



HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION

Thursday, November 8, 2018

Community Meeting Room

Palo Alto Civic Center

250 Hamilton Avenue

7:00 PM

REGULAR MEETING

ROLL CALL:

Commissioners Present: Brahmhatt, Lee, O’Nan, Stinger, Xue

Absent: Kralik, Smith

Council Liaison: Council Member Wolbach

Staff: Minka van der Zwaag, Mary Constantino

I. ROLL CALL

Chair Stinger: Good evening, and thank you all for coming. This is quite an audience, I’m thrilled to see everybody at our Human Relations Commission November 8th meeting. Roll Call, Mary? Before we start, I would just like to take a moment, a lot has happened this month. I found myself depressed and saddened much of the time. I wanted to read something to recognize the events that happened in Pittsburg and then this morning I realized that wasn’t enough. That thing happened in Thousand Oaks and I’d like to have a short reading. The Talmanar Collections of Learnings based on law and legend and what I’d like to read is a passage that was sent to me. It’s a story of a Rabbi passing through a field, noticing an old man planting an acorn. “Why are you planting that acorn?” the Rabbi asked in a scoffing tone. “You surely do not expect long enough to see if it grows into an oak tree.” To which the old man turning solely from the ground to fix his gaze on the not so wise clergyman says, “My ancestors planted seeds so that I might enjoy the shade and the fruit of these trees and I’ll do likewise for those who come after me.” So, I invite us to take a moment of silence, first to grieve for the loss in many communities; the loss that we share with the Pittsburgh community, the Oakland community, and the loss of life and perhaps the loss of innocents. Second, to consider that society grows and people plant trees under who shade they will never sit. I suggest we honor these people and commit ourselves to our vision and our work. We’ll just take a second. Thank you and I hope we don’t start that way again soon.

II. AGENDA CHANGES, REQUESTS, DELETIONS

Chair Stinger: Our first agenda, any changes or requests or deletions?

Commissioner Lee: Chair, I’d like to request we move Business Item Number One to the end of ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City’s compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

the meeting since we do have other presentations this evening. I'd like to be respectful of their time.

Chair Stinger: I appreciate that. I'd also like to have our norms in place for this meeting. Can we try to have the discussion briefly and move forward?

MOTION

Commissioner Lee: I would move that we amend the agenda to move it to the end of the agenda.

Chair Stinger: Do I hear a second?

SECOND

Commissioner Xue: Second.

Chair Stinger: Ok, I think you've spoken to your motion. Did you want to speak to your second?

Commissioner Xue: I second because I would like to respect the community's time.

Ms. Minka van der Zwaag, Human Services Manager: Can you turn on your microphone, please?

Commissioner Xue: Oh sorry. I feel the same way, we should respect other people's time, let them speak first, and then we can talk about our norms.

Chair Stinger: Do I hear any other speakers? I'll call for a vote on the motion to adapt the agenda to begin with Item Two. All in favor?

MOTION FAILED 3-2 WITH COMMISSIONERS SMITH AND KRALIK ABSENT

Chair Stinger: Then I would like to move to Agenda Item Two as it's printed -- one is we are progressing -- a presentation by PAUSD RISE, Responsive Inclusive Safe Environment, Task Force on your efforts to promote a culture in which...

Ms. van der Zwaag: Oh, you have oral communications.

Chair Stinger: I'm sorry. Mary, you set me up for that and I still...

Ms. van der Zwaag: I don't think you have any that are not on the agenda.

Chair Stinger: I do and I -- Stephanie?

Ms. van der Zwaag: Then I apologize.

Chair Stinger: I apologize too, I am so sorry. Oral Communications, Stephanie.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Be at the microphone right there, just turn it on.

Chair Stinger: Thank you.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Yes, please.

III. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

Ms. Stephanie Martinson My name is Stephanie Martinson and I'm the founder of Racing Hearts non-profit based here in Palo Alto. I'm also a County Commissioner for the Veterans Affairs here at District 5 in Santa Clara County and I feel like I am an advocate for underrepresented community members, whether it's health care, Veterans, or the LGBTQ members. I'm here to speak about encouraging you as Commissioners to encourage our leadership in the City of Palo Alto to do a concrete benefit to our LGBTQ community members. Racing Hearts is thrilled that we're going to have our 5k-10k race here in downtown Palo Alto this March 2019 in partnership with the City of Palo Alto. We are having our registration be gender inclusive, having multiple choices for genders when people register for the 5k-10k. I would like to encourage the City to also do all registration or something relative to including the LGBTQ community members during any time that an entity uses a public facility; something relative to a partnership with the City. This is one step that we could support our members. It is important to know that the LGBTQ community members have a 50 percent suicide attempted versus our general population of just 3 percent and we think about what our community wants to be like. I think that it's a very simple, easy, supportive solution to our community members. So, there's also some talk at the county level for this to happen but I do think that Palo Alto could be a leader in it. Thank you very much.

IV. BUSINESS

Chair Stinger: Thank you very much, Stephanie. I appreciate your comments and I appreciate you coming. I stand corrected, we will now move onto Agenda Item One.

Chair Stinger: I'd like to introduce the speakers from RISE, PAUSD's Committee. RISE is the...

Commissioner Lee: Sorry, point of order, Chair. Isn't Number One the review -- the norms established at the June Commission meeting?

Vice Chair O'Nan: Yes, she's reading Item Two.

Chair Stinger: I thought you...

Ms. van der Zwaag: It's not Item One, it got moved, two is now Item One.

Commissioner Lee: Oh ok.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Item One now.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Commissioner Lee: Ok, I thought it didn't pass.

Ms. van der Zwaag: It did pass.

Commissioner Lee: It did pass.

Chair Stinger: 3-2.

Ms. van der Zwaag: She passed it.

Commissioner Lee: Doesn't it require four of seven for any action? I mean I know...

Ms. van der Zwaag: That's true, that's...

Commissioner Lee: ...I mean I know I'm...

Vice Chair O'Nan: Alright so we're...

Commissioner Lee: We're going to do it right, yes.

Vice Chair O'Nan: So, it didn't pass.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Ok.

Chair Stinger: I'm so sorry.

Female: We understand.

Chair Stinger: Thank you, that was – we don't often do that and I was not aware, thank you. Great, thank you.

Ms. van der Zwaag: So, I guess we're going to continue with the agenda as it was written.

Female: Ok.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Sorry, my apology to you.

Ms. Karen Holman: With five present and three voted for it I would think it would pass.

Ms. van der Zwaag: I would think so but someone is saying that its...

Commissioner Lee: I believe the code says that.

Ms. van der Zwaag: I've been told before that it has to be four but...

Ms. Holman: If there's seven present...

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Commissioner Lee: The code says that four are required for any action by the Commission regardless of how many seats are filled.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Well if we want to go specific to the code, we can follow that then, that's fine.

Chair Stinger: Thank you all for your flexibility and your exercise.

Chair Stinger: We will begin with the existing Item One – printed Item One which is to review the norms established at our Commissioner retreat and consider instituting these norms for our monthly meetings of the HRC. I'll turn it over to staff, please.

1. Review norms established at June 16, 2018 Commission Retreat and consider instituting the norms for monthly meetings of the HR

Ms. van der Zwaag: Thank you, Chair Stinger. So, as most of you know the HRC set a list of norms to govern the conversation that took place at your annual retreat and I think that it was a very useful tool to help focus and guide your conversation that day. I believe part of the success of the retreat was thanks to establishing these guidelines at the beginning of your meeting. When you look at them, it's clear that several of the norms established were aimed at guiding the specific work of the retreat. Our process and procedures that are ground in other documents of the HRC that they adhere to such as your scope, your charge, your jurisdiction, and all those are listed in the City's Municipal Code but as an interjection, I think it's also important to remember that many of the non-meeting norms listed were included with the intent of helping the HRC to stay focused, move forward, and indicated the desire that once a decision is made by the Commission the topic not be reopened and debated at a subsequent meeting. As you can see that are listed on the attachment that was given to you that are more purely meeting norms and those are the ones that I would like to call out and focus our conversation on tonight. As the HRC, due to its role in the community, serves as a model for corporative, civil discourse on the often-challenging matters that the community faces and I feel that a listing of meeting norms would be helpful to the HRC's deliberations. Therefore, at this time staff would like to proceed as follows. I'd like to take questions, points of clarifications about my presentation, I'd like the HRC to make a decision up or down whether you want meeting norms and then I would like you to decide what they will be. My recommendation is that if you do pass meeting norms, that you consider the following ones that I'm about to read as a starting point. I also recommend that they are short, clear, and concise. I see this as a type of Gentlemen's Agreement that is gently enforced by the goodwill of the other Commissioners that are here tonight. So, my recommendation, if you want to look at the intro document that was included as part of your packet, is that you consider including the following. One is respect other people's responses. The second one would be model civil discourse and it was the five items listed underneath there; active listening, receptive posture, issue-focused, factual data not anecdotal, think before speaking, constructive suggestions, and the last one cell phones off. If people need to take a text or call please step out of the room. We have a full agenda tonight so if we feel like we need longer than the 10-minutes or so allotted perhaps this is something that we can start tonight and continue to have on our next agenda. I'd like to start as I suggested by first taking any questions or points of clarifications from the Commission.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Commissioner Lee: I wanted to find out what the force and effect of adopting any meetings norms. Are they similar to adopting a set of bylaws?

Ms. van der Zwaag: No, as I mentioned in my presentation, I see this just as an agreement amongst the body gathered tonight. That it's enforced between the goodwill of those that are on the Commission. They don't have the force of bylaws; they don't have a force of being on the Municipal Code but most often meeting norms are enforced by the goodwill of those in the room.

Commissioner Lee: Sure.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Other questions?

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: What is the penalty for violating them?

Ms. van der Zwaag: Well, as I mentioned, I don't see that there's specific penalty. I don't want to set this up in a punitive matter something that is by force of a rule, again that's in the City's Municipal Code. This is enforced by the goodwill of the Commissioners so if someone, for instance, is on their cell phone, then someone can gently say Commissioner, let's remember our norm of keeping off our cell phones during the meeting or saying, remember one of our agreements together was to really listen to what the other person has to say. As with any practice, it's going to take some experimenting but it is my hope that these can be set up and these could really help guide the conversation in a productive manner. My department meetings, we have our agreements listed on each of our agendas and we every time I see the agenda, I look at them. Ours are quite different, ours are show up, make it better, be positive, listen, and embrace differences. So, it's really depending on the group but it helps me when I'm in those meetings to really think that I'm there to do good listening and to make decisions that are for the best of that assembled body. If you decide on something tonight it would be what you would think would be most helpful to your assembled body to help with the structure and the discussions in your meetings.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: I don't think it's helpful to remind someone that they should not be on their phone.

Ms. van der Zwaag: I would like to make...

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: ... just as an example, that cell phone one. If somebody is on their cell phone, I would give that person a benefit of doubt, that there must be some good reason why that person was on their phone.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Well, I'd like to first get to the decision if the Commission would like to have Commission norms or not. So, I'd like that to be the first decision before we go into what specifically they may be or may not be. So, that would be my recommendation, that you first make that decision.

Chair Stinger: I like the...

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: My personal feeling is that we have enough rules as is without adding norms to this thing.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Ok, thank you for your opinion.

Chair Stinger: Have to turn it on, I've been pressing it on and off, thank you, Jill, –

Commissioner O’Nan. I like the order you set out, if there are no other questions of clarity let’s – may I have a motion to adopt the norms and then we’ll open it up for discussion – to adapt – to have norms.

Ms. van der Zwaag: I think the decision right now that staff is asking for is a question of whether you do or do not want to have any norms. That’s what I’m recommending before we get into any specifics.

Chair Stinger: At that general level may I have a motion?

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: So, the staff is making the motion or are you....

Ms. van der Zwaag: At this point, I would say that I would ask one of the Commissioners if you so want to, to make a recommendation, up or down, whether you want norms or not.

Chair Stinger: I can make the motion, can’t I?

Ms. van der Zwaag: You certainly can.

MOTION

Chair Stinger: I would like to make the motion that we have norms of behavior for our meetings and that we take the time to consider them carefully. Is there a second?

MOTION FAILED DUE TO THE LACK OF A SECOND

Ms. van der Zwaag: Ok, thank you for your time.

2. Presentation by PAUSD RISE (Responsive Inclusive Safe Environment) Task Force on Efforts to Promote a Culture in which Sexual Assault, Violence and Harassment are Not Engaged in Nor Tolerated.

Chair Stinger: Agenda Item Two, I want to reintroduce and re-invite the staff from PAUSD’s RISE, Responsive Inclusive Safe Environment the Task Force to speak to us. I think I mentioned at our last meeting, in considering some of the negative things that are happening, we wanted to have something – we wanted to show some positive efforts that were being championed in our community and hence the invitation to RISE. To talk about your efforts to – I’m going to read this from the agenda, to promote a culture in which sexual assault, violence, and harassment are not engaged in, nor tolerated. We’re very excited to hear about the progress you’ve made and the

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

programs you are proposing in – for our youth.

Ms. Karen Hendricks: We'd like to thank you for inviting us here tonight to talk about the efforts that have initiated and going to be ongoing. We'd like to introduce ourselves to you and I'd first like to start by thank you for your opening tonight. As a mom of two Pepperdine students who had several anxious hours this morning waiting for a sleepy daughter to wake up and asked me why I had phoned her so many times. I want to thank you for your sensitivity and for really addressing the public health crisis that is happening right now and the impact on our students in our community so thank you. I'm Karen Hendricks, I'm the Deputy Superintendent of Palo Alto Unified School District. Let's see how we can...

Mr. John Fitton: I'm John Fitton and I'm a parent of Paly students.

Ms. Laura Prentiss: I'm Laura Prentiss and I'm also a parent of Paly students and a Social Worker.

Ms. Michelle Higgins: Hi, I'm Michelle Higgins and I'm a parent of Paly and Grain students currently.

Ms. Hendricks: I could probably just use my outdoor recess voice and not even need this microphone but we'll give it a try. So, we'd like to start by sharing the work that we initiated last October and we're going to do this as a team because that's how the work has unfolded. When I step into the role of Interim Superintendent last year on October 1st, it was clear within the district that there was work that needed to be aligned in a strategic effort and that began on October 30th, 2017 with the first reading of what we call the RISE Task Force. This was a Superintendent's Task Force that pulled together stakeholders, community members, and staff members both who are already actively engaged in the work of looking at issues around sexual misconduct at our school sites and had actually strong pockets of work going in different places. That we wanted to identify, address, put a spotlight on better practice and also where we need to really build out. So, we came together as a large group with a very large topic and really had to start to refine where are we, where are we headed together, and what are we trying to address in terms of strategic planning for a Unified School District. We're not going to read all the slides to you I promise but we wanted to talk to you a little bit about the formation of RISE. I don't know – do we have a clicker? Oh, there we go, Michelle, you're in charge.

Ms. Higgins: That's not good news.

Ms. Hendricks: We know the slides can be flying now at this point. So, what we're going to do actually is I think John Fitton is going to go ahead and frame up the development of where we started last year, where we are to this point, and what we perceive as ongoing in recommendations at this point. So, John if you would like to go ahead and kick us off?

Ms. van der Zwaag: The reason for the microphone isn't so much for us to hear, it's because it's being recorded so that's really the reason for the microphone.

Ms. Hendricks: We understand, thank you.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Mr. Fitton: We'll do our best, so with these issues, when I say these issues we're really focusing on harm to self, harm to others, sexism, sexual assault, sexual violence, all those bullying issues and we're talking about TK-12 Palo Alto Unified School District. It really came to a head in the community I would say about a year and a half ago because what we'd experienced over the prior 4 to 5-years in the district were a series of issues that we're all probably well aware of but I'll just summarize quickly. They've been very challenging but also not unique to our community. I mean our nation is facing these issues, teen suicide rates are up nationally, we experienced that in our school district as you well know mostly 3 to 4-years ago. We also experienced principles acting inappropriately, sexual harassment, potential sexual assault, and sexual assault from a principal at Paly 4 or 5-years ago. We had issues with teachers in the school district where they were abusive, harassed students; again I'm talking about 2 or 3 different situations that were well publicized in the news. Then we had an issue with a student about a year and a half ago at Paly who had assaulted a number of students in different situations that really came to the fore when that student was back on campus and it was only found out through the media that the rhymes and the reasons for that. So, in the community a number of us parents had been working separately, we really knew each other a bit but not in this regard. Michelle Higgins has a background in law; she has extensive experience in these issues. Laura Prentiss is a subject matter expert really in our community and teaches classes on sex educations, response with your children, how to teach your teens about these issues, and she has a Master's Degree in the area. Brandy Walters was the parent who was involved early, he son played football and she handed out the book Missoula to the football coaches after the spring assaults at Paly with the idea that that could be useful. Tim Malar [phonetics], whose son also plays football, has also been involved with a sports psychology at Stanford and was very pivotal in doing our initial research. Bottom line, all of us agreed even before we met as a group that we thought we could do better. That, in fact, we needed and must do better as a community and that includes accountability at all levels; parents, teachers, administrators, and students to learn and become aware of these issues. So, how do we do that? We have a community that can work toward strong practice, if not best practice. How can we work together and do that? That's where the meetings started, really going back to initial meetings with Max while he was here, and Kim Diorio while she was here as Paly's principle. Both of those individuals are now gone. After the Cozen Report, there were decisions made and administrators ultimately left and we do believe in accountability at all levels. So, while that's difficult and challenging because many in our community feel these individuals were strong in other areas. It goes to show that these are serious essential issues that must be faced directly and there does need to be accountability at all levels. Then we give Karen full credit in her role as acting Superintendent of bringing the forces together and when I say forces, I mean teachers, administrators, community members, parents, students, all to one place under the RISE title, Responsive Inclusive Safe Environment. We have a mission and vision statement; I think maybe we can jump to that one because I'll just speak to that briefly. It's not the next one but the one after that. This was put together by the parent group initially but it became to be adopted by the RISE Task Force and it really speaks to what we believe we're about. We're committed to facilitating exception programming that increases student, school and community awareness, education, and response to prevent sexual harassment, assault, and violence. We strive to empower our students by teaching practical skills to reduce potential harm for self or for others and providing evidence-based, gender-responsive training to navigate these challenging issues and lead others during these years in high school. We were focusing on high school initially; we are now working down TK-12, college and

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

beyond. We're dedicated to utilizing proven facilitators with the highest level of expertise to provide guidance, education, and interactive student leadership and peer mentor training to prevent violence and create a cultural awareness, safety, and accountability at all levels. That was our focus last year; the issues were primary in high schools so we focused on that. We brought in two national subject matter experts after committing significant time to research. We brought these, they're on the hand out table, but a lot of research on what is national best practice? It can seem like the winds are blowing 12 different ways even for the most prominent universities in communities. We've worked with Stanford and looked at what they're doing. We looked across the country and we decided on two speakers, Jackson Cats and Anaya Boge [phonetics]. We brought them both in and Karen can elaborate on this but bottom line we gave them extensive involvement in presenting to all of the high school classes at both Gunn and Paly. We received feedback from students after that and are committed to continuous improvement. So, while some of that I would say was successful, it was certainly successful in starting the discussion. We also learned that large assemblies are not the best place for these issues and that there is some adaptation that needs to be done to maximize impact. So, we're moving more towards student leadership lead programs and Anaya is working with us this year. Small group discussions, again, focused on continuous learning and moving towards strong if not national best practice. I won't go through the rest of it, you got the idea from our mission and vision what we're focused on. I would say we continue to learn, we accomplished a lot last year. I think systems were greatly improved, I think the reporting process was greatly improved, we brought in Meghan Farrell. She has great knowledge and has put together a reporting system and Title 9 process to make it easier to report these issues. There's a transparency to these issues that weren't there before that was needed but we're not there yet. We still have a long way to go and we're learning as we go what's working well in other areas. I think we're a team -- at that initial meeting this year that we're 40 individuals and that's significant. We still need to involve more students, there's a lot of enthusiasm around this issue from students. We can do more, we can reach out more, and we want to have more buy-in from teachers. I think teachers have felt threatened on these issues for understandable reasons. So, we continue to learn and I think I'll stop there and just pause but hopefully, that gives a bit of the background of what brought us together.

Ms. Hendricks: Do you want to add anything

Ms. Prentiss: Well, if you want me to talk now about consent education...

Ms. Hendricks: Yes, we need you to scooch on over here a little bit and John touched on so much of the work and I really appreciate it. I think one thing that we want to say is that opening these conversations has been and will continue to be a difficult thing. These are uncomfortable conversations, these are painful conversations, and the shared goal, the shared interest is that our kids, your kids come to campus and do not experience the types of sexual misconduct that we know have happened in our area and in other areas. We've worked with neighboring districts as well because as communities we all struggle with the same challenges and we hope to continue to deepen those partnerships. We had a chance to really kind of preview some of the work being done by Anaya Boge [phonetics] in Mountain View and Los Altos. So, they opened their doors to us, we got to go in and see the work being done. Talk about how we could bring that in, in a two-step phase really into Palo Alto because they were about a year in front of us in the work.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

San Mateo now is coming in and joining into the work that we're doing so we see ourselves uniting within these efforts with neighboring districts and with community members as well. I think that is an important component.

Mr. Fitton: Stanford has been part of the process.

Ms. Hendricks: Stanford has been part of the process as well. As John said some of what we learned last year, of course, is what we know about; great teaching and about engaging kids in conversations. That isn't necessarily best done in large group settings and yet, the need to open the conversations and start with education dialog was so urgent that we took that route as the first step. This year coming in we have some design models to move from larger groups to smaller group work because the students told us that the most powerful parts of all of these initiatives so far were when they came back together and they talked about what they had heard and listened to and shared in the large group assemblies. Then really broke those down as small groups and as peers and as mentors and protectors of each other. Those were some of the most powerful moments for them, so we'll continue those efforts. John touched on our efforts and our commitment to compliance under our OCR Resolution Agreement. I won't read those details to you but we are so focused on compliance with the state and federal law with adhering to resolution agreement with the OCR and earn contact communication with them to ensure that we are indeed following best practice and receiving feedback from them. Our matters are transparent, our UCP Law is public, we expect that it's fair that the community be able to see what's on that log, and know how we are addressing uniform complaints in Title 9 matters in our district. The addition of Meghan Farrell as John said was a tremendous addition to our district. She has an extensive background in Title 9 work in a university level and came in very rapidly and assimilated into a K-12 structure as well. She has really helped us put structure and services in support into the work at our school sites; we talk about the heavy lift of the task force but it's the work at the school's sites that make a difference in what we're trying to facilitate, so that has been a tremendous effort. We have face to face Title 9 training for all over our employees in the district which is a tremendous initiative. We will be completed by that this year by the end of December. I think at this point we have over 1,500-1,600 staff members who received face to face training in Title 9 from Meghan Farrell directly. We have about 200-300 that we're working on scheduling in the upcoming month in a half. We have a series of training coming up. We wanted to talk to you about some initiatives and I'm going to ask Laura to assist us with that. Some of the things that we've been working with our initial options for informal resolution of complaints and restorative justice models; record keeping that is accurate and better; point person training and then making sure that forms, templates, and other support is available to sites. A large initiative for us as we move the work from high school into middle school into K-5 is understanding that the language of consent applies to humans of all age. Laura is going to speak to that a little bit for us; she has great expertise on this.

Ms. Prentiss: Last year we started at the high schools because that's where the urgency was and really the idea is to get kids educated about what does consent look like, what do healthy relationships look like, how are gender stereotypes impact the way that we relate to one another and in particularly in sexual relationships. All of this is a critic in high school but it's too late to be initiating these conversations in high school. What have the goal really been and what we've been talking about is how can we start this much earlier? So, our hope is this year we're starting

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

to move into the middle schools to start talking to them. Have Anaya come in and work with them on consent education, healthy relationships, and ultimately our hope is that we're going to be doing this in elementary schools. Starting in kindergarten with the most basic concept of discussing boundaries, consent on the playground and in the classroom. You know these concepts while at the higher level they're certainly about a sexual relationship, you're very young and how you share toys and how you play tag on the playground and all these kinds of things. So, the hope is if we can get a uniform language going within the district that early on our kids are going to be learning and able to conceptualize what consent is. As they get into sexual relationships as they get over it will be much more intuitive and they'll have the right vocabulary and these norms will be set. Rather than all of sudden, as it is right now, where it's very confusing and usual for our high school students, unfortunately, to be trying to figure out all these things.

Mr. Fitton: That was one of the themes that came out of the assemblies.

Ms. Higgins: Microphone.

Mr. Fitton: Oh, sorry, one of the main themes from students themselves in the small group discussions we were able to have after the assemble meetings; they said time and time again we wish we would have had this earlier. We need this in middle school, we need a version of this even down further TK-12, age appropriate of course, and appropriate for the class level. They wanted it earlier and I think as we look at the work we want out students to be safe first and foremost. Beyond safety we want them to have a skill set so that they feel like they can respond to these issues and navigate them in a way that's appropriate. Not just TK-12 but for college and beyond, for the workplace, for when they get to college so they're not surprised by these issues. So, they again can stay safe but that they can have a language for dealing with these issues and for really feeling empowered on these issues.

Ms. Higgins: I was just going to add in there that part of this going down through the levels is that we're including parents at every step of the way. So, when we're doing education at school that we're also trying to bring that to parents, so that they can be modeling it at home and that they understand this language around consent that we're using. That's very important to us and that we also find ways to do that, that we can connect with different communities in our schools. That's sometimes challenging but that's very important to us.

Ms. Hendricks: Exactly and I think to some extent we're looking for a part-time shift about what does the language of consent mean because it means different things in age-appropriate forums. Being in classrooms last year I could see these conversations happening from a TK-5 level as well as middle school and high school. They just weren't necessarily identified as part of this topic but in terms of curriculum and instruction, our young students are talking about my body rules. They are talking about how to sit and not touch each other, how to ask if they can borrow a toy or play tag or that type of thing. They are having conversations about gender stereotypes in elementary school and so the thread of curriculum and instruction runs through this from a TK to 12 level. We're used to that noise here, right?

Council Member Wolbach: Yes.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Ms. Hendricks: Ok good.

Council Member Wolbach: (inaudible)

Ms. Hendricks: Ok good, thank you. Yes, exactly. We did want to make sure that through strategic planning were able to capture all these pieces of curriculum and instruction. So, it's been really exciting in the last month we've had Anaya Boge [phonetics] meet with (I just renamed her) our Chief Academic Officer of Elementary Education as well as some representative elementary principals to talk about what can this work look like in our elementary schools as well. We do believe it's really a system-wide structure and initiative that we're looking at.

Mr. Fitton: Anaya came in the fall too, to talk to parents, student leaders, and teachers about ok, we did this last year. It was a big program, a big presentation, now what can we do to make it better and getting feedback so that there's a continuous loop of feedback between students, between parents, between teachers. Ok, we think this would work better or that would work better and that's part of the process this year.

Ms. Higgins: Another point to add in that another group of students who are often over looked in is students with special needs. That is very much in our consciousness because we know those students are actually at much higher risk of sexual assault and abuse. Also, that they also are sometimes perpetrators and that they actually need the education even more. They are very explicit language and behaviors around consent but to be done in a way that's appropriate. So, that's just another group because I think that group gets forgotten and actually there are very high needs in this area and that's on our minds.

Ms. Hendricks: We want all students to have ready access to this language. That empowers them to respect themselves and respect others. We collect quite a bit of data around this topic and I didn't want to bring to much here tonight to overwhelm the conversation but one of the things that I wanted to point out and we can flip through a few slides maybe – oh Michelle that's you.

Ms. Higgins: Is it that one?

Ms. Hendricks: No, we'll keep going. We're going onto the...

Ms. Higgins: Forward?

Ms. Hendricks: ... please describe the reason for concern that kept you from reporting. We asked students about their experiences at school when they've experienced harassment, witnessed harassment, collect data on that. Then we unpacked that and we asked our students on the next slide please describe reasons for concern that keep you from reporting? We want to know and understand why our students may not be letting us know if something happening in terms of sexual misconduct that they are not sharing with somebody that provide support. We broke that down and you'll see it's I don't need help or I don't want attention or publicity. You know I don't want to make things worse or be retaliated against. The process doesn't work, isn't effective that's 26.56 and we need to unpack that with students about what didn't work or what

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

do you fear wouldn't work so that we can figure out how to design a process that does feel like it works for our students. We thought what happen was all in good playful fun, so that goes to helping students from that basis or normalizing behaviors of misconduct and that we do not want them to feel they're acceptable for themselves or others. The reporting process is a pain or its just normal behavior. Good data gives us questions instead of answers and this gives us great questions to go back to kids and work on them in terms of unpacking. Our research assessment division is involved in this collection of data. We have multiple surveys that go out to students, Staff, and parents to collect perspectives. We're going to keep unpacking data and working to really address things that students are experiencing, the impact and the reasons why they did not report. I wanted to share some final recommendations and some next steps and I think we'll probably all join in those things. The RISE Task Force had provided some recommendations for next steps. For students it's we can do that too.

Ms. Higgins: Do you want it back or?

Ms. Hendricks: No, that one's good, let's do that one. What we have coming up because you can see there's a tremendous amount going on right now and there has been all fall. Our middle school staff are being trained right now, we had the first one yesterday. I think that was at Fletcher -- if I'm correct -- Middle School. We have Green Middle school and JLS coming up. We have parent community nights coming up, November 28th and December 6th. These nights are designed to be appropriate for parents of all students, K-12. Michelle, you can probably talk a little bit because you've been helping with some of the communication messaging around that. She's also got a communication expertise too outside of law.

Ms. Higgins: Well, I think that we're really trying to encourage parents to come and that's actually a hard task. We've had a number of parent sessions and getting the right language for parents to feel like it's important for them. Especially parents of younger children because I think if we can start early and get parents thinking about these issues and getting more comfortable around the language, we're going to do a better job as they move up through the grades. We've scheduled two sessions on these dates, the 28th and the 6th. They are actually aimed at parents from TK-12 and it's a little bit of an experiment because we've before done just high or just middle school. This is going to be much more of an overview and hopefully, Anaya is able to sift through the different age-appropriate ways of discussing these issues, so we'll see how that goes. We're hoping to get a good turn out and get parents engaged and really caring about these issues and understanding it's relevant to them.

Ms. Hendricks: We think if we can articulate the fact that this is a conversation that does from K-12, it's not an isolated conversation but it really impacts students developmentally the whole way along. The December 6th parent community night, we're moving into our Paly pack and we are hoping to invite neighboring districts to join in with us, so we'll be broadcasting and inviting wide on that. I'd love you send you information about that as well and have you or any community members come and join in the conversations with us. Our high school work continues on December 5th, 6th, and 7th; that's with high school students. The middle school students will be working with Anaya Boge on December 11th and 12th and then the elementary school alignment is unfolding. What I want to really emphasize is just the fact that our partnerships with the community and with neighboring districts remain extremely important to

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

us, the input is important, and we're just pleased to be here to share the journey. I don't think any of us would say that we will ever be near feeling like we're at the end of a journey or even incredibly successful with the journey because it's the hard work and it's the important work. I think we share the feeling that it's too important not to take on and keep moving forward. That is the goal of this group as it expands. Anything you'd like to add to closure?

Mr. Fitton: You know one thing that you may have read about that was hooked into Stanford, Brenda Tracy came and spoke with the Stanford football team at David Shaw's suggestion. Brenda was a victim of sexual assault and was it was very powerful with their student leaders last year. This year she came back to Stanford but also came across the street and talked with Paly students. The football team, under the direction of the football coach, the Paly Athletic Director, had taken on Brenda's pledge of what they stand for among other things standing up and into the issues of sexism and sexual harassment and sexual assault. These are our high school football players who are taking this pledge so it was noted in a prominent San Francisco Chronicle article that Paly High School was the only high school that did this. Other colleges had and the Cal Football coach called it the most important meeting he has had or will ever have with his players when Brenda came and spoke. I think that's powerful for our community when our high school players are taking that stand and that's just one segment of what's going on in the district.

Ms. Higgins: You just reminded of just one other thing is that we have a number of student's ambassadors now with One Love and One Love is an organization of prevention around intimate partner violence and teen dating violence. They – it's named after Yeardeley Love who was murdered by her boyfriend in college, so the family set up this foundation. They have a film and then they actually played at the Aquarius so it was open to the community and then their leaders run discussions with the people that are attending. They have discussions aimed at adults but also at teens and the teen ambassadors get trained so they can run the workshops with other teens. It's very empowering and I think that actually there was a question on Facebook about well, is this about domestic violence – they didn't use that term but I think that's what they meant as well and it's like it's all connected. We recognize that so One Love is just another – John talked a lot of about student empowerment and that's another way we're trying to give – hand it over to the kids to do that work.

Chair Stinger: Thank you for sharing so much of that. I am so impressed with the depth of work, the depth of research you're bringing in to identifying the problem and taking solutions forward. I particularly liked your phrase of mentors, peers, and protectors of each other. That's a great asset to give our young people as they go forward into the challenge of relationships on many fronts. There are two speaker cards and I want to make sure that we get those in before we turn the thank you's over to the Commission. The first is Kathy Jordan, is this right?

Ms. Kathy Jordan: Thank you to the Commission. Is this supposed to be on?

Ms. van der Zwaag: There you go.

Ms. Jordan: Is that it? Ok. Thank you to the Commission for letting us speak. I'd like to thank our fellow parents for their service on the RISE Task Force. What you've heard tonight is about

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

what the district is doing. The RISE Task Force is doing work that is needed, yes but what is lacking in this presentation is an actual reality check about the very real systematic problems in the school district itself that continue to this day. We would also like to see some positive action as you discussed and actually petition the Human Relations Commission participate in creating that needed positive action. We would like others who have suffered injustices in the past, not actually address what happened and what is happening doesn't move any of us closer to a solution. We first much acknowledge the problems before we can fix them. Both the Office for Civil Rights and the District Commission Cozen Report identifies systemic issues within Palo Alto Unified causing non-compliance with state and federal laws governing the school districts to require a response to sexual harassment and assault. People say that's all in the past, let's move past the past. Well, that's not true; it's not in the past. According to the districts own report on the one incident and according to the family of the other sexual assault victim that came out through the media, neither of our current high school principals responded appropriately to sexual harassment incidents that occurred, yet they were promoted. What message does that send to students and to our community? What message does it send when the districts own publication ignores its own District Commission report about one of the incidents, which documents that the 14-year old student made a report of sexual assault to both Paly counselors and Paly staff but instead that district publication published that the incident was consensual. The incident involving a 14-year old student, a minor who cannot legally consent and who also said that she did not consent to those Paly counselors, to the Paly staff, to the police to KTVU and to the Mercury News. What message does it send when these inaccurate and damaging statements continue on the school publications website as of today or when they're published in seven different articles delivered to the doorstep of approximately 1,000 Paly households seven different times? None of these statements have actually been disavowed or retracted and this violates Ed. Code Law that specifies that the teacher advisor must ensure that the district's publications meet professional journalism standards. What about these adults who should have been supervising the district publication? Public record shows that the teacher advisor was withholding information to be sent to students that were unfavorable to the former Paly principle. Public records also show that teacher advisor discussing the district publications messaging strategy for coverage of that sexual assault incident with the former Superintendent and the former Paly principle. Messaging strategy that includes saying KTVU got the story wrong.

Chair Stinger: Thank you. I have a second card, Keith Furey.

Mr. Keith Furey: Is it three minutes?

Ms. van der Zwaag: Yes three minutes.

Chair Stinger: Yes, please.

Mr. Furey: Ok, I'll give it a shot. Where do I hit a button?

Ms. van der Zwaag: No, you're fine.

Mr. Furey: I'm good?

Ms. van der Zwaag: You're good.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Mr. Furey: Ok. So, I took a quick look at your website and found this in the first paragraph. The Human Relations Commission is charged with the discretion to act with respect to any human relations matter when the Commission finds that any person or group does not benefit fully from public or private opportunities or resources in the community or is unfairly or differently treated due to factors of concern to the Commission. I think the events that have been going on throughout PAUSD should be of great interest and concern to this Commission -- you're welcome -- and I hope that you will take a more active role in how the district handles itself. I'm here to talk about the overall culture -- I'm sorry if I talk fast -- of harassment within PAUSD. While the formation of the RISE Task Force is highly publicized and has great intentions, it also tends to make the community believe that all is well in the district's harassment and reporting issues behind us. Let's see, RISE has presented on their efforts to promote a culture in which sexual assault, violence, and harassment are not engaged nor tolerated. However, there are many examples, John touched on this, that there's a culture of self-survival and positive optics engrained in the system and the staff throughout the district. I'll give a few examples; first the principles at both high schools have been publicly chastised by the Law Firm Cozen O'Connor for not following proper Title 9 procedures when they were assistant principals. Yet both were promoted to principle and one by the current Assistant Superintendent. The district, including the Board, was aware of their transgressions prior to them being promoted yet they were still given more responsibility. Secondly, the teacher advisor of the Palo Alto School paper, the Campanile, has allowed the paper to continually publish articles that an on-campus assault was consensual even though the victim has stated, as Kathy said, that she told the boy no multiple times and was forced into the act because she feared that she would be hit if she didn't. Many, including Board Member Todd Collins as well as many of the members of the RISE Task Force, have called the articles wrong and unacceptable and they constitute spreading sexual rumors which is forbidden by Board policy. The paper claims first amendment rights but that does not mean that they can publish anything they want. Now we think the goal of the school paper is to teach students how to be a responsible journalist and not to be merely a mechanism of propaganda for the school. The advisor Esther Wojcicki has stated that they based information about consensuality in a police report even though the records are sealed and either the Palo Alto Weekly or the Mercury News reported that the incident was consensual because records were sealed. Ms. Wojcicki has yet to offer any proof of the statements that were given or any reason for the ones that were reporting which was no doubt intended to make the school and the former principle come out in a positive light. Looking at the current UCP Log there's even a complaint of sexual harassment at the District Office. These are supposed to be the people setting policies against harassment, not increasing the incidents. I know RISE Task Force also believes there's work to be done -- I will stop that so, until the culture is changed within, very little will improve. I can give more personal examples of all that have occurred within the past 6-months that showed that the district is still more concerned about its image than it is about accountability. Awe, so close, thank you.

Chair Stinger: Thank you to both of the oral speakers. We are significantly behind but if any of the Commissioners want to make a quick statement or a question, please?

Commissioner Lee: So, I want to thank the RISE Task Force for coming. One of the reasons I had requested a presentation, I think it's very evident in 2018, both what's happening locally and nationally in incidences that get a lot of publicity but also incidences that don't get a lot of

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

publicity in just the day to day experience of folks in our community, makes it quite clear that there's an issue. It's an issue that doesn't just happen on campus, it happens everywhere in our community, and so we share a responsibility with the school district in helping to bring about these cultural changes and taking action. I really like the last point on the current slide about partnerships remain important and so my first question is regarding how the city can support, compliment, and add value to some of the efforts that you're currently working on as they are aimed towards students and to their parents? The second piece of that question is how might we work together or learn from your experiences to address these larger issues for folks who are non-students or non-parents in our community because it definitely requires all of use to address these issues?

Ms. Hendricks: I appreciate your time and the question very much. In the interest of time, we do have a workgroup that's formed to specifically work on issues of partnerships and community collaboration. We'd be glad to bring those folks together and strategize on ways we could come back to you and give you information on about how we could join forces with you because we do agree it's a community issue. So, we would love to get back to you with some thoughts on that and also just to invite you and welcome you to any of the work that we're currently doing as well.

Commissioner Lee: Fantastic. My second question and you probably won't be able to answer it all tonight but one of the slides mentioned an MOU that you're working on with the Palo Alto Police Department. I'm wondering if you could provide a top-level summary on what's involved with that.

Ms. Hendricks: The MOU with the Palo Alto Police Department? So, we've had an MOU in existence with the Palo Alto PD for some time now. What we've done is we've updated to bring it current and bring it forward to extend it an additional year. We've also added an exhibit that's specific to the work that we do around Title 9 issues and to delineate what that work looks like. That will be on the Board Agenda next Tuesday night for discussion.

Commissioner Lee: For staff, is that an MOU that is adopted by City Council as well in addition to the Board since it involves the Palo Alto...

Ms. Hendricks: I believe it is. The City Council had reviewed it; I believe in September and proved approval.

Commissioner Lee: September, ok, got it.

Ms. Hendricks: We took it back and did some additional work on it based on what we were looking at with our OCR Resolution Agreement. We now have it broken into a general scope of agreements and a scope of agreement related to Title 9 issues, so that will be coming in for discussion.

Ms. Higgins: I don't know if you mind me jumping on this...

Ms. Hendricks: No, please.

Ms. Higgins: ...but there are some parents active about the MOU with the police department

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

separate from the sexual harassments that the OCR Report in terms of issues around RICE in particular. I just would appreciate actually, attention to that as well, but it's separate. I'm not going to go into that now but it's something to be aware of that we need to be thinking about these bigger issues too.

Ms. Hendricks: Yes and the good...

Ms. Higgins: I'm sorry to...

Ms. Hendricks: No, that's great and the good questions that come up are around what is identified as the scope of work? Then what is separate in terms of a protocol and practice or procedure for an entity like the police department and how to keep those specific to the entities involved?

Commissioner Lee: So, one follow-up question, so it sounds like there's some revisions being made. Is that going to come back to the Council at some point?

Ms. van der Zwaag: I can't answer that, I can look into that but it seems like it's an agreement between the two entities at the Council and the Board level.

Commissioner Lee: Sure, but this body advises the Council on (inaudible) issues. I'll leave it at that but thank you very much for...

Ms. van der Zwaag: Well that body requests the review by this body.

Ms. Hendricks: Right, I think the police department will be looking at it to see if those changes are substantive from what was approved originally and I believe there will be a recommendation from them based on that.

Chair Stinger: I want to thank each of you for what you've done and what you've accomplished over the past year. I'm looking forward to following the progress this year.

Ms. Hendricks: Thank you so much.

Mr. Fitton: Thank you for your time.

Ms. Hendricks: Yes, thank you for having us, we appreciate it, thanks.

3. Art Center Request for Letter of Support for New Americans Artists Residency Program Grant Proposal

Chair Stinger: We'll move on to the Palo Alto Art Center and hi.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Do you want to sit at the end?

Ms. Lucy Larson: Sure and will I reach..

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Ms. van der Zwaag: What's easiest for you? You can sit right there so you can see the PowerPoint.

Ms. van der Zwaag: This is Lucy Larson, the Director of Education from the Art Center, who will be bringing us an update about a grant opportunity the Art Center went for last year and they weren't able to secure the grant. So, they are re-framing it and now want to come back to the HRC for hopefully your approval of a letter of support, so I'll turn it over right now.

Ms. Larson: Thank you for having us here tonight and our request to the HRC is to draft a letter in support of the Palo Alto Art Center and the library proposal for a New American's Artist and Residency Program. This is to the Institute of Museum and Library Services. IMLS is the largest funders of museums and libraries in the United States. It's a very competitive grant process and it's a peer review process. As you mentioned we have been here before, we requested a letter last year and you created the support letter. We submitted the proposal and unfortunately, our proposal was declined. However, we received valuable feedback from our peer reviewers. Most reviewers shared that the proposal was very strong, wished that we addressed a few issues which we have done for our new proposal. New Americans, the vision for the program is it's a collaborative art residency initiative between the Palo Alto Art Center and the Palo Alto Library that builds upon the transformative powers of art to develop community among immigrants in Silicon Valley. It builds off of the library New American Program and expands it with additional funding for materials, translation services, and outreach. The key audiences for this program are families, children, adults, seniors, teachers who participate in our Project Look field trip program and artists. The project goal is to build upon the power of art to connect new Americans to the Palo Alto community, to create multi-tier opportunities, community access, practicing artists and their artistic processes, to promote and explore empathy for others particularly those of diverse backgrounds, to empower the public, to explore art as a tool for self-expression and connection, to build and showcase the capacity of each artist to engage their community, to create opportunities for immigrants to practice language skills and access civic resources, to expand and diversify audiences for the Art Center and library. The project activities, essentially, we will have artist residencies. We will choose two different artists, each residency will be 1-year long, the artist will attend ESL classes and conversation groups and other New American's programming which currently takes place at the library, they will meet with Art Center and library staff to develop programming and then offer free art-making workshops at Mitchell Park Library for New American audiences. Our vision is two per month for a total of each artist. There will also be an exhibition at the Art Center. Each artist will work in the glass gallery, which is the small gallery off of the lobby in the Art Center, to create an installation that involves the artwork that the community created in the workshops as well as the artist's own work. So, there will be a final exhibition and we will give school tours of the exhibition. We run approximately 5,000 students through our school program annually and we also have family days that serve additional 1,500 or 2,000 people annually. The project activities will also expand the New American's Program at the library providing funding for additional staffing, materials, and outreach. We wanted to share two potential artists that we are looking as the artist residences for this project. The first is Cathy Lu. Her work revolves around the manipulation, appropriation, and de-contextualization of traditional Chinese art imagery and presentation. She explores how Eastern imagery is seen and understood in the U.S. and how ideas of cultural authenticity and

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

tradition interface contemporary transcultural experiences. Her materials are rooted in traditional Chinese art, working mostly in ceramic-based sculpture and watercolors. She draws inspiration from the displays at the Asian Art Museum, fruit markets and Chinese immigrant neighborhood and trinket shop in China Town. This installation you see here references a display in the Asian Art Museum in San Francisco which is a replica of display shelf from the Forbidden Palace in the Peoples Republic of China. The second possible artist is Yulia Pinkusevich. Yulia's background is rooted in change. She was born and raised in USSR and when she came to the United States her understanding of rules and social status were turned upside down. She learned to adapt and observe things carefully. The homogenization of culture through increasing globalization became a prime focus for her and her work began to reflect her study of population growth and urban architecture. I'll share an artist quote from Yulia, "The rapid spread of urban life is not visible throughout the plant. In the last century, the built environment has grown ever taller and denser. Daily life is now physically framed through an architectural lens. By breaking logical perspective, I create illusions of impossible spaces. Non-places that shift the viewpoint to the panoptic." So, I'm happy to take any questions that you may have about the project.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: Do you promote participation by kids or students or is that part of the New American's Program?

Ms. Larson: Recently we held listening sessions at two conversation groups at the Mitchell Park Library; ESL conversation groups as well as at the Palo Alto Adult School. We went to their ESL classes and talked to them about the project. Our goal is that the artists would go into the library; meet the people who are coming to these conversation groups and ESL classes. Then along with education staff and curators at the Art Center and library staff who specialize in these kinds of programs, they would plan these art-making workshops and who they are for. The ESL groups that I went to as well as the adult school really expressed a strong interest in family programming. They wanted it on the weekend, they wanted it when they could come and do something together as a family. We are definitely planning to provide family programs at the library on the weekends. There was also an interest in programs that don't involve children for people who are maybe new to our community or young who don't have families of their own and are looking for alternatives to going to bars or things like that. Those are our plans at the Mitchell Park Library.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: Thank you.

Ms. Larson: You're welcome.

Chair Stinger: I guess I'd like to ask a question. Is there anything you learned from submitting the proposal last year that would help us or help you going forward with this second proposal?

Ms. Larson: We narrowed the scope of the project based on feedback, so initially we had planned to serve teen audiences through our Art Center Teen Leadership Group and have conversations groups at the Art Center to enhance language skills. We received feedback that it was too broad and so they asked us to narrow our scope and to narrow our focus which we have done this year then also to really think about the communities of New Americans that live here and so I specifically asked that question at the ESL conversation groups. Is it important for you to see

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

artists from your own community and it was interesting because the responses overwhelmingly said no that they saw this as an opportunity to learn about people from other places. While our goal is to represent the communities that are in Palo Alto, it's also to create an environment of conversation and dialog and openness and build empathy for people from different communities. Our plan is to also be broad and inclusive.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: Would there be a reward or motivation? What are you doing for the people to continue to engage after the artist show up? Just why would they want to because I'm thinking they may not find it interesting depending on the artist's personality or there's so many different issues when you're trying to get a group together. What other interests or alignments that would apply to New American groups or children or teenagers or high school going kids? Why would they want to participate with this group?

Ms. Larson: Well, we did receive very positive feedback from the ESL conversation groups at the Mitchell Park Library. That they were very interested in Art Center programming but had never been to the Art Center or had never even heard of it. By taking the Art Center outside of the Art Center actually to a new environment, our hope is to connect these communities with one of the cultural resources in Palo Alto. The Art Center is always free; we have exhibitions of contemporary artists for local, national, and international artists. So, our hope is really to introduce the Art Center to a new audience. The Art Center offers free family days and our free exhibition openings, Friday Nights at the Art Center, and we participated in the YMCA Welcome Week initiative. Our hope is to introduce ourselves and to really welcome communities that may not know about us or what we offer.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: Thank you.

Ms. Larson: You're welcome.

Commissioner Lee: I just have one quick comment. I really appreciate everything you all are working on. I'd be very curious to hear after this initiative how effective it was in terms of trying to introduce the Art Center to new communities or aspects of the community who may not have been aware or utilized that. So, to the extent that we have the time it would be great to have you come back and give us an update on how it's going.

Ms. Larson: I think we would welcome that and we have an evaluation component built into our grant so we will have information to share.

Chair Stinger: A question to the...

Vice Chair O'Nan: Microphone.

Chair Stinger: ... Commission is would we want to write a letter of support to include in the proposal?

Ms. van der Zwaag: Right and I think to authorize the Chair to sign on behalf of the Commission. That would be part of it.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Chair Stinger: May I have a motion?

MOTION

Commissioner Lee: I move to authorize the Chair to write and sign a letter on behalf of the Commission in support of the New Americans Artist Residency Program grant proposal.

SECOND

Commissioner Xue: Second.

Chair Stinger: Would you accept an amendment?

Vice Chair O’Nan: Microphone.

Commissioner Lee: Yes.

Chair Stinger: I keep going the wrong way, thank you Commissioner O’Nan. Could I have help writing the letter?

Commissioner Lee: Of course.

Vice Chair O’Nan: Yes, sure, I can write it.

Chair Stinger: We have a motion that a letter will be written by the Chair and a Commissioner in support of the Art Center’s proposal.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Right and I think you can look – as a key – the letter you wrote the last time and maybe just provide some updates to that letter as you see fit instead of doing a completely new work if you so choose.

Commissioner Brahmhatt: We would welcome if you want to give reference to the letter that we gave last year, please feel free to redline it and send it to the Commission. Then we’ll give you a revised version.

Ms. Larson: I appreciate that.

Commissioner Brahmhatt: Yes because you got some feedback and you’re changing your proposal so depending on that, whatever you are probably on a very good position to know what needs to be changed in the letter.

Ms. Larson: Thank you.

Commissioner Lee: If I could ask one clarification question? Assuming that the grant is accepted, would it be appropriate for us to ask that when that happens that the Commission or the

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

City promote it in any way or promote the...

Ms. van der Zwaag: We can certainly if it is approved, I'm sure the Art Center would appreciate any collaboration with this Commission, with the Library Commission to help bring folks to maybe some of these outdoor sessions. Also, when the artists are actually in residences at the Art Center, so I'm sure that's possible.

Commissioner Lee: Do we need to do that now or do we do it later or do we need to do it at all?

Ms. van der Zwaag: I don't think there's any motion that's necessary. That's just a jester collegiality to get the word out.

Commissioner Lee: If we wanted to is it endorse? The Commissioner can endorse an event or we can't co-sponsor but we can endorse an event?

Ms. van der Zwaag: You can certainly endorse an event, yes.

Commissioner Lee: Should we do that now if the Commission wanted or wait?

Vice Chair O'Nan: You need to wait.

Commissioner Lee: Ok.

Ms. van der Zwaag: I would wait till they do it because we want them to get it but let's wait until that happens.

Commissioner Lee: Ok, ok.

Ms. van der Zwaag: One step at a time.

Ms. Larson: It's a very long process too. The grant is due in December and we will hear next September.

Commissioner Lee: Ok.

Ms. Larson: So, there's no urgency to your endorsement, although we would welcome it.
Chair Stinger: Well, there's a lot of other activities that we can endorse but, in the meantime, there's a motion and second and an amendment. May I have a vote? All in favor of writing a letter of support? Any opposed?

MOTION PASSED 5-0 WITH COMMISSIONERS KRALIK AND SMITH ABSENT

Council Member Wolbach: Has the motion been seconded?

Ms. van der Zwaag: Yes, it is.

Commissioner Lee: Yes.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Council Member Wolbach: Oh, I'm sorry.

Chair Stinger: Thank you.

Ms. Larson: Thank you all, I appreciate it.

Chair Stinger: Thank you, we're looking forward to a – thank you for asking us.

4. Human Services Resources Allocation Process (HSRAP) Listening Forum- Presentation by Abilities United.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Do you want to sit here or there, where ever you want to sit Sohelia.

Ms. Sohelia Razbar: Is it alright if I sit here so I can see the...

Ms. van der Zwaag: Ok, sounds good.

Ms. Razbar: Thank you, sir.

Chair Stinger: We welcome Abilities United to help us with our Listening Forum as we learn about the new programs that our grantees are taking forward.

Ms. Razbar: Yes.

Chair Stinger: Please introduce yourself.

Ms. Razbar: Absolutely. Thank you so much for the wonderful work you all are doing and making our city really become a really great city. My name is Sohelia Razbar and I'm Vice President of Programs here at Abilities United. We serve people with disabilities; mainly developmental disabilities and we also have some services for physical and learning disabilities. I'm sure you may know that we started 55-years ago and every day we try to do every innovative and creative way to serve the families. What really separates us I feel like is really doing a quality job and we wouldn't have been able to do this without your ongoing support. My main reason coming here and taking your time, I just want to thank you on behalf of our Board, of our staff, the people we serve and their families for your ongoing support because we wouldn't be able to exist. It's really, really hard running a non-profit with the expensive housing costs and having a hard time to hire qualified people. We wouldn't be able to make it work without your support. You may know that we have different programs in our agency but I just briefly wanted to tell you about new things we're doing. As you may know, we're serving infant and kids with therapeutic services and also early intervention services. We go to their homes if they prefer and we try to really help families come together. When a parent for the first time hears that they have a child with disabilities they are going through really, really hard situations. If we were able to just only provide services, we haven't been able to be successful. We try to bring families together by offering support for the family and these things we're doing they are not reimbursable. There are Regional Centers, we work with them over the referrals and work that

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

we do with the families is not part of the services. So, we don't get reimbursed but we do it like your mission. You wanted to create a great place that everybody can work and together well and have a diverse community. We really wanted to take pride in doing the work that we're doing and helping you to create really a community that the City of Palo Alto can really be recognized for diversity, good work, and quality. I want to tell you that we're not only getting awards every year from different places. We had during this past couple year we had visitors from South Korea, Australia, Russia and they really wanted to learn our model. We also got invited by the delegates from Russia to go to their countries because they were very surprised how we're doing the employment. We're regularly going to local corporations like LinkedIn and Google and doing presentations on how they can make their work environment very diverse. Because of this work we have been able to place 54 people last year during one fiscal year with almost less than a full-time job through our (inaudible) as you may imagine the non-profit worlds. Also, you may know that we produce a TV program here at Mid-Pen to just educate our community. One of the very recent works that we have done is podcast because keeping the family together, nurturing them, they're feeling how we can do more with less? Yes, and realize that if we have a podcast or TV programs we can be at the homes of the parents when they're exhausted when they feel like there is no hope in the world. They can just turn it on and it's a very quick 10-minutes. You can find it; it's Solutions, the name of the podcast. I think if you search for it, you will see it. We just started our first one so we're really trying to do our best with limited resources we have to really do more. Apart from the people that we serve in our Day Program and in our Community Connections program, they do volunteer. If they are not able to work or they are not ready for work, they are volunteering and giving back to their city. We're working at Ronald McDonald House, Avenidas, local YMCA, and the School of Music. They are trying to get to know the city very well and really knowing that it's also their responsibility to make this city better. Thank you so much for everything you are doing and it's great to be a part of this. Next time I come I'm going to bring you some videos with some pictures because I feel like you're all working so hard. That it's just great to just see you in person, thank you. I'm ready for any questions you have.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: I didn't have any questions. I just wanted to comment that I have personally experienced the kindness and generosity from all the instructors at Abilities United. We were part of the swimming lessons and when they closed was very sad part for my family...

Ms. Razbar: Yes, absolutely.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: ... personally but it has been great. Whatever interactions that I've had with Abilities United it's above and beyond.

Ms. Razbar: Thank you, I appreciate hearing that. Thank you so much and for those you, you may not know, we were at 525 E. Charleston. It's your home, you can just come, give me a call and I'll give you a tour. Just if you want to stop by, please do that.

Commissioner Lee: I just wanted to thank you for everything that you're doing and since you have boots on the ground, I wanted to see if there are any emerging needs or any things that you are observing that you haven't observed in the past? Related to that, if there's anything that the city or the Commission can do to further assist some of the efforts that you're working on?

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Ms. Razbar: Thank you so much for saying that, I could keep you for the rest of time. No, one of the biggest things is that having the unemployment rate so low now, we're really having challenges with hiring quality people. I strongly believe that the health of our city is in social services we have. We're you're soldiers in any work you're doing so we're all on this together, yes? How we can be part of something you're doing so people can see that we do a lot of good collaboration like with the City of Palo Alto we run the afterschool program and so on. How this can be known as something you're also supporting like Abilities United. Expertise that for a special major that is sometimes that becomes very, very hard on us. We have always parents who want to get more services and we can't hire enough therapists and we can't hire enough life coaches or swim instructors and we're very flexible. If someone wanted to come on board and work 5-hours a week, we're ok with that. We're very flexible because for us, it's the impact we're doing, that's what's more important. How we can find a way to serve? To be honest with you, if I may say this, sometimes I get worried that we're going to die because it's so expensive. They cannot afford to come and work at a non-profit. I get very, very worried that how long we can continue doing it on the good heart of the people we have. They make personal sacrifices to become a part of us, so I'm so happy for your question and I'm sure you may be able to help us to find a solution. Thank you.

Commissioner Lee: Thank you.

Chair Stinger: Any other comments or questions of our guest? I wanted to thank you. The participants in the Listening Forums have been very helpful for us to understand the depth of the progress that you've made and also the challenges you face. An employee hiring and retention is clearly something that's difficult. I respect you for taking that challenge and wish we could come up with a magic pill that would make it easier for each of the agencies because you do such good work in the City. Thank you.

Ms. Razbar: Thanks for your time.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Thank you, Soheila.

5. Review of the 2018 Human Services Needs Assessment Survey results and recommendations on the draft FY2020-21 Human Services Resources Allocation Process.

Chair Stinger: We'll move onto the next agenda item that will take us from a specific HSRAP agency to a review of the Needs Assessment Survey and I'll turn that over to you, Minka.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Thank you. I just want to give a quick overview of my Staff Report and include something that I don't believe I actually included in my Staff Report and that is the goal and philosophy of HSRAP. I think Vice Chair O'Nan may be the only one in the room that was here when we articulated this several years ago; I think 2012. The primary goal of HSRAP is to meet the need and improve the quality of low income and vulnerable populations while considering and addressing the financial, social, cultural, sociological, and physical barriers that prevent residents of the Palo Alto community from accessing and assessing the human services

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

they need. HSRAP, Human Services Resource Allocation Process, applications go out every 2-years and we're upon that time. So, each time before the HSRAP process happens we do some kind of needs assessment. You saw in my Staff Report in 2012 we did a huge needs assessment that was worthy of a consultant and we did it with Commissioner O'Nan, Commissioner Bacchetti, and a couple other past Commissioners. It was quite a feat of undertaking of which I was very proud as staff to be a part of. Since that time, we've done lower scale analysis, speaking to grantees and to persons, sending out surveys to our grantees but also to other human service non-profits in the community. This year we sent it out to 30 recipients, 19 responses and you were given the results to look at. I just want to give you a couple cautions in your discussions tonight and hopefully took in your analysis of the results in that the results are only a snapshot into the needs based on the providers we heard from. Also, just because an issue is not mentioned as a need, that doesn't mean it's not a need. It just could mean that the level of service that's available, even generally in the community or thanks to HSRAP funding, is sufficient. If that funding was taken away there may be a crisis. Digging a little deeper into the results, so as with the last results in 2016 affordable housing was the top need as Soheila just illustrated. We're talking not just for clients but for employers who are having a real tough time finding employees. I think last time Leaf Erikson at YCS said of his staff of 4 to 5, two of them were in their 30's and still living with their parents because otherwise, they couldn't afford to work for a non-profit in the community. While I believe affordable housing is a huge need in our community, I believe it's beyond the capacity of HSRAP to address with current funding. I believe by adding it to the priority of needs sends a false hope to applying agencies that we would be able to make a significant impact in that area. I want to quickly go over the issue of refugee resettlement. When you discussed the Council's Resolution on a Safe, Protective, Inclusive Community, Amnesty International came and in your deliberations, you said well, when HSRAP comes around maybe we'll consider adding refugee resettlement as a category in the priority of needs. I did some research into that and believe that it's an extremely important issue. I looked at multiple years of county social services data on their Refugee Cash Assistance Program, never anybody in Palo Alto. I called the two largest agencies in the county that do refugee resettlement, Catholic Charities and Jewish Family Services, and neither of them for years have settled anybody in Palo Alto because of the cost of living. So, while I think it's a huge need countywide, California wide, I think again with the limited amount of funding that HSRAP has, my recommendation as staff is that it not be added due to not a demonstrated need for that service in our community. Some of the other categories that are listed are ready as far as food assistance, cash assistance, mental health assistance, and those would apply to anybody of any category if they came to an agency. If you do bring up a need to be considered I would like you to be able to articulate the demonstrated need and how it would not already be covered in the priority of needs as currently listed. My recommendation is to approve the priority of need as written but I'd like to go over the discussion as follows. First, I'd like to open it up for any questions about the report, the demographics, or the current priority of needs. Then I'd like to hear any suggestions for additions or deletions and then I'd like to hear a motion to provide a recommendation. It does need to happen at tonight's meeting because the RFP, Request for Proposal, for HSRAP goes out in 2-weeks. So, that decision needs to be made tonight, so I welcome any questions that you have.

Commissioner Lee: My first question in terms of the priority of needs, is it typically unranked as such? Has it always been...

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Ms. van der Zwaag: There is no priority given as far as one is more important than the other. What we do is when the Committee that reviews HSRAP, Mary usually makes a grid and she indicates for the Commissioners that are reviewing what falls in which category. There's ranking as far as different priorities are far as a review like if they've completed their proposal or if they're meeting a priority of need. The individual priority of needs, there's not one that's more important than the other. I would caution one thing I would say about that is if there was a question like oh, should we do that one or that one? I'd go back to the goals and a philosophy of HSRAP that I mentioned earlier that says the primary goal of HSRAP is to meet the needs and improve the quality life of low income and vulnerable populations. The second part, while it was my understanding that the group that wrote the goals and philosophy that was an informal first tier and second tier. The first primary goal was to meet the needs of low income and vulnerable populations.

Commissioner Lee: That first tier is a very broad category and...

Ms. van der Zwaag: It certainly is.

Commissioner Lee: ... a lot of these categories are very broad as well.

Ms. van der Zwaag: It is, there have been discussions in the past about narrowing down the HSRAP categories. When the 2012 assessment occurred, there was no consensus from that subcommittee or from the HRC as a whole that there was any desire to limit the categories at all.

Commissioner Lee: So, if the Commission wanted to have a discussion about either limiting the categories or otherwise ranking them, when in the process would that conversation have been? I'm guessing it's too late for this round.

Ms. van der Zwaag: I would say it's too late. I would not recommend doing that with the amount of data that we only got from 19 agencies. What I indicated in the report is that what I am trying to do is raise the conversation internally with my department is to see if I am able to get funding to have a consultant do a more professional needs assessment. What we did in 2012, again we investigated all these cities that did needs assessments in the community and they all used professional consultants. We're the only hands-on, ground, grassroots kind of effort. I believe if I'm able to get funding for that and we take a very thorough look at it, then I think that conversation about limiting the scope -- I would feel a lot better about doing that then just based on anecdotal information though important information from 19 individuals.

Commissioner Lee: When would we know whether you're getting a consultant and when would we -- assuming you got...

Ms. van der Zwaag: I'd have to be in conversation with my department Director and looking in our budget. I'd have to see fiscal years exactly when that would happen but that usually happens at least a year in advance.

Chair Stinger: I'd like to comment on that. I think we've had that discussion about narrowing

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

the focus and I remember thinking the first time I looked at it that that would be a fabulous idea to really show what our focus was but we are serving all of the population needs with our HSRAP budget. It's sort of like saying in a school, it might academic or important but we have to cover everything. I wouldn't want to convey to the people submitting proposals that we were going to focus on Number One issue without supporting the whole footprint...

Ms. van der Zwaag: It's a philosophy that I think is worth having a discussion about but now is not the time and like I said with the documentation that we have right now I would recommend against that.

Commissioner Lee: Ideally, I would like us to eventually have that discussion ideally with a consultant. Even if there isn't any funding for a consultant, I think our role as a Commission is the sense that we have an ability to identify certain low income or vulnerable communities to prioritize them a little bit more than how it's currently laid out. We're not going to do that tonight but hopefully the next time this comes around we do that...

Ms. van der Zwaag: Ok.

Chair Stinger: Do you think...

Commissioner Lee: ... in advanced time.

Chair Stinger: I guess what I would suggest is when we set our priorities for next year; we set up or maybe if we would set them up earlier. The last assessment was 2012 and each year that we've looked at it we've said it's such a big project and a good strategic plan is good for 5-years to 10-years. I think it's ok to reference back to the deep work that was done in 2012 but it is getting to be time to revisit that. I had a more micro question if I can? Question 5 was what is your agency doing to respond to these changes? Some people were changing the program format, some people were looking at new programs but almost half were doing nothing?

Ms. van der Zwaag: I'm trying to think of or chose not to respond.

Chair Stinger: I wondered if that was the answer.

Ms. van der Zwaag: It's sometimes hard to do a full analysis of why everybody did not respond to that question. Either they were not doing anything that is possible but I don't think you can with certainty say that was the reason they didn't indicate either one or two of the responses there.

Vice Chair O'Nan: I wanted to share that I'm uncomfortable with the idea that we would go through and try to prioritize which needs are most important. The community is in flux at all times and people needs are evolving at all times. Also, needs are complex and overlapping and because we deliberately made these broad categories, we've been able to take on several new agencies. Otherwise, we maybe wouldn't have been able to accept them because they wouldn't have met our criteria. So, I think a better solution is to look more deeply at individual applications that come in. If they meet this first hurdle, that's fine, and then we may decide that

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

whatever program that they are proposing isn't a high enough priority to fund it. I think that is a better way to make those decisions rather than do it at this level.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Ok.

Chair Stinger: I wouldn't want to discourage somebody who had a good idea to come to us with a proposal. I'd like to have all comers.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Any more questions of clarification of the report or the demographics?

Chair Stinger: Qifeng?

Commissioner Xue: One quick question regarding the change in race from 2014 to 2017. When I looked at the bars, at a first glance every bar went up from 2014 to 2017. Would that make sense?

Ms. van der Zwaag: It looks – yes, yes, we can go by the actual data points on the PowerPoint but I just think visually you are correct that according to the research it looks like there was an increase in each of the data points. Except maybe not Native Hawaiian or other Pacific Islander alone, that actually was a decrease because I don't see any data point now.

Commissioner Xue: Thank you.

Ms. van der Zwaag: You're welcome.

Commissioner Lee: In response to some of the questions, folks have listed some of their top barriers and some of the trends are changing – changes that are impacting their agency. Will those questions be part of the HSRAP application in terms of in particular the stigma and embarrassment that they've indicated as the top three barriers that their clients face in using their services? I personally would be very interested to see how applicants are working to resolve that as well as the responding to culture and language needs of clients. How applicants are responding to those changing trends or changes in our community.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Yes, there has been a review criterion that is asking applicants to let us share with us if that's true for their agency what they are doing to reach out to new populations, immigrants, newcomers in the community. I see some of the issues of barriers that come out naturally. I didn't bring a copy of the RFP with me tonight but in having 6-years of experience reviewing the RFPs that is a lot of the information that does come out. Mary and I just did site visits for all 17 HSRAP agencies in a 2-week period. We were a powerhouse out there visiting the agencies and during those visits as well we talked about barriers. We also asked ways in which the city and the HRC can work in collaboration with them to help their agency be more successful. I will share those results with the subcommittee as they meet to deliberate the applications.

Commissioner Lee: Great, thank you.

Ms. van der Zwaag: I think some of the barriers are often some of the program ideas that come in

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

because it's we're helping to pay for services. We are paying for transportation to get clients from one location to the other. Stigma and embarrassment, that's some of the key roles of the applications that come in from the mental health providers, so, even though it's not specifically asked, those are items that we see coming in the program applications for funding.

Commissioner Lee: With regards to the cultural language needs, is that something that naturally comes out in their responses to the application?

Ms. van der Zwaag: That has but I think with the new language that I'm putting in the application I hope to see that more.

Commissioner Lee: I think that's very important given the growing Asian community...

Ms. van der Zwaag: I agree.

Commissioner Lee: ...in terms of the demographics of the community. Thank you.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Yes, I hear you.

Chair Stinger: I had a question of formatting that may not take us anywhere but I want to try this. I get very confused when I look at the priority of needs and then when we actually look at the proposal and I work with it, it settles down. My first pass is it's confusing to me. We go from – I see these sorts of the triangle of basic needs. We build homelessness, seniors, special needs, children, and youth. Well since I didn't pass this out ahead of time I'll just talk to my notes – looking at separating populations and programs or services and looking at disabled, Latino families, low income families, seniors, working families unhoused, and the youth which are basically in this list. It came from the notes you had sent us and then the programs or services, there were after-school academic, social support, recreation programs, stress management, and the high school programs. There were caregivers, employee retention, food access, gender identity, housing, affordable housing, legal aid, elder abuse, medical, dental, and emotional health services. I just wanted to test whether that added any clarity to anybody else's thinking because it seems to me that there's some programs like mental health that are important for children in stressful settings. They are important seniors, to income families, Latino families...

Ms. van der Zwaag: Right.

Chair Stinger: and I was just trying to find a way to have a matrix.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Sure, and I'm such a visual person that I'm not orally following what that would look like; I'll be completely honest there. I know that a couple of years ago this was like seniors and it listed every service a senior can have and then it'd have homeless, every service we have. We said well a lot of them filter up so basic needs. Food and nutrition can go back under seniors, housing can go under seniors, and we tried to slide some of the categories – to name some of the categories like basic needs and the needs that come underneath there knowing that the people that they affected would be those that are homeless, those that are seniors, those that are children or youth. It made it a lot shorter instead of listing it under every type of person

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

category. If I'm misunderstanding what you're saying, it's possible. I mean I don't think we need to spend the time tonight thinking about format. Let's talk about categories and if any of you have ideas that this could look shorter and less cumbersome but still have the intent that an applicant would look at it and know where they fit, I'm fine with that. At this point to help focus our conversation I would like to just talk about the actual priorities that are listed.

Chair Stinger: Then I would propose just one...

Ms. van der Zwaag: I'm welcome...

Chair Stinger: I did bring extra copies...

Ms. van der Zwaag: ... any help...

Chair Stinger: ... but I wasn't sure what the code was so I won't circulate those. Gender identity was one thing that I read several times in the application and I would like to propose adding that or including it in one of the other categories either calling it ours as a subset or as a separate line item.

Commissioner Lee: Can I vote on that?

Chair Stinger: Please.

Commissioner Lee: I was going to say the LGBTQ community, generally speaking, gender identity, gender expression, gender, there's just...

Ms. van der Zwaag: Yes, I'd rather have just one thing that was more, not just say if this something that the HRC was interested in. Not just gender identity because that's just one aspect of it and then I'd be listing 10 things which is not helpful. We do have the outlet that's already receiving funding that did see them on this list under youth wellbeing but I hear you there.

Chair Stinger: Since the problem of gender identity is more than youth wellbeing, it has other age segments. I would like to make a motion that we add that in a more extensive category.

Commissioner Lee: How would you propose that we...

Vice Chair O'Nan: Gender identity is only one aspect so why would we...

Chair Stinger: I know, I'm agreeing with Commissioner Lee that I'm used to shorthand for my lists but...

Commissioner Lee: Could it be – how does this work? LGBTQ/gender identity and expression? Is that broad enough?

Ms. van der Zwaag: That could be it.

Vice Chair O'Nan: No because it could also be gender assignment. I mean we could get into

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

such granularity here, right? I just don't think it's going to behoove anyone to go...

Ms. van der Zwaag: I wonder though, just to strike a middle ground that something that is of interested to the Commission that staff could call staff at the Outlet and say can you give us some terms that...

Vice Chair O'Nan: But even to me that's not appropriate because there are LGBTQ seniors who are really suffering.

Ms. van der Zwaag: No, no, I'm not asking just in the youth ground but with the Office of LGBTQ Affairs for the county, if there's some language then that could be used that could seem to be inclusive of the intent if the Commission is not able to find the correct language to be as inclusive as they'd like to be. That was all that I was saying.

Chair Stinger: I think your suggestion is a strong suggestion, to call the County office because they could give us words that would ring true to the agencies that would submit proposals. I would think that would be a strong...

Commissioner Lee: From timing perspective though, if we just approve it as is and you do your outreach to the County. Would you be able to add that in...

Ms. van der Zwaag: Yes.

Commissioner Lee: ...with the direction that we gave you tonight.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Yes.

Commissioner Lee: Ok.

Commissioner Brahmhatt: I was thinking that we should add something for women. It doesn't address women who are separated from their husbands or who have young children or who have – who are in need...

Ms. van der Zwaag: Domestic issues are covered under CDBG so that's one thing that I didn't bring up. HSRAP works in collaboration with CDBG so there's been some traditional agencies that CDBG has supported and some traditional agencies that HSRAP as supported. I hear you, I'm just cautious of having it be everything. We have no more money and what my concern is if you add five more categories, you create an expectation and then we start sending it out to multiple agencies, even with the other suggestion, with this feeling that we are really looking at new applications. In theory, every time HSRAP opens up, everything is up for grabs. I will say traditionally, in the majority of the cases the subcommittee comes together with their recommendation that includes many of the prior agencies and sometimes just a few new agencies if new money is allocated or they start cutting money from the other agencies to make money. So, they say ok, they have 75, let's cut 5 from them, 5 from them and give it to this new agency. It's a real tricky process, so I say that not to say no to the two ideas but it's not just a simple matter of infinite funds so we can start funding more things. It's a very tricky matter.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Commissioner Lee: My approach would be if we're going to actually rank or prioritize this list and we're just going to leave it up to the subcommittee to do that sort of evaluation based on what comes in. I'd be inclined to add those categories at this point and allow the subcommittee to make those decisions or those deliberations.

Ms. van der Zwaag: That's the recommendation of the full Commission to staff and staff will take that under advisement.

MOTION #1

Commissioner Lee: I guess if I could make the first motion to add LGBTQ/Gender Identity and expression to the list with some modifications allowed by staff based on their conversations with the county office and exact terminology that's inclusive. That would be my first motion.

Chair Stinger: Let's take that motion. Do I have a second?

SECOND

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: I can second that.

Chair Stinger: Ok, thank you. Do you want to speak to your motion?

Commissioner Lee: I just think it's a very obvious segment of our community that is particularly vulnerable right now and that certainly this Commission has decided to prioritize this year. I think it just makes sense to include it on this year's priority of needs.

Chair Stinger: Do you want to speak to your second?

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: No, I have nothing to add to what Commissioner Lee summarized. He did it really well so we can go with that.

Chair Stinger: I'd like to speak to that also. It's something that I saw in the reports, something I care about but I also take your suggestion that we don't want to add a lot of line items. I just don't see quite where that might fit in. If we have emotional and mental health as a basic need it might be a category under that but I think it needs to stand alone given the categories that we have right now. If somebody can think of a way to cluster it, I'd be happy to entertain that as an alternative. In lieu of that, I'll ask for a vote. All in favor of adding that as a priority? And opposed? One.

Ms. van der Zwaag: So that passes 4-1.

MOTION #1 PASSED 4-1 WITH COMMISSIONER KRALIK AND SMITH ABSENT

Chair Stinger: Are there any other suggestions of proposed priority of needs? I mean amendments to the proposal that's in front of us?

MOTION #2

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Commissioner Brahmhatt: I propose a motion to add a category for women who are in need separate to the subject domestic violence. Caring for young children or wanting to go back to work to make ends meet; all of those categories.

Ms. van der Zwaag: It would have to be a lot more specific than that to be able to be on here because that's like 5 different funding categories. It is domestic violence, it's just...

Commissioner Brahmhatt: So, women in need? Can we say it broadly like women in need?

Ms. van der Zwaag: I don't think that would be clear enough.

Commissioner Lee: Would just women be specific enough?

Ms. van der Zwaag: I think that'd be to open because women are in each of these categories here. Just asking for a little more clarity because I mean when applicants call and say what are you specifically mean by that?

Vice Chair O'Nan: I think this is a mistake because women in need are covered under CDBG, not under HSRAP. Adding it here would be confusing to agencies who would be potentially be applying for funds. They might come along and think oh, we counsel domestic violence victims. In fact, we don't have any money to add that agency this year and so women who need counseling, there are counseling programs here and women who need emergency shelter that is covered here. So, the services that they actually need are already covered here, so I just question whether it makes sense to break it out into a new category and give false signals to the potential applicants.

Commissioner Brahmhatt: I mean it seems like all the basic – seniors are outlined as a separate thing, children and youth are outlined as separate and so it seems logic...

Commissioner Lee: It seems like a lot of overlap.

Commissioner Brahmhatt: Huh?

Commissioner Lee: There's a lot of overlap already.

Commissioner Brahmhatt: Yes, there's a lot of overlap and it seems like by not mentioning women; I hear you that if CDBG covers everything but it seems like its missing women issues.

Ms. van der Zwaag: I mean if you can...

Commissioner Brahmhatt: If you think – just because it hasn't been...

Ms. van der Zwaag: What?

Commissioner Brahmhatt: ...included in previous years but if you feel we have it in enough

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

coverage in CDBG I can go with that too.

Chair Stinger: Can I offer a suggestion? Is there a way to amend the special needs adult section?

Ms. van der Zwaag: That's specifically special needs like Abilities United special needs.

Chair Stinger: Oh, mentoring programs would not be...

Ms. van der Zwaag: That's for adults with special needs mentoring.

Chair Stinger: Oh, I'm sorry.

Ms. van der Zwaag: That's ok.

Chair Stinger: I was thinking that women in transition would be a special need. Got it, sorry.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: No, this is like mental condition with the special needs?

Ms. van der Zwaag: That's physical or emotional or developmental disabilities. I was looking for the third word. So, I mean if it's a general category like women's issues if that's the will of the Commission to make a recommendation, that is a more universally known term than women in need. So, I think...

Commissioner Lee: I'd be supportive of women issues.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: Yes.

Ms. van der Zwaag: I just offered that as a term.

Commissioner Lee: If you want to amend your motion to that I will second it.

MOTION #2 AMENDED

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: I propose a motion to include women issues.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Ok.

SECOND

Commissioner Lee: I'll second that.

Chair Stinger: Thank you. Do you have anything that you would like to add to the statements that you've made? You've made some good points.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: I think my concern is to the extent that there are other applicants that are not already applying through CDBG. The goal is to make this as broad as can be and so

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

having that...

Ms. van der Zwaag: That's not specifically the goal. The list is quite broad but I wouldn't specifically state that the goal of staff or the program is to have this as broad as possible. It's as broad as it is through past history and past additions but that is not a philosophy or goal of the program specifically.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: No, that is my goal.

Ms. van der Zwaag: I hear you.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: I was saying that is my goal to make this list so that we get as many applications as possible. As you said, this is up for grabs and it doesn't mean that whatever list was there in previous years – you know we don't have funding for new things or things like that. So, my goal...

Ms. van der Zwaag: Ok.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: I revise it; I'm not talking about the HSRAP or anything like that. My goal is to make this as broad as possible and it seems women issues should be a category in here.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Ok.

Commissioner Lee: I would say that for me women's issues would be a priority if we had to narrow the focus. If we were keeping it confined, I would still want women's issues to be one of the priority of needs.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Ok but that's for another day.

Commissioner Lee: Sure. So, I support the motion but for slightly different reasons.

Ms. van der Zwaag: I hear you thank you.

Chair Stinger: Go ahead.

Commissioner Lee: Plus, I was going to say that this Commission, as part of its Work Plan, identified gender as a particular focus. I think as given as such HSRAP funding is one way we can live up to that priority or that need that we've identified.

Vice Chair O'Nan: Unfortunately, we don't have adequate funding so we're just going to send a false message out.

Commissioner Lee: But we are pre-judging what the subcommittee may decide.

Vice Chair O'Nan: No, I'm understanding what the budget already is and it's not going to be a

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

huge increase if any, this year.

Commissioner Lee: You're presuming that the subcommittee wouldn't want to adjust the current funding; I understand that there's not going to be an increase in funding. I'm saying that the Committee may decide to reallocate it to other priorities.

Vice Chair O'Nan: The Committee rarely does that because it's very hard on our non-profits to suddenly cut their funding to make room for somebody new.

Commissioner Lee: Sure, but it's still – I mean...

Chair Stinger: I think the counseling...

Commissioner Lee: ... I don't want to pre-judge that deliberation at this point.

Chair Stinger: Council Member Wolbach.

Council Member Wolbach: I'm always reluctant to jump in the middle of Commission debate. Just a couple thoughts on this, gender it being raised in a couple places, I think that's good. I'm really glad to see that. You know a lot of people on Council will agree with that. A lot of that's covered specifically for women under a different funding mechanism already, so it might be redundant to add it here. The one that was just added was, LGBTQ and gender identity expression, which itself seemed redundant because I kind of thought LGBTQ said it all but it also had gender identity expression. I think you all know I'm not going to be opposed to Palo Alto prioritizing in supporting women's issues, women in need, etc. Just as far as a question of process, I'd suggest thinking very carefully before proceeding.

Chair Stinger: Thank you. I have to say I'm struggling with this. I think it's something I personally would want to support putting on human service/HSRAP thought process but I'm going back to what we said was our mission or vision with the HSRAP funding that was given to us at the outset; low income and vulnerable populations and when I look at those basic needs, food, housing, emergency assistance, transportation, and we're not doing an adequate job of funding all of those needs and to the extent that we keep adding it dilutes our ability to serve low income and vulnerable populations. I also hear that women in transition are vulnerable so I'm really struggling with how I will vote and I'm going to call the vote. I will have to end my struggle unless there's another comment? May I have a vote on the motion on the floor? All in favor? Opposed?

Commissioner Lee: 2-3.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Yes so it doesn't go through.

MOTION #2 FAILED 2-3 WITH COMMISSIONER KRALIK AND SMITH ABSENT

Chair Stinger: I'd like to ask one more question.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Sure.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Chair Stinger: I wonder if we could consider at the end of the HSRAP – I’m looking at unfunded programs. We always go through the HSRAP process and there’s inadequate funding. Some of the agencies we fund and some agencies we can’t fund and I wonder if there’s some way we can work with the unfunded programs with two objectives. One would be to increase exposure. Maybe do an HSRAP fair where we would invite funders, foundations and donors in the community to hear a presentation about the objectives and successes and needs of these agencies. Second would be to perhaps help the agencies help themselves. When I was reading the summaries that you nicely gave us, they mentioned looking for collaboration or looking for solutions...

Ms. van der Zwaag: Right.

Chair Stinger: ... or some agencies that have facilities that are open in the morning and some in the afternoon. Working together they might be able to better use their facilities, better get used of staff. I just wonder if we can take that as a challenge to expand our resources.

Ms. van der Zwaag: I think what my suggestion would be for that is as you’re setting your priority of need for next year as a Commission if that is a project that the HRC would like to take on in looking at other ways of assisting non-profits in the community. If that’s a funder fair using connections from this Commission might have to call people in and present a 30-second funding pitch for some of these agencies. I don’t want to go into that tonight but I just want to say I think that’s something that can be considered at another time for what this Commission can do to raise the profile of some non-profits in the community. I’ll end it right there because I know we’re short on time. I would say that if there’s no other addition, that I’d like to hear a recommendation to accept the priority of need as proposed with the addition of LGBTQ.

MOTION #3

Commissioner Lee: I move to adopt the HSRAP priority of needs as amended.

SECOND

Commissioner Xue: Second.

Chair Stinger: All in favor?

Ms. van der Zwaag: Thank you.

MOTION #3 PASSED 5-0 WITH COMMISSIONER KRALIK AND SMITH ABSENT

6. Report from Ad hoc Committee Chairs on Work Plan

Chair Stinger: We have one agenda item left and that is to do an update on our Work Plans. I think I can do that or do my part of it quickly and then open it up to other Commissioners. I’m going to speak for Commissioner Smith. Fostering community conversations, we have

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

developed, Commissioner Smith and I are working on this and we've developed a format. We haven't done it yet but we would like to meet with Minka and propose the week of January 14th for the first forum.

Ms. van der Zwaag: That's soon.

Chair Stinger: Well...

Ms. van der Zwaag: Ok, you better meet with me soon.

Chair Stinger: Yes, we will meet with you soon. Our goal is – I'm sorry I've lost my notes – to look at gender identity – gender – I'm sorry. Wait a second. Our goal in that would be to invite a guest speaker to talk to gender equality. Sorry, I was getting my committees mixed up. The proposal is to do a presentation, use some of the exercises that we used in Being Different Together and then have small group conversations based on the exercise just because of time I'm going to leave it at that. We'll come back in December with an update on our Work Plan and the speakers that we would like to invite.

Vice Chair O'Nan: I just want to say though, I think the timing sounds very unrealistic. It's going to be Christmas time, staff will be going on vacation, speakers will not be available, they'll be on vacation. It's going to be really difficult to pull something off on January 14th.

Chair Stinger: I take that seriously and we'll put together a Work Plan and adjust the date if we need to, to do a successful program. If we can organize it ahead of time and deliver it on that week, then we will. If not, the following week is Martin Luther King celebrations in the city so we would skip that week and probably go to the first week in February. Just moving on, we also have a committee working on supporting an inclusive community. One of the committees is gender identity and Commissioner Lee and I are working on that. We have a policy side and a program side. I'll let you speak to the policy if...

Commissioner Lee: I'll keep it brief and just say that we'll be doing some research to see to what extent, if any, there might be opportunities to make policy suggestions with regards to ensuring that our LGBTQ community is being treated and served properly within our City. We don't have any specific conception of what that might be at this point in time but I think whenever we look at these issues there's always a policy aspect of it as well as an educational/programmatic aspect of it. We're going to be approaching it from both angles.

Chair Stinger: On the programming side we've put together a compilation of the data available to us. We've looked at the population of youth and adult – thank you – LGBTQ citizens in our community and the vulnerabilities that they are subject too. We've looked at a series of recommendations. We will bring a presentation hopefully in December, probably in January to this Commission looking at space, programs, youth advisory boards, and partnerships to deliver. I'm sorry to make it so short but I just think given the time.

Vice Chair O'Nan: I'm not sure what the research methodology was here but I think it would be not appropriate to make all those recommendations without input from the LGBTQ community.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Chair Stinger: We did do that...

Vice Chair O’Nan: Ok.

Chair Stinger: ... and are planning to – our goal would be to have a working summit of all of the LGBTQ community before we went forward with recommendations. You’re right; we did not and will not proceed in a vacuum.

Council Member Wolbach: Sorry to weigh in again. There already was a Listening Forum in Palo Alto with the LGBTQ community on those issues. I’m surprised that that’s not the primary or at least a key source along with the survey that accompanied that to identify policy needs. I guess I’m just surprised that’s not being utilized more.

Chair Stinger: I short-circuited that too much. We used census data to do some background work, then the Listening Forum, the online survey which delivered 104 responses, in-depth interviews with providers in the community, and I feel like we have a really solid list of proposals to take forward.

Council Member Wolbach: Oh ok, thank you for clarifying.

Chair Stinger: Thank you for asking. I wouldn’t want to leave that as a loose thought. I just wanted to watch our time so I took an inappropriate shortcut. Appreciate the correction.

Commissioner Lee: I’ll add one clarification, the summit is designed to bring together the various stakeholders who may have program initiatives that intersect with some of the needs that we’ve identified, figure out what they are doing and how can we work together to address these needs.

Chair Stinger: Speaker card from Council Member Holman.

Ms. Karen Holman: I don’t remember when the last time I did this was but here I am. You may see this upcoming next year. As I hear you struggle it’s like – one thing is I would suggest just for whatever its worth – I’m speaking as an individual here of course – Minka has been through this many, many times as have longer serving Commissioners. It’s a sad reality that we can’t seem to -- Corey and I can’t seem to get the Council majority to budge to give more money into the HSRAP funding. Corey and I have agreed on that the whole 10-years that we’ve served together. The thing that I really wanted to mention was at the Committee level there is something. There’s a national program Make a Difference Day and 3-years ago the city partnered with YCS, Youth Community Services. YCS does a lot of work on that day and they partner with Kiwanis and some other organizations that do a lot of different kinds of things. Unfortunately, the last 2-years the city has not promoted that and has not helped generate more volunteers. I’m just going to put out there that perhaps a Committee of this Commission might like to reach out to YCS and see what kinds of efforts this Commission might help with and help generate volunteers to do. They do everything the list is not limited but they do things like food sorting and clothing projects, Ecumenical Hunger Program, and they work with Project We

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Hope. On the other end of the spectrum, they plant trees and clean the duck pond. It's a wide assortment of things but it's a way that we can also partner with the community and it's a way that I think the Human Relations Commission might be able to expand your outreach and impact without the investment of money. Even with just the city promoting it, it brought forward a lot more volunteers and so maybe you can promote to Council and to city staff to promote it more this year. It's a nationwide thing and it's recognized locally too, led by YCS just to repeat. Thanks.

Chair Stinger: Thank you.

V. Reports from Officials

1. Commissioner Reports

Chair Stinger: Moving on to – any other Commissioner reports?

2. Council Liaison Report

Chair Stinger: Council Member Wolbach, liaison report?

Council Member Wolbach: No report.

3. Staff Liaison Report

Chair Stinger: Staff?

Ms. van der Zwaag: We do have some very nice, nifty gift bags for those Commissioners who were not able to attend the Council lead recognition event for Commissioners. So, Vice Chair O'Nan was there, Chair Stinger and Commissioner Lee but for Commissioner Brahmhatt and Commissioner Xue, we have certificates and swag bags or whatever you want to call them to thank you for your service. Mary will help me find the right – thank you for your service. Thank you for your service so that's all I have.

VI. TENTATIVE AGENDA FOR NEXT REGULAR MEETING: Thursday, December 13, 2018.

Chair Stinger: Agenda for our next regular meeting in December.

Commissioner Lee: If I could ask that we consider putting a very small item on the December agenda to discuss how we might want to follow up from the RISE presentation. Whether it designates a Commission Liaison or forming an Ad Hoc Committee to follow up with them just in terms of structurally what we want to do. Not necessarily get into the weeds of it. If that could maybe be a 5 or 10-minute item.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Do you have another Commissioner who would want to second that for you for consideration for our future agenda?

SECOND

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Commissioner Brahmbhatt: I can second that.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Ok.

Chair Stinger: I believe that YCS wanted to come in December.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Mary just whispered that into my ear. YCS, we told them there was too much on tonight's agenda as you would all agree so they want to come and we said we'd let them come in December.

Chair Stinger: I think we can ask them about Make a Difference Day.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Correct we can ask them about that. We also traditionally in December have a get-together. We will not be joining Commissioner Lee in Nebraska or where ever he is going to be.

Chair Stinger: You're on your own for that.

Ms. van der Zwaag: You're on your own for that.

Commissioner Lee: It's not that cold, just -6 degrees.

Chair Stinger: There was something – the Art Center wanted to present to us?

Ms. van der Zwaag: Correct, they have another funding opportunity for a grant that they've received that they want to speak to the HRC about. The Chair and I will be meeting with the Art Center Director to get a little more clarity about what the HRC's role may be. So, that is a tentative agenda item as well.

Chair Stinger: I would really like to try to do the presentation of the LGBTQ Committee.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Ok, if it's ready at that time, right.

Commissioner Lee: I wanted to ask several months ago we discussed having the Commission recognize various individuals or groups in our community doing great work. I was wondering if we had finalized that process.

Ms. van der Zwaag: We did.

Commissioner Lee: How does it get on the agenda – how do we recommend someone in a group and get it on the agenda?

Ms. van der Zwaag: I believe you recommend someone to Leadership and that's brought up at the next Leadership meeting.

Chair Stinger: Yes.

ADA. The City of Palo Alto does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities. To request accommodations, auxiliary aids or services to access City facilities, services or programs, to participate at public meetings, or to learn about the City's compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, may contact 650-329-2550 (voice), or e-mail ada@cityofpaloalto.org. This agenda is posted in accordance with government code section 54954.2(a) or section 54956. Members of the public are welcome to attend this public meeting.

Commissioner Lee: So, Leadership would decide and then it would be on the agenda to actually recommend them?

Ms. van der Zwaag: I don't have the process memorized but to the best of my knowledge that was it. If you want to be in contact with myself or Leadership.

Chair Stinger: Just make a suggestion.

Commissioner Lee: Great.

Chair Stinger: We are adjourned.

Ms. van der Zwaag: Thank you.

Commissioner Lee: Thank you.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

Meeting adjourned at 9:28 p.m.