



Planning & Transportation Commission Action Agenda: April 29, 2020

Council Chambers
250 Hamilton Avenue
6:00 PM

Call to Order / Roll Call

Approximately 6:04 pm

Chair Templeton: So, I have a section of things that I need to read before we call the meeting to order. So, I think that will give anyone else who wishes to join sometime. It's quite a bit of script so I think I'll just get started with that.

Mr. Vinh Nguyen, Admin Associate III: Sure, thank you.

Chair Templeton: Ok so I'm going to read some information here about how to join and get involved in this meeting. So, bear with me while I go through all of this, it's required.

Commissioner Alcheck: Did you guys take roll already?

Chair Templeton: We'll do the roll after I read this.

Commissioner Alcheck: Got it, thanks.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Templeton: Sure, alright.

2

3 Commissioner Summa: I can't hear anything.

4

5 Chair Templeton: Oh, Commissioner Summa you can't...are you able to hear? Alright well while
6 you work out (interrupted)

7

8 Commissioner Summa: I'm here.

9

10 Chair Templeton: That technical issue I'll go ahead and read through. So pursuant to the
11 provisions of California Governor's Executive Order N-29-20, issued on March 17, 2020, to
12 prevent the spread of Covid-19, this meeting will be held by virtual teleconference only, with no
13 physical location. The meeting will be broadcast live on Cable TV Channel 26 and Midpen Media
14 Center at <https://midpenmedia.org/local-tv/watch-now/>.

15

16 Members of the public who wish to participate can do so by email, phone, or computer. To
17 ensure participation in a particular item we suggest calling in or connecting prior... 15-minutes
18 prior to the item you wish to speak on. For written communications please send an email to
19 planning.commission@cityofpaloalto.org. Spoken comments via a computer will be accepted
20 through the Zoom teleconference meeting. To address the Commission, go through

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Zoom.us/join. The meeting ID is 463 430 942. You will be asked to enter an email address and a
2 name. We request that you identify yourself by name as this will be visible online and will be
3 used to notify you that it's your turn to speak.

4
5 When you wish to speak on an agenda item, click on raise hand. The moderator will activate
6 and unmute speakers in turn. When called please limit your remarks to the time allotted. A
7 timer will be shown on the computer to help keep track of your time.

8
9 Spoken public comments using a smartphone will be accepted through the teleconference
10 meeting. To address the Commission, download the Zoom application to your phone from the
11 Apple App Store or Google Play Store and enter the Meeting ID below 463 430 942. Please
12 follow the previous steps A through D.

13
14 Spoken public comments using a phone call, call the number 1-669-900-6833, and enter
15 meeting ID 463 430 942. When you wish to speak on an agenda item hit *9 on your phone so
16 we know that you wish to speak. You will be asked to provide your first and last name before
17 addressing the Commission. You will be advised how long you have to speak and when called
18 please limit your remarks to the agenda item and time limit allotted.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 You can find this information on the last page of the agenda. To better facilitate public
2 comments, our meeting host Vinh Nguyen will identify each person with a raised hand by name
3 or the last four digits of your phone number and request that you state your name and the
4 agenda item you wish to speak on. If you wish to speak under any item not on the agenda,
5 please state your intent to speak under Oral Communications. When it's your time to speak
6 during public comment you'll be identified and provided 3-minutes to speak. Any callers with
7 blocked numbers will wait until the end of the speaker's portion, the host will unmute them
8 one at a time, and all will be asked to speak.

9

10 So, Vinh, I think here it says I should ask you about public comments. Do we want to call roll
11 first or do the public comment first?

12

13 Mr. Nguyen: Well first let's identify the public speakers so (interrupted)

14

15 Chair Templeton: Ok.

16

17 Mr. Nguyen: That we know how many public speakers you have... we have and for which item.
18 So first I'm going to go down my list and read all the public speakers I have on my list and if
19 there's anyone else who is attending the meeting who wants to speak who is not on my list yet,
20 please raise your hand now.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

So, for Agenda Item Number Two, NVCAP, we have Rebecca Sanders and Ken Joye. For Agenda Item Number Three, 3000 Alexis, we have Jeff Froke, and are there anyone else who wants to speak? I see there are a couple of hands raised so I will go through each person. A. Dellaporta, can you please state your name for the record and also identify each agenda item you want to speak on.

Ms. Angela Dellaporta: Hi, my name is Angela Dellaporta, I'm a member of the working group and I'd like to speak on... I don't know which number it is but it's the NVCAP agenda item.

Mr. Nguyen: Sure, that's going to be Item Number Two and I'm sorry, did you say your first name was Anne?

Ms. Dellaporta: Angela.

Mr. Nguyen: Angela, ok. Ok, thank you, Angela. Once we get to the item we will call on you to speak. Ok the public with the user first name Winter, can you please state your name for the record and then also identify which agenda item you want to speak on. Hi Winter, are you there?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. Winter Dellenbach: Yes, I just unmuted. Winder Dellenbach, I want to speak on the NVCAP.

2

3 Mr. Nguyen: Thank you, Winter. Once we get to the item we will call on you. Alright, last
4 person with a hand raised... actually, there's two more people with a hand raised. We have
5 Kelsey Banes. Kelsey, can you please state your name for the record and also identify which
6 item you want to speak on.

7

8 Commissioner Lauing: You just come fix it. I don't care if someone sees it. There we go. Ok, so
9 where's my thing?

10

11 Mr. Nguyen: Kelsey, we can hear you.

12

13 Ms. Kelsey Banes: [unintelligible – bad audio] I think are talking over me.

14

15 Mr. Nguyen: Hello Kelsey, are you there?

16

17 Ms. Rachael Tanner, Assistant Director of Planning: Vinh I think her internet connection was
18 breaking up a little bit. I saw her go off mute. Kelsey, do you want to do unmute one more time
19 and try to speak and see if we can understand you.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. Banes: Sure. [unintelligible – bad audio]

2

3 Mr. Nguyen: Yeah, Kelsey, I'm really sorry. There seems to be something wrong with your
4 microphone. We can hear voice... we can hear sound coming out but it's really jumbled and
5 garbled. Let's give that one more try. Let me disable you and then reenable you to see if that
6 helps. Ok Kelsey, go ahead and give it one more try.

7

8 Ms. Banes: Ok, I'm trying again. I switched rooms. I would like to (interrupted)

9

10 Mr. Nguyen: Perfect.

11

12 Ms. Banes: Speak to the NVCAP item.

13

14 Mr. Nguyen: Ok, you said NVCAP, is that right?

15

16 Ms. Banes: Yes.

17

18 Mr. Nguyen: Ok. Alright, thank you so much, Kelsey. Alright, so we have no more raised hands.
19 Let's give everyone with the opportunity. If anyone else who wants to speak who I did not call
20 out... upon yet, please raise your hand now. Ok seeing as how there are no more raised hands,

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 we can... actually, we have one more raised hand that just raise a hand. Let's see here, the user
2 with the name Citizen can you please state your name for the record. And then also identify
3 which agenda item you want to speak one.

4

5 Mr. Cody [note – not last name:] My name is Cody and I would like to speak on Oral
6 Communications.

7

8 Mr. Nguyen: Ok, thank you, Cody. Ok, we have no more raised hands so Cari [note -Chair
9 Templeton] we can move on with the agenda.

10

11 Chair Templeton: Great, thank you. So, we'll call the meeting to order. Would you like to do roll
12 call, Vinh?

13 Mr. Nguyen: Yes, alright. Chair Templeton?

14

15 Chair Templeton: Present.

16

17 Mr. Nguyen: Vice-Chair Roohparvar?

18

19 Vice-Chair Roohparvar: Present.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Nguyen: Commissioner Alcheck?

2

3 Commissioner Alcheck: Present.

4

5 Mr. Nguyen: Commissioner Hechtman?

6

7 Commissioner Hechtman: Present.

8

9 Mr. Nguyen: Commissioner Lauing?

10

11 Commissioner Lauing: Present.

12

13 Mr. Nguyen: Commissioner Lauing?

14

15 Commissioner Lauing: Yes, present.

16

17 Mr. Nguyen: Commissioner Riggs?

18

19 Chair Templeton: He notified us that he would be absent today.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Nguyen: Ok thank you. Well, we have a quorum, thank you. Oh, I'm sorry, we have also
2 Commissioner Summa?

3

4 Commissioner Summa: Present.

5

6 Mr. Nguyen: Thank you. We have a quorum.

7

8 Chair Templeton: Alright.

9

10 Commissioner Summa: I turned my video off because I wasn't getting audio and I just got audio
11 like a minute ago. So, I'll just leave my video off if that's alright?

12

13 Chair Templeton: I think that will be fine for now. If you do take the floor to speak on an item
14 you may want to try putting video back on and see if it works.

15

16 Commissioner Summa: Ok.

17

18 Chair Templeton: Thanks, and just for process-wise unless you're the speaker please be on mute.

19 **Oral Communications**

20 The public may speak to any item not on the agenda. Three (3) minutes per speaker.^{1,2}

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Templeton: Alright so now we want to open Oral Communications at this time. If you wish
2 to speak on an item not on the agenda and you're using a Zoom application you may raise your
3 hand. Use the raise your hand function to indicate your interest in speaking. It's located at the
4 bottom of your Zoom screen. If you're dialing in from a phone you can raise your hand by
5 pressing *9. This will create a queue. The meeting host will unmute each speaker, display the
6 timer, and alert you when you may begin.

7

8 Vinh, can you please let us know who are the public comments for Oral Communications.

9

10 Mr. Vinh Nguyen, Admin Associate III: Yes, we do have one public comment from Cody. Let me
11 get that setup. Ok Cody, if you could please restate your name for the record and then proceed
12 with your public comments.

13

14 Mr. Cody [note – no last name]: Hello?

15

16 Mr. Nguyen: Hi, we can hear you.

17

18 Mr. Cody [note – no last name:] Hi, my names Cody, I'm a student from Stanford, and I'm
19 calling simply to thank the Planning Department for ensuring that the public is informed of the

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 public hearings. These are trying times and I'd just like to thank the Planning Department for
2 their efforts. That is all.

3

4 Mr. Nguyen: Ok thank you, Cody. We have one more hand raised from a Kirsten Flynn. I'm not
5 sure if she wants to speak on Oral Communications or if she wants to speak on a different item.
6 So, let me ask her. Kirsten, if you can hear us can you please state your name for the record and
7 also identify if you want to speak on Oral Communications or on an agenda item. Hi, Kirsten?

8

9 Ms. Rachael Tanner, Assistant Planning Director: She's not unmuted, Vinh. She's still on mute I
10 believe.

11

12 Mr. Nguyen: Yeah so, I already (interrupted)

13

14 Ms. Kirsten Flynn: I got it. Ok, it's... I got it. It's Kirsten Flynn and I just wanted to speak on the
15 NVCAP.

16

17 Mr. Nguyen: NVCAP, Item Number Two, ok. Thank you.

18

19 Chair Templeton: Alright well thank you. Thank you, Cody, for kicking us off with such a positive
20 start to the meeting. I echo your appreciation for the Staff and the work they're doing.

21

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 **Agenda Changes, Additions, and Deletions**

2 The Chair or Commission majority may modify the agenda order to improve meeting management.

3 Chair Templeton: So, let's move on to agenda changes, additions, or deletions. Staff, are there
4 any changes to the agenda?

5

6 Ms. Rachael Tanner, Assistant Planning Director: There are no deletions or agenda changes to
7 the agenda. The agenda is... got everything we're going to be doing tonight.

8

9 Chair Templeton: Ok and I had heard some interest offline in changing the order of our agenda
10 items. Is there a motion from a Commissioner to hear the golf course item first before the
11 NVCAP?

12

13 MOTION

14

15 Vice-Chair Roohparvar: I can go ahead and make that motion.

16

17 Chair Templeton: Alright.

18

19 Vice-Chair Roohparvar: So, I maker it. Yeah, I move that we go through Agenda Item I think it's
20 Two. The golf course item first and then thereafter move (interrupted)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Mr. [note- unknown public speaker]: Are these hedges rose hedges?

3

4 Ms. [note- unknown public speaker:] Rose hedges?

5

6 Mr. [note -unknown public speaker]: It's rose [unintelligible](interrupted)

7

8 Vice-Chair Roohparvar: And then the NVCAP study session.

9

10 Chair Templeton: Any seconds?

11

12 SECOND

13

14 Commissioner Summa: Second.

15

16 Chair Templeton: And that was Commissioner Summa?

17

18 Commissioner Summa: Doria.

19

20 Chair Templeton: Ok.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Summa: Commissioner Summa.

Chair Templeton: Excellent. So, we have a motion to hear the golf course before the NVCAP item and a second. Any discussion? We'll have to use the raise your hand button and Vinh, would it be possible to stop presenting when... I guess not. Don't worry about it. Ok so seeing no hands raised, can we take a vote on...oh, is there a hand? I'm sorry, I can't see any of the Commissioners through the presentation. So, can (interrupted)

Commissioner Lauing: This is Ed [note – Commissioner Lauing]. I just... I think I got mute ok but for some reason, my hand raise button is not appearing so.

Chair Templeton: Oh dear, that's not good.

Commissioner Lauing: So, I'm just going to have to do manual until I get this fixed.

Chair Templeton: That's ok.

Commissioner Alcheck: Hey Carie [note- Chair Templeton] (interrupted)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Templeton: Yes?

2

3 Commissioner Alcheck: Can I make one suggestion?

4

5 Chair Templeton: Yes.

6

7 Commissioner Alcheck: At the top of your Zoom window, next to something that says, in bright
8 green, you are viewing PDS Public Meetings.

9

10 Chair Templeton: Yes.

11

12 Commissioner Lauing: Yes.

13

14 Commissioner Alcheck: There's a thing that says view options and if you click that [unintelligible
15 – audio cut out]

16

17 Commissioner Lauing: I did a few times and I'm not getting anything.

18

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Alcheck: If you click that view options button, it will drop down and you'll have a
2 choice to hit side by side. And if you do side by side, you can then view your fellow
3 Commissioner's video.

4

5 Chair Templeton: That's excellent.

6

7 Commissioner Alcheck: And also, alternatively under the video settings at the bottom left, you
8 can also click where it says video, you can click video settings. And down there you can select to
9 not to hide non-video participants and then you'll only see the seven people are sharing video.

10

11 Chair Templeton: Thank you so much.

12

13 Commissioner Alcheck: And that might be easier if someone raises their hand like this you
14 might be able to see it better.

15

16 Chair Templeton: That's perfect. And one more technical detail that we did not review for the
17 Commissioners is the participant's button. You'll see the little double person icon, is how you
18 access the panel where you can raise and lower your hand. So ok, any more discussion?

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. Tanner: Commissioner Lauing, do you have a comment? Commissioner Lauing you're on
2 mute if you're speaking.

3

4 Commissioner Lauing: Thank you. I didn't know you were asking for comments on the item. I
5 thought you were asking for a vote on whether or not we wanted to move it.

6

7 I just had one comment and I had suggested to Rachael perhaps we could get some elevation
8 pictures or drawings because the only thing from my perspective on this issue is if there's more
9 building exposed it might look awful from open space. Then that's not (interrupted)

10

11 Chair Templeton: Commissioner Lauing.

12

13 Commissioner Lauing: Yeah?

14

15 Chair Templeton: Can you hold those comments until we're at that agenda item? We're just
16 talking about moving the agenda right now in the order.

17

18 Commissioner Lauing: That's what I thought.

19

20 Chair Templeton: Oh.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Lauing: That’s what I thought, ok.

VOTE

Chair Templeton: Sorry about the confusion. Ok so let’s vote. Can we... the motion is to hear the golf course item first and then the NVCAP item. All those... I guess we have to do voice votes on Zoom calls, is that correct Vinh?

Mr. Vinh Nguyen, Admin Associate III: Yes, that is correct.

Chair Templeton: Alright can you please (interrupted)

Mr. Nguyen: Absolutely. Commissioner Alcheck?

Commissioner Alcheck: Yes.

Mr. Nguyen: Commissioner Hechtman?

Commissioner Hechtman: Yes.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson’s presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Mr. Nguyen: Commissioner Lauing?

3

4 Commissioner Lauing: Yes.

5

6 Mr. Nguyen: Vice-Chair Roohparvar?

7

8 Vice-Chair Roohparvar: Yes.

9

10 Mr. Nguyen: Commissioner Summa?

11

12 Commissioner Summa: Yes.

13

14 Mr. Nguyen: Chair Templeton?

15

16 Chair Templeton: Yes.

17

18 Mr. Nguyen: Ok this motion passes. Thank you.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 MOTION PASSED 6 (Lauing, Summa, Alcheck, Hechtman, Templeton, Roohparvar)- 0- 1 (Riggs
2 absent)

3

4 Chair Templeton: Great thank you all.

5 **City Official Reports**

6 1. Directors Report, Meeting Schedule and Assignments

7 Chair Templeton: Alright so the next item is the City Official Reports, so Rachael is that
8 (interrupted)

9

10 Ms. Rachael Tanner, Assistant Planning Director: That is to me.

11

12 Chair Templeton: Ok. Ms. Tanner.

13

14 Ms. Tanner: [unintelligible] I appreciate your time and I'd be happy to also answer any
15 questions that folks may have now or also at the end of the meeting during Commissioner
16 Comments and Questions.

17

18 Overall, it's been a little while since we've gotten together so I'm really excited that we're
19 having our first virtual meeting. The Historic Resources Board and the Architectural Review
20 Board just this month also had their first virtual meetings and they were very successful. I will

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 be a little nervous tonight, I think technology has a potential for challenges. It makes me
2 nervous. There's usually always a few but I'm really happy that you guys all made the time.
3 Hopefully, you're all safe as well and that we can continue to carry on the public business which
4 is really important despite the pandemic that is occurring.

5
6 Some of the things that have happened in the last I guess 6-weeks since the Shelter in Place
7 Order was first in place is all of the operations in the Planning and Development Services
8 Department have moved offline... off-site to virtual communication. So, Staff thankfully had
9 laptops prior, those who do desk work, and were able to then pivot quickly, get the equipment
10 that we needed, have video conferencing. We're using Microsoft here at the City so
11 [unintelligible] to allows us to do lots of rapid communication and video communication as well
12 as our VPN, other things to do file sharing, and we even have our phones. Our desk phone lines
13 ring through to our laptop so there is a lot of seamlessness for the members of the public who
14 need to call, have questions, get services.

15
16 Obviously, our Development Center is closed and that's a place where we have lots and lots of
17 walk-in services provided to folks who are filing Building Permits or Planning Entitlements, who
18 may be coming to see things for fire or Public Works as well. And we're really proud to
19 announce that just... I guess now it was 2-weeks ago we launched our online permitting system
20 and that system allows folks to submit their plans online for planning, for building, other

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 departments as well, to receive their comments back digitally, for us to review the plans
2 digitally. So, it really is a step forward that we have been looking forward to for several years.
3 And due to the Shelter in Place but our need to continue to serve the public in a safe way, we
4 were able to really quickly pull together and make it happen in less than a few weeks. So, I'm
5 really proud of that and if you have friends or colleagues who are wondering what's going on in
6 Palo Alto. Can they get a permit? They certainly can go ahead and submit their plans,
7 documents, everything online which is great.

8
9 And just today the County of Santa Clara updated the Shelter in Place Order. It's a lengthy
10 order. If you would like to read it, it has some good information for you and your family and
11 also information that we, in the City, are still continuing to digest and understand. One of the
12 big headlines though is that construction is allowed and so we are working together in the City
13 to figure out how we can operationalize that. Particularly when it comes to inspections. Our
14 Building Inspectors have been continuing to be performing essential inspections of essential
15 construction projects throughout this time. And I really want to give them a big hand and
16 thanks for putting themselves literally out there on the front lines, in a safe way, and following
17 the protocols. But we certainly want to remember them and we're just really grateful for all of
18 their work that they are engaging in. So that's a lot of exciting stuff, you know more things to
19 come.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 And the last little bit I'll say before I hand it over to some of our folks in the Office of
2 Transportation is that housing work continues. And so, the legislature in this... the state
3 legislature should be getting back together in early May to meet. They've been on recess since
4 the Shelter in Place Order, perhaps a little bit before. And so, we still... we haven't heard any
5 changes to a lot of the state-mandated housing laws or any delays to other state-mandated
6 housing regulations. So, we still expect for example our Regional Housing Needs Allocation to
7 come this spring. State law is that reflects housing that go... went into effect this year or going
8 into effect over a course of time are still planned to be in effect and we need to prepare for or
9 adapt to them. There's, fortunately, a grant deadline that's coming up that would hopefully give
10 us some funds to do some more planning work here in Palo Alto. So that is staying... is on as
11 scheduled. We do have an understanding that some of the priorities for the legislature when
12 they return will be obviously responding to COVID, fire season, and also addressing
13 homelessness as top priorities for the state.

14

15 So that's my update. I want to hand it over to Philip Kamhi who is the Director of the Office of
16 Transportation for an update.

17

18 Mr. Philip Kamhi, Director of the Office of Transportation: Good evening Commissioners. Can
19 everybody hear me? Great. I see nods, alright, that's good news. So, thank you very much for
20 having me tonight and I have some of my Staff here with me. So, I just want to share some of

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 the brief updates about things that the Office of Transportation has been working on since this
2 Shelter in Place and really as kind of interim operations for the Office of Transportation. So, I'm
3 going to go through a couple of those and I'll hand it off to some of my Staff that I have with me
4 and I'll introduce them of course first.

5

6 So, the first one is the Office of Transportation is currently developing a pilot program to
7 discourage non-local traffic on some residential streets. And the plan is to discourage drivers
8 other than those that either live on the street or have some business on the street. For
9 example, if they're making a delivery and of course if there are emergency services or they have
10 some kind of a business on the street. The roads will not be entirely blocked so we would only
11 be requesting and encouraging cut-through traffic to focus on other routes. And we would not
12 be issuing citations or attempting to enforce this or asking for anybody to admonish somebody
13 that's driving on that street. So, it's very similar to programs that have been recently rolled out
14 in Oakland, Minneapolis, and Denver and I believe San Francisco is actually doing it as well. So
15 again, we'd just be attempting to discourage non-local drivers to reduce and slow traffic and
16 then create more space for allowing for physical distancing and exercising. So, if you're walking
17 down the sidewalk and you see somebody walking toward you. You don't have to run back to
18 your house and hide. You could pass them but you still need to be mindful on these streets
19 because there could be cars. So, bicyclists and pedestrians on these streets really need to be

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 safe and mindful of not just others but also if they're entering the street to pass for physical
2 distancing.

3

4 The second thing that I want to mention is that the City of Palo Alto is currently operating with
5 approximately 24 traffic signals in the downtown area where the automatic pedestrian phase
6 comes on without pushing the button. And this is just to allow for the accessible buttons to
7 happen without somebody doing that tactile... you know the touch of it and risking potentially
8 or feeling like they need to wear gloves or something like that. And it's in those areas where
9 there is typically high pedestrian. And actually, right now it's an unusual pedestrian pattern
10 because we have people making a lot of deliveries and pickups.

11

12 And so, with that, I've got two of my Planning and Transportation Managers here. The first one
13 you've probably... many of you have met before, that's Sylvia Star-Lack and she manages a lot
14 of our mobility programs. Our Safe Routes to School Programs, and all kinds of other really
15 great things. So, I'll have her go first but then second, we're going to have Nathan Baird and
16 Nathan Baird is our Transportation Planning Manager that's managing our parking programs
17 that we've all been really excited to have come on board and actually has quite a lot of stuff
18 that he's planning to bring in the future to the Planning and Transportation Commission. And I
19 just want to say one more thing about him before I turn it over to Silvia and then she can pass it
20 to Nate. He actually started his first day I believe was the first day of the Shelter in Place. So, in

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 a really unusual fashion, he has been integrated into our team completely virtually and he's fit
2 in really well. So, I'm really excited to introduce him and with that, I'll hand it off to Sylvia.

3

4 Ms. Sylvia Star-Lack: Thank you, Philip. Good evening Commissioners. It's nice to see your faces,
5 even just on video. I wanted to update you about three things that are Safe Routes to School
6 team has been working on.

7

8 The first is that when the Shelter in Place Order emerged, our Safe Routes to School team was
9 preparing for our busy spring programs in the schools. Our team pivoted quickly to support our
10 students so that they would not miss out on critical safety lessons that they would normally get
11 even now there's no school. They worked with mybikeskills.com to convert our former 5th-
12 grade safety assembly to an online modular-based format, complete with a quiz, that can be
13 taken at the end of class. Students can even print a certificate at the end of the lesson. We're
14 working on converting our 8th grade getting to high school event to an online format as well as
15 our bringing up bicycle class which is for parents of elementary school students. So, we're
16 converting our... some of our in-person curriculum to online and we're really excited about
17 that. It's something we've wanted to do.

18

19 The second thing is because of Shelter in Place we're currently offering one on one and group
20 bike safety appointment, presentations, and consultations to reinforce the rules of the road

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 and support physical distancing guidelines. Due to the increased interested in bicycling that's
2 happening on our streets right now, our Staff is also serving as thought partners to help families
3 make the right choice when purchasing a family, cargo, toddler, or student or ebike. There's
4 been an increase in bike purchases. This increased activity on our streets compliments our very
5 busy year which was already a record-setting one for walking and biking to school.

6
7 And finally, we're very excited about the recent revamp of our Safe Routes to School website.
8 You should all go check it out. We are providing the community with the safety resources
9 needed to accommodate the unprecedented numbers of those walking and biking in our
10 neighborhoods right now. We are pushing these resources out to the community because we
11 realize that many students and families may be taking for granted that our streets are virtually
12 traffic-free. And we want to support their safety during the transition out the Shelter in Place,
13 whenever it happens, by sharing skill-building, education, and materials now. And that's what I
14 have for you today. Thank you.

15
16 Mr. Nate Baird, Parking Manager: Alright thank you, Sylvia. Hello Commissioners, it's nice to
17 meet you all virtually. I am assuming that you guys can hear me and see me just fine. Again, my
18 name is Nathan Baird, I am your new Parking Manager. I am excited to get to be working for
19 you all and the City despite the strange time that I have started here at the City.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 As Philip was saying we've got a lot coming for you in the near future. I've really been wrapping
2 my head around all of your parking planning documents that have been kind of rolled out the
3 last 3 to 5-years. And also, been really looking into all of the background and history of our
4 color zones, our RPPs, the downtown and commercial parking districts that we have, the
5 garages, lots. You know because of COVID-19 we have suspended temporarily all of our parking
6 restrictments, enforcement, as well as our field operations. That includes valet, on-site permit
7 sales support, contract enforcement, parking sign maintenance. All of that has been
8 temporarily suspended but like Philip said we are working hard to queue up a lot of next steps
9 for ourselves to really make an impact and support the local community's quality of life and
10 support our local businesses once the economy does start getting back online and once our
11 COVID-19 restrictions are lifted. So yeah, it's really nice to meet you all virtually. It's been a real
12 pleasure working with the team so far and I look forward to finally getting back to the office for
13 the first time at some point soon. Thank you all.

14

15 Chair Templeton: Alright, thank you so much. Welcome Nathan, we're... or Nate we're really
16 happy to have you here and parking is a fun topic of discussion in this City. So, we're very
17 excited to have you onboard and to meet you through the Commission. I would like to open it if
18 there's any questions that the Commissioners have. Please use the raised hand. I see Bart,
19 Commissioner Hechtman, you can go first and any other Commissioners who wish to ask
20 questions on this City Official Reports can raise their hand now.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Commissioner Hechtman: Thank you. This is a question for the transportation group. I saw in the MERK this morning an article that Redwood City was closing a few streets to help with social distancing and that article mentioned that Palo Alto had already done that which I hadn't heard. Was that an overstatement or a correct statement? I'm just missing the news.

Mr. Kamhi: I think people got really excited when it came up at Council meeting but no, we haven't implemented that yet. We're working on the pilot program. Currently, we know which streets we're looking at and we're working on the details for how we're going to roll it out. And right now, it's really with the Chief Communication Officer who's working on the messaging and all of the information. There's an educational component to this as well because we don't just... we're not just going to tell pedestrians and bicyclists go in the street, you're safe to do it. Its really still pay attention, still, make sure you're looking both ways if you're going to pass somebody in the street. And this is not... we're not endorsing people to go out and set up picnic tables in the middle of the street. We're expecting cars will still be driving on the street. We're just hoping that it's a reduced volume but no, we have not enacted that as of yet.

Commissioner Hechtman: Thank you.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Templeton: Alright I don't see any other Commissioners yet but I wanted to also thank
2 you for working on that program. I'm also interested in the non-local pilot. It's not clear to me if
3 that's the same thing as closing some streets but whatever it is, I'm glad you're working on it.
4 We definitely have a lot of opportunity to experiment and willingness I think from the
5 community to try some of these programs that may have been harder in other times. So, we'll
6 take the opportunity. So also thank you to Sylvia Star-Lack for the safe routes work. I'm
7 receiving a lot of updates about that through my children in the school and also, I'm glad to
8 hear that the online plans are now an available option in planning. That's really exciting so lots
9 of great updates. I really appreciate everybody there. Alright, last chance to raise hands if you
10 want to comment on this? Ok, so Vinh are there any public comments?

11

12 Mr. Vinh Nguyen, Admin Associate III: We don't have any raised hands at the moment but let's
13 give everyone maybe about 10-seconds to see if anyone wants to raise their hand. If anyone
14 wants to speak on this item please raise your hand now.

15

16 Chair Templeton: And a reminder, if you're dialing in by phone you can raise your hand by
17 pressing *9. Oh.

18

19 Mr. Nguyen: Ok so looks like we have one speaker, Winter. One second.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. Dellenbach: Sorry, sorry I forget to do that unmuting. I am assuming this will be a
2 temporary closure and not permanent in any way given that we have a policy of not balkanizing
3 or closing off streets permanently or closing off neighborhoods permanently. So, this is a
4 temporary arrangement which may be really suitable. Can you hear me?

5

6 Chair Templeton: Winter, yes, we can hear you. I'm not sure Staff is allowed to directly respond
7 to that but noted that it would be helpful for Staff to clarify the duration of this experiment and
8 what would happen... would learnings would we take away for the long term if any.

9

10 Ms. Dellenbach: Thank you.

11

12 Mr. Nguyen: Ok thank you, Winter. Looks like we have no more public speakers so we can
13 proceed with the agenda.

14

15 Ms. Tanner: Certainly, if Staff... if Commissioners did want us to respond to that question by the
16 Commissioner's asking it, we could respond to that.

17

18 Chair Templeton: That would be wonderful. Could you please respond to that question?

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Kamhi: Sure, yeah, I'd be happy too. First, I just want to clarify that the City will not be
2 closing any streets so there will not be any closures. We'd be looking at encouraging local traffic
3 only. So, there might be some barriers but we'll not be completely closing any streets. What
4 we'd be doing is asking local traffic only to be using the streets but not enforcing. That said it
5 would be of course temporary. It would really be during this time of the Shelter in Place and of
6 course at this time to be determined when that ends but it looks like at least through the rest of
7 the remainder of this month and then we'll see. This is going to be a pilot. I think we're going to
8 probably try it on three street segments in this initial pilot and kind of see how it goes and get
9 some feedback. I hope that answers your question.

10

11 Chair Templeton: Great thank you.

12

13 [The Commission moved to Item Number Three]

14 **Study Session**

15 Public Comment is Permitted. Five (5) minutes per speaker.^{1,3}

16 2. Study Session to Review and Comment on the Draft Alternatives Proposed for the
17 North Ventura Coordinated Area Plan. Environmental Assessment: Exempt from the
18 California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), Not a Project. For More Information
19 Contact Planner Chitra Moitra at Chitra.Moitra@CityofPaloAlto.org.

20 Chair Templeton: Thank you to all of those who are hanging on until we are able to discuss the

21 NVCAP. So, we are ready for the presentation, and is that Ms. Tanner?

22

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. Rachael Tanner, Assistant Director of Planning: Great, thank you very much Commissioners
2 and Chair Templeton. So, I am going to be presenting the NVCAP presentation so let me get
3 that up here and share my screen and let me enlarge that. Does everyone see a screen North
4 Venture Coordinated Area Plan that has a green background? Excellent. Great.

5
6 Good evening, I'm really excited to present on this project this evening. We also have Chitra
7 Moitra on the line, on the Zoom with us. She is the Staff Planner who's been supporting this
8 project since it's inception and has a lot of history. We also have another new Associate
9 Planner, Nicole Loreola, she's not on the Zoom this evening but she's also been providing some
10 support to this project.

11
12 I became the project manager for this project when Elena Lee departed the City last August.
13 And so, I'm a relative newcomer compared to Chitra and our working group members but I'm
14 really excited to be part of it and really privileged to be a part of this really important work that
15 Palo Alto citizens, you all, the Council, etc. are undertaking.

16
17 I want to give a big shout out and notice to our working group members. There are many of
18 them who are actually on the line right now who are part of the Zoom. I'm just going to see if I
19 can see who's there. Although with my screen share I'm not sure how to get to my panel
20 anymore so I will tell you who I saw beforehand, who I can remember. I believe that we had

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Kirsten Flynn, we have Angela Dellaporta who's one of our Chairs... one of our two co-Chairs,
2 Keith Reckdahl and Alex Lou. Keith is also on our Parks and Recreation Commissions and Alex on
3 our Architectural Review Board. So, I want to thank them for doing double duty along with
4 Commissioner Summa who's a member of the working group who has proceeded in that by
5 Commissioner Templeton or Chair Templeton before she was on I think the PTC role. And I
6 think we had some other members there and other folks who've been following this project.
7 So, I'm really really thankful for all of them for their work. This process has gone on for longer
8 than we told them it was going to when they signed and so we really thank them for hanging in
9 there with us. And there are a number of members of the working group who... for whom it's
10 their first real foray into public service or into a public Board or advisory body. And I think that's
11 really great and I hope they don't get frustrated but they see the power they have and the
12 chance to really impact their community and stick with it. And I also want to recognize the City
13 Council for helping to initiate this process and of course, we have a great team of consultants
14 lead by Perkins and Will and supported by ARUP, Strategic Economics, Planned to Place, also
15 Rincon [note – sounds like] and WRA and Page and Turnbull who've done some work for this
16 project. So, I say that in part to let you know that this work is not my own. It is the work of
17 many, many, many people, and I'm doing my best this evening to present it to you tonight.

18

19 And I do just want to have one note, you will notice the page numbers of this presentation are
20 not in order. We had some technical difficulties with a couple really dense slides. And so, we're

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 not able to present those tonight in the slide presentation but we do have those available. They
2 were part of your Packet. So, if you notice the pages get kind of weird, get high fast, that is why.

3

4 So, with that, we'll talk a little bit about the goals, vision, and the process of this NVCAP. So, the
5 North Ventura Coordinated Area Plan is going to be a regulatory document that captures the
6 vision for roughly 60-acre area of Palo Alto. It's an area that's bounded by El Camino, Page Mill,
7 Lambert, and Park Boulevards/Caltrain. Caltrain's kind of on the side there but Park Boulevard
8 runs through with a little sliver between Park and the Caltrain Boulevard sliver of land there.

9

10 The 2030 Comprehensive Plan which was adopted I believe in 2017 outlined that this would be
11 a priority in Program L-4.10.1 of the Comp Plan. And that stated that this would be a walkable
12 neighborhood with multi-family housing, ground floor retail, a public park, creek
13 improvements, and an interconnected street grid. The idea in that program is that this plan
14 would guide the development towards a well-designed, mixed-use district with diverse land
15 uses and pedestrian-oriented streets. And so, we started this project I think with a really good
16 blueprint from that Comp Plan of what this project would do and what the purpose of this
17 project is.

18

19 And the purpose tonight of this meeting is to begin the PTC's engagement through a study
20 session of understanding what has been done to date and some of the dynamics of the project

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 and the site. And specifically, look at three draft alternatives and other aspects of the project
2 and hopefully for you to provide comment. But also, for those members of the public who are
3 weighing in to also provide their feedback on the project, on the draft alternatives, and on
4 where we go from here.

5

6 So, the Staff report includes a thorough review of the activities that have been taken to date
7 and on our path that we are on. So, I'll just summarize them very briefly here. We began...
8 started with the Comprehensive Plan and then in 2017 in November we applied for and
9 successfully received and accepted a federal grant. At which time the City Council also initiated
10 the area planning process in accordance with the rules of the Palo Alto Municipal Code. We
11 then... then in March of the following year Council adopted project goals followed the next
12 month appointing a 14-member working group. And then selecting a prime consultant that
13 summer and in the fall of 2018, we kicked off the project officially with Perkins and Will and
14 Staff leading the working group through a process. Along the way, we've also had several
15 meetings with decision making bodies and also with advisory bodies. So, we've met with City
16 Council, Historic Resources Board, Parks, and Recreation Committee, and the City School
17 Committee.

18

19 So, where we are tonight is over on the left in the refine as we head in towards the spring and
20 the summer. So, we had a workshop in February where we talked about the three draft

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 alternatives and had about 50 members of the public out to partake in activities and give their
2 feedback. We also created a survey which closed this month... opened and closed this month to
3 also get more feedback on those alternatives that were presented at the workshop. To make
4 space for those who weren't able to come in person to be able to still give their feedback.
5 We're having our PTC meeting tonight and then we'll have a working group meeting next
6 month where we are also expecting to get lots of feedback from folks. We have a homework
7 assignment which I shared with you all via email. You can take a look at their homework and
8 we're looking forward to really hearing from them what they think about the alternatives that
9 we've presented. In addition, we've had five working group members create alternatives
10 inspired by this whole process that also provide another point for us to reflect and kind of think
11 about what we want to do. And the whole goal really is kind of what is sometimes unflatteringly
12 called sausage making but its' really taking the parts of everything, mixing it all together.
13 Somethings get left behind, somethings stay in, and ultimately, we have hopefully one
14 preferred alternative which is what we hope to bring to City Council. Now we may not be
15 bringing one preferred alternative to City Council. Maybe we'll narrow down from all the
16 alternatives just to two, go to City Council, and get further direction and help... have them to
17 help guide us on kind of this is the direction that they more want to go. We can then do a few
18 studies of that alternative that's selected, come to the PTC again for recommendation before
19 taking that recommendation to City Council to be the preferred alternative that becomes the
20 draft plan. Documents get written, we have environmental assessment and then Council

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 adoption. So, you can see there's a lot of sausage making left and so I know there's a lot that
2 we will be presenting tonight and that was in the Staff report. So, thank you again for dipping
3 your toes into this project.

4
5 So, we've made a lot of progress and it really started here looking at these whole that we have.

6 So, you can see here on the left-hand side the City Council goals that were adopted in March
7 2018. You can see they track a lot with the different outcomes or goals that were outlined in
8 the Comprehensive Plan. And then on the right-hand column, you can see the working group
9 vision. This is a portion of the working group's vision that was helped... was crafted with lots of
10 help and leadership from Angela Dellaporta who led the working group through a great exercise
11 to really pull out... the goals I think have a great goal post for us. Housing and land use,
12 transportation, bike, and pedestrian, but the visions really is a narrative that really brings to life
13 what it is that we're seeking to create in the NVCAP and kind of a little bit of the why. Why did
14 do these things matter and what would that look and feel like if it were to be realized? Some of
15 the things that stick out are the idea of European style town square with an open plaza. The
16 idea that buildings designs would fit well into the existing context and they might range from
17 three to six stories, be interconnected with bicycle and pedestrian paths. There would be local
18 serving retails like cafes, local markets, maybe even a theater, and there'd be a lot of lively foot
19 traffic that'd be drawn to these uses and to the area. That has diverse housing opportunities
20 and importantly not a lot of intrusion from cars into this wonderful town square and this

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 vibrant and bustling area. So that's the vision we're going to for and I think if we continue to be
2 collaborative and work together, make some compromises, we definitely will get there.

3
4 So, this section is going to by no means do justice to the rich history or the present character of
5 the Ventura neighborhood. And I hope that not only the Staff report but other documents and
6 maybe even some of our public commenters can speak to really the vibrancy of the area, the
7 importance of the area in Palo Alto, and the unique neighborhoods that it is beyond just some
8 of the characteristics of the location.

9
10 So, it's a very diverse area in Palo Alto. It's majority white but has a significant Asian population
11 at 38 percent, black population is about 3 percent, and those of other races are about 1
12 percent. And even though it's a small African American population it's significantly larger than
13 other parts of the City. In terms of tenancy, its 55 percent renter-occupied and 45 percent
14 home owner-occupied which is a little bit different than the balance of most other... if you look
15 at the City as a whole, the balance tends to shift the other way. And then lastly in terms of
16 educational attainment, you've got about 76 percent of those who are over age 25 have a
17 Bachelors's Degree or higher. So again, an educated area but also one of those areas that has
18 been for many times seen... for a long time in Palo Alto seen as a more affordable neighbor.
19 Granted affordability is very relative in the Bay Area here but I think that legacy of being
20 affordable, being a place where people can access housing, and having maybe some smaller

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 lots than some other parts of Palo Alto making it more affordable. Affordability has been a
2 really key priority for the working group for the community members ensuring that people can
3 of diverse incomes, of diverse work, and kind of careers can live here in Palo Alto and this be a
4 neighborhood where they can or perhaps continue to live or move if they are not able to live in
5 other parts of Palo Alto.

6

7 In terms of land use, the area is got a lot of diverse land uses as well. You can see a cross on the
8 across the Caltrain is dominated by single-family homes. But here in the project area, which is
9 outlined here in this black box here, you can see that there's a lot of commercial service
10 wrapping down Lambert Avenue and on to El Camino Real. You also see that there's quite a bit
11 of Research and Office Park and this of course here being the Stanford Research Park. It's also
12 adjacent to the California... Cal Ave Business District and this red dotted line here than you can
13 see outlining a larger area. That's the California Avenue Priority Development Area and that is a
14 regional planning designation indicating that so this is an area where the City Council said as we
15 have increased population and need to grow regionally. This is a place with its adjacency to
16 transportation and to jobs, that would be a good place to have some growth be located.

17

18 So, to put a little bit more context on the uses here, you can see this map which shows some of
19 the existing uses. Purple being office uses, this light pink here being personal services, the
20 darker pink being neighborhood-serving commercial retail, and you can also see the single-

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 family homes here on Olive. And then wrapping right here, Pepper and Ash Street having the
2 single-family homes. This building here at the corner of Page Mill and Park Boulevard is the
3 headquarters for Cloudera and so they have an officer here. They have a surface parking lot and
4 then also a parking structure here. And then 340 Portage which is the building that until very
5 recently, at the end of last year, had Fry's electronics and also has other office uses mixed here.
6 I will note that there should be a significant portion, about 60,000 -70,000 of square feet of this
7 building, designated as the dark pink and having retail uses because it is designated as an office
8 and retail building. The black outlines on this map indicate a site that is a housing opportunity
9 site. So, for example, you can kind of see it wrapping around this site here, this block here, and
10 throughout the plan area. The housing opportunity sites are identified in our Certified Housing
11 Element as areas where we can build housing when we need to meet our RHNA Housing Needs
12 Allocation. That allocation which comes periodically, we're about to get our next allocation for
13 the next 8-year cycle, indicates how much housing a City or jurisdiction would need to build
14 over that 8-year time period to accommodate the projected population growth for that region
15 or for that jurisdiction. And so, when you add up all the sites that we identify as housing
16 opportunity sites it equals the number of units that are in our RHNA Allocation. If you look at all
17 these sites in black it equals about 350 realistic yield of units that we think could have gone
18 here based on our most recent Housing Element.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 If you look at this map you can a bit of the common and contiguous ownership of land in this
2 area. So, compared to SOFA I, which resulted when the Palo Alto Medical Foundation relocated,
3 this plan doesn't have single land ownership from one landowner. And so, it really is a
4 collaboration between the community, between the City, between the property owners,
5 between the neighbors, residents, tenants. A lot of stakeholders to have an interest in what
6 goes on here and it's not just kind of one landowner and then the City and community
7 negotiating with that entity. You can see the Cloudera site here is a large site, the largest site
8 being 340 Portage again where the Fry's is which also includes some additional and adjacent
9 parcels. You can see it crosses the creek here. And I think not to leave out some of the obvious
10 characteristics of the area, it's located on a very high capacity street, El Camino Real, that has
11 group and bus service. It's located near Caltrain which is commuter services which also not only
12 the service to that stop but also, it's served by the Stanford Research Park and the Marguerite
13 Shuttle. And also has a wonderful creek that's flowing through it that right now is channelized
14 and not showing its natural beauty but again is a great natural resource that we have. And also,
15 again all the wonderful families who live here and the folks who work here in these... in the
16 project area.

17

18 So, I want to get a little bit this evening into some of the plan elements. Again, I know there are
19 a lot of topics that I won't be touching on in my oral presentation but I do welcome the
20 Commissioners to ask questions about them. And so, we're going to start out by looking at

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 some of the building typologies that were proposed. Again, I do apologize I have some great
2 renders of these buildings that have a lot more life and detail. Those were the slides that were
3 crashing the program so I will not be able to show those on-screen this evening. Again, if you do
4 have questions please let me know and I can make sure you also have those slides in non-
5 crashing your computer format. So, the building typologies that we have here are five
6 typologies. They're... starting here in this box they're townhomes which are three-stories,
7 attached units that have parking at grade underneath. So, you can see that little grey box there,
8 that's where the person might drive down this center aisle and park their car beneath. Then
9 they have a front stoop here and kind of front green area. We have the low-rise Greenway
10 which is a four-story building, it's about 107 dwelling units per acre, it would be parked at one
11 parking space per unit, and the idea is the parking would be underground. And you can see
12 again that there's still provided green space around this building here. Then you have three
13 buildings that look a little similar, a low-rise block neighborhood-serving commercial and then a
14 mid-rise block. So, this low-rise block is four-stories tall and I know some folks for... do not
15 believe low-rise is four-stories and I think that's totally fine. We can come up with terminology
16 that fits our community better. The typical density here would be 124 dwelling units per acre
17 and it would be for sale or it could work as rental but most of these were modeled as... well,
18 they're modeled as for sale and rental. Again, one parking space per unit, and there'd be a
19 center courtyard here. This building is very similar but it's five-stories with neighborhood-
20 serving commercial on the ground floor. And part of the reason for the increased height there is

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 to offset having that space that was dedicated to rental uses or housing uses becoming retail
2 use. And so that's the additional floor there and then we have an eight-story mid-rise block.
3 Again, to think about something what if we were to do something at a higher scale or higher
4 density what might that look like? And where would members of our community and your self
5 as Commissioners think that would be appropriate or not appropriate in Palo Alto? That typical
6 density is about 159 dwelling units per acre and you'd note that it steps back here at the 6th
7 floor. So, trying to give a little bit more air and light to the street. So, all of these you will note
8 are pretty boring buildings or as we had thought Lego looking buildings. The idea again is that
9 these are massing models, they are not the architectural details of what the buildings would
10 look like. Really you could have these buildings in terms of density or general shape look like
11 anything. They could be looking like more modern buildings, we could do kind of a faux historic
12 look, can go to really any architectural style we want. We really wanted to focus on what type
13 of heights, what type of relationship to the street, the open space do we want, and we can have
14 the architectural conversation as we continue this process.

15

16 I won't go into detail on these slides but they are here in case we want to return to them. Really
17 just looking at the Financial Feasibility Analysis conducted by Strategic Economics that really
18 looked at what is the average market sales price of these properties and what's feasible. You
19 can also see here some of the community benefits that are provided by that. So, this townhome
20 model, for example, would have three below market rate units provided on-site. If they are

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 building the market unit... the units on-site they wouldn't be doing the In-Lieu Fee. These are
2 modeled as ownership and so you can see that the Park Revenue Fee would be about \$147,000
3 and so that's a way to think about how the community benefits. We might yield from these
4 different development types. And you can see for example here, they looked at the mid-rise
5 with the retail as rental and it was not feasible. So, this is the type of exercise that was gone
6 through. State the obvious with COVID-19 and the economy I think we all have somewhat of a
7 question mark about the immediate future for the construction industry look like for housing,
8 for retail, for office. All of these things. So, I want to say that we know that we don't know
9 what's coming but we hope that this project has a 10 to 20-year really future looking like span.
10 And so that we can be flexible and really create a plan that could adapt to what changes might
11 happen in the economy.

12
13 So, this is an idea, Complete Community Metrics. One of the working group exercises was to
14 present and provide example Cities or areas that the working group liked to use as precedent to
15 say what are some areas that we might want to emulate as we move forward with the NVCAP?
16 And so, you have here in green is the NVCAP itself area, you have The Yards, Emeryville,
17 University Avenue, Oak Park, Pearl District, and Central Square. And so, then you have these
18 different bars that are looking what's the population density of those areas? What's the job
19 density of those areas? What about retail services? And then this over here is intersection
20 density which is the measure of thinking about how walkable an area is. If there's a lot of

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 intersections and points where pedestrians or bicycles can cross and connect to different uses.
2 And so, you can see the NVCAP and Cal Ave area kind of here in different regards, in a different
3 relationship to these metrics. And so, what our consultants did is use that to say ok, well if
4 we're going to try to have this really vibrant, walkable place, how do we measure up compared
5 to some of these other places that we really liked? And you can see in terms of retail sales and
6 services we're pretty on par with where we need to go and so maybe if we calibrate our growth
7 of retail sales and services that would be great. No surprise there's a lot of job density there.
8 Right across the street from the Research Park near Cal Ave. There are quite a lot of jobs in the
9 area already. We're looking at a vibrancy target of having more people living in the area. That
10 will bring again that part of that walkable population. People who are walking to work and
11 people who are using those shops and the retail that we want to see there.

12
13 So, with that, I will get into the three different draft alternatives that we have to discuss this
14 evening. So Alternative One is the Minimum as per Comprehensive Plan and so just to orient
15 you to how these are laid out. You obviously have the key up here that tells you the different
16 types of housing and then a key over here which will change on the next page even though it
17 will be on the same alternative. And you can see the total number of housing units is 514 but
18 that's an addition of 386 through the buildings that are part of this plan. We also have an office
19 space. This is actually a decrease because some of the buildings here have office uses and, in
20 this model, they have been turned into house instead of office. And similar with the retail,

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 some of the retail uses are going away and becoming housing. There is open space here that is
2 perhaps publicly accessible though privately owned but we're not able to get to our publicly
3 owned centralized park that we want in this model. Primarily because we're not really seeing a
4 lot of development. We're seeing again about 386 which is just a little bit more than the
5 Comprehensive Plan calls for. And in terms of residence, how many people do we think might
6 live in those units? An additional 926 people, jobs might be about 822 employees, and that's
7 really looking at the ratio of jobs per space. And so different office and retail have different jobs
8 per space and of course, those numbers can be debated as to what is the better and definitely
9 in post COVID environment. How many people will be in offices? I know and how far away they
10 will be is your guess it probably as good as mine in that. You can see these are distributed
11 between townhomes and apartment-style buildings.

12

13 Alternative Two is Prioritizes Portage and so this really was a strong idea that I think is... has a
14 lot of traction in the working group. Is that really if Portage Avenue could become kind of a
15 main street that really is part of the central core for the vibrancy of the neighborhood, that
16 would be a goal that we would want to try to achieve. And one of the ideas is to reconnect
17 Portage but to have this portion here right in front of the 340 Portage building, that might be
18 pedestrian or bicycle access only. Perhaps closed with bollards or just some other means to
19 makes sure that cars are not driving there. So, it really becomes that there's retail here, looking
20 over here, people are passing from this park alongside the creek over to the retail, back and

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 forth. And then this park over here, if we did have a path along the creek it would come over
2 here and right in this area is where the expansion of Boulware Park is slated to be. Near the
3 AT&T building and that part of land that the City just purchased last year. So, there could really
4 be this nice green connection cross Lambert Avenue and into the plan area. Again, you see
5 more buildings here along El Camino, you see that there's some retail here. Again, on Portage
6 as kind of this main street with some townhome buildings coming online here. A parking
7 structure in part to be able to take the parking here and where would those workers and
8 visitors who are coming to 340 Portage Park if they're coming not from within a walking
9 distance of the neighborhood? It would be in this area. There's also you see introduced an idea
10 perhaps that maybe there could be ways to allow in ways that don't displace current tenants.
11 Allow these buildings to become four plexus which are currently single-family homes. Currently,
12 owners are allowed to build an ADU and a Junior ADU and a main house which is three units.
13 So, in some ways maybe envisioning how to do that in a way that might maximize not just the
14 opportunity for development but really for nice habitable units that really contribute to the
15 feeling of the neighborhood. So again, you can see the numbers over here. I won't go over all of
16 them just for the sake of time but we do get...we hope a little bit more ability to perhaps have
17 some centralized green space. Perhaps it is publicly owned, again that would be working with
18 the property owners and with the City to be able to make that publicly owned or at least
19 publicly accessible. And that's that dark green color that's here.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Design Diversity looks at really kind of bringing on a lot more parcels into development
2 potential and so you can see similarly we have Portage Avenue here. This proposal... this draft
3 does envision that and perhaps the Fry's buildings is demolished. And that if that building were
4 demolished and replaced with housing but also some office component. That is a bit more than
5 the office component that's currently there but part of the tradeoff being perhaps then we're
6 able to get some of the housing built there. Similarly, the Cloudera building is imagined to still
7 have some office. It has a little bit more office than currently is there at site right now but again
8 getting more housing, getting some public parkland. This is really trying to think about what
9 kind of trade-off might make it beneficial, advisable, or desirable for landowners to turn an
10 office uses and office rents into housing and undertake that work. One thing I will say also
11 about all of these options that you'll see kind of... I'll just go back and forth. Is that you could
12 have this option happen maybe in the next 10-years and then if this option were to become
13 realized. You really haven't lost anything. You haven't created any streets or any pedestrian
14 pathways that you have to break up or go back on but really one plan could build upon the
15 other into the future. You can see we've tried to put townhomes nears the single-family area or
16 maybe this becomes small college clusters or smaller denser units but still kind of in a single-
17 family home like low scale style. And so, we want to have those lines with the townhomes but
18 then larger buildings facing El Camino Real which is a street of a greater scale. And so that scale
19 perhaps is more appropriate for that large street.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ok, so I think I've been talking enough so there... I wanted to point out just a few items that
2 might be helpful for the Commission to opine on that we'd love to hear on. There are many,
3 again many other items that are beyond this that I would love to have your feedback on and
4 Chitra will be taking furious notes. Thank you, Chitra. And these are some of the I think the
5 different trade-offs that we as a working group and as a community have to really think about
6 and wrestle with and try to figure out where we do we land? Some items include the number of
7 housing units. So, there is a desire among many in the working group and I think we saw in a lot
8 of our feedback from the survey folks who really do want housing. And I think Council heard
9 that also this year having housing be a top priority. So, what is the right number of housing
10 units, and then also, where should the location of different building types go? I just talked
11 about Portage Avenue kind of or Portage Street being the center street, this main street. Is that
12 were a lot of the density should go or particularly higher height buildings because then it's away
13 from the single-family areas? And so that height might not be as imposing if it's located
14 elsewhere. Some... another way to think about it is putting more of the density and more of the
15 housing units as close to Caltrain as possible. So that even though that some folks may work in
16 Cal Ave or in the Research Park, they may have partners or other folks living with them who
17 catch the train to go to work. And so that might be a better location to have more of the high-
18 density buildings located.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 We also had talked about non-traditional types of housing like cottage clusters, live/work units,
2 artists lofts. If you have any opinions or experience with those we'd love to hear what you think
3 as well.

4

5 When it comes to retail and office use, I think one of the big tradeoffs we face is this desire to
6 say let's just building housing and zone everything for housing. And then perhaps at least again
7 previous reality that office uses paid a significant rent and were pretty lucrative in Palo Alto.
8 And so, if someone has an office use that is paying its rent and it is generating income, how to
9 incentives ending that office use to build housing. And so, I think that's kind of a discussion that
10 we keep having of how much do we just say no, build housing via zoning or other tools the City
11 might have available such as amortizing the uses, the retail uses, over a period of time and
12 having them cease or trying to say yes, you can build a little bit more office as long as you build
13 housing. Is that trade-off worth it?

14

15 Similarly, with retail, I think that there is a desire to have a lot of retail but there can be a
16 connection between office users and workers in the day time who then use that retail during
17 the daytime. And so, we want to be thoughtful to think about what's that mix between housing,
18 office, and retail that can really create a strong ecosystem.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 For public space, there's a real desire for strong... for open space and I think... I'm totally
2 supportive of. I think we have to pursue making sure that we have public parkland in this area.
3 It's in the Comprehensive Plan, that's part of the goal. So, we've looked at how to look at
4 naturalizing the creek and making the creek more of an asset even within the park of the creek
5 that is not expanding it. But we can do some naturalization, some pathways, some walkways,
6 some bikeways which would be really great. But what's that balance between publicly owned
7 space but also privately owned but publicly accessible space? Is that something that we see has
8 some good potential here in Palo Alto to make sure that as people are building these new
9 apartment buildings, they're also building some space that's for the community to access as
10 well.

11

12 And lastly circulation, there is a pretty strong consensus to promote walking and biking and to
13 really try to keep cars out of here. There's a little bit of a rub with that, not to great though,
14 with the fact that people who live in new housing will likely have at least one car. We see this
15 area in currently already a lot of people have two cars in their household even though a lot of
16 people in the area as it is do walk or bike to work. Which is great but a lot of times for weekend
17 trips or for things around town because Palo Alto and the region is still pretty car-centric,
18 people are likely going to have to have at least one car in their household. So, you need a place
19 to park it and they need a way to get from the main to their parking space. And then also if
20 we're going to have retail, if it's going to survive just on those people who are with walking

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 distance. Then we need a lot of people within walking distance. Conversely, if we're going to
2 draw from a larger area for people to walk and bike and get to the retail. We may also need to
3 have some parking spaces and so trying to balance again the idea of limiting cars but also
4 promoting a lot of cars or a lot of people coming to support that retail uses that are there.

5

6 So those are a couple of points. I'm going to lease those up on the screen but let me know Chair
7 Templeton if you'd like me to take this down and Vinh, you can also put the Zoom to where
8 people can see a gallery view if that's something that is needed or desired.

9

10 Chair Templeton: Great, thank you so much for this presentation. Yeah, let's definitely leave
11 that up for now. I will start to take questions from... and these are content-related questions
12 from the Commissioners if you have any for Ms. Tanner. And then we will go to public comment
13 and then we will entertain this discussion. So, let's try and compartmentalize a little bit to keep
14 some order in this. So, the first hand I see here is Vice-Chair Roohparvar.

15

16 Vice-Chair Roohparvar: Thank you. Thank you for the presentation. It's extremely helpful. So,
17 my question is the 2017 federal grant that kicked off the NVCAP. Were there any strings
18 attached to that or timelines or anything like that that would provide boundaries that we need
19 to stay within? Or do we have the money? How does that work? Do we have the money now
20 and?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Ms. Tanner: Yes, and I will [unintelligible] Chitra in case I forget any of the details because she has been with this project since the inception of the grant and I'm sure is part of the actual grant writing team.

So, in terms of time, we did get a... we are... so it's a grant from Caltrans and it's federal... but it's Federal Past Through Grant. So, the money is coming from the federal government to Caltrans and then to us for essentially doing work in transit-oriented planning work. Which clearly this falls into that bucket and so we need to fulfill the terms of the grant which were to go through with the area plan process. And so, for example, if we were let's say if there's lot of discussion about what needs to get cut in the budget or something like that. Fortunately, this is mostly grant-funded but if for some reason the City said oh we just don't want to do this project anymore. We would need to give any money that we have received through the reimbursement process back and so we wouldn't be able to keep that. So that's one thing. We need to finish the project.

We did get one 2-year extension and so I believe that we need to finish this up by 2022 December is our deadline to go through with the adoption process and all of that.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chitra, are there any other big things that we have to do that I'm missing? I don't hear anything
2 so maybe that's a no but we'll give Chitra a second to find her mute if there's anything else.

3

4 Ms. Chitra Moitra, Project Planner: No there's nothing else other than that. Just the timeline.

5

6 Ms. Tanner: Great thank you.

7

8 Chair Templeton: Commissioner Roohparvar did you have any... I mean Vice-Chair Roohparvar
9 did you have any other questions?

10

11 Vice-Chair Roohparvar: No.

12

13 Chair Templeton: Ok great. Any other hands, Commissioners? I appreciate the question that
14 Vice-Chair Roohparvar just asked. I was also wondering about that so thank you and then do we
15 need to seek any extensions on that related to the COVID crisis emergency?

16

17 Ms. Tanner: At this point in time I don't foresee that. We have... we did miss two meetings. We
18 were supposed to meet in March and in April for the working group but since we have a good
19 2-years plus before we need to conclude I think we should be ok.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Templeton: Ok and then I had a... I think this is a technical question but if you want me to
2 rephrase it for the next section please let me know. But you mentioned in all of these that
3 you're maintaining the streets as they are. Did you have any consideration of reclaiming some
4 of the street area for housing?

5

6 Ms. Tanner: Yeah and what I meant by that is that in any of the proposals... so as you go from
7 Proposal One to Three you obviously have more density. And I didn't go over in detail but we
8 do have some new streets and some of it is making existing streets a little more formal. So, for
9 example, maybe connecting Ash through so that you could get from Ash over to I believe it's
10 Acacia. And so, if we started at Plan One and over time build up to Three [note – Alternative
11 Three], we wouldn't be building housing where we then need to tear it down to build a street
12 or something like that. I don't believe that we're necessarily reclaiming any of the streets for
13 housing because some of the parcels are so big. That in order to have some connectivity work,
14 kind of building a street possibly or pathway, pedestrian or car or bike pathway through that.
15 So, we didn't contemplate vacating any streets but the street network in the area is broken up
16 by some of those big land parcels.

17

18 Chair Templeton: Ok I got it, so it's not... there's not really a discussion of a campus type effect
19 for this. We're keeping the grid the way it is for now in the discussions that we're having.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. Tanner: I would say...yeah so if you look... so this is One [note- Alternative One] and so you
2 can see here this is actually a little street here that goes around the building and then you can
3 connect over here. But it's pretty narrow and so then maybe we'd make sure that actually is a
4 street that is connecting. And then there could be a street you could connect here and then
5 connect actually over here to Olive. Sorry, I said Acacia, that's Olive. So that would be a new
6 connection and if you... if we built this version first, here's a house. Well, next version the
7 houses are still there and the street can be connected through.

8
9 Chair Templeton: Got it. Alright, thank you, this is a great presentation. Very helpful. I don't see
10 any more hands from Commissioners. Last call before we go to public comment. Alright, so Vinh
11 can you please lead us through the public comment. I know we had several folks dialing in to
12 comment.

13
14 Mr. Vinh Nguyen, Admin Associate III: Yes, so for this item we have six public comments. First
15 will be Rebecca Sanders followed by Ken Joye followed by Angela Dellaporta followed by
16 Winter and then Kelsey Banes. Last but not least we have Kirsten Flynn. If there's anyone else
17 who wishes to speak on this item please raise your hand now. First, we have Rebecca. Rebecca,
18 I see you have two user accounts in this meeting so I will unmute the first account first and if
19 that doesn't work we'll try the second one, ok? So, let me go ahead and get the timer up and

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 then Rebecca if you can go ahead and try to speak. Rebecca are you there? I have unmuted you
2 on my end but you have to unmute from your computer as well.

3

4 Ms. Sanders: Can you hear me now?

5

6 Mr. Nguyen: Yes.

7

8 Ms. Sanders: Alright right on. Thank you. Let me just pull my stuff together here. Thank you.

9 Alright, have you... are you starting my timer like right now? Is it my time?

10

11 Mr. Nguyen: Yes.

12

13 Ms. Sanders: Ok, yes, my name is Becky Sanders. I'm moderator of the Ventura Neighborhood

14 Association. I do not speak for all Venturians but I speak for Ventura Neighborhood Association

15 who has been following this process closely. And we have discussions monthly and bi-monthly

16 about the progress of NVCAP. So, I want to thank you City Staff for the presentation and all your

17 hard work. And thank you, Commissioners, for convening and discussing.

18

19 We Venturians have been watching with growing frustration the NVCAP process. This is our

20 neighborhood and for us, NVCAP was to be a really iterative, inclusive process where the

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 working group would be empowered to take our feedback, brainstorm, understand existing
2 conditions, and synthesize all those good ideas through the funnel and come up with some
3 exciting options for us. But the reality is this, none of the proposals put forth by Perkins and Will
4 really reflect the wishes of the people of Ventura and do not really reflect the will of the
5 working group. The three proposals are not alternatives, they are gradations of the same plan,
6 Stage One, Stage Two, Stage Three. There's nothing that they did that really addresses or
7 honors the space or even looks like it belongs in Ventura.

8
9 So, the working group has never had a chance to discuss the proposals which were presented
10 tonight. They were never able to put forth their own design to the group for discussion. None of
11 the proposals seem to be site-specific. They're not really designed with current zoning or
12 context or conditions in mind. Now we Venturians have been waiting 25-years as it is for the
13 Fry's site to revert to housing. That's what we said back in the day. It's in the record. Fry's was
14 supposed to wither away and then be replaced by housing. We really want housing there like
15 other neighborhoods.

16
17 Ok and so I met with Jonathan right before... Jonathan Lait right before the quarantine and I
18 asked him if we couldn't slow down the train here to give the NVCAP working group a chance to
19 really dig into the process. And he did tell me that they needed to get the work done in order to
20 meet the deadline. So, I'm really excited about this 2-year extension. I hope that gives us a

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 chance for course correction. So, but even if we had to give the money back, it's kind of
2 foliaceous. I mean the bus is packed, the tires have air, the fuel... and fuel, people are on the
3 bus but they weren't really sure which direction they should take and they don't really know
4 where they're going. So, I kind of felt like the NVCAP process laughed and drove all over the
5 place and was kind of wandering through the wilderness.

6

7 Ok so everyone always freaks out when you say eminent domain. So, if we don't want to use
8 that tool, which by the way has been used in Palo Alto to create the Opportunity Center for
9 example, what tools do we have? Well how about a moratorium for additional development in
10 the planned area until we can figure out what we're going to do? Zoning, let's get rid of that
11 commercial use which allows the owners to reap these enormous rental benefits.

12

13 And so, I just think the goal slide that Rachael showed, which was lovely, about the NVCAP
14 visions said nothing about office and kept the focus on the community-serving retail. So, we
15 don't want office, we want housing. And so, we really hope that you will take it to heart to use
16 the NVCAP area to help solve our housing problem and housing for everyone at all price ranges.

17 Thank you so much.

18

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Nguyen: Ok thank you, Rebecca. So, we just have another member of the public who just
2 raised their hand, L. David Baron. David, you will be our last speaker after Kirsten. Up next we
3 have Ken. Ok Ken, if you can just unmute your microphone you may speak. Ken are you there?

4

5 Mr. Ken Joye: I'm having trouble unmuting.

6

7 Mr. Nguyen: Ok we can hear you now.

8

9 Mr. Joye: Ok. This is Ken Joye. I've lived in the Ventura Neighborhood since 1992. I thank you
10 for the opportunity to speak to you this evening. Joe Simitian, when addressing the Stanford
11 GUP used the phrase "full mitigation". When considering this Staff report, please ask yourself
12 whether the impact of the proposed alternatives upon the Ventura Neighborhood could be fully
13 mitigated. That is what would be required to mitigate the impact of proposed development
14 upon our neighborhood? Furthermore please consider whether other adjoining neighborhoods
15 are absorbing any of the impact of development and traffic in our community? Certainly, Palo
16 Alto needs to add housing to attack the jobs-housing ratio but at what cost?

17

18 Regarding the Staff report you've been given tonight please ask Staff why it states three draft
19 plan alternatives have been created when only Alternative Three, Page 32 of 54, actually covers

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 the entire study area? Seemingly, only one full alternative actually has been created as Becky
2 just noted.

3

4 Lastly, I would suggest to you that it is inappropriate to make policy decisions based upon
5 whether a project pencils out for a commercial developer. Rather we should zone for what we
6 want as a community and not allow commercial developers to build something which is non-
7 conforming.

8

9 Also, we should not allow a property owner to lease a building for a use which does not meet
10 the zoning or which is different from the existing legal non-conforming use at the time the
11 zoning was established. If 340 Portage Avenue was allowed to have retail use at the time it was
12 zoned RM-30, that should be strictly enforced. We don't need more office space to fill up where
13 Fry's retail was. Thank you and thank you for your work on this effort.

14

15 Mr. Nguyen: Thank you, Ken. Our next speaker is Angela Dellaporta. Angela, if you can unmute
16 your microphone from your computer you may speak.

17

18 Ms. Dellaporta: Hello, can you hear me?

19

20 Mr. Nguyen: Yes, we can hear you.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Ms. Dellaporta: Ok great. Thanks, yes, my name's Angela Dellaporta and I'm a member of the
3 working group. And first I want to thank all of the working group members for all of their hard
4 work, all of my neighbors in Ventura for their attention to this project, and also, I want to thank
5 Rachael and Chitra for providing so much information and help as we move forward or try to
6 move forward with this process.

7

8 I want to make sure that the Commissioners know that the three alternatives that Rachael
9 presented are not the only alternatives. The working group members have come up with some
10 or some working group members have come up with five different alternatives to the
11 alternatives that are guided by the vision that Rachael shared with you. And we will be
12 discussing those at our next meeting and I think that they do address a lot of the concerns that
13 many people have had on the working group and in the neighborhood. Though we'll have to
14 see but I think they do address a lot of the concerns and are guided by that vision as I said.

15

16 I do want to add also that many of us are concerned about new construction that is just
17 springing up in the NVCAP area before we have had a chance to say anything about what we
18 recommend. And we do think... many of us think that it would be important not to allow new
19 construction when we have not had a chance to decide what we as a City, as a neighborhood
20 and as a City, what we really want to see there. So that's it, thank you very much.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Nguyen: Thank you, Angela. Our next speaker is Winter. Winter, I have unmuted your microphone. If you can please unmute your microphone from your end you may speak.

Ms. Dellenbach: Yes, as to these three so-called plans. You know they're no parking studies, they're not based on any zoning codes that we have, they don't conform to our development standards, they basically disregard our Park Land Dedication requirements, they're in no way reality-based, therefore there's no real way that they can be compared. So, the results are... that were presented with are false choices and they're presented... they were presented to us in a very bias, poorly designed survey and now they're presented to you, Planning Commissioners, and to the public tonight and I really find this disturbing.

You know if Plan Three were built out, do you realize and I wonder if people on the NVCAP where ever... it was ever explained to them that it would be 18 times denser, 18 times denser than anything else in Palo Alto. Plan Three, 18 times denser than anything else in Palo Alto with all the implications that that brings in terms of overflow parking, traffic, everything, and the consequences for the Ventura neighborhood.

The first plan includes no additional parks, the second only 1.1-acres of open space, and the third 2.7-acres. And open space includes plaza, even some setbacks, narrow strips. For

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 comparison, Heritage Park downtown is 2.0-acres of grass, trees, and children’s play acres.
2 Actually, a useable park.

3
4 Under the Park Land Dedication, I want to read you the relevant part. The... in second... Plan
5 Three. The amount of land required is 531-square feet per single-family home and 366-square
6 feet per a multi-family unit. The multi-family rate typically applies to anything other than single-
7 family detached units. Do you realize how... the amount of park required in this town and how
8 under... how both... all of these alternatives do not meet up to the amount of parkland.

9
10 In addition to Boul Park is a very small park and the Ventura neighborhood is the most
11 underserved, has the lowest income, and is most diverse. And I think this very poorly serves the
12 good people of the Ventura Neighborhood and takes advantage of them. I think that it is boards
13 on economic racism. And I think that this town should be a... I think... not this town but I think
14 you need to rethink this. Seriously. That’s what I think about this. Thank you.

15
16 Mr. Nguyen: Ok thank you, Winter. We have another member of the public who just raised
17 their hand. Mark. Mark, you will be our last speaker after L. David Baron. Thank you. Our next
18 speaker will be Kelsey Banes. Ok, Kelsey, if you can please unmute your microphone and then
19 you can speak.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson’s presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. Banes: Hi, can you hear me?

2

3 Mr. Nguyen: Yes, we can hear you.

4

5 Ms. Banes: Great. So, hi Planning Commissioners and Staff. Thank you very much for your
6 service during this difficult time. So, I would just like to say that I am really excited about the
7 opportunity for this location. It's one of the few large sites in Palo Alto and we really have the
8 opportunity to create a great neighborhood that is walkable and serves the needs of our
9 community. And I know that one of the biggest needs that's been expressed has been our dire
10 need for housing at all income levels. And that came across in the survey data, it has been
11 expressed many times, and I think we have the opportunity to over the course of time adds a
12 lot of housing and serves a lot of residents and future residents at this parcel.

13

14 And one thing I wanted to note is that if we care about affordable housing if we want to
15 prioritize it, that is going to require density. The way that you get a lot of affordable housing is
16 with density. I'll share that last night I was advocating for a project in San Mateo, it is 225 new
17 affordable homes and that was made possible because it was a seven-story building and they
18 did the parking off-site. It's a beautiful building and I wish we were looking at this site at doing
19 some district parking rather than doing all underground parking. Which is much more expensive

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 and I think makes buildings look a lot uglier. So, I wish we were doing some looking at shared
2 parking structures without doing that underground parking.

3
4 The other point I wanted to make is just about the survey results which I was excited to see that
5 the survey results suggested that people prioritize housing and that people were open to the
6 low rise four and five-story buildings. And even though the mid-rise buildings were more
7 controversial, I will note that still, a majority of respondents supported those buildings. And I do
8 think there was a pretty skewed sample in that only 20 percent of survey respondents were
9 renters. Despite renters making up a majority of the Ventura Neighborhood. So, in the future, I
10 would like to potentially see more outreach to renters as renters really stand to be the
11 beneficiaries of this plan if it's done well. So, thank you again and that's all. Bye.

12
13 Mr. Nguyen: Thank you, Kelsey. Ok, our next speaker will be Kirsten. Let's see, ok Kirsten, if you
14 will please unmute your microphone.

15
16 Ms. Flynn: Ok. So, I want to thank Staff for the presentation and the Commissioners for meeting
17 on this topic. I am Kirsten Flynn and I'm a member of the NVCAP. And we are committed group
18 of citizens who love our City and our region and are very much willing to work hard to hash out
19 a creative solution. We've given countless hours to this process and it has not been an ideal
20 process and now, of course, we're faced with working through this horrible health crisis.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

So first of all, I want to express that I'm eager for this to be a robust process where we really delve in deep and dissect the plans and the plans that our working group has come up with. And I think for that to happen I strongly support a permit freeze for new projects in this area.

We have gotten to the point where we know a great deal of what interests and concerns people about this project area. And I thought I'd share with you what I see as the key themes.

First of all, inclusive and affordable housing, even though not everyone has made peace with density. So that is just... I guess you could call that an opportunity to communicate that.

Secondly, the bike boulevard along Park, especially in the traffic conflict area around Park and Page Mill, is very much an area of concern and improving the east-west connections to our already robust north-south bicycle routes. Very important to the community, it comes up consistently as one of our most important things in this region. Thirdly, traffic in that... El Camino and Page Mill, I don't need to tell you, is a broken intersection. It's one of... it's the worst in the City and one of the worst along El Camino and it constantly causes cut-through traffic in the neighborhood. And this is a great concern to all of the people we have heard from.

Both from the quality of the street life and from the safety of the bike boulevard. And therefore, one of the options has the parking structure very close to bike boulevard which I think as the more crossings you add to the bike boulevard of car in egress and outgo. The more you're asking for that... the quality of the bike boulevard to be decreased. So, I'd just thought

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 I'd share what I was hearing from working group members and from the public as you look at
2 this plan.

3

4 Mr. Nguyen: Ok thank you, Kirsten. Our next speaker is L. David Baron. David, can you please
5 unmute your microphone and you will have 3-minutes to speak.

6

7 Mr. L. David Baron: Can you hear me?

8

9 Mr. Nguyen: Yes, we can hear you.

10

11 Mr. Baron: Good. So good even Commission. I think there are number of things I've said at
12 public comment at various times before that are worth repeating very briefly. We have a crisis
13 level housing storage in the Bay Area and you can see this in the prices of housing and the
14 people who are being pushed out of the area. I'm a big supporter of having dense housing near
15 transit. That's good for the environment, it's something that many people want.

16

17 Given those things, I think I would encourage supporting one of the plans... supporting the end
18 of the spectrum that has more housing density. I don't think that... I don't have an opinion on
19 whether it needs to be looking like Alternative Three but I think something with that density or
20 potentially, even more, is the kind of thing the City should be looking at. If the City has a target

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 in its next RHNA cycle of 10,000 to 15,000 units, which I think is something that's plausible, the
2 City's going to miss that target by a lot if one of the largest developable parcels is
3 underdeveloped.

4
5 I think... so I live on the other side of the City in University South and I think my own
6 neighborhood has significant under zoning. And a bunch of that zoning was done... redone in a
7 Comprehensive Plan about 20-years for the south of Forest area and a number of those areas
8 that were rezoned many of the parcels didn't end up being redeveloped. And when we do see
9 development proposals in say the RT-35 Zone, I remember one a few years ago, they look very
10 small and we wonder why people are building these small things in a place that should... that
11 we feel today should have bigger things.

12
13 So, I would just both encourage looking at the plans here that have more housing density and
14 also remember that if the zoning that you end up with isn't enough for developers to want to
15 build the thing. The parcels are going to remain the way they are today and you don't
16 necessarily end up with a vision just because you zoned for it. Unless that vision is appealing
17 enough for people to want to build it. Thank you.

18
19 Mr. Nguyen: Thank you, David. Our last speaker for this item is Mark. Mark, can you please
20 unmute your microphone and you have 3-minutes to speak. Mark are you there?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Mark [note- no last name]: Yes, do you hear me?

Mr. Nguyen: Yes, we can hear you.

Mr. Mark [note- no last name]: Ok, cool, then let's go. Well hi there, I'm Mark, I'm a renter, live on Seal Avenue. I would just like to say, it's a point made before but I'd like to restate it, I think it's essential both in the server results and it's [unintelligible] comments to look at conflicts of interest. I think homeowners in the area, they both are insulated from any unaffordability issues. In fact, they benefit. They're investors in real estate and any scarcity in housing actually [unintelligible] their economic benefit. I think due to conflict of interest; all of their input here should be disregarded.

The point was made earlier, density would be 18 times higher here than other areas of Palo Alto. This would be true. It is a reflection of the unzoned capacity of the rest of Palo Alto. That really should be revisited, especially in the light of both what outcomes we need to guarantee. You could look at that external factor of RHNA capacity that Palo Alto will have to do. One of the leading RHNA Allocation measures is looking at job opportunity and so on. Palo Alto is going to have to increase a huge amount. I'd say RHNA is the floor to look at. The goal should be what are the aims in affordable housing we want to create? When you have single-family housing

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 units that are selling for \$3 million, this is not serving the greater good. It is a broken system
2 and I think people who are pointing to process to say this is the way zoning has been done. It
3 should continue. I think we have to really look at what are the outcomes we want and I think
4 preserving low-density zoning in the face of \$3 million ranch homes is just absurd. And I think
5 people who just point to process, that's a ridiculous way to look at it.

6
7 I'd say one valid point is looking at the problem if we actually of parking. I think this has to be
8 joined with measures of restricting the anarchy of free street parking throughout the City.
9 Especially any place it would possibly be within walking distance of this development. I think we
10 need a comprehensive allocation of parking spots to make sure that if we have unparked units
11 in this area. That we actually need to make sure that they aren't just taking up street parking.
12 This is a very scarce resource we need to use wisely.

13
14 So, I am very happy that it's improved density. I think it should be much denser but it's a start.
15 So, thanks for your time.

16
17 Mr. Nguyen: Thank you, Mark. Chair Templeton, that concludes the public comments for this
18 item.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Templeton: Thank you all very much for hanging in there and providing us with your
2 thoughts on these plans. I'm going to first go to the PTC representative to the NVCAP to hear
3 her thoughts and I encourage the other Commissioners to please raise your hands as well if you
4 wish to... when you're ready to participate in the discussion. Vinh or Rachael, would you mind
5 putting up your slide with discussion guidance. Alright Commissioner Summa, thank you.

6

7 Commissioner Summa: [unintelligible – muted]

8

9 Chair Templeton: You're muted.

10

11 Commissioner Summa: Thank you very much. So, I don't think I need to... so yes, I was the PTC
12 rep... am the PTC rep to the working group. I've been there every single meeting. I don't think
13 we need to go back over the process. I think Staff covered things very well but I have to say
14 when I saw... I wasn't aware that this was going to be on our agenda. I thought we were
15 actually from... based on a conversation I had with Staff, that we were going to be looking at
16 parking issues downtown. So, I was really surprised to see this on the agenda and a little
17 confused because the working group has not... I think a member of the public said this but the
18 working group has not had an opportunity to go over these alternatives. And they were
19 presented at our last meeting and the meeting went so late that we actually just went a few
20 minutes over. So, the seven working group members that were there could have... make one

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 initial, like 1-minute or 2-minutes response, and that was... there were only half of the working
2 group members at this meeting. Then there was a community meeting and obviously, the
3 schedule has been challenged because of the global pandemic.

4
5 So, I don't think this is ready for the Planning Commission to discuss yet and the main reason is
6 because the working group and Staff haven't had an opportunity to dig into the details. And I
7 don't see how anybody could evaluate and compare these three plans because we don't have
8 any of the impacts; traffic impacts, parking impacts, traffic studies. We don't have development
9 standards and zones. We don't have a way to compare the three alternatives because we
10 haven't... we don't have all the information yet. I mean I agree with Staff... on Packet Page 15
11 especially they talk about the give and take that has to go here. And that we... that's it's going
12 to be challenging but working together we'll figure it out. And I just think this just needs a lot
13 more work by Staff and the working group before we can have a very valuable discussion about
14 it. So sorry to throw that wrench in the works but I do feel kind of... I'd like my colleagues'
15 feedback but I just don't think there's enough here for us to evaluate and compare these.

16
17 And I find the tree alternatives... well, let me leave it at that, and let's see what you guys think
18 because I'd rather this was further along as to understand what the impacts are of preferring
19 the alternatives and comparing them.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Templeton: Thank you, Commissioner Summa. The next hand I see up in Vice-Chair
2 Roohparvar.

3

4 Vice-Chair Roohparvar: I think... I have a lot to say. I think there needs to be a lot of flexibility
5 built in to anything that's adopted or the alternatives. And we need to be very future-looking
6 given COVID-19 and the impact that it's had. We're talking about a global pandemic. We're
7 looking at 26 million people unemployed, 4.6 percent contraction in the economy. I think we
8 need to think about how quickly can all that unemployment be reabsorbed; what kind of
9 economic ramification is it going to have and by extension what does that mean for planning
10 and real estate? What are our Cities going to look like? We need to be very future thinking and
11 forward-thinking. This is a great opportunity to build housing in a unique... again a unique
12 opportunity. We don't want to fritter it away. I know that we already invested a lot of time but I
13 think I would agree I think we need to wait to see what happens when we get on the other side
14 of COVID to really be able to evaluate what we want this space to look like. I think when you
15 look at expert analysis from Mikenzie, VCG, I've been following them. The one thing that
16 everyone is saying is there is so much uncertainty and volatility right now. We do not know
17 what's going to be... we just don't know what the world's going to look like. We know it's going
18 to be different, we just don't know-how. So, there are a few things that I wanted to touch on.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Well, first of all, I do think that this needs to be a collaborative process between the
2 landowners and the homeowners and the residents. I don't think it behooves anyone to start
3 talking about litigation or we're going to force it or something like that. Because I think one of
4 the members of the public said the landowners can just leave their property as it is and I don't
5 think that benefits anyone. So, therefore, I think it really does need to be a collaborative
6 process but a few things that I wanted to point out economically that could impact what this
7 area would look like.

8

9 The first being work from home. A lot of tech companies are moving to working from home and
10 working remotely. I think that's going to impact the demand for office space. And we might be
11 looking at a situation where office rents aren't as lucrative. And we might be looking at a
12 situation where we need fewer cars because people aren't commuting to work and what kind
13 of impact is that going to have on traffic? The trend was working from home and I think that
14 the pandemic has now accelerated that, so that's one thing.

15

16 Another thing that I wanted to highlight is e-commerce. E-commerce is decimating retail right
17 now. If you look at I think Neiman Marcus is talking about filing for bankruptcy, Gap is having
18 problems. I mean retail is struggling, struggling so when we are looking at this space and we're
19 talking about ok we're going to put all these... all this retail in. Let's be very sensitive and think
20 through things clearly. Are there going to be retail tenants to tenant this space? That's another

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 issue. I'm not saying yes or no, I'm just saying this is something that we need to really think
2 through and make sure that if we're putting these things in there are going to be people that
3 are going to them.

4
5 Another thing, I think a theater was mentioned. If you have been following the news, the
6 theaters... theaters are getting decimated. Universal and AMC Theaters are currently in a
7 dispute because given the prevalence of online streaming. Universal has released their Trolls
8 World Tour movie on streaming at the same time it was supposed to go into theaters and is not
9 rethinking its distribution channels. There's a lot of economic pressure on theaters and the
10 question is, is this going to destroy the entire theater experience and concept because
11 everyone is moving to online streaming now.

12
13 And the other issue I want to raise is we have a very big... everybody knows, there's significant
14 unemployment right now. What is that... we have mortgage deferrals for now until July that
15 have been mandated but once July hits and all these people are still unemployed. Are we going
16 to see defaults? Defaults on homes and on credit cards and what is that going to mean in terms
17 of the mix? Do we want more rental or do we want more ownership or what type of mix do we
18 want in this area for it to still work 10, 20, 30-years down the road?

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 A few other things. Well, tied into that brokerage activities are down significantly. People aren't
2 buying and selling homes. Is that going to immediately pick up after COVID-19 or are people
3 going to be more conservative and want to rent for a longer period of time? That's something
4 else to think about.

5
6 And then finally a lot of companies are actually thinking about moving away from open space,
7 doing touchless tech, anti-microbial fabrics, what impact is that going to have on tenant
8 improvement allowances? And again, the construction costs that go into building these spaces.

9
10 So those are just a few things that I want us to hopefully think about. I do agree with
11 Commissioner Summa that for me at least it's premature to think about this. But for me, the
12 reasoning is I kind of want to wait for this COVID-19 stuff to shake out and have a little bit more
13 data and analysis from planning once they have more insight. I understand right now we just
14 don't have visibility. But I just want to make sure that we are very future thinking and where we
15 don't just do something because now we're not in the process but we do the right thing that's
16 best for this City in the long term.

17
18 Chair Templeton: Thank you Vice-Chair Roohparvar. I see Commissioner Lauing followed my
19 Commissioner Alcheck. Commissioner Lauing.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Lauing: Ok I think I'm unmuted now? First, I want to really thank the public
2 speakers who were very specific and they're very obviously very attuned to this and they, like
3 all of us, want to get it right. So, comments that we need full mitigation, that there's frustration
4 there, none of the three alternatives is at all right and we aren't listening as a City, etc. I think
5 certainly that has to be considered. Other alternatives are coming out right now.

6
7 And then our own participate in the working group is I really respect the summary that she put
8 out there. My own thought is I went through this was actually pretty close to identical which is
9 this is a good start and there's... the working group is working it. They have been for 2-years so
10 they're the experts at this point. I think it's too early to be discussing this with planning because
11 we're not being asked for anything about zoning. There's no project so we're not being asked
12 about traffic flow or whatever. We all are in favor of, not to mention must do, substantive
13 housing so that is packed into any of these proposals which is absolutely great. But it just seems
14 a little bit early.

15
16 And I think that.... the other thing that's of concern is that... I guess Commissioner Summa
17 mentioned this but I'm not sure how... the objective tonight was to provide input. And I don't
18 know how we can provide input on these alternatives or any without any look at the outcomes;
19 any calculations of that. One just because I was able to do the math pretty quickly. If we just
20 picked Alternative Two for example. That would about triple the current households there and

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 using the current car ownership, which I just rounded off because some are one and some are 2
2 so it's 1.5. That's a minimum of about another 1,050 cars. That could be fine but I don't know
3 because we don't have anything in here that says where they're going to go, how it can be
4 mitigated. So, for us to opine on this in a way that might begin to create a recommendation to
5 Council, I just don't think there's enough here to be making those calls. And some of these
6 things are so aspirational, which is great at this stage, that in spite of the fact that the Staff
7 report says that there are barriers to pedestrians and bicycles because of the actual landscape
8 there. One of the main things that comes out is that we need to minimize vehicular traffic and,
9 in my example, here we're already adding 1,000 cars. So again, I'm not... I don't go into this
10 with any preconceived notion. I'm just saying we don't know how to do the calculations on
11 what we're really gaining here with the data that we have right now.

12
13 I would also caution us to do more surveys over the course of how much time this takes
14 because right now you have 70 people who live in Palo Alto opining and that's again a good
15 start. That's valuable but it's... we shouldn't be making decisions for the next 100-years that are
16 based on that. So that's kind of another detail that we just don't have enough be at our level at
17 this stage making that kind of call.

18
19 So, I would be... I would suggest that we return this to the working group and take feedback
20 from them and Staff as to when we would have more... I hate to use the word data but more of

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 a proposal here around these alternatives. But also listen to others that are going to become
2 up...brought up by the neighbors because they're obviously working on it.

3
4 Some of the things that are embedded in here I think absolutely, at this point, almost mom and
5 apply pie. Yes, we absolutely have to have housing in this project. We got to figure out how
6 much. Yeah, it's got to be mixed-use. Open space needs to be real, not just say a patio in an
7 office. Displacements of current residents should be zero if at all possible. Eminent Domain
8 should be off the table. When we go with self... definitions of being self-parked, let's make sure
9 we know what we're talking about there and so on. So, there's a lot of stuff that's baked in here
10 that needs to be here but relative to us addressing this tonight in a substantive way. I just don't
11 think we're ready yet. So again, I thank the public for their input to crystalize this for all of us.
12 Thank you.

13
14 Chair Templeton: Thank you Commissioner Lauing.

15
16 Ms. Tanner: Vice-Chair... Chair Templeton if I may respond to something that Commissioner
17 Lauing said? Is that ok?

18
19 Chair Templeton: Of course.

20

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. Tanner: I just wanted to thank Commissioner Lauing for your comments and I think these
2 comments are actually exactly what we're looking for tonight. We're not... we aren't coming to
3 you with a study and unfortunately due to the way the project is going to have to go with our
4 constraints of time and budget. We're not going to be able to study these. We're not going to
5 be able to afford traffic studies for three alternatives. So, what we need to do is work with the
6 working group to refine these down to maybe one or two, get Council to give us direction on
7 what direction are they wanting to go with some of these things, and then we'll be able to
8 study one alternative that we're... maybe with some variance in there but that's really where
9 we're headed towards.

10

11 And so, things that you said that to me are really helpful, saying that in your opinion eminent
12 domain is off the table. Displacement is a thing. Even your comments on open space, maybe
13 you have more about what is sufficient open space? Yeah, you know a patio and balcony is nice
14 but we really need X or Y or things like that. So, to me that is helpful. It may seem like oh, it's
15 already known but I think for myself, for the working group, it's helpful to know where the
16 Commissioners are at. What are the things that you're curious about knowing so when we do
17 come back... as we're working and when we come back we are more knowledgeable? And also,
18 just hopefully a chance to provide the Commissioners with just more insight into the process so
19 that when we come back for a recommendation, that's not the first time that you are hearing

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 about what's been going on and the work of the group. So, I thank you for your comments and I
2 think they're very helpful to me.

3

4 Commissioner Lauing: Ok yeah, I would just add that this probably echoes the public as well but
5 we don't want to just get it done. We want to get it right and we don't know how long the
6 COVID is going to delay this process or if this moves to one of those things that Council talked
7 about the other night as being a mothball item. We don't know that yet as Commissioner
8 Roohparvar [note -Vice-Chair Roohparvar] said. But we got to get it right because it's a really
9 big deal, it's a really important deal, and it could be as you guys are working on it a wonderful,
10 beautiful neighborhood that houses a lot more people but let's work it. Thanks.

11

12 Chair Templeton: Thank you and thank you so much, Ms. Tanner, for chiming in on that. I do
13 think we are having a very useful discussion right now so it is much appreciated that you
14 brought this to us to give this early feedback. I would also say that I would encourage all the
15 Commissioners to attend the NVCAP meetings. The open house we had in February was
16 fascinating and really an informative and a great place to get a feel and a sense for the
17 community and have direct opportunity to talk with members of the neighborhood. And I
18 would just plug attending those and now that they may be virtual in the next...who knows if the
19 next ones will be virtual. It might be even easier to attend. Ok so next we will hear from
20 Commissioner Alcheck followed by Commissioner Hechtman. Commissioner Alcheck.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Alcheck: Thank you, Chair Templeton. If it's ok I'd like to ask Staff a few questions? So, I'm assuming that's ok with you Commission... Chair Templeton (interrupted)

Chair Templeton: Go ahead.

Commissioner Alcheck: If they respond during my... ok so do you... are there written or stated objectives for the working group?

Ms. Tanner: So, the goals that we have I did share those City Council goals. They do have longer paragraph-level descriptions of what those goals are so it isn't just housing. It has some descriptors of what those objectives are.

Commissioner Alcheck: I mean did the working group have the objective to make a single recommendation or to conclude or was there some sort of stated objective that 51 percent of the... how... what was their... I guess what I'm asking you is. Was there criteria laid out that would allow us to say they're done?

Ms. Tanner: You know maybe I'll ask Chitra if she has any input in this but as I... again coming to the project part-way through looking backward at the documentation that was laid out. I see

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 that there was a desire and a goal to say we want to get to the one consensus alternative. I
2 think there's also room in the process to recognize that that may not happen. And so, in
3 previous area planning processes in the City, there have been recommendations from the
4 working group, from Staff, and different bodies have had divergent ones. And so, I think there's
5 a recognition that we would like to get to consensus but that there may not... we may not reach
6 that full consensus around one alternative but that's the goal. That's the dream, the aspiration.

7

8 Commissioner Alcheck: And I can't... I... would you shed a little light on how the members were
9 selected?

10

11 Ms. Tanner: I actually am not sure. I know they were appointed by the City Council. Chitra do
12 you know the process by which members put forward their names to be considered?

13

14 Ms. Moitra: Yes, there was a selection criteria. They were members of the residents and
15 property owners and then people who do business over there or owns businesses. So, there
16 were a list of criteria which we had and I think there was a big [unintelligible] from which the
17 Council had to select from so.

18

19 Commissioner Alcheck: Ok so stakeholders. So, look I think that my understanding of this group
20 and the objectives reflect an abstract hope that a group of individuals who have stake in the

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 area, among others, could come together to help illuminate what they as a group has
2 consensus on. And I think whenever you involve often people with shared interests in an area
3 but divergent or diverse goals. Then it's almost like a negotiation, right? And I think that the
4 benefit of the working group is that the conversations they have allow decision-makers in our
5 community to visibility see the articulation of the range of opinions.

6

7 I don't know necessarily that I would refer to the working group as the experts on what should
8 be the final notion of what should take place there. And the reason why is because the...
9 unfortunately the residents or the commercial property owners, they're individual interests
10 may not reflect the needs of the City as a whole the way that the City wants to respond to its
11 own long-term goals. Whatever they are. The way the City wants to respond to the state
12 requirements. So, I'm a little hesitant to accept this idea that it needs to go back there; as if this
13 is the drafting of a Comprehensive Plan, and there's a Committee that's been tasked with
14 developing it and they haven't had the chance to review and make final edits. I don't think that
15 the working group will realistically come to some conclusion that will represent necessarily the
16 best way forward. I think that they're discussions and their perspectives help inform decision-
17 makers on where there are serious sensitives. But I am reluctant to describe them as the
18 experts in the room and that they should be differed too. And that's not intended to be
19 insensitive to the commitment or the time that's been volunteered but it is to say that I don't

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 have the same confidence that that process will bring us to the conclusion that we need to get
2 too.

3

4 I also I really appreciate the comments that Commissioner Roohparvar [note – Vice-Chair
5 Roohparvar] said. I think that it's clear that this particular moment in time has injected so much
6 uncertainty on so many levels that there's a real... it paralyzes decision makers to some extent
7 from moving forward. I'll take the alternate view that I don't think it's unreasonable to create a
8 blueprint for development in this area during this moment of uncertainty. The factors that are
9 at play with respect to housing in California have not changed. And our reluctance to explore
10 height limits and densities is not... what we were... our discomfort in this community with
11 pushing the boundary on those things 6-months ago and today are not different because of the
12 COVID crisis. We need to begin the process of design... I will... you know I had another question
13 for Staff which was did... maybe I wasn't quite paying attention in catching this and I may have
14 missed it and I apologize if that's the case. Do one of the alternatives reflect what an SB-35
15 development would look like? And I ask that question because we're not operating in a vacuum
16 and there are alternatives to development that supersede what our local rules are like SB-35 for
17 example. And I was curious to know how maybe the working group or even the alternatives
18 that Staff put forward today relate to those?

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. Tanner: That's a fair question considering even though SB-35 did not... SB-35... so what
2 that... so just a future of casting that will be the subject of our next PTC meeting will be SB-35
3 and objective standards and streamlining that have come out of that law. And that is with us as
4 a City and will probably... could impact more parcels as we do or do not meet our affordability
5 in terms of housing construction. We will talk more about that next time.

6
7 SB-35 specifically adhering to that or accommodating to that requirements were not conceived
8 of in this plan. Although to some degree with SB-35 the goal being to increase in human
9 housing and permit more dense housing. That is kind of in the background but I don't know that
10 it specifically responds to it.

11
12 If you think about something like the SB-50 which did not go through. That was also not really
13 apart the design here but certainly, we are aware of the increasing rules from the state
14 legislature that are pushing for more housing, more dense housing, and more housing located
15 near transit. So that's maybe not a direct answer to your question but it's certainly kind of
16 (interrupted)

17
18 Commissioner Alcheck: No, look (interrupted)

19
20 Ms. Tanner: In the ether of what we're trying to do as a department.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Commissioner Alcheck: I'll say this. My reluctance to continue to invest Staff resources in the
3 stakeholder group or excuse me the working group's work... and my reluctance to invest more
4 time and resources was never... was... is not... today is not because of COVID. It's because I am
5 just assuming that the state will figure this out before our local Palo Alto group does. That
6 based on the speed at which we operate, we're more likely to have the state's make... create an
7 option that may not adequately reflect... you know basically the Cupertino/ Valco situation.
8 Where the state made it so that there was just unfair... I don't know if I should say unfair. An
9 uneven leverage between the developer and the City Council and then the community at large.

10

11 Well look, I'll say this, I think that as far as alternatives go I think that the alternative that
12 explores the greatest density should be the one we focus on the most. We should be working
13 through that option and understanding what are the elements of that that breaks the camel's
14 back in our community. To what extent that alternative has trigger points that seem
15 insurmountable and then we can dial it back.

16

17 I think that there's a lot of... look there's a lot of creative ideas that you put forward today. And
18 I think that we... I think it's difficult to make decisions to appreciate the community sentiment
19 in this format on a Zoom call and in Zoom City Council meetings. And that to me is problematic
20 but I would encourage the Commission to not shy away from the opportunity to continue

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 reviewing this and to say look, this is the largest opportunity in our City right now. That's
2 regardless of the fact that the property owners may not have the wherewithal to develop
3 anything in the next decade in that space if the downturn is as bad as it could be. But I think we
4 could still say but if you do develop this is what we in the City want to encourage and if you do
5 this you get this. And if... there's no... I think everyone would probably agree the current
6 guidelines are not sufficient to meet the goals of the City. So why not take the opportunity to
7 improve them? Even if you put a sunset on it, even if said ok well lets... until such time as we
8 can do this what are the pieces that we're willing to agree on now? I just think I say this too
9 often, perfect is the enemy of good. So, I don't think we should shy away from this. I'm not sure
10 how to resurrect the... I don't know how to put us back on track in terms of having this
11 discussion move forward on a Commission level. So, but I would largely not support this idea of
12 returning it to a working group because I don't think that they're likely to get through any
13 progress in this COVID situation if we're not able to as a Commission and so. And frankly, I'm
14 not... I don't want to sound... I don't want to take too much time.

15

16 But the last thing I want to say is I'm not sure what the objective is for them. I don't think that
17 we expect them to come with us and say this is what should go on the Fry's site. That's not
18 likely to result in a development. Fry's isn't going thank you, we'll do it. I think we need to
19 create the zoning guidelines and the blueprint which should be based on the preferences we're
20 already aware and the goals that we have. And then say we'll see what happens and hope for

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 the best. And when I say hope for the best I mean hope that there are stakeholders who have
2 the desire and funds to invest. That's it. Thank you.

3

4 Chair Templeton: Thank you so much Commissioner Alcheck and it is Commissioner Hechtman
5 and Doria... Commissioner Summa, I see your hand up. I'd love to have a chance to give some
6 comments first so it will go Commissioner Hechtman, myself, and then Commissioner Summa.
7 Thank you.

8

9 Commissioner Hechtman: Thank you, Chair Templeton. Could I ask Rachael to put up the slide
10 that had the schedule and while she's doing that I want to start by acknowledging the working
11 group. That is... that kind of Commission work is largely thankless unless somebody takes the
12 time to thank you. And I'm sure people do but I want to be one of those people that says thank
13 you for taking your time without the glamor of sitting in the Council Chamber like Planning
14 Commissioners normally get to do when we're not sheltering in place. But I do think it's
15 important work and I think that it's an augmentation of what we can do as a Planning
16 Commissioners. And so, I'm really appreciative of that work.

17

18 Also... and I want to really start by talking about process. I do understand that these three
19 alternatives that have been presented to us tonight were presented to the working group but in
20 a context, through really no fault other than COVID perhaps, where the working group really

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 hasn't had an opportunity to deliberate these three alternatives. And I think that that's really
2 important after the 2-years of discussing what might be for them to be able to take a look at
3 these three alternatives, discuss them amongst themselves, and through that evolve what they
4 like and don't like. And I understand there are either four or five plans the working group
5 members have come up, alternative plans, and we haven't even seen those. And I for one
6 would be curious to know what people who spent 2-years working on these issues have in
7 mind.

8
9 And so, when I look at the calendar, thank you for putting it up Rachael, I see that the plan is to
10 go from here back to the working group. And I understood is as Commissioner Lauing said, part
11 of what we're supposed to do here is providing some input I think for the working group to take
12 into account as it goes further with its work. And so, I want to eventually do that but I do... and
13 I'm not really understanding the flow here. To me this looks like we're here tonight, this is going
14 to go to the working group and from the working group maybe it's going to City Council. Is that
15 the intention Rachael?

16
17 Ms. Tanner: Yes, the intention would be that we're in the refining phase. So, we're trying to get
18 down to the... from... I think we at this point we maybe have 10 different versions of
19 alternatives out there... down to one or two that we could get further Council direction on. So
20 that as we go forward again when we want to spend our resources on studying those... that

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 alternative. We know that that's something that we... ok, this is where the City wants to put its
2 resources for the studies.

3

4 Commissioner Hechtman: Ok thank you. So that being the case I do think and this echoes to
5 some extent what Commissioner Summa was saying. That... and other Commissioners actually.
6 That I think... I think this should go back to the working group on May 26th thereabouts and
7 when they have [unintelligible] their ideas about the three alternatives that were produced and
8 their five alternatives. I'd actually like it to come back to us because I think that I... again I've
9 never even seen their five alternatives and I'd like to have their best thinking come back to us.
10 And then we can talk about that iteration and whether it goes from there back to the working
11 group. And then to Council or straight to Council which would, of course, would be more
12 traditional to go from the PTC up to Council. I'm open on that but I would really like to see that
13 process. And I think Council would appreciate it too because at this point if we... if it doesn't
14 come back to us Council won't get any input from PTC on any of these five items... of these five
15 alternatives. And for all, we know one of those five alternatives could be the one that is
16 forwarded by the working group.

17

18 So, I do want to echo what Rachael said in terms of the long-term process. My impression is
19 that we're really in the concept plan part of this process and that it is premature to have impact
20 studies. I was envisioning that the way this would play out is through this iterative process,

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 eventually, we would take something to the Council with recommendations. They would pick a
2 preferred plan and that would be the study of I'm sure an EIR and perhaps the second and third
3 preferred plan would be the project alternatives that are studied in that EIR as iterations. And
4 so, I think we're a long way from that point. So those are my process comments.

5
6 Substantively I do want to give the working group and ultimately the Council my thoughts on
7 the three alternatives that were presented to us in the Staff report. So first of all, the
8 Alternative Number One which was the most limited growth version. I think that to me that's a
9 non-starter. It's too little of everything. I think that... and I think that it's pretty clear that Palo
10 Alto is going to have to... must become more dense in its housing. Not over the entire City but
11 in opportunity areas where we can become more dense. And this is a... I think this area is a
12 fantastic opportunity for us to be looking at those things.

13
14 And so... and then when we look at Alternative Two and Three which are the medium and most
15 dense versions, there are a couple of things that strike me. One is as Vice-Chair Roohparvar
16 mentioned, this is a 20-30-year plan perhaps and I think our City is going to evolve over that
17 time to become more accepting and embracing and tolerant of density but we're not there
18 today. So, I think it may be frightening for Palo Alto citizens to approve a plan next year calling
19 for eight-story buildings in the short term. And so, I think that the plan that we come up with
20 really needs to phase over time an increase in density. And we should start with five-story

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 buildings in the short term because those I think are recognizable and fit within our overall
2 scheme, but have milestones in this plan as to when we will up the density, up the height. And
3 again, everything is not going to be built. No matter what plan we do everything is not going to
4 be built in 5-years or 10-years. There's going to be plenty of open areas here to do this.

5

6 And I've got the same concern parking. All three alternatives said one space per unit. I'm
7 worried that developers aren't going to be able to get conventional loans for that today. I agree
8 and the evidence is pretty clear that we are moving in a direction of needing cars, personal
9 owned cars, less and less. I think we'll get there but I think our... again I think if we are going to
10 approve something that could be done today, it has to be buildable today. And so, I think we
11 need to, in the parking area, start with something that is more realistic for presently and then
12 have milestones that would allow us to feather back parking to smaller numbers over time.

13

14 And then the final input that I wanted to give was on the open space. My feeling is this area has
15 to have a central park. That... a couple acres, I don't know, but in the middle. I understand that
16 the natural attraction of making the creek a useable open space and I'm supportive of that but
17 maybe not as the main open space because the people who live over by Page Mill in this
18 development. That's a long way for them to go to get to their park and so I would like to see
19 some emphasis in locate... in having some central park. Maybe taking some of the resources
20 that we're going to expand and improve the creek and instead devoting those more in the

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 middle of the development area. So that everybody can use is; the residents and the office and
2 the retail. It's available for everybody.

3

4 So those are the thoughts I had and I want to thank Staff also for the long work that they have
5 put in on getting this process to the point where it can be presented to us tonight.

6

7 Chair Templeton: Alright thank you, Commissioner Hechtman. I would like to make my
8 comments and then we'll go to Commissioner Summa. While you have this slide up I would like
9 to say I think it would be great for the PTC to see it again before it goes to City Council for
10 longer range finalizing plans. But I'm not quite sure that you need to see them sooner rather
11 than later to check in but I'm excited about the idea that we'll get to see it again here on the
12 Planning Commission. So, thank you for that.

13

14 And then if you could go to your discussion slide that would be helpful for me. In general, I
15 made a list of likes and dislikes from what I read and heard during the presentation and then
16 responses to each of the alternatives. But one question I have to start off with is the page
17 where we have the list of participants is just the appointees and doesn't say the Staff. So aside
18 from the Planning Department what other departments are involved in the North Ventura... the
19 NVCAP program?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. Tanner: That's a great question and we have had involvement from the Office of
2 Transportation. So, Sylvia Star-Lack who was with us earlier this evening has been involved. You
3 obviously know Chitra and myself and then we have our consultant team. We've also worked a
4 bit with our folks from the Green Infrastructure or Green Stormwater Infrastructure Plan, which
5 we recently I think late last year saw, and just thinking about as redevelopment comes how to
6 incorporate green infrastructure into the plan. Also, our Utilities Department, especially in
7 terms of some of the planning regarding where are utilities are currently located which creates
8 some constraints for us.

9

10 And also in regards to the creek restoration our Public Works, again with our stormwater folks,
11 and others kind of thinking about what would the creek restoration look like as well as some
12 partners at other agencies helping us to think through what a creek restoration plan would look
13 like. We've even had folks from the fire department opining on some of the ideas we've had
14 such as closing a street too vehicular access and what their standards would be regarding some
15 of that. So, we can really understand dimensionally how some of our ideas may or may not
16 again under current standards get by from our fire department.

17

18 Chair Templeton: That's really cool and in addition to the Planning and Transportation
19 Commission we also had representatives from Architectural Review and Parks. So, it's really
20 nice to see that this discussion and this working group has included so many different points of

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 view from stakeholders as Commissioner Alcheck mentioned. I think that's really made the
2 discussion very rich. I will (interrupted)

3 Ms. Tanner: You actually made me think of someone else who I forgot and I'm sorry. Peter
4 Jenson, Parks and Recreation. We did... and he's involved with Public Works but with the
5 expansion of the park there, Boulware Park, we did a joint... the workshop. He had a table there
6 to try to make sure we can maximize people coming to one workshop. [unintelligible – technical
7 difficulties]

8
9 Chair Templeton: That's awesome. I don't know if your video is lagging or if it's my video. If it's
10 mine I apologize. Ok so just want to say thank you for making sure that people are involved
11 from all aspects and really getting creative on this.

12
13 So, my initial thoughts, I liked the compare and contrast about the different densities in terms
14 of the alternatives. I was very intrigued by the idea of first floor retail. I would love... I like to see
15 the BMR housing included. I would love to see more of that. I like the slide that had the
16 community metrics with the line and then the target circles. Like we have enough of the jobs
17 and enough of the retail but not enough of the housing. It was really nice to see those in... lined
18 up together to see where we lack. I also liked your idea about progressing from alternatives...
19 one of the alternatives to another alternative over time and that there's ways to build this and

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 you don't have to do it all at once. I think that addresses some of the concerns about culture
2 shock or whatever we want to call it that Commissioner Hechtman brought up.

3

4 I am concerned about the infeasibility of rental. I'm not sure if there's anything that can be
5 done about that but it was a concern for me to see that we would talk about all this housing
6 and we could not be able to accommodate renters. I think that's a huge missing housing
7 solution in our community.

8

9 I'm also concerned about some of the... I need to find a better word here... maybe some
10 disfunction is creeping into the working group. You know not having some of the alternatives
11 included was concerning. I would definitely like to see those once they're developed. I think it
12 may be just a timing thing, that was my read.

13

14 And then one of the other concerns that I have and I say this as someone who used to live in
15 Ventura so just full disclosure there. I do have a soft spot in my heart for that neighborhood at
16 times but I'm concerned that we have a lot of discussion about increasing the density in this
17 neighborhood and not in... looking for more opportunities throughout the City. And I think it's
18 important because my understanding of just hearing from those comments from the neighbors
19 in Ventura. I do think that they're interested in being part of the housing solution but I also
20 sense that there was some concern that they would be the only neighborhood trying to solve

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 this or they'd be trying to solve it alone or we're trying to solve it first or whatever. This is a
2 community-wide area that the City needs to address. So, I would say that being able to include
3 this as part of a larger plan, I think Commissioner Alcheck eluded to this as well, would go along
4 way into understanding how we as a community...a larger community are going to solve the
5 housing shortage and not just restrict it to certain neighborhoods. So those were some of the
6 concerns I had.

7

8 And then finally, other Commissioners may have mentioned this as well but looks like the
9 survey could be improved in terms of who is surveyed and making it more representative
10 sample. I think that would be really interesting if we have the means to do that. I know
11 sometimes it's just a matter of getting the questions out there and seeing who answers but if
12 we have the ability to be a little bit more well-rounded in terms of who we get our responses
13 from that would be super helpful.

14

15 As for the alternatives I agree with Commissioner Hechtman that Alternative One does not
16 seem like enough as for an aspirational goal. It might be a good starting point. I could see that. I
17 liked the way that you presented Alternative Two. It's not displacing current tenants and being
18 more open to creative zoning solutions there like four plexus and prioritizing maintaining the
19 feel of the neighborhood. I could definitely hear that from some of the neighbors who spoke
20 during public comment that the feel of the neighborhood is very important so I really liked that.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 And then for Alternative Three, I would like to hear more about the... and we can do this offline
2 but I'm interested about getting more out of the space that's currently occupied by the Fry's
3 building and finding ways to do that, that still honors the work that went on there in the
4 historic frame. You know finding ways to either echo some of the key architectural elements or
5 findings a way to do some area that honors the work that went on there. However, I do like the
6 idea having worked in the building before. I do think that it's very outdated and does not have
7 the facilities for a modern workplace. So, I definitely think that I would be open to seeing if we
8 could find a way to honor the historical work while also being able to update the facilities;
9 including with housing.

10

11 So those were my thoughts. I really appreciate you bringing this to us. It is like many other
12 Commissioners have said before me, it is early but great. Great, thank you for bringing it to us
13 earlier and giving us a chance to weight in. I know that we haven't had the level of participation
14 yet from the Planning Commissioners at the NVCAP meeting so this is a great way to bring it to
15 us. I will plug once again, this is a huge opportunity for Palo Alto and would really benefit from
16 some of the Planning Commissioners finding a way to get involved more. You don't have to be
17 appointed to it to attend. We have many community members who attend regularly and I've
18 really learned a lot. It's a great group and the work that's going to come out of this I hope will
19 influence this 60-acre area for the next 100-years. So, thank you to all the people that are on
20 the NVCAP and to all the Staff who have prepared this material. Alright, Commissioner Summa.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Commissioner Summa: Thank you. So, I know... I don't know if you want to go another round or
3 I think part of my earlier statement was based on I was really unclear from the Staff report
4 what kind of feedback you wanted right now. And I was concerned that those three... that we
5 really evaluate those three alternatives as if we were picking one at this time because it's way
6 too soon. I in no way ever envisioned that the NVCAP and working group and Staff and
7 consultants would stop working on this at this time. That never occurred to me but I will say
8 that I think we have to be careful to create a neighborhood that has development standards
9 that are less than what we would have in other neighborhoods. And that's in terms of parking
10 standards and development standards of buildings themselves.

11

12 And I would love to see a central park here too but as Commissioner Hechtman wanted but I
13 don't... the City has to acquire land to buy a park. They have to buy land and somebody has to
14 sell it so I don't think it's that realistic. Especially not right now and unless some sort of deal...
15 there's always some... there's always opportunity to make deals but it's hard for the City to
16 acquire land where they don't have it. So, if we're going to make a neighborhood that doesn't
17 have... that is so underserved by parks according to our law and Quimby Act and stuff. I think
18 we have to be very clear that we are not providing parks.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 And I think adaptive reuse of a building, like a warehouse-type building like the Fry's site, for
2 housing, is done all over the country and can be incredibly lovely architecturally. A gem in the
3 neighborhood.

4
5 And I think that all three... there's probably... I don't want to rigidly be held to the three. I want
6 to explore the ideas that come from working group members. They're probably things in Three
7 [note -Alternative Three] that are good but I don't like... I don't think any of the three
8 alternatives, the way they are right now, is adequate.

9
10 I would like to address the Park Boulevard bike situation and see how not right... not going to
11 happen next week or next year even but how that can be improved. That's a very important
12 bike boulevard and it's very unsafe also.

13
14 So, I just... I don't know if we want to go a whole other round or if Rachael got kind of a general
15 direction in what we're doing here but I just wanted to emphasize some of those ideas.

16
17 Chair Templeton: Thank you, Commissioner Summa. I too wanted to ask Ms. Tanner if we want
18 to have a motion or somehow capture and formalize or if the information... just the discussion
19 itself has been beneficial. And I do see some other hands up but it would be helpful to know
20 how to close this.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Ms. Tanner: I mean this discussion so far has been helpful. If Commissioners do have further
3 comments perhaps from hearing each other speak or just learning more through this process.
4 It's great if you have ideas afterward that you forgot to have or told you could also email me.
5 And it's not like you can't continue to provide thoughts on this process because it's still in
6 motion.

7

8 And then as far as a formal motion, we don't need a formal motion at this time as it is a study
9 session. And so, when you feel that we can conclude we could conclude the discussion.

10

11 Chair Templeton: Alright that sounds good. So, I'm comfortable going another round. Be
12 forewarned I'm sitting outside so I'm getting cold but that is not your problem. So next I see
13 Vice-Chair Roohparvar followed by Commissioner Lauing.

14

15 Vice-Chair Roohparvar: Thank you. I'm going to be brief but I do want to provide a little bit
16 more guidance I guess on my thought. I agree with the Commissioners that we want a more
17 housing dense site here. Therefore, also I'm not... I think Option One is a good starting point but
18 I'm leaning more towards the more dense alternatives. With that said I am also... you know
19 what Chair Templeton said about being sensitive to the fact of not just sticking all the
20 affordable housing in the Ventura neighborhood. That seems very unfair. I mean this is a

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 burden that everybody needs to share across Palo Alto. Not burden but you know it needs to be
2 fairly allocated. You can't just put all the affordable housing or all the housing dense sites into
3 one area.

4
5 I liked Commissioner Hechtman's comment about the milestones. That was interesting and
6 interesting idea to explore. I think we should also give thoughtful consideration as to the
7 remaining mix of uses to have on the site in order to activate the space.

8
9 I agree with Commissioner Lauing that open space needs to be real open space and I agree also
10 that eminent domain needs to be off the table. I don't think that's productive. This should be a
11 collaborative process and I also agree that we should see this again. It should come back to us
12 before it goes to City Council if possible. Thank you.

13
14 Chair Templeton: Thank you Vice-Chair Roohparvar. Commissioner Lauing.

15
16 Commissioner Lauing: Thank you. I think that... I was startled to hear that this might not come
17 back to PTC. I actually definitely agree with Commissioner Alcheck that it ultimately on issues
18 like this it's our responsibility to be recommending items to Council. My prior comments did not
19 contradict that I hope. I was just saying that there... it's too early for us to do that because
20 there's still some scenarios that have to be played out and I'd like to have some more work

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 there to go on as we make our recommendation to Council. We can clear that up with one call
2 to the Mayor and see if that's the case but I think this absolutely has to come back to us
3 because that's our job.

4
5 But I also just want to point out that those people in the neighborhood get that as well and
6 they're not ignoring that. So, we don't want to sort of talk down that because I don't think
7 that's what they're thinking. They're trying to think of a way to get both. A great neighborhood
8 and some housing and it have it done where it's a pleasant way to be as the document plays it
9 out. So, I think that's due able.

10
11 I think we should also take another look offline at the process from getting to where we are
12 here, back to the working group, and back to us. So that when it comes back to us, nobody is
13 surprised. And we know what to expect and we can be very productive if that's in a meeting or
14 two meetings or a long meeting or whatever it has to be. Certainly, Commissioner Summa
15 would have to be involved in that and maybe more from the working group or maybe there's
16 some other things but I think we just want to make sure it doesn't come back undone. We need
17 to be ready to go and ready to prep to make our recommendation. Thank you.

18
19 Chair Templeton: Alright thank you Commissioner Lauing. Commissioner Alcheck.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Alcheck: Yeah thank you. Oh, I appreciate that comment Commissioner Lauing. I
2 do think then I misunderstood you to some extent. I thought that the comments that you and
3 Commissioner Summa made earlier were a general satisfaction with the report's suggested
4 timeline. And I was worried that we were suggesting that we wanted to not proceed on what I
5 understood as an aggressive schedule of getting it back to us and going forward.

6
7 And so, let me clarify my... if our recommendation tonight is to proceed with the timeline. To
8 have this theoretically come back to us this summer with an opportunity to push it to Council
9 before the fall then I would support that motion. I'm reluctant to provide the working group
10 with more time than absolutely necessary to review the... if the working group needs more time
11 to review the option in a complete way then that's... I think that's good but I'm reluctant with
12 giving them enough... with providing more time to come to some conclusion. I think we need
13 perspectives and I think if we keep that timeline rigid then they'll be forced to provide all of
14 their input. And then we can move forward and then Council ultimately can make some
15 decisions because I don't think that our overarching goals as a City, with respect to
16 development, are somehow cloudy to us because of the current pandemic. I think we can
17 articulate what we want to see there. And I certainly think that there is opportunity even in the
18 short term for things to be developed in the line with whatever we end up putting forward. So, I
19 just want to delay the opportunity to provide a template.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 So, thank you for that clarification because I think now we are really on the same page which is
2 to keep this ball moving forward as Staff has suggested.

3

4 Chair Templeton: Thank you Commissioner Alcheck. Commissioner Hechtman do you have any
5 additional thoughts? No. Ok.

6

7 I have one additional thought that I did not spell out earlier but related to circulation; the
8 circulation component. I think that for the housing... the dense areas of housing discussion to
9 continue or to move forward there are some key transportation areas that need to be
10 addressed. And some of them involve multiple jurisdictions so like that intersection of El
11 Camino and Oregon/Page Mill. So, I would say that that's a big take away for Staff from this
12 discussion should be to think about how can we prioritize and push forward some
13 improvements there that would make conversations about adding housing on that site easier.
14 Because it is a really challenging intersection and I know we have a couple of intersections in
15 the City that need that kind of attention. So, if there's any way that we can lean on that and
16 have those be... even if it's not a traffic study. At least having some of those sites be prioritized
17 to maybe have a report back on how progress is developing and improving those intersections
18 would go along way towards improving the nature of this discussion.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Alright well, thank you all for chiming in. I think... I anticipated this might be a fun and lengthy
2 discussion so thank you all and to the members of the public who hung in there to hear the
3 whole thing. We appreciate you and recognize the 3 ½-hour commitment that you have made
4 to this conversation so thank you all. With that, I guess we need to close this agenda item and
5 move on to... let's see is these minutes? Is that's what's next on the agenda?

6

7 [The Commission moved to Approval of the Minutes]

8

9 **Action Items**

10 Public Comment is Permitted. Applicants/Appellant Teams: Fifteen (15) minutes, plus three (3) minutes rebuttal.
11 All others: Five (5) minutes per speaker.^{1,3}

12

13 3. PUBLIC HEARING / QUASI-JUDICIAL. 3000 Alexis Drive [19PLN-00304]:
14 Recommendation of a Site and Design Review for the Palo Alto Hills Golf and Country
15 Club to Renovate the 18-hole Golf Course. Environmental Assessment: Exempt From
16 CEQA Pursuant to Guidelines Section 15304, Minor Alterations to Land. Zoning
17 District: OS (Open Space). For More Information Please Contact Project Planner
18 Sheldon S. Ah Sing at sahsing@m-group.us.

19 Chair Templeton: Ok let's move on to the public hearing on the 3000 Alexis Drive.

20

21 Ms. Rachael Tanner, Assistant Planning Director: Great thank you, Commissioners, and thank
22 you Chair. I'm going to turn this over to our Chief Planning Official Amy French. She is going to
23 introduce the project and our planner on the project and then we'll have a presentation by the
24 planner. We also have, because it is a hearing, up to a 10-minute presentation by the applicant
25 which will be sharing slides with that presentation. And then, of course, can turn it over to the

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commission for perhaps questions, public comment, and then Commission deliberation and
2 decision. So, Amy take it away.

3
4 Ms. Amy French, Chief Planning Official: Good evening Commissioners. Sheldon Ah Sing is here
5 with us today as are the applicants for this project. So, Sheldon will share his screen to show the
6 Staff's presentation and will be followed by the applicant's presentations. So that's all I had to
7 say and thank you, Commissioners, for taking on a public hearing during the COVID timeline.
8 Thank you. Sheldon.

9
10 Mr. Sheldon Ah Sing, Project Planner: Yes, thank you.

11
12 Ms. Tanner: Sorry, Sheldon, sorry not to cut you off, Sheldon. One thing maybe I'll say more just
13 as this is our first public hearing. We are really excited to keep bringing items before the
14 Commission and before all of our Boards and Commissions to move forward. And so, we're
15 excited to see... get folks ready so that... well, initially we're thinking when construction is
16 allowed they can get their shovels in the ground and get to work. Little did we know
17 construction would be allowed as of today and so I'm not sure... although apparently golf
18 courses still are not allowed under the local county order though the state order did allow
19 golfing. So, we'll see if they can figure out what that means, so during this time, it's a good time
20 for the golf course to put forward their work and hopefully get that underway. So perhaps by

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 the time that the course the work is finished, maybe there can be time to go golfing again. So,
2 we're excited to bring this forward and bring this project moving ahead. Take it away Sheldon.

3

4 Mr. Ah Sing: Ok.

5

6 Chair Templeton: Sorry, sorry, sorry, sorry, one more thing before we get started, Sheldon. As
7 this is quasi-judicial, do we need to do disclosures? Does anyone have anything to disclose? Any
8 conflicts? Ok. Alright, now it's all on you Sheldon.

9

10 Ms. Tanner: [unintelligible]

11

12 Mr. Ah Sing: Ok thank you. Thanks for having me here to present the project. Sheldon Ah Sing,
13 planner. This is a recommendation of a Site and Design Review for the renovation of an 18-hole
14 golf course at 3000 Alexis Drive. And so, I do have a PowerPoint presentation and then the
15 applicant does have a presentation that I... which I will also control.

16

17 So just in summary kind of overall, there are renovation to this 18-hole golf course which the
18 goal is to seek improvement on playing conditions, the drainage, the maintenance of the
19 facility, and the applicant intends to complete the project within two phases to minimize
20 construction in the area. And this will also result in a reduction in pervious surface areas.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 So specific improvements would include grading to update the existing greens, the tees,
3 fairways, sand bunkers, and also add a short [unintelligible] practice area. There would be
4 upgrades to the irrigation system for efficiencies and try to reuse some of the heads where they
5 can do so. There also will be a replacement of certain golf course pathways with pervious
6 surfaces such as decomposed granite and then the installation of some flatwork for a small
7 patio extension at the clubhouse. So, they'll be using some pervious pavers there.

8

9 A little background of the site and facility. The golf course was constructed in 1961 and it's on
10 over 128-acres. It's a pretty large parcel there. It's... additions were made in 2009 following the
11 Site and Design Review and Condition Use Permit by the City that enabled clubhouse addition
12 and a fitness facility. And the approval of these conditions included Transportations Demand
13 Management Plan and also included membership limits and verified through the club that these
14 are not exceeded today, so they're still maintaining those conditions.

15

16 The process, and just to understand here, is that it's a Site Design Review. There isn't any need
17 to amend the CUP because the CUP does allow a commercial recreation use in the OS as well as
18 they're not intending on changing any other operations. This is a... we'll include a Staff
19 Architectural Review concurrent with this process and that's for some of the landscaping, patio
20 expansion which are deemed to be minor changes to the Council approved plans back in 2008.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 So, we will do that concurrently after recommendation from the PTC this will be recommended
2 to the Council and placed on the Consent Calendar and then that will be the process.

3
4 A little bit about the setting here, it's located in the Foothills west of Interstate 280. It's
5 surrounded by some large properties, single-family homes to the east and south, and also butts
6 a natural preserve area. Views of the property are limited from the adjacent street, there's a lot
7 of berming up and the actual golf course is kind of down in elevation. There would be views
8 from the back yards of these neighboring homes and some of these homes do have two-story
9 components that take advantage of views to the golf course. And some would say that those
10 are premium views.

11
12 So, consistency with the Site and Design Review, there's no change of use requested. The use is
13 allowed via the existing CUP. There's no site or facilities expansion, the site modifications do
14 not require a CUP, the pervious area will be reduced by about 14,000-square feet and the area
15 does include some buildings, a parking lot, golf cart pathway and flatwork. The reduction would
16 result from going from 6.5 percent to 6.25 percent with the pervious pavers and decomposed
17 granite. It doesn't seem like a whole lot but when you're looking at a very large site, that is an
18 improvement. There will also be tree protection ongoing throughout the project. There were 71
19 protected trees surveyed, four of the protected trees would be proposed to be removed and
20 these in decline in health. Also, 35 non-protected trees would be proposed for removal and the

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 applicant proposed to plant 132 trees, 62 Redwoods and 70 Oaks would be proposed on the
2 site throughout.

3
4 And these are the findings that are required by the Council to make and public planning
5 Commission recommend. I'll spare reading through them but those are in the... in your packet.

6 The project pursuant to CEQA is exempted for minor alterations to land. That the grading on
7 the land is less than 10 percent of the slope, the site averages 8.8 percent and that all of the
8 cubic yards of grading [unintelligible] nearly 40,000 square feet of cut and fill balance on site.

9 So, there's no soil that's being transferred on or off. There're no trucks going on the streets. It
10 will all be taken on the property.

11
12 So, recommendation this evening is approval of the proposed project to City Council based on
13 the findings and subject to conditions of approval. So that concludes my presentation, I'd be
14 happy to answer any questions. The applicant has their presentation. They also have some
15 slides regarding those photos that the Commissioner had mentioned regarding elevations so
16 thank you.

17
18 Mr. Nguyen: Sheldon who should I unmute?

19
20 Mr. Ah Sing: Brian Costello.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Nguyen: Ok one second. Ok, Brian if you can unmute on your end you may speak.

Mr. Brian Costello: Unmuted. Thank you, Sheldon, Commissioners, Staff, good evening. Thank you for this opportunity to present out partial renovation of the 18-hole golf course at Palo Alto Hills Golf and Country Club which we've titled transforming a 1960's Design into the Modern Era and Beyond. And there's a nice image in the lower right of the title there, the title slide, showing you kind of the context of the golf course in the surrounding community. Next slide.

This is our project team of professionals. The left column, the center column, and then we also have some representatives from the club. This is a partial list. It's really been a team effort. I would like to point out that two of our consultants, Jeff Froke our Environmental Consultant, and Russ Mitchell and Associates. Both worked on the City's Baylands Golf Course project and for them and everybody else we really welcome everything that was put into this presentation into the packet to date. Next slide, please.

So, I'm going to give you a brief overview. Sheldon mentioned some of these items but the club was founded in 1958, the first 9 holes opened in 1960, and then the following year in 1961 the final 9 holes to complete the 18 was completed. So, we're dealing with essentially a 60-year old golf course design and it needs to be brought up to modern standards. And a lot of the

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 components of the golf course have a natural life cycle and those need to be replaced with new
2 technologies. So, we're replacing the irrigation system with the new state of the art design.
3 That should realize about a 3 to 5 percent savings. We're also doing some improvements with
4 drainage, Sheldon mentioned about the cart paths, and then all the golf course features are
5 going to be built to United States Golf Associations standards. Turf selection improvements,
6 we're continuing to maintain the turf reduction that's already been put in place. Andrew
7 Morgan, the golf course Superintendent, has reduced the other all irrigated turf from about 86-
8 acres to 65-acres which represents a 25 percent reduction in irrigated turf and we're going to
9 continue to use that footprint. We're also using disease and drought-resistant varieties of
10 turfgrass. We'll be enhancing native areas and then we'll be restoring kind of the native trees
11 and the character of the site by removing some of the disease Monterey Pines and replacing
12 those with the Oaks and Redwoods at nearly a 4 to 1 ratio. Next slide, please.

13

14 So, this is a little bit of a deeper look into the Monterey Pines and the situation. There're a
15 couple of images there where you can see where these very majestic groves of Monterey Pines
16 have succumbed to the Pitch Canker Disease. And so, there's been some concerns obviously
17 associated with that because the tree limbs could fall on players or Staff. It also exposes the golf
18 course with adjacent holes to wayward shots or intentional shortcuts for that matter. So, we're
19 replacing the trees that are removed with 132 again Oaks and Redwoods and they'll provide

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 directional screening and... excuse me, safety screening, and directional influence. Next slide,
2 please.

3
4 So, this was a picture in the upper right that was taken just yesterday and this is looking from
5 about the beginning of the first fairway back toward the clubhouse which is on the right-hand
6 side and the first tee. And then on the left-hand side of the image is the 9th green and in the
7 bottom, image is a rendition of what conditions would look like near maturity in that same
8 area. So, the intent with this planting is to restore in-kind nature massing and groves and not
9 necessarily try to create a linear wall of trees. Next slide, please.

10
11 This is about again what some statistics that Sheldon had mentioned; 39,750-cubic yards.
12 Everything balances on-site, there's no import or export, and the area that the project is
13 involved is about 36-acres which represents about 28 percent of the overall site. Next slide,
14 please.

15
16 This is an Earthwork and View Analysis. This base information here was something that our
17 geotechnical consultant had requested of us last year to help them identify where some of our
18 deeper fills and cuts were. So, some of these colored areas you're seeing on this image show
19 exactly where those are. So, in the overall footprint of 36-acres, the areas that have a little bit
20 more grading are very very small as an overall percentage. So, then we took this base

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 information and applied a View Analysis of what you might see from the golf course from the
2 adjacent properties. So, starting just below the Palo Alto Hills Golf and Country Club logo in the
3 upper right-hand corner, that's where the parking lot and the clubhouse is located. And you see
4 there's kind of minor grading around the clubhouse. If you work your way clockwise around to
5 the bottom right, that's the southernmost tip of the golf course and that's not visible from the
6 open space due to topography and vegetation. Then if you move right to left toward the
7 bottom, that's the part of the golf course that's adjacent to the Arastradero Preserve and
8 there's either very little that's visible or you wouldn't see it because it's minor grading. And
9 then working around to the left-hand side of the phone, that's the north end of the property. If
10 anything, we're doing a little cutting there. So, we're never creating artificial mounds or
11 anything like that to try to hide anything. We're trying to really be responsive to the natural
12 topography. And then if you work your way to the top of the photograph, say around 12 o'clock
13 and then work down to 6 o'clock, that is a natural spine or kind of a high plateau that has an
14 eastern aspect. So, it tips away from the open space and the same things with the holes 1 and 9
15 which is kind of the bottom leg of that that ties back up to the clubhouse. That has very limited
16 visibility and the grading. Again, this is just isolated pockets. Next slide, please.

17

18 This is a View Analysis from the open space so this is the Arastradero Preserve on your left. You
19 can see the logo for Palo Alto Heroes. That's where the golf course kind of fits into the
20 preserve. These pictures were also taken yesterday. Image A was taken from the parking lot

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 looking south towards the golf course and then from this particular photograph, you can't see
2 the course. On the bottom, Image B, that was taken from the intersection of de Anza and
3 Meadowlark Trail. That gives a good panorama. You can see a little bit of the golf course at the
4 north end on the left-hand side of the photograph. Again, that area we're doing a little bit of
5 cut so if anything, that might be lower and then in the center part of the photograph we're not
6 doing any grading in that area that you can see in that gap. Next slide, please.

7

8 This is Foothills Park on the map and these are also picturing that we took yesterday. The top
9 image was taken from Bobcat Point which is in the north corner there on the right-hand side.
10 You can't see the golf course in this particular representative image and then from B, that's
11 from Panorama Trail and a cul de sac intersection. Also, at the boundary of the park. This is
12 from a drone taken from about 80 to 100-feet in the air. Just to prove that yes, there is a golf
13 course there just over the horizon but if you're actually at grade level at least at this point you
14 wouldn't be able to see the course. But you can't see the clubhouse in this drone shot for
15 perspective on the right-hand side and then the left-sided you catch some glimpses of the golf
16 course. Next slide.

17

18 So, this is the last slide and the presentation and again just to reiterate some of the key points.
19 We're updating a 60-year old golf course design to a more modern standards. We're going to
20 be introducing new component technology, we're continuing with turf selection improvements

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 that are disease and drought-resistant, and then we're going to be restoring more of the native
2 trees for the property. So, thank you very much and we'll be happy to answer any questions.

3
4 Chair Templeton: Alright thank you very much both of you for the presentations. I'm going to
5 open it up to Commissioners. Please raise your hand with the raised hand function and we'll go
6 in order to see them. So, Commissioner Hechtman. So, the first part of the questions, what
7 we're going to do now, are going to be questions to the presenters. Then we're going to have
8 public comment and then we can talk about opinions... the opinions portion. Alright.

9
10 Commissioner Hechtman: Thank you Chair. This is a question for the applicant. I see in the Staff
11 Packet and in your plan set that you are going to be reorienting to some extent some of your
12 fairways and greens. What I couldn't tell and I'd like you to comment on is whether we need to
13 be concerned that any of that reorientation might have the effect of more error to golf shots?
14 Either landing in the adjacent homes, the adjacent street, or trails on adjacent open space.

15
16 Mr. Costello: I'd be happy to answer that. Sheldon do you have the opportunity to jump to slide
17 12? So, this is a proposed design overlay and there really isn't any significant change as far as
18 the positioning of the golf course. We're really trying to respect the existing corridors. The only
19 real difference and it's subtle is the introduction of a Par 3, hole number 7, that's adjacent to
20 Alexis. And it's really kind of borrowing the tee location from the existing hole number 8. The

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 setback is per industry standards and it shouldn't present a problem. Every other alignment of
2 the golf holes remains essentially in the same corridor. I hope that answers or addresses your
3 concern about that.

4

5 Commissioner Hechtman: It does, thank you.

6

7 Chair Templeton: Alright any other Commissioners have questions please raise your hands
8 now? Ok so now we should open the floor for public comments. Please used the raised hand
9 feature to indicate if you have a public comment or press *9 if you're dialed in.

10

11 Mr. Vinh Nguyen, Admin Associate III: Chair Templeton.

12

13 Chair Templeton: Yes.

14

15 Mr. Nguyen: Before we proceed can you confirm if you wanted to give members of the public 3-
16 minutes or 5-minutes for this item.

17

18 Chair Templeton: I think 3-minutes should be... we said it earlier in there that we're going to use
19 3-minutes today.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Nguyen: Ok, sure so our first speaker will be Jeff Froke, and then afterward we have
2 Winter. One second, let me get Jeff on the line. Ok, Jeff if you're there you can unmute your
3 microphone and speak.

4
5 Mr. Jeff Froke: I had not intended to speak; however, I may have misspoken when I signed up.
6 However, I am available to answer any questions as one of the project team. Particularly
7 regarding the any environmental or ecological concerns. Environmental aspects of the golf
8 course.

9
10 Mr. Nguyen: Ok so to confirm you have no public comments for this item, is that right?

11
12 Ms. Tanner: Yes Vinh, he's part of the project team for the golf course.

13
14 Mr. Nguyen: Ok, gotcha. Ok and in that case next we have Winter. Winter your microphone is
15 unmuted, if you can unmute on your end you can speak.

16
17 Ms. Dellenbach: Yes, I have a question and a comment. My question is could you say again the
18 trees that would be coming out, are they all Monterey Pines? And oh, I'm sorry, are they... my
19 question is are the trees coming out all Monterey Pines? Are there Oaks? Are there native trees
20 coming out too? I would like that clarified and if native trees, mature native trees are coming

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 out I would like to know how many of what native trees do you [unintelligible – audio cut out]
2 want to remove?

3

4 And my suggestion is you... I have been to the club on several occasions and I know the
5 [unintelligible] parking lot situation and there surely would be room in the tiered parking lot for
6 planting of canopy trees in a reasonably spaced and rational way to provide cooling of that
7 parking lot. Because right now it's just tier after tier after tier after tier coming up of that
8 hillside that gets really hot and there's no cooling of that. And I think that would be a very good
9 addition to this project providing habitat to carbon sequestration. All of those other good things
10 but also cooling down what is a really really hot area leading up to your wonderful clubhouse.
11 Those... that's my question and that is my suggestion. That's all.

12

13 Chair Templeton: Alright Vinh do we have any other public comments on this agenda item?

14

15 Mr. Nguyen: We have no more raised hands.

16

17 Chair Templeton: Alright technology giveth and taketh away. Alright so we'll move on to
18 comments (interrupted)

19

20 Mr. Nguyen: Sorry about that, we have no more raised hands so we can proceed.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Chair Templeton: Thank you so much. Alright so let's move on to Commissioner's comments.
Please raise your hand if you'd like to speak to this item. Commissioner Summa.

Commissioner Summa: Thank you very much and thank you, Staff and applicant, for the application. I also had a couple questions about the trees and one is I appreciate the planting of native trees which will naturally do very well there. But I also just wanted to encourage you to plant large trees because the ones that you're replacing, the Monterrey Pines that you showed, while they may be ailing from the Pitch Canker Disease also are still providing I would assume some visual screening. So, I would just encourage you to plant large enough trees and I also have been to this club more than once. And I do think the parking lot as a member of the public said could benefit very much from some native trees as well. So, thank you very much.

Chair Templeton: Thank you, Commissioner Summa. Now Commissioner Lauing.

Commissioner Lauing: Ok thanks, yeah, I had requested and you provided very quickly some nice pictures of what that's going to look like afterward of the four findings. That was the only one that I had concerns about just because I didn't know.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 You definitely said that you weren't going to be changing the architectures so I wasn't
2 expecting an extra story that had be dealt with when I'm walking through Arastradero but I
3 didn't know if the removal of some landscape might create an issue. It looks like you're being
4 extraordinarily sensitive to that and I appreciate you moving quickly to show us those pictures.
5 So that we have confidence making the correct recommendation to the public and to the
6 Council. That's all thank you.

7

8 Chair Templeton: Thank you. Any other Commissioners wish to speak on this item please raise
9 your hand? I would like to just share a few comments that I appreciate that you're only
10 removing the unhealthy trees and that you're planting so many new trees. If you wish to
11 respond to the question about what kinds of trees... oh I see Commissioner Hechtman next.
12 What kind of trees are being removed please let me know. I'd be happy to hear that. And also, I
13 appreciate that you're reducing the amount of irrigated turf. That seems very, very responsible.
14 So, to the applicant did you want to say anything more about the trees?

15

16 Mr. Costello: Sure. Yeah, am I unmuted?

17

18 Chair Templeton: We can hear you.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Costello: Ok good. To the first question and I hope I get them all. Perhaps you can remind
2 me if I don't but the... all the trees that are being removed are non-native pines. They're... the
3 majority are the Monterrey Pines. There are a few Italian Stone Pines and a few... what the heck
4 where they called?

5

6 [note – unknown speaker:] [unintelligible]

7

8 Mr. Costello: Canary Island Pines. Canary Island Pines, Stone Pines but the majority is the
9 Monterrey Pines. The types or the sizes of trees where following Urban Forestry Guidelines for
10 the Ratio depending on the size or the caliper of the trunk of the trees. So, we're planting 48-
11 inch, 35-inch, and 24-inch box trees, and all that information has been provided in the
12 documentation we've submitted to date.

13

14 Chair Templeton: Thank you so much. I appreciate that. Commissioner Hechtman.

15

16 Commissioner Hechtman: Thank you. So, I first want to acknowledge that golf courses public
17 and private are a very important open space feature of Palo Alto and it's important to properly
18 manage our open space. And I'm pleased that the golf course is really taking this step to
19 manage and beautify the green space. We're not here talking about the buildings.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 And also, I want to acknowledge that the way they've done it, they're proposal here, is really to
2 me checks all of the environmental sensitive boxes. They have balanced their cut and fill so that
3 that there's not going to be any trucks bringing soil onto the site or taking it away. I think that's
4 great. They are reducing the pervious coverage by about 14,000-square feet. So as Sheldon
5 pointed out it's only .25 but we're talking about 128-acres so it's substantial. They are removing
6 39 trees, all of them are one type of pine or another, and they are replacing them with 132
7 Oaks which as I understand is 20 more than they are required by ordinances to do. And there's
8 a variety of Oaks and so again, I think that's the right way to do it. And I learned tonight from
9 Mr. Costello's presentation that they are reducing by 25 percent the amount of irrigated turf
10 which should be more water savings and a better water conservation approach. So, I think all of
11 those things are terrific and I wanted to just acknowledge that it appears to me that the team
12 that put this together really did their homework and has brought us something that we can...
13 that I feel like I can recommend to the Council wholeheartedly. Thank you.

14

15 Chair Templeton: Thank you, Commissioner Hechtman. Any other Commissioners wish to speak
16 on this item? I was wondering Sheldon if you could present your Staff recommendation slide so
17 that we can entertain any motions about that. Ok any motions, please raise your hand?
18 Commissioner Alcheck.

19

20 MOTION

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Alcheck: I'll make a recommendation [note -motion] that we approve the proposed project. Let see, we recommend approval of the proposed project to the City Council based on the findings and subjects to the conditions of approval.

Chair Templeton: Any second? Commissioner Lauing.

SECOND

Commissioner Lauing: Yes, I'm happy to second that motion.

Chair Templeton: Alright any discussion? Do either of you want to speak to the motion?

Commissioner Alcheck: I'll just say that I think Commissioner Hechtman really articulated what I was thinking.

Commissioner Lauing: Ditto. Absolutely, it's just superb design and I think there was a bit of a template on the golf course in Palo Alto. The former Municipal, now Baylands, and it's good to have some of the folks that even learned lessons live there working on this one as well. So, I think it looks all the way around.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

VOTE

Chair Templeton: Excellent. Last call for comments or discussion on this item before we vote please raise your hand. Commissioner Lauing. Oh, ok. Vinh, can you please conduct a roll call vote?

Mr. Nguyen: Absolutely. Commissioner Alcheck?

Commissioner Alcheck: Yes.

Mr. Nguyen: Commissioner Hechtman?

Commissioner Hechtman: Yes.

Mr. Nguyen: Commissioner Lauing?

Commissioner Lauing: Yes.

Mr. Nguyen: Vice-Chair Roohparvar?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Vice-Chair Roohparvar: Yes.

Mr. Nguyen: Commissioner Summa? Commissioner Summa?

Chair Templeton: You're muted.

Commissioner Summa: Yes, sorry.

Mr. Nguyen: Chair Templeton?

Chair Templeton: Yes.

Mr. Nguyen: Ok the motion passes. Thank you.

MOTION PASSED 6 (Lauing, Summa, Roohparvar, Alcheck, Templeton, Hechtman)-0-1(Riggs absent)

Chair Templeton: Great. Thank you call for a great presentation. I appreciate it and we will move on to the next agenda item.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21

[The Commission moved up to Item Number Two]

Commission Action: Motion to approve by Alcheck, second by Lauing. Passes 6-0 (Riggs absent)

Approval of Minutes

Public Comment is Permitted. Five (5) minutes per speaker.^{1,3}

4. February 12, 2020 Draft PTC Meeting Minutes

5. February 26, 2020 Draft PTC Meeting Minutes

Chair Templeton: Yes, ok. So, we're moving to Agenda Item Number Four which is the approval of the minutes. I understand that one of our Commissioners has submitted some minor, not substantial changes, that don't need discussion. That's from Commissioner Hechtman but any other thoughts that haven't been submitted already to Staff or any changes to the minutes? Raise your hands if so. Ok, would anyone like to move to approve the February 12th and/or February 26th meeting minutes? Whoops. Commissioner Summa. Oh, you're on mute. Sorry.

MOTION

Commissioner Summa: I'll move to approve. I forget the dates. I'd have to (interrupted)

Chair Templeton: February 12th and February 26th.

Commissioner Summa: February 12th.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Chair Templeton: Okay doke. Any seconds?

SECOND

Vice-Chair Roohparvar: I'll second.

Chair Templeton: Thank you Vice-Chair Roohparvar. Any discussion? Alright do we need to do these separately or should be... can we combine them? Commissioner Lauing. You're on mute.

Mr. Albert Yang, City Attorney: Just to answer your question, you can absolutely approve both in one motion.

Chair Templeton: Ok. Commissioner Summa, can we do both?

MOTION AMENDED

Commissioner Summa: Yes. I'll change my motion.

Chair Templeton: Is that ok with... thank you. Is that ok with the seconder?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Vice-Chair Roohparvar: Yes.

VOTE

Chair Templeton: Alright. Any discussion? Seeing none let's do out voice vote. Thank you, Albert.

Mr. Vinh Nguyen, Admin Associate III: Ok so for the roll call vote. Commissioner Alcheck?

Commissioner Alcheck?

Commissioner Alcheck: Yes, sorry, yes.

Mr. Nguyen: Commissioner Hechtman?

Commissioner Hechtman: Aye.

Mr. Nguyen: Commissioner Lauing?

Commissioner Lauing: Yes.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Nguyen: Vice-Chair Roohparvar?

Vice-Chair Roohparvar: Yes.

Mr. Nguyen: Commissioner Summa?

Commissioner Summa: Yes.

Mr. Nguyen: Chair Templeton.

Chair Templeton: Yes.

Mr. Nguyen: This motion passes, thank you.

MOTION PASSED 6 (Templeton, Lauing, Alcheck, Summa, Hechtman, Roohparvar)-0-1 (Riggs absent)

Chair Templeton: Thank you.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 **Commission Action:** One motion to approve both sets of minutes by Summa, second by
2 Roohparvar. Passes 6-0 (Riggs absent)

3 **Committee Items**

4 Chair Templeton: Ok so now we are on to Committee items. We had a thorough update of the
5 North Ventura Coordinated Area Plan. Commissioner Summa anything to add? Ok.

6
7 I should mention that the XCAP has also resumed via Zoom. So, if you want to participate in
8 those discussions you are welcome to listen in. We just had our first meeting last week and
9 we'll be going every other week I believe.

10

11 Alright, any other Committee items? Seeing no hands raised, moving on.

12 **Commissioner Questions, Comments or Announcements**

13 Chair Templeton: Any questions about or comments or announcements or future agenda items
14 please raise your hands. Ms. Tanner, could you please tell us what is up for the upcoming
15 meeting or two as of now?

16

17 Ms. Rachael Tanner, Assistant Director of Planning: So, the next meeting we're going to be
18 talking about, ironically or perhaps maybe Commissioner Alcheck knew, SB-35. And that
19 legislation requires some... if we become subject to it, it requires us to have objectives
20 standards for development. And so, it's a pretty major shift in how we might review

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 development potentially for the City. I mean really especially with the Architectural Review
2 Board would or could depending on the path we choose really fundamentally change the way
3 that body operates and really the way that development is reviewed. So, I'm looking forward to
4 the discussion. I imagine it would probably be a good 2-2 ½-hours discussion. It's quite meaty in
5 terms of just the content itself. There's a lot of moving parts and we have great Staff, we have a
6 really talented consultant working with us on it as well, and we'll be doing a presentation about
7 the item. But I'm looking forward to it. It's a study session so we don't need to take action but I
8 know that the ARB wanted to make sure that it came to the PTC before the item went back to
9 them. They've had two discussions about it and want to see where the PTC is and kind of some
10 of your reflection as they continue to really dig into that topic. And depending on how things go
11 with the economy maybe we won't have to hurry as much with it but it is something that we
12 want to get done so that we can be in compliance with the state laws.

13

14 And then we will be having the meeting following the EV charger item will be returning. Albert
15 who is on the line here has been working quite a lot with our Staff on that and I believe at that
16 same meeting we will have an item from transportation. I'm sorry, I don't recall what the item
17 is but they will also be coming with that item that day.

18

19 And hopefully, before June is out we will also bring before you an update to our ADU
20 Ordinance. We... you may recall we had to do an urgency ordinance in January which Albert and

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 then also Amy French helped on because we needed to make sure that our law was still in
2 effect even though state law had changed and make sure that they were kind of married. And
3 this really is a more thoughtful look at how do we help to facilitate more ADU development in a
4 way that is in line with what we want to see in our community and creating just overly a more
5 thoughtful Code, and easier to read Code. And that would really be a precursor to some
6 publications, some ways we can really help the community be more informed about how they
7 can build ADUs and what that could look like in the future.

8

9 Chair Templeton: Alright thank you very much. Any other comments? I see Commissioner
10 Alcheck.

11

12 Commissioner Alcheck: I just wanted to say I've been on a lot of Zoom meetings in the last
13 weeks and credit to you and Staff, Chair Templeton, for running an unbelievably well-run
14 meeting. So, you should be very proud of yourself and Staff as well because this has gone better
15 than 100 percent of my Zoom meetings so far. And that's really a testament to the dedication
16 that you guys have so nice work tonight.

17

18 Chair Templeton: Thanks. I'm really shocked that my kids have not found me. I'm sitting on the
19 patio so, so far so good. Alright, so last call for comments, questions, announcements, etc.?

20 Alright with that I would like to reflect back to Commissioner Alcheck and to the other

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioners here my appreciation for you sticking with what has turned out to be a very
2 long and intense discussion but very valuable and important to the community. So, thank you
3 all for making this is a great Zoom meeting and we'll see you in a couple weeks. This meeting is
4 adjourned. Thank you.

5 **Adjournment**

6 9:30 pm

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

Palo Alto Planning & Transportation Commission

Commissioner Biographies, Present and Archived Agendas and Reports are available online: <http://www.cityofpaloalto.org/gov/boards/ptc/default.asp>. The PTC Commission members are:

Commissioner Michael Alcheck
Commissioner Bart Hechtman
Commissioner Ed Lauing
Commissioner William Riggs
Vice-Chair Giselle Roohparvar
Commissioner Doria Summa
Chair Carolyn Templeton

Get Informed and Be Engaged!

View online: <http://midpenmedia.org/category/government/city-of-palo-alto> or on Channel 26.

Show up and speak. Public comment is encouraged. Please complete a speaker request card located on the table at the entrance to the Council Chambers and deliver it to the Commission Secretary prior to discussion of the item.

Write to us. Email the PTC at: Planning.Commission@CityofPaloAlto.org. Letters can be delivered to the Planning & Community Environment Department, 5th floor, City Hall, 250 Hamilton Avenue, Palo Alto, CA 94301. Comments received by 2:00 PM two Tuesdays preceding the meeting date will be included in the agenda packet. Comments received afterward through 2:00 PM the day of the meeting will be presented to the Commission at the dais.

Material related to an item on this agenda submitted to the PTC after distribution of the agenda packet is available for public inspection at the address above.

Americans with Disability Act (ADA)

It is the policy of the City of Palo Alto to offer its public programs, services and meetings in a manner that is readily accessible to all. Persons with disabilities who require materials in an appropriate alternative format or who require auxiliary aids to access City meetings, programs, or services may contact the City's ADA Coordinator at (650) 329-2550 (voice) or by emailing ada@cityofpaloalto.org. Requests for assistance or accommodations must be submitted at least 24 hours in advance of the meeting, program, or service.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.