Assets Assessment Subcommittee from 2016 to 2018. We wrapped up our subcommittee work in September of 2018. Thank you very much for the acknowledgment. I would like to thank Chair Stinger and Vice Chair O'Nan, thank you very much for your support of our needs and assets assessment process and for your participation in the Community Listening Forum that we held in collaboration with the County Office of LGBTQ Affairs and also for your participation in other public meetings that we held about this topic. I also attended the Palo Alto LGBTQ Listening Forum that was referenced earlier and from my perspective, it was very well attended, very well run, with productive breakout discussion, and I really appreciated the ideas that were shared there which helped to inform our Mountain View assessment. We, in Mountain View, had similar data sources and limitations to those that were presented this evening for Palo Alto. We also had a number of similar findings. In relation to the recommendations, I cannot speak on behalf of the Mountain View HRC because they haven't had an opportunity to see and discussion on the presentation but I would like to say that as an individual with experience doing this kind of assessment, I am familiar with this kind of data and support these recommendations. Also, I want to mention that in September 2018 the Mountain View HRC recommended to our City Council that we explore opportunities to partner with others to identify Mountain View or other north county location for LGBTQ+ community services. The Ad Hoc subcommittee's presentation referenced the lack of community space and services here in North County as well. So, I want to say that I'd be happy to help facilitate dialog about potential opportunities across our cities and here in Mountain View with county, with City, and with other stakeholders. Thank you, very much and best wishes, for your work ahead.

Chair Stinger: Thank you, Julie, thank you for your comments, and thank you for your offer. I'd like to turn it over to the Commission to ask if there are any questions about the information that's here in. Anything you expect to hear but did not hear?

Vice Chair O'Nan: Let me ask Chair Stinger... Yes, so one thing that I or a couple things that I noticed that I was surprised by, there was mention about hate crimes against LGBTQ people but the reality is most crime against LGBTQ people occurs in the context of the family. I didn't see any references to family violence, domestic violence, and I think that would be a really key thing to add. Secondly, we have a very serious problem in Palo Alto where some communities in the City are more progressive, whether that's for social, cultural, ethnic, or religious reasons but we have more traditional cultural within the city as well who are not friendly to LGBTQ people. I

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

didn't see any acknowledgment of that or any plan for how to help people within those more traditional cultures who are LGBTQ or how to educate their family members who may be very negative toward them. That's another important thing to bear in mind I believe.

Chair Stinger: Thank you for both of those, I totally agree. The first piece, the family violence, the domestic violence we have anecdotal data but not statistical data. We need to do a better job of reporting that and capturing that and we will try to going forward. We have identified some programs – let me see if I have it here. There's an educational program, Families Still Parent Family: Parenting in a Complex World that we'd like to take out too as a program to more traditional families. So, we'll present that as a priority to the joint group and there's probably more that we need to identify also. Those are good calls, thank you.

Commissioner Smith: Chair Stinger? First, I'd like to thank you for your spectacular leadership and all the Commissioners that worked on this. I'm really very encouraged also about the inter-city work with Mountain View because it is not a city problem, it's a cultural problem. We have to reach across communities. I would like to second Commissioner Jill O'Nan's point. We do live in a community that's 43% Asian, 7% Latino, 1 – 2% Black and what we do find is that cultures preserve LGBTQ issues in very different ways. The one thing I found in organizing in the City of Palo Alto is when we do events people become very self-selecting. So, I think the challenge moving forward is how we broaden the umbrella to invite others in that wouldn't traditionally come to these events because we do have a progressive city. We don't want to talk to those that are already advocates but we want to open the doors to others that are curious or might have questions. Thank you.

Chair Stinger: Thank you. Commissioner Lee?

Commissioner Lee: I think my comment at this point would be I know that the recommendation in the presentation by the Community Services Department focuses on programming, visibility, and space. I think that's just one of many tools in our toolbox at our disposal. I think programs and visibility and space are a key component of that and I look forward to engaging with various community partners to have educational programs that engage with different segments of our community. In particular, the traditional segments of our population who may not be use to talking about these issues and engage with them on that. I also think that there are other tools in our toolbox, specifically with regards to social services. We do provide grant funding to various agencies that provide services. A lot of them are already doing great work to address some of the issues that the survey presented. I just would like us to continue to think about these survey results as we go into the season of allocating funding to those various agencies and look for opportunities to partner up with them or partner them with each other so that we can further focus on these issues. In particular, mental health and the intersection with the LGBTQ community is particularly striking and is something that I think this community has set as a huge priority. I also think that there are some opportunities for policy recommendations as well. You know we are a policy advisory body to the Council and during our Listening Forum, one of the things that was listed as a top priority was really taking stock of policies and resources. Certainly, we're going to be taking stock of the resources available through the city and through various other agencies through our working summit but to the extent that we can identify opportunities to improve policies, I think we should play a role in that as well. Our Committee

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

has discussed one possible recommendation which hopefully we'll bring to the full Commission in February or March. Just as a preview of that, it would involve updating the City's Non-Discrimination Policy to explicitly include gender identity and gender expression which was not included when the policy first passed about 15-years ago. I really look forward to the program aspect of it but I want us to think broadly and think of all the different tools in our toolbox so that we can have as broad and deep of an impact as possible.

Chair Stinger: Thank you.

Commissioner Smith: Chair Stinger, can I ask staff a question?

Chair Stinger: Please.

Commissioner Smith: Is it within the breadth of this body to recommend that the city do some marketing and outreach?

Ms. van de Zwaag: For specific HRC events or what are you referring too?

Commissioner Smith: Well, there are two slides on – the top slide on Page 10 includes – that's the invisibility and limit of community understanding. The two statements that jump out at me says, "I'm queer, identified and have worked in Palo Alto for 6-years and I have truly zero conception of what the vibes and terms of the LGBTQ+ community here. It feels invisible, not hostile." Also, above there it says, "I would love to see an annual Palo Alto pride event or at least for one of the existing city street fairs or parades to have a significant LGBTQ+ component. The visibility is important for me and my family." I think if we could recommend – and my question is, is there a way for us to recommend the city do more outreach or do more marketing or talk to City Council? I don't know the process so I'm asking city staff for advisement.

Ms. van de Zwaag: Right, so the Commission works more on the policy aspect of it and staff works more on the operational. So, if it's a policy recommendation that the HRC recommends that the city look more into offering more programs and services for the LGBTQ community, that's one aspect of it. Specifically saying we want it to be a parade, we want it to be this, we want it to be that, that operational aspect of it is what staff would do but the overall arching policy or intention could come from the HRC. I will say this is something that we could continue to have a conversation with the subcommittee because often times the subcommittee, just in dialog with staff, there are often things that staff is already thinking about doing. So, it doesn't need to get to the sense of making an official policy and having that go to Council and then possibly back to staff. That would be the answer that I have at this point.

Commissioner Lee: That's one of the purposes of the working summit is to see where the various city departments that may have a role on this issue and the various stakeholders in the community. What are they currently thinking, what are they doing, what do they see as the issue, and then work collaboratively to see how we may address them as opposed to dictating...

Ms. van de Zwaag: Right, what I'm interested in and how I see the value in working with the providers in the community? So, you've done some analysis of information, you have the survey

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

results, we have the Listening Forum results, and the value of the summit is really testing some of those ideas with the agencies and key representatives that work with our LGBTQ community or work on those issues in the community to say, these are some ideas and thoughts that came out. What value did you see in some of them or they could say yeah, we were going to do that anyway. If the city wants to partner with us or if the HRC wants to partner with us or those three agencies work together to do so. As a first step, I'm in support of taking some of these ideas that have come out of this analysis work and running it first past these stakeholders to see where we can go from there because they could easily say, we'll take that on. We'll take that on but to go to your point again, the HRC can't specifically say to staff, I'd like you to plan a LGBTQ pride event. I mean as far as going to Council and saying the HRC did this report, we feel strongly about having more visibility, our recommendation is the city have more visibility in planning events inclusive of the LGBTQ community and it's kind of goes from there.

Commissioner Smith: Thank you so much.

Commissioner Lee: As a specific reference to our authority, I think the one that would speak most directly to your concern is Section E which says to coordinated programs of the Commission with similar programs by private and public agencies and organizations.

Commissioner Smith: Perfect, thank you so much.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: With regards to that space requirement for the LGBTQ community center, is it possible to find a space between Mountain View and Palo Alto broader which can work for both the cities?

Ms. van de Zwaag: We haven't even gone that far. I think that's, again, an idea that needs to be tested out at this forum idea but are you asking specifically if there's a city space or if there's been discussion about where it might be?

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: No, I was asking if there's a city space or in the past whether we have worked with the City of Mountain View to split the rent for a city run operation where both the cities could have a common space kind of thing.

Ms. van de Zwaag: There might be within some other entities within the city that have done some joint programming. I think the idea of having an ongoing space is something that requires a lot of conversation and it's a lot more complex than people might imagine. So, I'd hate to say yes or a no or this could be possible, that might be possible because I think there's a lot more thinking that needs to be done. That's another operational decision that is beyond the capacity of the HRC to say specifically we want you to have a space. It could be a recommendation that goes to Council to see if there's support of the city in that capacity.

Vice Chair O'Nan: I think it's important too that we not lose sight of the county's role. For example, some years ago people in the North County were complaining that they couldn't even sign up for social security and other types of benefits because the county offices in San Jose were so far away and so hard to get to. So, some years ago, not that long ago, a county office – satellite office was established in Mountain View for the whole North County and that's been a

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.



huge boon to people who live in the north county who are disabled, frail, unable to travel as far as San Jose. It's just a convenient outpost that we have now and I know Joe Simitian is very supportive of that. We now have a county office of LGBTQ Affairs, again based in San Jose, and the Billy DeFrank Center for LGBTQ people, also based in San Jose. So, conceivably north county cities like Palo Alto, Mountain View, and Sunnyvale could possibly have a conversation. Then reach out even then to our county partners and see if a space can be identified. Just as we've done in the past with things like social services. It's not out of the question but Minka has said it's complicated and roles have to be thought out and funding has to be procured but I'm sure we could reach out to Joe Simitian, have some preliminary talks, and possibly get the ball rolling on that at some point soon.

Chair Stinger: Yes, we have identified some legislative funding sources that would maybe allow us to proceed that way. It's just so vague that it didn't belong in this discussion but it would be something to pursue, to have some access to space in North County.

Commissioner Kralik: I kind of liked Commissioner Brahmbhatt's comment and I think one of the things that the subcommittee talked about was what the summit objectives are because that's the next step. I think when you look at the findings here in this report, the community space, safe space, etc. is a major finding. It's possible that we could share that finding with the folks at the summit and get some of their ideas. It could be as simple as inviting community groups or organizations. I was just thinking just kind of off the top of my head and saying what about a basketball tournament at the Y celebrating LGBTQ safety or something like that? Where you could talk to these folks and you could, as HRC, partner with them and maybe even talk to them about trying to promote it, start small, see what can be done now with that we've got. I like that objective; it's an important one to be cognizant of and certainly, the direction of interfacing with Mountain View and pooling resources is something that's good. There is, I think, a safe community space in San Mateo. I don't know if Steve if you've got some thought about that because I did hear a presentation from them. Have you had a chance to visit there?

Commissioner Lee: I did, I did attend an event at the San Mateo Pride Center and they actually used some state I think healthy innovation funds to get that funded. It brings together the various agencies which provide services to the LGBTQ community. I think they got something like 3-years of funding to try it out.

Commissioner Smith: Have we reached out to any clergy or churches? I know there are a lot of church buildings in Palo Alto with a lot of clergy that are very supportive of the LGBTQ community because they are members of that community or they are very supportive? They have building space so they might be...

Commissioner Lee: I don't think we've done that outreach yet but those might be the kinds of people we invite to the summit.

Chair Stinger: When we did the Listening Forum there were members of the faith community that expressed interest and so I've been dialoguing with them. They would be included on the list – and the list is incomplete.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Commissioner Smith: Ok, we'll talk.

Vice Chair O'Nan: I did have another concern about a constituency that may be overlooked in the current plan that seems to be focused on service providers. That would be parents of transgender children who are younger and adolescent age. I've heard from a number of parents that of young transgender children, say elementary or middle school age, who are very concerned about the bullying and lack of administrative compassion for their child. Several of them have said they felt people at the school district needed more training in dealing with their children and that better education needed to be done in the schools. That's outside of HRC purview because the school district is separate from us but I'm concerned that that type of situation won't be covered by Adolescent Counseling Services. Those kids are too young but their parents, they may have their own support group or they may have contact or some sort of resources within the school district. I think we should definitely check on that and make sure we're not overlooking a very vulnerable population and failing to represent them.

Ms. van de Zwaag: There were at the Listening Forum some parents of young transgender children so there would be a starting point for that.

Chair Stinger: That actually takes me to the third question I had and I think we've covered some of the others. Other suggestions of organizations that we should include in the support groups – in the family support groups, community support groups? Oh, I just turned it off, thank you, sorry, I'm pressing it in the wrong sequence. What I started to say was that was a lead into the next question I had which was other avenues of exploration that we might be missing? The support groups, the faith groups, are people we've touched on but we need to firm up that list. Any other suggestions would be appreciated and you can forward them to Minka as you think about them and she will forward them to us. If there are no other comments, I think I will just thank my Committee members and we'll look forward to coming back to you in February with more detail.

### **3. Response to presentation by Palo Alto Unified School District RISE (Responsive Inclusive Safe Environment) Task Force to Promote a Culture in which Sexual Assault, Violence and Harassment are Not Engaged In Nor Tolerated**

Chair Stinger: Let's see, I think we are on Agenda Item Three which I have seemed to have lost.

Vice Chair O'Nan: I think you turned over your page.

Chair Stinger: You're right, I did, thank you.

Ms. van de Zwaag: I can handle the introduction for that if you would like, Chair? Ok, so this is, as you see, from the agenda introduction item that was included in your packet. So, this is on the agenda at the request of Commissioners Lee and Brahmhatt. As you remember at the November meeting, we had a large contingent from the RISE Commission come to the HRC to speak about their work at the school district. At the end of that discussion, there was an interest by the Commissioners that I previously mentioned to bring this back on the agenda to see if there is interest by the HRC to either continue some kind of relationship or involvement in the work of

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

the school district? The Assistant Superintendent said that part of their work will include that of a committee in that community members are invited to participate in; there's a community role on it. You'll see many of the bullet points listed are things that are happening on the campus that are very specific to specific regulations, Title 9, that they are required to keep in compliance with but there is an opportunity for community involvement. When I was in dialog with the Assistant Superintendent, it's been a couple weeks now; they had not set their January meeting. I looked on the website today and it did not look like they had set their January meeting. So, the HRC can have a dialog if there is interest in continuing work as far as the issue that the RISE Committee brought to you which is promotion of a culture in which sexual assault, violence, and harassment are not engaged in or tolerated. As I mention in my report an official liaison relationship, since this is a school district committee that's not really appropriate for the HRC to have an official liaison. If you just put the semantics and take away the official liaison, there's nothing that prohibits the HRC from sending a member to listen at the meetings, to hear what they're doing, to bring back that conversation to the HRC to see if there are avenues for mutual assistance. I also put back that as I looked at the HRC's work plan because I am cautious that this is something that's additional and there's still several items from your work plan that we talked about tonight that there weren't updates on. So, there are still things on the work plan that still need to be accomplished and I'm cautious about adding something new when what you established in August is still a work in progress. So, I thought if you wanted to do something it might be thought as best under the work of gender equity which you have listed as a priority. At this point, I turn it back to the Chair to oversee the conversation from here.

Commissioner Lee: Do we have any public comment?

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: I wanted to add something that. I have had conversations with different parents and things and I think something that was discussed at that point was during the presentation a part of it was to bring in more education on this issue at the elementary school level. I think in short what I'm saying is I do have some feedback on a portion of their presentation that day which it would be good if we could give back to them. I mean I'm neutral as to whether we have an ongoing thing where we go on discussing it.

Ms. van de Zwaag: Right, I guess I would say a couple things. If as a parent of a PAUSD student and if your feedback more is in the guise of as a parent in the district, I would just suggest that you work directly or attend directly the RISE Committee or provide your feedback directly to PAUSD. I think what we're thinking of here is as a Commission in your role in the city to do -- be concerned about issues -- women's issues, is there a role for the HRC to be involved with this committee or is there a role to take some of the issues they're working on to say community-wide? Is there something we would like to add value to but it's just...

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: Yes so, I wanted to address that comment. I think it is not personal feedback from me as a parent. It is what I heard from several different parents who were talking on this issue so I think the goal of HRC is to be the voice of the people and give feedback on different issues. I don't want...

Ms. van de Zwaag: It's not really the HRC's - I'm just trying to understand the HRC's role to give feedback to a school district committee, I mean based on anecdotal comments from the

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

community. I would leave that to the commission to work on.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: They were not anecdotal, I mean – when you're using the word anecdotal comments from different parents, it was not a formal feedback saying hey, you are member of HRC and there was no written paper saying this is a formal feedback but it was in no means anecdotal. These are personal feedback about people experiencing this sexual education for their kids in the school district. This is valuable feedback and I don't see why you are limiting that to oh, as a parent this is your personal thing. I want to say it's not my personal feedback; it is what I heard from ...

Ms. van de Zwaag: Right.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: ... in different meetings...

Ms. van de Zwaag: I'm just trying to understand...

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: ... in different situations from different people.

Ms. van de Zwaag: Sure, and I hear you and I appreciate that. I'm just trying to take what you're saying and looking at the role of the HRC in providing that comments back to the school district.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: I mean I feel it is – I'm involved in this committee and I'm hearing from that side I feel it's my legal duty to bring back to them whatever I'm hearing from the people and give that feedback. My feedback may not be given that much weight if it was just coming from a random parent. If it coming through somebody through HRC...

Ms. van de Zwaag: Right.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: ... it may be given more weight. So, my interest in giving feedback through the HRC to that is so that it gets the proper attention.

Ms. van de Zwaag: Right so then if you wanted it through the HRC then that would have to be a decision by the HRC that – that was a message that they wanted to pass on to the school district committee. If you could go to the RISE Committee and you could speak as an individual person or as an individual person you could say that you are a member of the HRC. Unless you are designated by the commission you cannot speak on behalf of the commission.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: No, I appreciate that and I have always understood that to be the case. Since we are talking about whether we should have an ongoing relationship where we are monitoring their meetings and giving them feedback. I wanted to also bring this to the attention of the commission that whether we go for the ongoing or not, I would like to give a portion of the feedback for one part of that.

Commissioner Lee: If I could jump in here for a second? If there was a specific school district policy that we either wanted to support or provide feedback on I think that would be within our authority. If we look at 2.22.060 F, it says that we can recommend or oppose legislation, other

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

than that of the city, provided that the City Council has not taken an official position with respect to such legislation. We certainly have done that with regards to state legislation pending and passed. I think in interpreting that provision very liberally as the code permits us to do, if there was a specific policy proposal or existing policy that the school district was implementing or considering in response to this task for, I think that would be an opportunity certainly for this commission to weigh if our colleagues wanted to do so.

Chair Stinger: I guess I would have a question about that, that I'd like to ask to staff. In this case or we have a standing committee between the Council and the school board.

Ms. van de Zwaag: That's correct.

Chair Stinger: It seems like we would want to take it perhaps there. With some state legislation, we don't have a standing committee so a comment would be taking a different avenue. So, I'm not quite sure how I would interrupt that code with regard to this issue. (crosstalk)

Ms. van de Zwaag: I'm concerned about the word legislation. I mean what this is referring to is state or local legislation. I don't know if I would use the same terminology for a procedure at the school district. I'd...

Commissioner Smith: I think the fundamental question outside of the school district is, is the issue around sexual assault and sexual abuse at a primary level that this commission should do something? Should we continue to examine it whether that's intertwined with the school or not? One of the things that has deeply troubled me over the last 6-months or 12-months is the vulnerability of women after they've been assaulted and not reporting and not understanding where to go and how culture perceives that? If we are truly concerned about human relations outside of –I don't have a penny in that fight with the PAUSD, that's not my department but I would recommend that if not a significant but a primary issue for us moving forward. Even if we don't put it on the docket this year and just do some exploratory stuff and then bring it back at our retreat in June and make it a primary issue. I am one that believes that this needs to be a primary issue at some point, if not today, within the next span of months.

Commissioner Lee: One of the things that the school district did recently as part of this process is, they took stock of everything they were doing district-wide by each site to see what they're currently doing to address these issues. They found that there are a lot of things that they were already doing which they just didn't know about and then from there really evaluating what additional steps or modifications they needed to take. In my conversations with Karen Hendricks, the Deputy Superintendent, she definitely saw an opportunity to partner with the city on some of the programmatic aspects of what they are working on. Towards the end of last year, they really focused a lot on educational pieces and they plan on meeting with some of their principles in January to get feedback on how those educational pieces work. Then based on that feedback they will be engaging with any interested stakeholders to see what collaboration we can take. I agree with you, Kaloma, this is something that we should prioritize. I think when we talk about the culture around sexual assault and all these things, they're not just issues constrained to the school. I mean these kids they go to school most of the day but they live in our community and the tone that we set as adults can either reinforce or undermined some of those efforts. I

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

definitely see an opportunity and a responsibility for the city to find ways to engage with the school district on some of the programmatic aspects. When we look at the RISE Task Force's charge, there's about five of them, I think the first and fifth ones probably we want to steer clear. In terms of two through four, education of the community about rights and responsibilities, promotion of a culture in which sexual assault, violence, and harassment are not engaged in or tolerated, and empowerment of all community members to interrupt and report incidents of assault, violence, and harassment. Those are things that aren't constrained purely to the school district and are things that we, as a city and as a commission, should do. I would recommend that at this point if we want to subsume this under the existing gender equity work that I'm the lead on this year I'd be happy to continue engaging with the school district, attend their meetings, and just seeing where those opportunities may exist. We certainly want to make sure that there's by in from the school district for any involvement that we play. So, I can keep my ear to the ground and continue to participate in those discussions and come back to the commission periodically. My recommendation would be that we, as a body, permit me to continue those conversations not necessarily as the commission's liaison but as someone who is permitted to work on it and bring back some thoughts as they arise.

Commissioner Kralik: I just wanted to mention that not every child goes to public school and we are broader than the school district. In the sense that they have an effort that we can take advantage of by hearing reports from, we can draft policies that are broader that could encompass more children at schools. Children also don't just go to school, they do other things, they go to places where harassment occurs, assault occurs. That's something that we can look into as well. We've seen the statistics about the hundreds of complaints that have emanated from the complaint procedure at the public schools but getting by in from private schools is important.

Commissioner Smith: Good point.

Commissioner Kralik: That's another way in which, without being frictional to the subcommittee of the Council that interacts, we can still listen to the RISE presentation and still come up with our own policy that can guide our community. In some ways it doesn't have to be a second to the RISE effort, it can take advantage of what we think might be a limitation and too much focus and broaden that out. Again, I want to say to Commissioner Brahmhatt, I think it's a good thing to listen to the community and I do like the fact that you've received these comments. It sounds like you have a good pulse on your community and maybe this is a forum. A listening forum is that could be something that we've done I know on LGBTQ, it could be done on this same issue as a community and as a Commission.

Vice Chair O'Nan: I'd like to jump in kind of on the other side of it. The school district did a very poor job handling several cases of sexual assault that occurred on campus and off. They've had to spend millions of dollars on legal fees and they've really created themselves a wound that they now have to heal. I think this Commission should be very cautious about stepping in the middle of that. The school district has a lot of work to do to rebuild trust with parents and with students. Their staff needs massive training; they had to hire a whole new administrative person just to oversee compliance because they were not even complying with the law. So, there are a lot of complex issues here and I know that parents have particularly strong feelings about what's happened in the public schools but they are beyond the HRC's purview. It is a very sticky

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

situation and we've already had a couple people come to our meeting and basically yell at us to do something because feelings are running so high. It could put us in a position where people are coming and admonishing us and browbeating us around things that we really don't have any authority over. We also don't have millions of dollars to spend on solving this problem so I'm just going to be the voice of caution that I agree this is a very, very important issue. I feel terrible for the young girls who were assaulted and I feel a bit angry at the school district for not handling it better but those lessons are being learned. There's a point where I'm not sure how much we really add to what's already underway.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: I mean I totally agree with Commissioner O'Nan that the school district has really messed up in the past but I think the problem is bigger. The culture in the school districts – this is a personal comment, my son just entered middle school and both my husband and I are shocked by some of the cultural things that are going on in his middle school. We never appreciated the elementary school principal. He's very good but then the jump to middle school and I'm thinking high school just gets worse. It's the culture, it's the culture of the city and I mean I'm disappointed at the culture of the city. So, it's not just what's at the school, I think what they are seeing is the culture coming from the city so it is in some ways an HRC problem. Whether we want to fix that or not I don't think it's a fix in a year or two, it's a long-term thing that needs to happen.

Commissioner Smith: I think one of the responsibilities of a Commission, particularly one around human relation, is getting into the difficult stuff. I do agree with Commissioner O'Nan that we should not couple our work to the School Board or the school system because there are legal and financial ramifications there. One of the things I think people don't truly clearly understand is that nowhere in somebody's life are the laws on sexual assault or what sexual assault is explained to people. So, if a child or somebody comes to them and says this is sexual assault, they don't even clearly understand what their next recourse or step as a parent, as a victim, as a person, as somebody in private school is dealing with. I think as a Commission where we now live in a time of MeToo, we've seen assaults, rapes judged, there's a numerous different community thing – as a community – I think deferring to the school system for a response from the city or from a human relation perspective would be advocating our duty. I would agree with Commissioner O'Nan, we don't want to get involved with the school district thing but I think it's important to say A) we understand the pain that victims have. B) we understand that people in our community have a lot of perceptions, conceptions that might not be correct -- that's an educational opportunity -- and how do we start healing and talking around those values in our community? I think this is a task of a Board or Commission is well equipped for.

Commissioner Kralik: This may be anecdotal but what where you shocked and surprised at by in the middle school?

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: Just the vocabulary and different actions like he'll ask what does this mean, what does that mean?

Commissioner Kralik: Was it the curriculum or was it just the students?

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Commissioner Smith: No, people.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: No, vocabulary, just the people...

Commissioner Kralik: Vocabulary.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: The people – it's more about the 8<sup>th</sup> graders thinking what is cool. It's not cool to be in a math club. There are three kids and so they are stopping the math club because there were just three kids attending. From ten kids it went down to three kids because it's not cool to do that. Whereas in the competing communities around it's actually a competition to get into math club so, math teachers have to take tests to see who is good at math. You know you have forty or fifty kids wanting to join the math club and the teacher has to say no. In just our surrounding cities, you don't have to go too far whereas in Palo Alto...

Chair Stinger: Let's come back to that because that's really interesting and probably works on gender perspective too. I see this as an action agenda item and I've listened to the discussion. I'm going to make a proposal to continue this. I also agree with the statement that the compliance issues in Bullet One and the methods for rectification is Bullet Five are probably the bulk of what the RISE Committee has to spend its time on. The education of the community, the promotion of culture, the empowerment of community members seems like something we could pull out and deal with ourselves. To not deal with ourselves, we could add value too for our broader population, not just the PAUSD student population. I would like to suggest that a subcommittee under the gender equity explore ways that we can precede in the subsequent year. That would be a stand-alone priority next year or perhaps identify policy changes. This is where I actually finish my thought process – recommend activities that we would pursue this fiscal year.

Commissioner Smith: Chair?

Chair Stinger: Please.

Commissioner Smith: Is this something that we can address in a manner at the LGBTQ summit because sexual assault – Commissioner O'Nan brought it up earlier in the discourse about families and there –being in families x, y, z? Is there some level of education we can do in this forum to even start addressing that part of it?

Chair Stinger: Yes, I think that would be a direction to that subcommittee for the project summit but I also think it's a standalone, larger issue.

Commissioner Smith: Thank you.

Chair Stinger: I don't know if we need a second and a vote to...

Commissioner Smith: What's the motion?

Ms. van de Zwaag: I think if you want to make a motion to establish an Ad Hoc Subcommittee then you would look for a second now.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.



Commissioner Smith: Why wouldn't we put it on the gender equity?

Ms. van de Zwaag: You could also just add this work to the Gender Equity Committee which is already established so that's fine. I stated that because I heard language that it would be yet another subcommittee under the gender equity but if that's something the Gender Equity Committee wants to take on that's fine.

Commissioner Lee: I would move that we add this work, Bullet Points Number Two through Four, to the list of responsibilities for the Gender Equity Committee. If anyone wants to join that committee, because right now it's currently just me, let me know.

Commissioner Smith: That's so large.

## **MOTION**

Commissioner Lee: Maybe, Deepali, would you like to join me? So, I move to add this task to the Gender Equity Committee with the addition of Commissioner Brahmhatt to explore avenues to address these issues both in collaboration and independently of the PAUSD and to bring back recommendations to the Commission for further discussion and consideration.

## **SECOND**

Commissioner Kralik: I'll second the motion.

Commissioner Lee: Thank you.

Chair Stinger: Do we have any further discussion? All in favor? Any opposed? Abstentions? 7-0.

## **MOTION PASSED 7-0**

Chair Stinger: Thank you. I think that is a really strong suit. I do have one questions, I'm a little confused on the policy/programming aspect. We can come back with educational forums or the subcommittee can come back with ideas for forums?

Ms. van de Zwaag: Certainly.

Chair Stinger: Yes, ok.

Ms. van de Zwaag: Certainly. Where I just have the definition of the word program is something that is ongoing but the HRC can set up a mini-series of educational conversations as you have in the past. If you're going to have a program that's every month and so forth that is akin to something that staff would do, that's really outside the purview of the HRC.

Chair Stinger: Great.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

#### **4. Human Relations Commission Chair and Vice Chair Elections**

Chair Stinger: Agenda Item Four, elections.

Ms. van de Zwaag: Ok.

Chair Stinger: Do I have a script?

Ms. van de Zwaag: I was going to take that over for you if you don't mind.

Chair Stinger: Ok thank you.

Ms. van de Zwaag: I just wanted to go over the protocol for the elections that will be in front of you this evening. I am taking this out of the HRC Commission handbook. How it works is the current Chair explains the general duties and responsibilities of the Chair, including the monthly time commitment. Then the Chair opens the floor to nominations for the position and the Commissioners nominate one Commissioner at a time. The person nominated needs to be present at the meeting so that won't be an issue because we have full attendance tonight. Someone can nominate someone else or you can nominate yourself. The Chair then asks the nominated person if they are willing to accept the nomination and this process continues to happen until all nominations are on the floor. At that point, the Chair closes the nominations and we go to the ballots. So, the ballots we are using are the same type of ballots that the City Council uses. Mary will hand them out in a minute so you will each get a ballot for Chair and it will have all your names listed on it and your name listed on the top to identify you with the ballot that you are posting. It's all the names there but you will make a mark on the person that you would like to support for a position. If there are no names that you want to support you would leave it blank or you would just check mark of the name of the person you will be voting for. Then it comes back to us, we collect it. To have a passing vote we need four members to vote for someone. If its 3-3 and there's an abstention, it's going to get really complicated and we'll deal with that as it comes but that's the way it works. Once that is determined we go to the process of Vice Chair. Are there any questions?

Commissioner Lee: How long will these positions be serving and we adjusted the cycle back in the summertime?

Ms. van de Zwaag: It would be a 1-year term until next January.

Commissioner Lee: Ok. We did that to align with the...

Ms. van de Zwaag: We did that to align with the Council. For those who weren't here in the past, often we did this in March or we did this in April or May. It was kind of an odd sensation that people who were going to be off the Commission the next month were voting on people who they weren't even going to serve with or we had it before in June. So, people who don't even know the people that they're sitting next to were having a vote. Both of those seemed a little awkward so in dialog with my colleagues in our department has three Commissions and in dialog with the Clerk's Office, we thought this was the wisest course of action. I turn it back to you,

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Chair Stinger.

**1. Election of the 2019 Chair.**

Chair Stinger: It calls for a brief summary of responsibilities very briefly it's chairing meetings, leadership will set the agenda for the meeting which is, actually I think, is probably the hardest thing to do. Setting the priorities for what we can cover and the timing for each agenda item and wanting to respect the priorities we've set for the year, respect new ideas and wishes of the Commission has to all come down to the leadership setting the agenda. There are also communications with staff, maybe answering specific questions. I think that pretty much sums up what the responsibilities of the Chair; being an outward face to the community.

Commissioner Smith: How many hours?

Chair Stinger: I would say it probably depends on the person. I can spend a lot of time reading and going over things. I think other people might be slower and many people would be quicker; a couple hours a week I'll say. I'll open it up first to any questions about the responsibilities and activities of the Chair. Then I'll open it to nominations.

**NOMINATION:** Commissioner Lee nominated Chair Stinger for Chair for 2019.

Commissioner Lee: I'll nominate Valerie Stinger for Chair.

Commissioner Smith: Second the nomination.

Vice Chair O'Nan: I'd like to nominate Gabe Kralik for Chair.

Ms. van de Zwaag: We can go one at a time and did you accept Valerie, I didn't hear?

Chair Stinger: I really appreciate that thank you, thank you. I really like leadership and I would like to continue in some way but I think we need a new Chair.

**CHAIR STINGER DECLINED THE NOMINATION**

**NOMINATION:** Vice Chair O'Nan nominated Commissioner Kralik for Chair for 2019.

Vice Chair O'Nan: I'd like to nomination Gabe Kralik for Chair. He's previously served on the County HRC in leadership and I think he would be a good leader for the local Palo Alto HRC going forward.

**NOMINATION:** Commissioner Smith nominated Commissioner Lee for Chair for 2019.

Commissioner Smith: I'd like to nominate Commissioner Lee. I think he brings a great perspective – a millennial perspective as to where the community is going to with great passion. I really appreciate the work he did around the Ruth Bader Ginsburg film series. I think he'll do a phenomenal job.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Chair Stinger: Do I need a second for first before we...

Ms. van de Zwaag: Yes, you need a second and ask each of these – well let me look at the thing again. We do this once a year and I just read it. Let's see, I don't believe you need a second but you do need the person to say if they are willing to accept the nomination.

Chair Stinger: Go in sequence then, Gabe are you willing?

Commissioner Kralik: I would be willing.

### **COMMISSIONER KRALIK ACCEPTED THE NOMINATION**

Chair Stinger: Then I hear Commissioner Smith, Commissioner Lee are you willing?

Commissioner Lee: Yes, I would.

### **COMMISSIONER LEE ACCEPTED THE NOMINATION**

Chair Stinger: Ok.

Commissioner Lee: Do we get an opportunity to make a statement or how does that work?

Ms. van de Zwaag: If you'd like.

Commissioner Lee: I would just say on my behalf thank you Kaloma for that nomination. This is my third Human Relations Commission that I've served on in my 12-years of service on local commission. I've served on seven commission total, including Chairing a non-Human Relations Commission in Davis. I'm also one of the more senior members of this body and I think I've learned a lot over the last year and a half from our Chair. I think we've had a lot of very productive meetings. I think we complement each other very well in terms of our style and approach to things. Without getting ahead of myself, I would like to see Valerie continuing serving in leadership as Vice Chair. I think if the Commission gave us that opportunity we would work really well together. One of my personal goals is to really empower each individual Commissioner to achieve his or her goals for joining this Commission. I think we all take a lot of time out of our busy schedules to serve on this Commission. I want to make sure that at the end of our 3-year terms that we feel like we've been fulfilled and that we've had an opportunity to work and engage on the issues that we want. I think I've reached out to or met personally with just about every member of this Commission. Moving forward my objective would just be empowering this Commission both as a body and individually to achieve our respective goals, really serving our community, and being steward for making sure that human rights and human relations continue to be a priority. I think often times the city gets busy with sexier topics and I think it's our responsibility to really be listening to the community and identifying areas where we can make an impact. So, that would be my objective if selected as Chair.

Chair Stinger: Thank you, Commissioner Lee. Commissioner Kralik?

Commissioner Kralik: I don't have anything to add personally. I just want to say I've worked with Steve on this last subcommittee he's put in a lot of energy and so everything he said is true. He's a really hard worker. If someone elects me, I'd be happy to do my best and bring forward the efforts of everyone too but I think in my own thinking as a young member I think I would like to have Valerie continue. First, because I think she does a great job of welcoming people. She has spent a lot of time drinking coffee and I think she favors scones over at Ada's Café. That is an important thing so I just want to say nice things about those two individuals because it was a real privilege to work with them on this report which they were the prime movers behind. That's all I wanted to say.

Commissioner Smith: Minka? Staff?

Commissioner Kralik: Is there more people that want to run?

Vice Chair O'Nan: No.

Commissioner Smith: You could add that. I marked this wrong. I feel like I failed.

Ms. van de Zwaag: Do you want to just put it on right and put your initials?

Commissioner Smith: Yes.

Commissioner Kralik: Steve, I feel young that you are the senior person.

Commissioner Smith: You got to be like 18 years old..

Commissioner Lee: I am 30 now so I feel pretty old.

Ms. van de Zwaag: We're just going to double check it because it's got this whole fancy spreadsheet here and we just want to make sure that we did it right. I hope you can understand.

Commissioner Lee: I'm not very good at spreadsheets either.

Ms. van de Zwaag: So, it was a 4-3 vote with four votes for Commissioner Kralik and three votes for Commissioner Lee. It takes four votes for something to pass so Commissioner Kralik congratulations. So now...

#### **NOMINATION PASSED WITH 4 VOTES FOR KRALIK AND 3 VOTES FOR LEE.**

Chair Stinger: While I still have the gavel, if I can before I turn it over to you, I just want to express the work of this Commission means to me and how much respect I have for each of the Commissioners and staff. Minka and Mary are brilliantly professional and kind and a font of knowledge and responsiveness to make things happen. Each of the Commissioners -- Commissioner Brahmhatt, your passion for teenagers is remarkable and brings so much to this Commission. Commissioner Xue, your questions are so direct and so helpful in moving the topic forward that I'm just so impressed with your insight and wisdom. Commissioner Lee, we have

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

got some work to do on our summit and I know that we will continue to work well on that. You are just the history and benchmark and what you do for the HSRAP agencies, the way you represent them in the community and see them going forward is brilliant.

Vice Chair O’Nan: Thank you.

Chair Stinger: I appreciated your insight Commissioner Kralik on our summit and on so many of the pieces. You have a lot of depth that you bring and it’s just like going to the Fountain of Knowledge. We have a lot of history Commissioner Smith.

Commissioner Smith: Yes, we do.

Chair Stinger: I’m looking forward to more community conversations and being productive...

Commissioner Smith: Thank you.

Chair Stinger: ... in that regard. So, I will give this gavel to you and tell you to take good care of us and keep us going forward and I’ll take my ballot with me.

Chair Kralik: Where are you headed?

Commissioner Smith: That’s your seat over there.

Commissioner Stinger: Don’t we switch?

Chair Kralik: No, we don’t have to do that.

Ms. van de Zwaag: We can just go like this for now.

Commissioner Stinger: Ok.

Ms. van de Zwaag: So, Chair Kralik, if you would lead the conversation for the nomination of a Vice Chair.

## 2. Election of the 2019 Vice Chair

Chair Kralik: I don’t what the Vice Chair does so I will call on Commissioner O’Nan to dictate a little description of it and her efforts.

Commissioner O’Nan: Alright, thank you so much, Chair Kralik. The role of the Vice Chair is basically two-fold. One is to support the Chair and work with city staff planning the agenda for each HRC meeting. So, that’s a commitment of once a month either attending or phone into an agenda planning meeting. Second, the Vice Chair stands by and pitches in to run the meeting in the event the Chair is absent. The responsibilities are fairly limited but it’s a great learning opportunity to understand how the HRC plans its agendas, chooses its directions, and works with staff.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Chair Kralik: Do I hear any nominations for the Vice Chair positions?

**NOMINATION:** Commissioner Brahmhatt nominated Commissioner Lee for Vice Chair for 2019.

Commissioner Brahmhatt: I nominated Commissioner Lee for Vice Chair.

Chair Kralik: Steve, are you willing to serve as the Vice Chair?

Commissioner Lee: I'm willing too, yes.

**COMMISSIONER LEE ACCEPTED THE NOMINATION**

Chair Kralik: Ok, great.

**NOMINATION:** Vice Chair O'Nan nominated Commissioner Xue for Vice Chair for 2019.

Commissioner O'Nan: I'd like to nominate Qifeng Xue for Vice Chair.

Chair Kralik: Commissioner are you willing to serve?

Vice Chair Xue: Well that's very surprising. As every Commissioner here knows I'm the junior one so this is my first public position served. As you guys can tell, typically I don't speak too much. I'm not a good speaker so I am willing to serve, however, when I compare to other Commissioners, I feel I may be a little bit ignorant. So, as I said I'm willing to serve but also, I'd want to support our team. As this point, I cannot say no so that's the only answer I can give you so go ahead.

**COMMISSIONER XUE ACCEPTED THE NOMINATION**

Chair Kralik: Ok, a very short answer I guess you're saying you are willing to serve and we'll move forward if there are other nominations? We have two nominations and I guess we will proceed to vote.

Ms. van de Zwaag: Yes, I believe Mary already handed them out to you. I feel like there should be music.

Commissioner Stinger: I would like music

Commissioner Lee: Jeopardy music perhaps, jeopardy music.

Ms. van de Zwaag: This was also a 4-3 vote with Commissioner Xue being elected as Vice Chair, congratulations.

**NOMINATION PASSED WITH 4 VOTES FOR XUE AND 3 VOTES FOR LEE.**

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Commissioner O’Nan: Congratulations.

Ms. van de Zwaag: Now you continue with the agenda, Commissioner Kralik.

Chair Kralik: So, we...

Ms. van de Zwaag: Chair, I’m sorry.

## **V. Reports from Officials**

### **1. Commissioner Reports**

Chair Kralik:... have the reports from officials, starting with the Commissioner reports. If a Commissioner would like to speak just put on your light and I’ll call on you, ok? Commissioner Smith.

Ms. van de Zwaag: Accident.

Chair Kralik: Ok, it’s a quiet night and we’re going to go ahead with Commissioner O’Nan.

Commissioner O’Nan: Thank you, so I’ve been serving on the Age-Friendly Committee for some time along with Minka and we do have some interesting proposals on the table for how to increase a feeling of community among the seniors in our population. We are looking at partnering with local cafes and the YMCA to create coffee klatsches. We’re considering doing storytelling events to get seniors to come out and tell their stories of interesting things that have shaped their lives and possibly involved youth and trying to capture those oral memoirs. I’m excited to see some of these projects come to fruition in the New Year and we’ll definitely be inviting the rest of the HRC to attend when these things get launched. Thank you.

Chair Kralik: Commissioner Stinger.

Commissioner Stinger: My report is two-fold; I attended a national immigration forum. Out of Many – Immigration Forum, one which was done by a national organization and is probably not specifically geared to our questions about the immigrant population. I think there are some aspects we can learn from and I will forward this to the subcommittee. I also attended a countywide Human Rights Day on December 10<sup>th</sup> which was heavily populated by county speakers and learned a lot about activities in the county. I will forward some of these suggestions also to the appropriate Committee.

Chair Kralik: Thank you for attending that, I was a member of the County Commission, and they take great pride in setting up that day. I’m glad you were able to attend and meet with some of the other members.

Commissioner Stinger: I felt really lucky to attend. It was a great celebration of Human Rights Day and I’ll repeat that again? It was a great celebration of Human Rights Day and I’m always so impressed with the work that goes on in the county. I think they are planning a follow-up day before next year at this time.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.



Chair Kralik: Great.

## **2. Council Liaison Report**

Chair Kralik: Council Liaison reports, anyone?

Commissioner O’Nan: We don’t have one yet.

Chair Kralik: It’s early in the year, we have new Council Members and does it happen that a new Council Member might be a Liaison with us?

Ms. van de Zwaag: It’s possible, the Mayor chooses the Council representatives to the Commissions and he makes the Committee appointments. So, that’s often-late January, early February. We may have our Council Liaison by the February meeting but it may not be till the March.

Chair Kralik: We’ll await that with bated breath.

## **3. Staff Liaison Report**

Chair Kralik: The Staff Liaison report? I imagine we still have our staff?

Ms. van de Zwaag: That’s me.

Chair Kralik: That’s wonderful.

Ms. van de Zwaag: That’s good. A couple things, one is just to call attention to an email I sent you regarding Brown Act training. That’s coming up one or two weeks from Monday in the late afternoon. I’m really hoping that you can all make it. It’s also been brought to my attention that there will be special training for Chairs and Vice Chairs. A date has not been set for that but especially as we have two new people in leadership, I think that will be a very valuable training for you two to come too. I also have holiday cards that were delivered and came from La Comida. Four of the Commissioners got cards; I’m not sure what happened to the other three. They went to City Hall so they could be floating around City Hall but it’s a holiday card from La Comida. I also would like to show you this. I’m sorry that Kristen O’Kane the Chief Operating Officer from the Community Service Department is no longer here. Our department creates a calendar and annual report. This is the third year in which we have done so Human Services has one page and your names are also listed and your thank you’s for your service in the back of the calendar. I wanted to provide you each with your own copy of this beautiful annual calendar that also shares the accomplishments which are many of the what the Community Services Department does and the impact that we have on individuals and families in our community. Those were the three announcements that I had.

Chair Kralik: Mary, did you have anything? Ok, thank you so much.

## **VI. TENTATIVE AGENDA FOR NEXT REGULAR MEETING: Thursday, February 14, 2019.**

Chair Kralik: Tentative agenda items for the next regular meeting. I'm opening to listening to Commissioners that would like to do that. I see Commission Lee.

Commissioner Lee: So, as our LGBTQ Subcommittee discussed earlier in the week, we do have my half hour policy recommendation that I'd like us to discuss in February.

Chair Kralik: I know you have a lot of hard work in that because we went over it in detail and it's very good. I'm looking forward to the presentment to everyone so that is certainly worth it. Does staff have any thoughts about the next agenda or is that something that we can work on together after the meeting?

Ms. van de Zwaag: We definitely always work on after the meeting and if there are things pending Mary already has them on the list and I don't see that she had anything. I think what's always helpful is a continued conversation on the work plan item and I think Mary and I will have to go back if there are any items that come on an annual basis or some annual basis that we might have forgotten about. It's February you can expect in the March meeting probably hear back from the CDBG recommendations and March/April for the HSRAP funding recommendations. With those two subcommittees..

Mid-Peninsula Media Center: Please turn on your microphone.

Ms. van de Zwaag: Sorry Patrick. The HSRAP applications are due next Thursday so then we'll have a better idea and please raise your hand if you're on the HSRAP Committee? One, two, three and then CDBG? One, two, three. Have you heard yet from...

Commissioner Stinger: No.

Ms. van de Zwaag: No, you have not heard yet from the Planning Department. Ok, well I'm sure you'll be hearing first in the next couple weeks.

Commissioner Lee: Another agenda item that I'd like the Commission to consider in February. Project Sentinel contract to administer the mediation program, it's a 3-year contract, comes up for renewal in June. I'd like us to consider forming an Ad Hoc Committee at the February meeting to discuss what, if any, recommendations we may want to make in light of that opportunity. Again, it could be...

Ms. van de Zwaag: Commissioner...

Commissioner Lee: ...no recommendation but...

Ms. van de Zwaag: Right, Commissioner Lee, I will need to check with my leadership if there is a role that is afforded to the HRC as far as that is concerned.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail [ada@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:ada@cityofpaloalto.org). This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Commissioner Lee: Ok.

Ms. van de Zwaag: I'm not sure that there is so once I find that out, I will share that with leadership.

Commissioner Lee: Ok, well will you let me know as well?

Ms. van de Zwaag: I will certainly let you know sir.

Commissioner Lee: Thank you.

## **VII. ADJOURNMENT**

Chair Kralik: Well the excitement is palpable, let's carry on and we'll see you at the next meeting. Thanks, everyone, meeting is adjourned.

Meeting adjourned at 8:49 p.m.